

## FILE

## PUCO EXHIBIT FILING 2013 APR -9 PM 3: 19

Date of Hearing: March 26, 2013

Case No. 12-426-EL-SSO, et al. - Volume VII

PUCO

**PUCO Case Captions:** 

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of its Market Rate Offer. Case No. 12-426-EL-SSO

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Revised Tariffs. Case No. 12-427-EL-ATA

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority. Case No. 12-428-EL-AAM

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Waiver of Certain Commission Rules. Case No. 12-429-EL-WVR

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company to Establish Tariff Riders. Case No. 12-672-EL-RDR

List of exhibits being filed:

Staff Exhibit 9

Reporter's Signature:	maria L	LiPaolo	Jones	
Submitted by Armstrong			0	
	•	,	_	

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the :

Application of The Dayton :

Power and Light Company : Case No. 12-426-EL-SSO

for Approval of its

Electric Security Plan.

In the Matter of the

Application of the Dayton:

Power and Light Company : Case No. 12-427-EL-ATA

for Approval of Revised

Tariffs.

In the Matter of the

Application of the Dayton:

Power and Light Company : Case No. 12-428-EL-AAM for Approval of Certain :

Accounting Authority.

In the Matter of the

Application of the Dayton:

Power and Light Company : Case No. 12-429-EL-WVR for the Waiver of Certain :

Commission Rules.

In the Matter of the

Application of the Dayton : Case No. 12-672-EL-RDR

Power and Light Company : to Establish Tariff Riders:

PROCEEDINGS

before Mr. Gregory A. Price and Mr. Bryce A.

McKenney, Hearing Examiners, at the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad Street, Room 11-C, Columbus, Ohio, called at 9:00 a.m. on Tuesday,

March 26, 2013.

VOLUME VII

	Comp	any Proposal (65mos.	\$137.5M	SSR)
		Company Market R	ates	
		Attachment TST-3	Attac	hment TST-3a
	E	SP Revenue exceeds		ESP Revenue exceeds
Period	<b> </b>	MRO by:		MRO by:
Jan 13-May 14	\$	194,788,240	\$	92,577,155
June 14 - May 15	\$	118,796,223	\$	46,121,223
June 15 - May 16	\$	106,906,195	\$	34,231,195
June 16 - May 17	\$	98,637,173	\$	25,962,173
June 17 - May 18	\$	109,727,827	Ş	37,052,827
Total	\$	628,855,657	\$	235,944,572

	Comp	any Proposal (65mos.	\$137.5M	SSR)
		Staff Market Rat	es	
		Attachment TST-4		Attachment TST-4a
ي والإمراز الي		SP Revenue exceeds		ESP Revenue exceeds
Period		MRO by:		MRO by:
Jan 13-May 14	\$	194,788,240	\$	92,577,155
June 14 - May 15	\$	117,017,483	\$	44,342,483
June 15 - May 16	\$	99,600,657	\$	26,925,657
June 16 - May 17	\$	94,952,641	\$	22,277,641
June 17 - May 18	\$	106,922,076	\$	34,247,076
Total	\$	613,281,097	\$	220,370,012

											Total itan Chan bastus
	te davers	Under the ESP option verses the MRO option, ratepayers	e ESP option ve	Under the					19,440,000	13,822,395	Total Distribution MWHs =
·									17 Months	12 Months	
\$ 109,727,827		\$ 98,637,173		<u> </u>	\$ 106,906,195		\$118,796,223		\$ 194,788,240		Total (ESP G+SSR+ Yankeel-MRO Rev)
\$ 376,844,004		\$ 379,040,960		J	\$ 381,920,824		\$385,912,401	_	\$ 550,095,560	Non-Shop kwhs)	MRO Revenue (Comparable MRO Rate * Non-Shop kwhs)
\$ 138,500,000		\$ 138,500,000		Ŭ	\$ 138,500,000		\$138,500,000		\$ 194,788,740	Distribution kwhs)	SSR & AER-N revenue (SSR+ AER-N Rate * Distribution kwhs)
\$ 348,071,831		\$ 38,178,132			\$ 350,327,019		\$366,208,623		\$ 550,055,550		ESP G revenue (Comparable ESP Rate * Non-Shop kwits)
7.1185	7.1600 Comparable MRO	7.1600	ble MRO	7.2144 Comparable MRO	7.214	7.2898 Comparable MRO	7.2898	7.3444 Comparable MRO	7.3444	Comparable MRO	C
3.2875	2.5628 Market Rate •	2.5628	ate*	18510 Numet Nate *	1851	1.1602 Market Rate * 30%	1.1602	0.4486 Market Rate * 20%	0.4486	Market Rate * 10%	~
50% 3.8310		4.5972	ate * 60%	Current rate *	5.3634	6.1296 Current rate * 70%	6.1296	6.8958 Current rate • 80%	68958	Current rate * 50%	-
	MRO			M.RO		MRQ		ONIN		MRO	~
	į							,			<b>I</b>
7.5770	Total ESP	7,4090	-		7.61%	Total ESP		Total ESP		Total ESP	
0.9948	923	0.9948	į	<u>&amp;</u>	0.9948	SSR		SSR	0.9948	SSR	
0.0072	0.0072 AER-N (Yankee 1)	0.0072	ankee 1)		0.007	AER-N (Yankee 1)		0.0072 AER-N (Yankee 1)	0.0072	AER-N (Yankee 1)	P
	Comparable ESP	6,4070	S	Comparable ESP	6,6176	Comparable ESP		Comparable ESP	7.3444	Comparable ESP	0
100% 6.5750	-	6.4070	ate • 100%	Market Rate *	4.3190	Market Rate * 70%	2.3204		0.4486 N	Market Rate * 10%	782
0,000	0.0000 Current rate *	0,000	ate . Ox	Current rate	2.2986	4.5972 Current rate * 30%	4.5972	6.8958 Current rate • 60%	6.8958	Current rate 90%	0
	ESP			æ	w-sq	<b>.</b>		e\$9		딿	72
											** Warket rates from RIM-1
9.4949		2		ľ	, see	***************************************	0,0000				2cd revised and the Sub-Net DIAL 2
0.000	0.000	0,000	30		0000	0.004.0	OCCOUNT	934	മനാ	6946	SSR (\$137.5M)
	0.0072		0,0072			0.0072		0.0072		0.0072	AER-N (Yankee 1)
5.25		25.70.0		Ī							
6.5750	7,5630	6 <b>4</b> 070	7.65	2	6 1700	7.5620	01083	7,6620	4 4950	7.56.20	Warket Comparable Total Generation
	2.9030		2 9030			2.909.0		2,9030		2.9030	Fuel
	0.0590		0.0590			0.0590		0.0590	···	0.0590	RPM*
	OETE'0		DETECT.			0.3130		0615.0	*	0.31.30	Transmission (TCRR-B)*
	4.3870		4.3870			4,3870		4.3870	<del></del>	4.3870	Base Generation w/EICC*
Rates**	EŞØ	Rates**	P	les	Rates**	ESP	Rates**	EXP	Rates"	ES\$	т
Market	Proposed	Market	psed	Ргорозе	Warket	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Warket	Proposed	
DP&L	2018 May	DP&L	Nav -	7017 May	1340	2016 May	DP&L	2015 May	D5840	14-May	Category
	2017 June		une	2016 June		2015 June		2014 June		2013 Jan -	
					k₩ħ)	ESP v. MRO (cents per kWh)	ESP v. MI				
Artidelinitetit 131-3											

\$ 613,281,097	riod:	would pay this much more over the 65 month period:	ould pay this much m	£				7,490,000	5,293,868	Total Non-Shop MWHs =
	tepayers	Under the ESP option verses the MRO option, ratepayers	nder the ESP option v	<b>~</b>				19,440,000	13,822,395	Total Distribution MWHs =
					,			17 Months	12 Months	
		ŀ								
\$ 106,922,076		\$ 94,952,641		\$ 99,600,657		\$117,017,483		194,788,240		Total (ESP G+SSR+Yankee1 - MRO Rev)
\$ 374,038,254		\$ 376,584,605		\$ 376,441,670		\$384,133,661		551,466,230	ton-Shop kwhs) \$	MRO Revenue (Comparable NNO Rate * Non-Shop kwhs)
		\$ 138,500,000				\$138,500,000		194,788,240		SSR & AER-N revenue (SSR+ AER-N Rate * Distribution kwins)
\$ 30 AS 33		\$ 333,037,745		to contre		35 A 14		ee 346 330	on-Shon burke)	FSD (spayeous (Comparable FSD Rate * Non-Shoo huke)
7.0655	7.1136 Comparable MRO	7.1136	7.1109 Comparable MRO	7,1100	7.2562 Comparable MRO	7.2562	Comparable MRO	7.3627	Comparable MRO	
3.2345	2.5164 Market Rate * 50%		1.7475 Martiet Rate • 40%	N 527/1	1.1256 Martet Rate * 30%	1126	0.4669 Market Rate * 20%	0.4669	Market Rate * 10%	
3.8310	4.5972 Current rate * 50%		Current rate * 60%	S.3654 C	6.1296 Current rate * 70%		6.8958   Current rate * 80%	6.8958	Current rate * 90%	
	*****		MRO	~	Mac	:	MRO.		MRO	
7.4710	Total ESP	7.2930	Total ESP	7.3781 10	Total ESP	7.8524	Total ESP	8.3647	Total ESP	
0.9948	SSR	0.9948	ž	0.9948 SSR	BSS	0.9948	SSR	0.9948	ESS.	
0.0072	0.0072 AER-N (Yankee 1)	0.0072	AER-N (Yankee 1)	V 220010	AER-N (Yankee 1)	0.0072	AER-N (Yankee 1)		AER-N (Yankee 1)	
6.4690	Comparable ESP	5.2510	Comparable ESP	6.3761 C	Comparable ESP	5,850	Comparable ESP	7.3627	Comparable ESP	
6.4690	Market Rate * 100%	6,2910	Market Rate * 100%	4.0775 M	Market Rate ' 70%	2.2532	Market Rate * 40%		Market Rate ' 10%	
0.0000	0.0000 Current rate * 0%	0.0000	Current rate * 0%	2.2986 C	Current rate * 30%	4.5972	Current rate * 60%		Current rate * 90%	
	453		To the	63	<b>653</b>		63		dS3	
									:	* 2cd revised update Exhibit RIN+2
0.000	0.9948	0.0000	0.9948	0.000	0.9948	0.0000	0.9948	0.0000	0.9948	SSR (\$137.5M)
	0.0072		0.0072		0.0072		0.0072		0.0072	AER-N (Yankee-1)
6.4690	7.6620	6.2910	7.5620	5.8250	7.6620	5.6330	7.6620	4.6690	7.6620	Market Comparable Total Generation
	2.9090		2.9030		2.9030		2.9030		2,9030	Fue!*
	0.05.90	<del>,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,</del>	0.00	<del>- 1</del> -	0.0590		06301		0.0590	SAMA
	CEIE D		0.870	T	1 50 72	<del></del>	4.36/0		0.2120	Transmission (TCBB_RI*
			1400	<del></del>	200		a constant		. 200	Bree Cooperation w/GITT#
Rates	æ	Rates	ESP ESP	Rates	딿	Rates	ESP	Rates	<b>ξ</b>	
Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	•
¥	2017 June	Staff	2016 June	Staff	2015 June 2016 May	Staff	2014 June   2015 May	Staff	2013 Jan -	Category
				<i>(h)</i>	ESP v. MRO (cents per kWh)	ESP v. MRO				
- 101 Marian										

Attachment TST-4

Current rate         US         0.000         current rate         OS         0.000           Comparable ESP         6.4070         Market Rake * 100%         6.5750         6.5750           CAPA (Yankee 1)         0.0072         AER-M (Yankee 1)         0.0072           SSR         0.9948         SSR         0.9948           Total ESP         7.4990         Total ESP         7.4990           MRO         MRO         7.4990         Total ESP         7.5770           Market Rate *         40%         2.5628         Market Rate * 50%         3.8310           Market Rate *         40%         2.5628         Market Rate * 50%         3.2875           Comparable MRO         7.1600         Comparable MRO         7.1185           RSC         0.5258         Total MRO         7.6433           Total MRO         7.6658         Total MRO         \$ 348,071,831           \$ 379,040,960         \$ 37,052,844,004         \$ 72,675,000           \$ 25,962,173         \$ 37,052,827           Under the ESP option verses the MRO option, rate payers         \$ 37,052,827		\$ 350,3 \$ 134,5 \$ 34,2		\$ 46,121,223		\$ 92,577,155 17 Months 19,440,000	12 Months 13,822,395	Total Distribution MWHs +
6.4070 Comparable ESP  0.0072 AER.N (Yankee 1) 0.9948 SSR 7.4090 Total ESP  2.5628 Maro 4.5972 Current rate ' 50% 3 2.5628 Market Rate ' 50% 3 7.1600 Comparable MRO 7.6858 Total MRO 7.6858 Total MRO 399,040,960 \$ 376,844 72,675,000 \$ 37,684	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP Current rate * 60% Market Rate * 40% Comparable MRO RSC Total MRO	\$ 30,3 \$ 136,5 \$ 72,6	bearmed	\$ 46,121,223			12 Months	
6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 6.4070 Comparable ESP 0.0072 AER N (Yankee 1) 0.9948 SSR 7.4990 Total ESP  7.4990 Total ESP  MRO 4.5972 Current rate * 50% 3.2.5628 Market Rake * 50% 3.2.5628 Market Rake * 50% 3.7.1600 Comparable MRO 7.6858 Total MRO 7.6858 Total MRO 3.99,178,132 \$ 348,0 138,1 138,	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP Current rate * 60% Market Rate * 40% Comparable MRO RSC Total MRO	\$ 350,3 \$ 381,9 \$ 34,2	<b>Transmit</b>	\$ 46,121,223				
6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 7.4090 Total ESP 7.4090 Total ESP 7.1600 Comparable MRO 7.1600 Comparable MRO 7.16858 Total MRO 7.6858 Total MRO 379,040,960 \$ 376,844 72,675,000 \$ 576,844	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP  Current rate 60% Market Rake 40% Comparable MRO RSC Total MRO	\$ 350,3	•	AND C 10171 C		•	lev - MRO RSC)	Total (ESP G + ESP SSR+ Yankee1 - MRO Rev - MRO RSC)
6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 6.4070 Comparable ESP 0.0972 AER, N (Yankee 1) 0.9949 SSR 7.4990 Total ESP MIRO 4.5972 Current rate * 50% 3.2.5628 Market Rake * 50% 3.2.5628 Market Rake * 50% 7.1600 Comparable MIRO 7.5858 Total MIRO 7.6858 Total MIRO 399,178,132 138,500,000 5 376,844 5 376,844	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP  Current rate * 60% Market Rake * 40% Comparable MRO RSC Total MRO	\$ 28.5 \$ 2		KW X2 LL 3		\$ 102,211,086		MRORSC (RSC * Distribution kwhs)
6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 6.4070 Comparable ESP 0.0072 AER N (Yankee 1) 0.9948 SSR 7.4990 Total ESP  7.4990 Total ESP  4.5972 Current rate * 50% 3.2.5628 Market Rake * 50% 3.7.1600 Comparable MRO 7.6858 Total MRO 7.6858 Total MRO 3.38,178,132 5.48,0	ACR-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP Current rate * 60% Market Rate * 40% Comparable MRO RSC Total MRO	\$ 350,3		\$385,912,401		\$ \$50,095,560	'Non-Shap kwhs)	MRO Revenue (Comparable MRO Rate "Non-Shop kwhs)
6.4070 Market Rake * 100% 6.4070 Comparable ESP 0.0072 AER-N (Yankee 1) 0.9948 SSR 7.4990 Total ESP  MRO 4.5972 Current rate * 50% 3.2.5628 Market Rate * 50% 7.6858 Total MRO 7	AGR-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP  Current rate * 60% Market Rake * 40% Comparable MRO RSC Total MRO			\$138,500,000			* Distribution kwhs)	SSR & AER-N revenue (SSR+ AER-N Raie * Distribution kwhs)
50 SS	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP MRO Current rate * Market Rake * Comparable MRO RSC Total MRO			ECY 802 1925 5		\$ 550,095,560	Von-Shop kwitsi	ESP G revenue (Comparable ESP Rate * Non-Shoo kwhs)
	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP MRO Current rate * Comparable MRO RSC		7.8156 Total MRO	7.8156	7.8702 Total MRO	7.8702	Total MRO	
55 SS	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP MRO Current rate * Market Rate * Comparable MRO		RSC	0.5258	RSC	0.5258	RSC	73
	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP MIRO Currentrate * Market Rate *		Comparable MRO	7.2898	Comparable MRO	7.3444	Comparable MRO	
50x	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP MIRO Current rate *		Market Rate * 30%	1.1602	Market Rate * 20%	0.4486	Market Rate * 10%	
<b>1</b>	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP	7.6136	Current rate * 70%	6.1296	Current rate * 80%	6.8958	Current rate * 90%	
Market Rate* 100%  Comparable ESP  AER-N (Yankee 1)  SSR  Total ESP	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR Total ESP	0.9948 7.6196	CUM		OSW		MRO	
Market Rate * 100%  Comparable ESP  AER-N (Yankee 1)  SSR  Total ESP	SSR Some (Yankee 1) Total ESP	7.6196						
Market Rate * 100%  Comparable ESP  AER-N (Yankee 1)  SSR	AER-N (Yankee 1) SSR	0.9948	Total ESP	79196	Total ESP	8.3464	Total ESP	
Market Rate * 100%  Comparable ESP  AER-N (Yankee 1)	AER-N (Yankee 1)			0.9946	SSR	0.9948	SSR	5
Comparable ESP		0.0072		0.0072	AER-N (Yankee 1)	0.0072	AER-N (Yankee 1)	
<b>X</b> 00X	Comparable ESP	6.6176	Comparable ESP	6.9176	Comparable ESP	7.3444	Comparable ESP	
ş	4.3190 Market Rate * 100%	70% 4.3190	Market Rate	2.3204	Market Rate * 40%	0.4486	Market Rate * 10%	
₹	2.2986 Current rate * 0%		Currentrate * 30%	4.5972	Current rate 1 60%	6.8958	Current rate * 90%	
653	ESP		eSb		e£3	,	esc.	
								** Narket rates from RJM-1
7177		90000		4		5.5	9,55,75	* 2rd revised undate Exhibit RIM-2
0.5250	Ī	8505.0		0520	0.4048	0 5258	0 9000	SSR (ESP) or RSC (MRO)
0.0077	0.0072		0.0072		0.0072		0.0077	AER-N (Yankee 1)
9.40/V	1,000	o.T.o.	Property of	citios	7,0000	4,4000	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	Ment Comberant tries of Icianon
0606.7				7 0040	7 COM	4 4000	Mens: 4.	Fue
7.000	) oneo		1 635		3 020		) man	A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR
O. Trop	2 2500		0 7600		0.0500		0.000	DDV.
2147	กลเล		0.2120		0.3130		0.515.0	Transmission (TCRR-8)*
	A 3870		4 44 7		ULAR V		W.R. V	Rate Constraint w/FICC
ESP	ESP	Rates**	ESP	Rates**	සු	Rates**	ESP	
_	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Warket	Proposed	
DP&L 2018 Nay DP&L	2017 May	138d	2016 May	DP2H	2015 May	DP&L	14-Ntay	Category
2017 June	2016 June		3015 June		2014 June		2013 Jan -	
		rkWh)	ESP v. MRO (cents per kWh)	ESP v. M.				
Attachment 151-56								

\$ 220,370,012	eriod:	would pay this much more over the 65 month period:	old pay this much m	<b>*</b> /				7,490,000	5,293,868	Total Non-Shop MWHs ==
	alepayers	Under the ESP option verses the MRO option, ratepayers	nder the ESP option \	Ç				19,440,000	13,822,395	Total Distribution MWHs =
								17 Months	12 Months	
\$ 34,247,076		\$ 22,277,641		\$ 26,925,657	سننو	\$ 44,342,483		\$ 92,577,155	<b></b>	Total (ESP G + ESP SSR+ Yankee1 - MRO Rev - MRO RSC)
\$ 72,675,000		\$ 72,675,000		\$ 72,675,000		\$ 72,675,000		\$ 102,211,086	<b>1</b>	MRO RSC [RSC * Distribution kwhs]
\$ 374,038,254		\$ 376,584,605		\$ 376,441,670		\$384,133,661		\$ 551,466,230		MAO Revenue (Comparable MRO Rate * Non-Shop kwhs)
				\$ 128,500,000		300,002,861,5				SSR & AER-N revenue (SSR+ AER-N Rate * Distribution kwhs)
\$ 342,460,331		\$ 333,037,245		\$ 337,542,327		\$362,651,144		\$ 551,466,230		ESP G revenue (Comparable ESP Rate * Non-Shop kwhs)
7.5913	7.6394 Total MRO	7.6394	Total MRO	7.6357 10	7.7820 Total MRO	7.7820	Total MRO	7.8885	Total MRO	
0.5258	RSC	0.5258	Ò	0.5258 RSC	BKC .	0.528	32	0.5258	<i>₹</i>	
7.0655	Comparable MRO	7.1136	Comparable MRO		Comparable MRD	7.2562	Comparable MRO	7.3627	Comparable MRO	
3.2345	Market Rate * 50%	2.5164	Market Rate * 40%	1.7475 Ma	Market Rate 7 30%	1.1266	Market Rate * 20%	0.4669	Market Rate 10%	
3.8310	Current rate • 50%	4.5972	Current rate * 60%	5,3834 (2)	Current rate * 70%	61296	Current rate * 80%	6.8958	Current rate * 90%	
	MRO		8	ORIN	ONW		OWIN		MRO	
									1	
7.4710	Total ESP		Total ESP		Total ESP		Total ESP	8.3647	Total ESP	
0.9948	SSR	0.9948	<b>73</b>		SSR		SSR		SSR	
0.0072	0.0072 AER-N (Yankee 1)	0.0072	AER-N (Yankee 1)		AER-N (Yankee 1)		AER-N (Yankee 1)	0.0072	AER-N (Yankee L)	
6.4690	Comparable ESP	6.2910	70		Comparable ESP		₹6		Comparable ESP	
		6.2910	_	4.0775 Ma		2.2532				
0.0000	0.0000 Current rate * 0%		Current rate " 0%	22560 Ca	Current rate * 30%	4.5972	Current rate ' 60%	6.89%	Currentrate 90%	
	esa		9	453	453		63		453	
						¥				<ul> <li>2cd revised update Exhibit RIM-2</li> </ul>
0.5258		0.5258	0.9948	0.5258	0.9948	0.5258	0.9948	0.5258	0.9948	SSR (ESP) or RSC (MRO)
	0.0072		0.0072		0.0972		0.0072		0.0072	AER-N (Yankee-1)
6.4690	7.6620	6.2910	7.6630	5.8250	7.6620	5.6330	7.6620	4,6690	7.6620	Market Comparable Total Generation
	2.9030		2,9030	1	2.9030		2,9030		2,9030	Fige!
	0.000		0.000	Ţ	0.000		O PEOP		o ocen	DOMAN CO
	Carre D		0.3130	T	218		0.31.50		CE EE	Transmission (TCRR-A)*
	4.3870		0.35.7	1	4.887		4,3870		4.3870	Base Generation w/EVC*
Rates	\$3	Rates	ESP	Rates	ESP	Rates	ESP	Rates	ESP	
Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	Market	Proposed	
Staff	2018 May	Staff	2017 May	Staff	2016 May	Staff	2015 May	Staff	2014 Nay	Category
	2017 June		2016 June		2015 June		anul MOX		- wer 6102	
				<b>*</b>	ESP v. MRO (cents per kWh)	SP v. MRO	LL)			-
Attachment (51-4a	A									

Attachment TST-4a

MRO scenario as assumed in Attachment TST-2(a) ratepayers would pay

\$79,418,355 more over a three period.

4 13. Q. What is your conclusion from the analysis presented in Attachment TST-3?

A. Based on Attachment TST-3, and as summarized above, the ESP as proposed by the Company is not more favorable than the blended MRO utilizing the stated assumptions by the Company and the forecasted market rates as determined by the Company. If DP&L pursued the ESP option verses the MRO option, ratepayers would pay \$ 628,855,657 more over a 65 month period. If DP&L pursued the ESP option versus the MRO option and the RSC is included under the MRO scenario as assumed in Attachment TST-3(a) ratepayers would pay \$235,944,572 more over a 65 month period.

A.

14. Q. What is your conclusion from the analysis presented in Attachment TST-4?

Based on Attachment TST-4, and as summarized above, the ESP as proposed by the Company is not more favorable than the blended MRO utilizing the stated assumptions by the Company and the forecasted market rates as determined by Staff witness Windle. If DP&L pursued the ESP option verses the MRO option, ratepayers would pay \$ 613,281,097 more over a 65 month period. If DP&L pursued the ESP option versus the MRO option and the RSC is included under the MRO scenario as assumed in

Attachment TST-4(a) ratepayers would pay \$220,370,012 more over a 65 month period.

3

12

18

19

20

21

- 4 15. Q. Do you have any recommendations?
- A. I have performed quantitative analyses on the comparison of the ESP and

  MRO and the analyses indicates that the ESP is not more favorable than an

  MRO on a quantitative basis in any of the four scenarios/analyses. To

  change the outcome in order to ensure that the ESP is more favorable in the

  aggregate than an MRO, the Commission can either reduce the SSR rate

  proposed by Staff, conclude that the Staff-projected market rates are too

  high, and/or consider other qualitative benefits of the ESP.

## <u>Issue 2 – Phase Out of the Maximum Charge Provisions</u>

- 13 16. Q. The Applicant is proposing to phase out the maximum charge provision
  14 that is currently applicable to GS Secondary and GS Primary customers as
  15 addressed by DP&L Witness Parke. In addition, the Applicant is proposing
  16 to exclude the maximum charge provision completely from Riders TCRR17 N, CB, and SSR. Does Staff support this proposal?
  - A. No, Staff does not support this proposal. Phasing out the maximum charge provision as proposed as well as excluding the provision from certain riders will result in substantial increases to low load factor customers that are subject to the maximum charge provision. As a result, the Staff