

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of Application of The            )  
Dayton Power and Light Company for        )  
Approval of its Market Rate Offer.            ) Case No. 12-426-EL-SSO

In the Matter of Application of The            )  
Dayton Power and Light Company for        )  
Approval of Revised Tariffs.                 ) Case No. 12-427-EL-ATA

In the Matter of Application of The            )  
Dayton Power and Light Company for        )  
Approval of Certain Accounting                )  
Authority.   ) Case No. 12-428-EL-AAM

In the Matter of Application of The            )  
Dayton Power and Light Company for        )  
Waiver of Certain Commission Rules.         ) Case No. 12-429-EL-WVR

In the Matter of Application of The            )  
Dayton Power and Light Company to         )  
Establish Tariff Riders.                        ) Case No. 12-672-EL-RDR

---

**REPLY BRIEF OF  
OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY  
AND  
THE EDMONT NEIGHBORHOOD COALITION**

---

**I. Introduction**

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy (“OPAE”) and the Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition (“Edgemont”), advocates for low-income residential customers of The Dayton Power and Light Company (“DP&L”), hereby submit to the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) this reply brief in the above-captioned matters which are applications of DP&L for approval of an Electric Security Plan (“ESP”), revised tariffs, accounting authority, a waiver of certain Commission rules, and the establishment of tariff riders. This reply brief

will respond primarily to certain positions of DP&L in its initial post-hearing brief with regard to the issues affecting low-income residential customers of DP&L. OPAE and Edgemont will not repeat herein the arguments made in our initial brief with regard to other issues concerning the proposed DP&L ESP, but our positions on these matters remain the same as expressed in our initial brief.

**II. The evidence of record shows an increased need for assistance to at-risk populations in DP&L's service territory.**

DP&L argues that it should not be required to “make charitable contributions” by continuing to support its existing fuel fund, even though DP&L also indicates “its current intent...to provide some level of support so long as it can do so without adversely affecting its financial integrity”. DP&L Brief at 62. DP&L's position ignores the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Sec. 4928.02(L), which states the policy of the State of Ohio to “[p]rotect at risk populations”. This statute makes it a policy of the State of Ohio to balance the interests of vulnerable customers with the interests of the utility when approving a standard service offer. Protecting at-risk populations is a requirement of the State's policy, and though that requirement can take the form of charitable contributions, the protection of at-risk populations itself is not defined as a “charitable contribution” under Ohio law.

The Commission does have authority to require that DP&L comply with the statute. The requirement is best satisfied by a continuation and expansion of the current fuel fund. A fuel fund provides a different type of protection for at-risk

populations than the Percentage of Income Payment Plan (“PIPP”), which has a limited eligibility level and is designed for customers that require constant assistance to ensure that essential energy service is affordable. Unlike PIPP customers, many other low-income customers require assistance only once or twice a year; the fuel fund meets this need at a lower cost than PIPP. The General Assembly has already determined there is a need to protect vulnerable customers. It did not prescribe a particular approach, permitting the Commission to determine an appropriate method for providing the protection envisioned by the statute based on the record in a particular case. DP&L’s financial integrity is a separate issue.

In its brief, DP&L continues its argument with the assertion that the increase in the fuel fund requested by OPAE and Edgemont is not based on an analysis of the need. This is not true. DP&L ignores the evidence of record provided by the Office of the Consumers’ Counsel’s witness James D. Williams about the increased need for assistance for at-risk populations in DP&L’s service territory. DP&L’s service has become increasing unaffordable for its low-income residential customers who comprise a significant and growing portion of DP&L’s residential customers.

DP&L also ignores the testimony of OPAE’s witness David C. Rinebolt. Beyond his experience with establishing, designing, and implementing bill payment assistance programs since 1983, Mr. Rinebolt cited the results of an extensive study, the State of Poverty 2012, which provides detailed information on the significant increase in the number of households eligible for assistance

from the fuel fund. This study was attached to Mr. Rinebolt's testimony and includes the following information with regard to poverty levels in DP&L's service territory.

**Percentage of Customers in Poverty --  
DP&L**

<b>County</b>	<b>1999</b>	<b>2010</b>	<b>% Increase</b>
Auglaize	6.2%	9.4%	51.6%
Brown	11.6%	13.0%	12.1%
Butler	8.7%	13.5%	55.2%
Champaign	7.6%	13.1%	72.4%
Clark	10.7%	20.0%	86.9%
Clinton	8.6%	15.7%	82.6%
Darke	8.0%	12.2%	52.5%
Fayette	10.1%	16.2%	60.4%
Greene	8.5%	13.1%	54.1%
Hardin	13.2%	17.2%	30.3%
Highland	11.8%	18.6%	57.6%
Logan	9.3%	16.9%	81.7%
Madison	7.8%	15.0%	92.3%
Mercer	6.4%	9.6%	50.0%
Miami	6.7%	11.9%	77.6%
Montgomery	11.3%	18.0%	59.3%
Pickaway	9.5%	12.7%	33.7%
Preble	6.1%	12.1%	98.4%
Ross	12.0%	19.3%	60.8%
Union	4.6%	8.2%	78.3%
Van Wert	5.5%	12.5%	127.3%
Warren	4.2%	5.9%	40.5%
<b>Average</b>	<b>8.7%</b>	<b>14.0%</b>	<b>64.9%</b>

DP&L's recent rate increases coupled with its quest for 'financial integrity' threatens to make basic energy service unaffordable to the increasing number of poor families in its service territory. Extending the existing fuel fund at an

increased level as recommended by OPAE and Edgemont is necessary to fulfill the policy established by the State of Ohio to protect vulnerable populations. The fuel fund should be continued with funding of \$750,000 per year.

In addition, OPAE and Edgemont support the argument of the City of Dayton in its initial brief, at 10-12, that DP&L's current energy efficiency and economic development initiatives are consistent with the policy of the State of Ohio at Revised Code Sections 4928.02(L), (M), and (N) and that the absence of a commitment to continue funding for these initiatives is not consistent with the policy of the State of Ohio. In addition to the policy at Revised Code Section 4928.02 (L) to protect at-risk populations, Revised Code Section 4928.02(M) states the policy of the State to encourage the education of small business owners regarding the use of energy efficiency programs, and Revised Code Section 4928.02(N) states the policy of the State to facilitate the State's effectiveness in the global economy.

As the City of Dayton points out, DP&L has been funding the City of Dayton's energy efficiency audit and implementation program since 2009, but under the proposed ESP, DP&L's funding for the City's energy efficiency program on an annual basis will cease. Just like the absence of a commitment for the fuel fund, there is also no proposed alternative funding for the City's energy efficiency program. Given that the ESP makes no provision for the continued support of the City's energy efficiency program, it is difficult to see how the proposed ESP encourages the use of energy efficiency in conformance with the State's policy at Revised Code Section 4928.02(M).

The City also notes that DP&L has funded efforts to support and attract new investment and improve job growth in Ohio, consistent with Revised Code Section 4928.02(N). Again, the proposed ESP does not provide for such ongoing support; therefore, it cannot be said that the proposed ESP is consistent with the policy of the State of Ohio at Revised Code Section 4928.02(N). DP&L should be required to continue its current efforts to attract new businesses and retain businesses in its service territory in order to conform to the policy of the State of Ohio.

### **III. Conclusion**

DP&L's proposed ESP includes no provision to continue or expand the existing fuel fund approved in DP&L's current ESP. In conformance with Ohio Revised Code Section 4928.02(L), which states that the policy of the State is to protect at-risk populations, the Commission should order DP&L to expand its support for low-income bill payment assistance. The evidence shows that there is a great and increasing need for low-income bill payment assistance in DP&L's service territory. DP&L should be ordered to contribute at least \$750,000 annually to a fuel fund for bill payment assistance for low-income residential customers.

It is also the policy of the State of Ohio to encourage energy efficiency and to facilitate the state's effectiveness in the global economy. Revised Code Sections 4928.02(M) and (N). The ESP as proposed by DP&L does not continue the existing energy efficiency and economic development programs vital to the City of Dayton and therefore does not conform to the State's policy.

The Commission must modify the ESP to assure that it conforms to Ohio law and gives meaning to the legislation that enacted the policy of the State to

protect at-risk populations, to provide bill payment assistance, to promote energy efficiency, and to support economic development in DP&L's service territory.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Colleen Mooney

Colleen L. Mooney  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
Findlay, OH 45840  
Telephone: (419) 425-8860  
[cmooney@ohiopartners.org](mailto:cmooney@ohiopartners.org)

/s/Ellis Jacobs

Ellis Jacobs  
Counsel for Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition  
Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc.  
130 W. Second Street, Suite 700 East  
Dayton, Ohio 45402  
Telephone: (937) 535-4419  
[ejacobs@ablelaw.org](mailto:ejacobs@ablelaw.org)

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Reply Brief was served electronically upon the parties of record identified below in these cases on this 5th day of June 2013.

/s/Colleen Mooney  
Colleen L. Mooney

### SERVICE LIST

Judi L. Sobecki  
Dayton Power and Light Company  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, Ohio 45432  
[judi.sobecki@dplinc.com](mailto:judi.sobecki@dplinc.com)

Charles J. Faruki  
Jeffrey Sharkey  
Faruki Ireland & Cox, P.L.L.  
500 Courthouse Plaza, SW  
Dayton, Ohio 45402  
[cfaruki@ficlaw.com](mailto:cfaruki@ficlaw.com)  
[ishakey@ficlaw.com](mailto:ishakey@ficlaw.com)

David F. Boehm  
Michael L. Kurtz  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  
[dboehm@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:dboehm@BKLawfirm.com)  
[mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com)  
[ikyler@BKLawfirm.com](mailto:ikyler@BKLawfirm.com)

Melissa R. Yost  
Maureen R. Grady  
Office of the Consumers' Counsel  
10 W. Broad Street, 18<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485  
[yost@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:yost@occ.state.oh.us)  
[grady@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:grady@occ.state.oh.us)  
[berger@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:berger@occ.state.oh.us)

Samuel C. Randazzo  
Frank P. Darr  
Matthew R. Pritchard  
Joseph E. Olikier  
McNees Wallace & Nurick  
Fifth Third Center, Suite 1700  
21 East State Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4228  
[jolikder@mwncmh.com](mailto:jolikder@mwncmh.com)  
[sam@mwncmh.com](mailto:sam@mwncmh.com)  
[fdarr@mwncmh.com](mailto:fdarr@mwncmh.com)  
[mpritchard@mwncmh.com](mailto:mpritchard@mwncmh.com)

James F. Lang  
N. Trevor Alexander  
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP  
1400 Key Bank Center  
800 Superior Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44104  
[jlang@calfee.com](mailto:jlang@calfee.com)  
[talexander@calfee.com](mailto:talexander@calfee.com)



M. Howard Petricoff  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease  
52 East Gay Street  
PO Box 1008  
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008  
[mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  
[smhoward@vorys.com](mailto:smhoward@vorys.com)

Richard L. Sites  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 East Broad Street 15<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3620  
[ricks@ohanet.org](mailto:ricks@ohanet.org)

Amy B. Spiller  
Jeanne Kingery  
Duke Energy Retail  
Duke Energy Commercial  
Management  
139 East Fourth Street 1303-Main  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960  
[Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com](mailto:Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com)  
[Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com](mailto:Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com)

Mark Hayden  
First Energy Corp.  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, Ohio 43308-1890  
[haydenm@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:haydenm@firstenergycorp.com)

Anthony Long  
Honda of America Mfg., Inc.  
24000 Honda Parkway  
Marysville, Ohio 43040  
[Tony\\_long@ham.honda.com](mailto:Tony_long@ham.honda.com)  
[asim\\_haque@ham.honda.com](mailto:asim_haque@ham.honda.com)

Matthew W. Warnock  
Thomas Siwo  
Bricker & Eckler  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291  
[warnock@bricker.com](mailto:warnock@bricker.com)  
[tsiwo@bricker.com](mailto:tsiwo@bricker.com)

Thomas J. O'Brien  
Bricker & Eckler  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291  
[tobrien@bricker.com](mailto:tobrien@bricker.com)

Elizabeth Watts  
Rocco D'Ascenzo  
Duke Energy Ohio  
139 East Fourth Street 1303 Main  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960  
[elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com](mailto:elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com)  
[rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com](mailto:rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com)

Jay E. Jadwin  
AEPSC  
155 Nationwide Blvd., Suite 500  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[jejadwin@aep.com](mailto:jejadwin@aep.com)

Robert A. McMahon  
Eberly McMahon LLC  
2321 Kemper Lane, Suite 100  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45206  
[bcmcmahon@emh-law.com](mailto:bcmcmahon@emh-law.com)

Werner Margard  
Thomas McNamee  
Devin Parram  
Attorney General Public Utilities  
180 E. Broad Street, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793  
[Werner.Margard@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Werner.Margard@puc.state.oh.us)  
[Thomas.McNamee@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Thomas.McNamee@puc.state.oh.us)  
[Devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us)

Kimberly W. Boyko  
Joel E. Sechler  
Mallory M. Mohler  
Carpenter Lipps & Leland  
280 North High Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[boyko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:boyko@carpenterlipps.com)  
[sechler@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:sechler@carpenterlipps.com)

Vincent Parisi  
Matthew White  
Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, Ohio 43016  
[vparisi@igsenergy.com](mailto:vparisi@igsenergy.com)  
[mwhite@igsenergy.com](mailto:mwhite@igsenergy.com)

Christopher L. Miller  
Gregory H. Dunn  
Chris Michael  
Ice Miller LLP  
250 West Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[Christopher.miller@icemiller.com](mailto:Christopher.miller@icemiller.com)  
[Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com](mailto:Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com)  
[Chris.michael@icemiller.com](mailto:Chris.michael@icemiller.com)

Bill C. Wells  
Christopher C. Thompson  
Bldg. 266 Area A  
Wright Patterson AFB, Ohio 45433  
[Bill.wells@wpafb.af.mil](mailto:Bill.wells@wpafb.af.mil)  
[Chris.thompson.2@tyndall.af.mil](mailto:Chris.thompson.2@tyndall.af.mil)

Mark A. Whitt  
Andrew J. Campbell  
Gregory L. Williams  
Whitt Sturtevant LLP  
88 East Broad Street, Suite 1590  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com](mailto:whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com)  
[campbell@whitt-sturtevant.com](mailto:campbell@whitt-sturtevant.com)  
[Williams@whitt-sturtevant.com](mailto:Williams@whitt-sturtevant.com)

Matthew J. Satterwhite  
Steven T. Nourse  
AEPSC  
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[mjsatterwhite@aep.com](mailto:mjsatterwhite@aep.com)  
[stnourse@aep.com](mailto:stnourse@aep.com)

Mark S. Yurick  
Zachery D. Kravitz  
Taft Stettinius & Hollister, LLP  
65 E. State Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[myurick@taftlaw.com](mailto:myurick@taftlaw.com)  
[zkravitz@taftlaw.com](mailto:zkravitz@taftlaw.com)

Gregory J. Poulos  
Enernoc, Inc.  
471 E. Broad Street, Suite 1520  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[gpoulos@enernoc.com](mailto:gpoulos@enernoc.com)

Trent A. Dougherty  
Cathryn Loucas  
Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
[trent@theoeg.org](mailto:trent@theoeg.org)  
[cathy@theoeg.org](mailto:cathy@theoeg.org)

Allison Haedt  
Jones Day  
PO Box 165017  
Columbus, Ohio 43216  
[aehaedt@jonesday.com](mailto:aehaedt@jonesday.com)

Robert Ukeiley  
435 R Chesnut Street, Suite 1  
Berea, KY 40403  
[rukeiley@iqc.org](mailto:rukeiley@iqc.org)

Mary W. Christensen  
Christensen Law Office  
8760 Orion Place, Suite 300  
Columbus, Ohio 43240  
[mchristensen@columbus.law.org](mailto:mchristensen@columbus.law.org)

Steven M. Sherman  
Joshua D. Hague  
Grant E. Chapman  
Krieg DeVault, LLP  
One Indiana Square Suite 2800  
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204  
[ssherman@kdlegal.com](mailto:ssherman@kdlegal.com)  
[gchapman@kdlegal.com](mailto:gchapman@kdlegal.com)  
[ihague@kdlegal.com](mailto:ihague@kdlegal.com)

David J. Fein  
Cynthia Brady  
550 W. Washington Blvd. Suite 300  
Chicago, Illinois 60661  
[David.fein@constellation.com](mailto:David.fein@constellation.com)  
[Cynthia.brady@constellation.com](mailto:Cynthia.brady@constellation.com)

Scott C. Solberg  
Eimer Stahl LLP  
224 South Michigan Ave., Suite 1100  
Chicago, Illinois 60604  
[ssolberg@eimerstahl.com](mailto:ssolberg@eimerstahl.com)

David A. Kutik  
Jones Day  
901 Lakeshore Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114  
[dakutik@jonesday.com](mailto:dakutik@jonesday.com)

Matthew R. Cox  
4145 St. Theresa Blvd.  
Avon, Ohio 44011  
[matt@matthewcoxlaw.com](mailto:matt@matthewcoxlaw.com)

Joseph Clark  
Direct Energy Services  
6641 North High Street Suite 200  
Worthington, Ohio 43085  
[joseph.clark@directenergy.com](mailto:joseph.clark@directenergy.com)

Carolyn S. Flahive  
Stephanie M. Chmiel  
Philip B. Sineneng  
Michael L. Dillard  
Thompson & Hine LLP  
41 South High Street, Suite 1700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[Carolyn.Flahive@thompsonhine.com](mailto:Carolyn.Flahive@thompsonhine.com)  
[Stephanie.Chmiel@thompsonhine.com](mailto:Stephanie.Chmiel@thompsonhine.com)  
[Philip.Sineneng@thompsonhine.com](mailto:Philip.Sineneng@thompsonhine.com)  
[Michael.Dillard@thompsonhine.com](mailto:Michael.Dillard@thompsonhine.com)

Tasha Hamilton  
Constellation Energy Group, Inc.  
111 Market Place, Suite. 500  
Baltimore, Maryland 21202  
[tasha.hamilton@constellation.com](mailto:tasha.hamilton@constellation.com)

Stephen Bennet  
State Government Affairs  
300 Exelon Way  
Kennett Square, Pennsylvania 19348  
[Stephen.bennet@exeloncorp.com](mailto:Stephen.bennet@exeloncorp.com)

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**6/5/2013 12:05:15 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 12-0426-EL-SSO, 12-0427-EL-ATA, 12-0428-EL-AAM, 12-0429-EL-WVR, 12-0672-EL-RDR**

Summary: Reply Brief of Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy and the Edgemont  
Neighborhood Coalition electronically filed by Colleen L Mooney on behalf of Ohio Partners  
for Affordable Energy