

**BEFORE**  
**THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc., for an Increase in Gas	)	Case No. 12-1685-GA-AIR
Rates.	)	

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Tariff Approval	)	Case No. 12-1686-GA-ATA

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval of an	)	
Alternative Rate Plan for Gas Distribution	)	Case No. 12-1687-GA-ALT
Service.	)	

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval to	)	Case No. 12-1688-GA-AAM
Change Accounting Methods.	)	

---

**MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**  
**BY**  
**THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

---

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") hereby moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO") for a protective order regarding information asserted to be confidential by Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. ("Duke").<sup>1</sup> As part of the discovery process in this proceeding, Duke provided information to OCC, subject to a protective agreement, and Duke asserts that this information constitutes trade secret information under Ohio law.

OCC hereby requests that, in accordance with Ohio Adm. Code. 4901-1-02(E), the PUCO issue such order as is necessary to protect the undisclosed (redacted) portions

---

<sup>1</sup> This Motion is filed pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-02(E), 4901-1-12 and 4901-1-24(D).

of the Direct Testimony of OCC witnesses James R. Campbell and James E. Gould that Duke asserts to be confidential. Subject to OCC's rights under the protective agreement, OCC is filing the Direct Testimony of OCC witnesses James R. Campbell and James E. Gould under seal, and is also filing a public version that shows all information Duke does not claim to be confidential.

By filing the instant Motion, OCC does not concede that the information constitutes trade secret information. However, OCC acknowledges that it has obtained this information pursuant to a protective agreement with Duke that provides for such information to be treated as confidential and protected (subject to OCC's right under the protective agreement to initiate a process for the PUCO to rule whether the information deserves confidential treatment under Ohio law).

The grounds for this Motion are more fully described in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

BRUCE J. WESTON  
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

/s/ Larry S. Sauer

Larry S. Sauer, Counsel of Record  
Joseph P. Serio  
Edmund Berger  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

**Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel**

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485  
Telephone: Sauer – (614) 466-1312  
Telephone: Serio – (614) 466-9565  
Telephone: Berger – (614) 466-1292  
[sauer@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:sauer@occ.state.oh.us)  
[serio@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:serio@occ.state.oh.us)  
[berger@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:berger@occ.state.oh.us)

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc., for an Increase in Gas	)	Case No. 12-1685-GA-AIR
Rates.	)	

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Tariff Approval	)	Case No. 12-1686-GA-ATA

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval of an	)	
Alternative Rate Plan for Gas Distribution	)	Case No. 12-1687-GA-ALT
Service.	)	

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval to	)	Case No. 12-1688-GA-AAM
Change Accounting Methods.	)	

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

---

OCC files this Motion for Protective Order (“Motion”) contemporaneously with the filing of the Direct Testimony of witnesses James R. Campbell and James E. Gould. In filing this Motion, OCC does not concede that the information in the Direct Testimony of OCC witnesses James R. Campbell or James E. Gould is trade secret information pursuant to R.C. 1333.61(D) and does not concede that the information is deserving of protection from public revelation under Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D).

OCC understands that Duke considers the undisclosed (redacted) information to be confidential and deserving of the protection of trade secret information as defined in R.C. 1333.61(D). OCC’s understanding is based on claims by Duke that the information (1) derives economic value, actual or potential, from not being known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by others, and (2) is the subject of efforts that are

reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.<sup>2</sup> Under the assertions made by Duke, at this time, confidential treatment of the redacted information in the Direct Testimony of OCC witnesses James R. Campbell and James E. Gould would be appropriate, subject to OCC's rights under its protective agreement with Duke to initiate a process to determine whether the information should be protected.

In addition, OCC is filing a public version of the Direct Testimony of witnesses James R. Campbell and James E. Gould so that all information Duke does not claim to be confidential is accessible for the public's review. The public versions do not contain information that was asserted by Duke to be confidential.

For the foregoing reasons and subject to the foregoing reservations of rights, this Motion should be granted at this time.

Respectfully submitted,

BRUCE J. WESTON  
OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

*/s/ Larry S. Sauer*

---

Larry S. Sauer, Counsel of Record  
Joseph P. Serio  
Edmund Berger  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

**Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel**  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485  
Telephone: Sauer – (614) 466-1312  
Telephone: Serio – (614) 466-9565  
Telephone: Berger – (614) 466-1292  
[sauer@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:sauer@occ.state.oh.us)  
[serio@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:serio@occ.state.oh.us)  
[berger@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:berger@occ.state.oh.us)

---

<sup>2</sup> See R.C. 1333.61(D).

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Motion for Protective Order* by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel has been served upon those persons listed below via electronic mail this 25th day of February 2013.

/s/ Larry S. Sauer

Larry S. Sauer  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

### **SERVICE LIST**

Samuel C. Randazzo  
Frank P. Darr  
Joseph E. Olikar  
Matthew R. Pritchard  
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC  
21 East State Street, 17TH Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Amy B. Spiller  
Rocco O. D'Ascenzo  
Jeanne W. Kingery  
Elizabeth H. Watts  
Duke Energy Business Services, LLC  
139 East Fourth Street 1303 Main  
P.O. Box 961  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960

Thomas McNamee  
Devin Parram  
Attorneys General  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 East Broad Street 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

A. Brian McIntosh  
McIntosh & McIntosh  
1136 Saint Gregory Street, Suite 100  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Douglas E. Hart  
441 Vine Street, Suite 4192  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Colleen L. Mooney  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
Findlay, Ohio 45840

Thomas J. O'Brien  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291

Mark S. Yurick  
Zachary D. Kravitz  
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP  
65 East State Street Suite 1000  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Kimberly W. Bojko  
Mallory M. Mohler  
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  
280 North High Street  
Suite 1300  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Vincent Parisi  
Matthew White  
Interstate Gas Supply Inc.  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, Ohio 43016

M. Howard Petricoff  
Stephen M. Howard  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
52 East Gay Street  
PO Box 1008  
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

Andrew J. Sonderman  
Kegler, Brown, Hill & Ritter LPA  
Capitol Square, suite 1800  
65 East State Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

[Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com](mailto:Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com)  
[Elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com](mailto:Elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com)  
[Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com](mailto:Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com)  
[Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com](mailto:Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com)  
[sam@mwncmh.com](mailto:sam@mwncmh.com)  
[fdarr@mwncmh.com](mailto:fdarr@mwncmh.com)  
[joliker@mwncmh.com](mailto:joliker@mwncmh.com)  
[mpritchard@mwncmh.com](mailto:mpritchard@mwncmh.com)  
[Thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us)  
[Devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us)  
[brian@mcintoshlaw.com](mailto:brian@mcintoshlaw.com)  
[dhart@douglasshart.com](mailto:dhart@douglasshart.com)  
[cmooney2@columbus.rr.com](mailto:cmooney2@columbus.rr.com)  
[tobrien@bricker.com](mailto:tobrien@bricker.com)  
[myurick@taftlaw.com](mailto:myurick@taftlaw.com)  
[zkravitz@taftlaw.com](mailto:zkravitz@taftlaw.com)  
[bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  
[mohler@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:mohler@carpenterlipps.com)  
[vparisi@igsenergy.com](mailto:vparisi@igsenergy.com)  
[mswhite@igsenergy.com](mailto:mswhite@igsenergy.com)  
[mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  
[smhoward@vorys.com](mailto:smhoward@vorys.com)  
[asonderman@keglerbrown.com](mailto:asonderman@keglerbrown.com)

AEs: [Katie.stenman@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Katie.stenman@puc.state.oh.us)  
[Christine.Pirik@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Christine.Pirik@puc.state.oh.us)

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**2/25/2013 3:56:22 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 12-1685-GA-AIR, 12-1686-GA-ATA, 12-1687-GA-ALT, 12-1688-GA-AAM**

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel electronically filed by Patti Mallarnee on behalf of Sauer, Larry S.