

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application for)	
Establishment of a Reasonable)	Case No. 12-1494-EL-AEC
Arrangement Between ASHTA)	
Chemicals Inc. and The Cleveland)	
Electric Illuminating Company.)	

**MOTION OF ASHTA CHEMICALS INC.
FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER
AND MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

Samuel C. Randazzo, Trial Attorney
Scott E. Elisar
Frank P. Darr
Joseph P. Olikier
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-4228
Telephone: (614) 469-8000
Telecopier: (614) 469-4653
sam@mwncmh.com
selisar@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com

September 13, 2013

Attorneys for ASHTA Chemicals Inc.

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application for)	
Establishment of a Reasonable)	Case No. 12-1494-EL-AEC
Arrangement Between ASHTA)	
Chemicals Inc. and The Cleveland)	
Electric Illuminating Company.)	

**MOTION OF ASHTA CHEMICALS INC.
FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Pursuant to the provisions of Rule 4901-1-24(D), Ohio Administrative Code ("O.A.C."), ASHTA Chemicals Inc. ("ASHTA") respectfully requests that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") issue a protective order to protect the confidentiality and prohibit the disclosure of the confidential information contained in the Joint Stipulation and Recommendation (Stipulation") filed on behalf of ASHTA on September 13, 2013 in this proceeding. The confidential information is not subject to disclosure and includes competitively sensitive and highly proprietary business information comprising trade secrets. The grounds for this Motion are set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Scott E. Elisar
Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)
Scott E. Elisar
Frank P. Darr
Joseph P. Olikar
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC

21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-4228
Telephone: (614) 469-8000
Telecopier: (614) 469-4653
sam@mwncmh.com
selisar@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for ASHTA Chemicals Inc.

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application for)	
Establishment of a Reasonable)	Case No. 12-1494-EL-AEC
Arrangement Between ASHTA)	
Chemicals Inc. and The Cleveland)	
Electric Illuminating Company.)	

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Contemporaneous with this motion, ASHTA has filed the Stipulation in an unredacted form and under seal. By this motion, ASHTA requests confidential treatment for competitively sensitive and highly proprietary business information that constitutes trade secrets under Ohio law and the Commission's rules. State law recognizes the need to protect information that is confidential in nature. Accordingly, the General Assembly granted the Commission statutory authority to exempt certain documents from disclosure.¹ Pursuant to this statutory grant of authority, the Commission promulgated Rule 4901-1-24, Ohio Administrative Code ("O.A.C."). Rule 4901-1-24(D), O.A.C., provides for the issuance of an order that is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed at the Commission to the extent that state and federal law prohibit the release of such information and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code.

¹ See Sections 4901.12 and 4905.07, Revised Code.

Trade secrets protected by state law are not considered public records and are therefore exempt from public disclosure.² A trade secret is defined by Section 1333.61(D), Revised Code, as follows:

"Trade secret" means information, including the whole or any portion or phase of any scientific or technical information, design, process, procedure, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any **business information or plans, financial information**, or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

(1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.

(2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

Section 1333.61(D), Revised Code (emphasis added).

The information contained within the Stipulation is competitively sensitive and highly proprietary business and financial information falling within the statutory characterization of a trade secret.³ Public disclosure of the information would jeopardize ASHTA's business position and its ability to compete.

Non-disclosure of the information will not impair the purposes of Title 49 as the Commission and its Staff will have full access to the confidential information in order to complete its review process. Because ASHTA's information constitutes a trade secret, it should be accorded protected status.

² Section 149.43(A)(1)(v), Revised Code; *State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Insurance*, 80 Ohio St. 3d 513, 530 (1997).

³ Section 1333.61(D), Revised Code.

WHEREFORE, ASHTA respectfully requests that this Motion for Protective Order be granted for the reasons set forth herein.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Scott E. Elisar

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Scott E. Elisar

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Olier

MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC

21 East State Street, 17th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

selisar@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for ASHTA Chemicals Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Motion of ASHTA Chemicals Inc. for Protective Order and Memorandum in Support* was served upon the following parties of record this 13th day of September, 2013, *via* electronic transmission, hand-delivery, or ordinary U.S. mail, postage prepaid.

/s/ Scott E. Elisar

Scott E. Elisar

James Burk
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 S. Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
burkj@firstenergycorp.com

**ON BEHALF OF THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC
ILLUMINATING COMPANY**

William Wright, Section Chief
Thomas W. McNamee
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us
william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

**ON BEHALF OF THE STAFF OF THE PUBLIC
UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Jody Kyler Cohn
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com

COUNSEL FOR OHIO ENERGY GROUP

Mandy Chiles
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
mandy.chiles@puc.state.oh.us

ATTORNEY EXAMINER

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

9/13/2013 12:46:02 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-1494-EL-AEC

Summary: Motion ASHTA Chemicals Inc. Motion for Protective Order and Memorandum in Support electronically filed by Ms. Vicki L. Leach-Payne on behalf of Elisar, Scott E. Mr.