# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., for the Establishment of a Charge Pursuant to Revised Code Section 4909.18.	)	Case No. 12-2400-EL-UNC
In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval to Change Accounting Methods.	)	Case No. 12-2401-EL-AAM
In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., for the Approval of a Tariff for a New Service.	)	Case No. 12-2402-EL-ATA

## COMMENTS OF CITY OF CINCINNATI

### **INTRODUCTION**

Pursuant to the October 3, 2012 Attorney Examiner's Entry, the City of Cincinnati ("City) respectfully submits comments regarding Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.'s ("Duke") application to establish the amount of a cost-based charge, pursuant to a state compensation mechanism, for the provision of capacity services by Duke throughout its service territory.

### **COMMENTS**

On October 4, 2012, the City joined with nine other intervening parties filing a Joint Motion to Dismiss ("Motion"), one day after the Attorney Examiner issued the procedural schedule calling for comments on Dukes application from the staff and intervenors. That Joint Motion was intended, at least from the perspective of the City, to be dispositive of this Case. Rather than burden the record with a complete replication of that Joint Motion, the City hereby adopts as its Comments the Memorandum in Support of the Joint Motion to Dismiss, filed along with the October 4, 2012

Motion to Dismiss.

## **CONCLUSION**

The City of Cincinnati urges the Commission to grant the intervening parties' Joint Motion to

Dismiss for the reasons set forth in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted on behalf of

CITY OF CINCINNATI

Thomas J. O'Brien

BRICKER & ECKLER LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291 Telephone: (614) 227-2335 Facsimile: (614) 227-2390

E-mail: tobrien@bricker.com

5990434v1 2

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing COMMENTS was served upon the parties of record listed below this  $2^{nd}$  day of January 2013 *via* electronic mail.

Thomas J. O'Brien

Amy B. Spiller
Rocco D'Ascenzo
Elizabeth H. Watts
Jeanne W. Kingery
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.
139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960
Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com
Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com
Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
Elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

Maureen Grady
Kyle L. Kern
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
grady@occ.state.oh.us
kern@occ.state.oh.us

Colleen L. Mooney Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy 231 West Lima Street Findlay, OH 45839-1793 cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Jody M. Kyler
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com
mkrtz@BKLlawfirm.com
jkyler@BKLlawfirm.com

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Oliker
Matthew R. Pritchard
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17TH Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Kimberly W. Bojko Mallory M. Mohler Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP 280 North High Street, Suite 1300 Columbus, OH 43215 bojko@carpenterlipps.com mohler@carpenterlipps.com

Douglas E. Hart 441 Vine Street, Suite 4192 Cincinnati, OH 45202 dhart@douglasehart.com

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1405 East Sixth Street
Cleveland, OH 44114
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

5990434v1 3

Gary A. Jeffries Dominion Resources Services, Inc. 501 Marindale Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817 Gary.a.jeffries@dom.com

Lawrence W. Thompson Karen Campbell Energy Strategies, Inc. 525 South Main Street, Suite 900 Tulsa, OK 74103-4510 <a href="mailto:thompson@energy-strategies.com">thompson@energy-strategies.com</a> kcampbell@energy-strategies.com

David Stahl Eimer Stahl LLP 224 S. Michigan Ave., Suite 1100 Chicago, IL 60604 dstahl@eimerstahl.com

M. Howard Petricoff
Lija Kaleps-Clark
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
PO Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
lkalepscark@vorys.com

David I. Fein
Cynthia Fonner Brady
Constellation Energy Group, Inc.
550 W. Washington Blvd., Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60661
David.fein@constellation.com
Cynthia.brady@constellation.com

Stephen Bennett
Exelon Corporation
300 Exelon Way
Kennett Square, PA 19348
Stephen.bennett@exeloncorp.com

Mark A. Hayden FirstEnergy Service Company 76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308 haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

Jay E. Jadwin
Yazen Alami
American Electric Power Service Corp.
155 Nationwide Blvd.
Columbus, OH 43215
jejadwin@aep.com
yalami@aep.com

Thomas W. Craven Wausau Paper Corp 200 Paper Place Mosinee, WI 54455-9009 tcraven@wausauper.com

Steve Beeler
John Jones
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us
john.jones@puc.state.oh.us

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
American Electric Power Service Corp.
155 Nationwide Blvd.
Columbus, OH 43215
<a href="mailto:stnourse@aep.com">stnourse@aep.com</a>
<a href="mailto:mjsatterwhite@aep.com">mjsatterwhite@aep.com</a>

Joseph G. Strines DPL Energy Resources Inc. 1065 Woodman Drive Dayton, OH 45432 Joseph.strines@dplinc.com

5990434v1 4

Judi Sobecki
Randall V. Griffin
Dayton Power & Light Company
1065 Woodmand Strive
Dayton, OH 45432
Judi.sobecki@dplinc.com
Randall.griffin@dplinc.com

Rick D. Chamberlain Behrens, Wheeler & Chamberlain 6 N.E. 63<sup>rd</sup> Street, Suite 400 Oklahoma City, OK 73105 Rdc\_law@swbell.net

Kevin J. Osterkamp Roetzel & Andress LPA PNC Plaza, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor 155 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215 kosterkamp@ralaw.com Kimberly W. Bojko
Mallory M. Mohler
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
bojko@carpenterlipps.com
mohler@carpenterlipps.com

Barth E. Royer Bell & Royer Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927 barthroyer@aol.com

5990434v1

5

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

1/2/2013 3:57:54 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-2400-EL-UNC, 12-2401-EL-AAM, 12-2402-EL-ATA

Summary: Comments electronically filed by Teresa Orahood on behalf of CITY OF CINCINNATI