

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

<b>In the Matter of the Application of Ohio</b>	)	
<b>Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric</b>	)	<b>Case Nos. 12-2190-EL-POR</b>
<b>Illuminating Company, and The Toledo</b>	)	<b>12-2191-EL-POR</b>
<b>Edison Company For Approval of Their</b>	)	<b>12-2192-EL-POR</b>
<b>Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand</b>	)	
<b>Reduction Portfolio Plans for 2013 through</b>	)	
<b>2015</b>	)	

---

**MOTION TO INTERVENE  
BY THE  
ADVANCED ENERGY ECONOMY OHIO**

---

For the reasons set forth in the accompanying Memorandum in Support, Advanced Energy Economy Ohio moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio for leave to intervene in the above-captioned case pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 4903.221 and Ohio Administrative Code 4901-1-11, and to grant to the Advanced Energy Economy Ohio the full powers and rights specifically authorized by statute or by the provisions of the Ohio Administrative Code.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Todd M. Williams  
Todd M. Williams, Counsel of Record (0083647)  
*Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC*  
Two Maritime Plaza, Third Floor  
Toledo, Ohio 43604  
Telephone: (567) 225-3330  
Fax: (567) 225-3329  
E-mail: [toddm@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:toddm@wamenergylaw.com)

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

<b>In the Matter of the Application of Ohio</b>	)	
<b>Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric</b>	)	<b>Case Nos. 12-2190-EL-POR</b>
<b>Illuminating Company, and The Toledo</b>	)	<b>12-2191-EL-POR</b>
<b>Edison Company For Approval of Their</b>	)	<b>12-2192-EL-POR</b>
<b>Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand</b>	)	
<b>Reduction Portfolio Plans for 2013 through</b>	)	
<b>2015</b>	)	

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO INTERVENE OF THE  
ADVANCED ENERGY ECONOMY OHIO**

---

**I. Introduction**

The Advanced Energy Economy Ohio (AEE Ohio) seeks intervention in this proceeding where the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, the Toledo Edison Company and the Ohio Edison Company (collectively “FirstEnergy” or “Companies”) have submitted energy efficiency program plans for implementation over the 2013-2015 period. AEE Ohio seeks to participate in this proceeding because AEE Ohio and its members may be adversely affected by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“PUCO” or “Commission”) rulings in these matters. The portfolio plan and subsequent proceedings will present several issues regarding FirstEnergy’s interaction with customers and the provision to customers of energy efficiency services. These and other issues, which are a part of this proceeding, may directly impact the AEE Ohio’s interests in positioning Ohio as a world-leader in the development and manufacturing of clean energy and associated technologies, and the interests of Advanced Energy Economy Ohio’s members engaged in these industries. As such, AEE Ohio is entitled to intervene in this proceeding.

## II. Legal Standard

Ohio law states that a party may intervene in a Commission proceeding if that party “may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding.”<sup>1</sup> In the determination of whether a party may be adversely affected for purposes of intervention, the Commission is required to evaluate:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor’s interest;
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings;
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.<sup>2</sup>

The Commission’s rules similarly provide that any person may intervene where “[t]he person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding.”<sup>3</sup> The PUCO regulations set forth the same four standards that are established in Ohio Revised Code 4903.221(B) for determining whether a party may be “adversely affected,” and also purport to add a fifth factor regarding “the extent to which the person’s interest is represented by existing parties.”<sup>4</sup>

As the Ohio Supreme Court has held, intervention in Commission proceedings “ought to be liberally allowed so that the positions of all persons with a real and substantial interest in the proceedings can be considered by the [Commission].”<sup>5</sup> The Commission has consistently maintained a policy to “encourage the broadest possible participation” in its proceedings, even

---

<sup>1</sup> R.C. 4903.221.

<sup>2</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B).

<sup>3</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(A)(2).

<sup>4</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B).

<sup>5</sup> *Ohio Consumers’ Counsel v. Pub. Util Comm’n of Ohio* (2006), 111 Ohio St. 3d 384, 388, 2006 Ohio 5853, 856 N.E.2d 940.

under extenuating circumstances.<sup>6</sup> AEE Ohio satisfies these liberal intervention standards and respectfully requests that its intervention be granted in these cases.

**III. AEE Ohio is entitled to intervene under §4903.221 because the organization and its members “may be adversely affected” by the outcome of this proceeding.**

AEE Ohio is entitled to intervene in this proceeding because AEE Ohio satisfies each of the four statutory factors demonstrating that the organization and its members “may be adversely affected” by the outcome. First, the nature and extent of AEE Ohio’s interests in the proceeding is real and substantial,<sup>7</sup> as the issues involved herein are directly related to AEE Ohio’s interests in promoting energy efficiency and will have direct economic impact on AEE Ohio’s members and mission in Ohio.

AEE Ohio is an Ohio-based organization representing a wide range of advanced energy businesses, with some members involved directly in renewable energy and related industries. AEE Ohio is the premier network of businesses and business leaders advancing renewable energy, energy efficiency and clean energy technology through effective communications, broad advocacy and business development.<sup>8</sup> AEE Ohio’s members have a financial interest in the development and expansion of the technology and equipment employed in distributed generation.

This proceeding presents issues that are directly relevant to the interests of AEE Ohio and its members. For example, the Companies will be proposing a host of energy efficiency programs to be implemented over the next 3 years. Ensuring that FirstEnergy programs are soundly constructed and developed will have a direct impact on the amount and effectiveness of

---

<sup>6</sup> See e.g. *In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company*, 2009 WL 322883 at 1, Ohio PUC February 5, 2009 (Commission granted motion to intervene in light of policy to encourage participation, despite party’s failure to file within the deadline).

<sup>7</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B)(1).

<sup>8</sup> For more information, please see the OBCCE website at: <http://ohiobusinesscouncil.com/>.

energy efficiency measures in FirstEnergy's service territory. As such, the interests of AEE Ohio in this proceeding stem from the direct and indirect impacts specific issue outcomes will have on the energy capacity of the State of Ohio and surrounding areas.

Second, the desire of AEE Ohio to promote energy efficiency in Ohio is directly related to the issues of this case. Specifically, this case directly involves energy efficiency program development over a period of three years. Such programming will impact AEE Ohio's members.

Third, AEE Ohio's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay the proceeding<sup>9</sup> as this motion is being filed by the deadline set for intervention<sup>10</sup> and AEE Ohio is able to comply with all case management deadlines established by the Commission and/or agreed to by the parties.

Fourth, intervention by AEE Ohio will significantly contribute to the full development of the record in this proceeding.<sup>11</sup> AEE Ohio will bring significant expertise to bear in this proceeding. AEE Ohio's members have extensive experience in all aspects of clean energy and renewable policy, energy efficiency, equipment and deployment. As such, AEE Ohio should be permitted to intervene pursuant to Ohio Revised Code §4903.221.

**IV. AEE Ohio may intervene because AEE Ohio and its members have a “real and substantial interest” in the proceeding as presented in Ohio Administrative Code 4901-1-11(B).**

AEE Ohio may also intervene in this proceeding because they satisfy each of the five factors listed in the PUCO rules demonstrating that they have a “real and substantial interest” in the proceeding.<sup>12</sup> The first four factors are identical to those set forth under §4903.221(B) and,

---

<sup>9</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B)(3).

<sup>10</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(E).

<sup>11</sup> R.C. 4903.221(B)(4).

<sup>12</sup> Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-11(B).

therefore, AEE Ohio should be permitted to intervene for the same reasons as set forth in Section III above.

As for the fifth factor, AEE Ohio's interests in this proceeding will not be fully represented by other parties<sup>13</sup> because none of the other parties can adequately represent AEE Ohio's interests as an Ohio organization representing businesses involved in every aspect of the renewable and advanced energy industry. Therefore, AEE Ohio respectfully requests that its intervention and participation be granted in this case.

## **V. Conclusion**

For the foregoing reasons, the Advanced Energy Economy Ohio respectfully request that their Motion to Intervene be granted, and AEE Ohio be authorized to participate as full parties to this proceeding.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Todd M. Williams  
Todd M. Williams, Counsel of Record (0083647)  
*Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC*  
Two Maritime Plaza, Third Floor  
Toledo, Ohio 43604  
Telephone: (567) 225-3330  
Fax: (567) 225-3329  
E-mail: [toddm@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:toddm@wamenergylaw.com)

---

<sup>13</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B)(5).

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing *Motion to Intervene and Memorandum in Support* has been filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio and has been served upon the following parties via electronic mail on September 4, 2012.

/s/ Todd M. Williams  
Todd M. Williams

Devin Parram  
Attorney General's Office  
Public Utilities Commission of  
Ohio  
180 East Broad St., 6th Fl.  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[Devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us)

Jody M. Kyler  
David F. Boehm  
Michael L. Kurtz  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
[jkyler@bkllawfirm.com](mailto:jkyler@bkllawfirm.com)  
[dboehm@bkllawfirm.com](mailto:dboehm@bkllawfirm.com)  
[mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com)  
Attorneys for Ohio Energy Group

Christopher J. Allwein  
Williams Allwein & Moser, LLC  
1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212  
Columbus, OH 43212  
[callwein@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:callwein@wamenergylaw.com)  
Attorney for the Sierra Club

Cathryn N. Loucas  
Trent Dougherty  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, OH 43212-3449  
[Cathy@theOEC.org](mailto:Cathy@theOEC.org)  
[Trent@theOEC.org](mailto:Trent@theOEC.org)  
Attorneys for the Ohio Environmental  
Council

Colleen L. Mooney  
Ohio Partners for Affordable  
Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
Findlay, OH 45839-1793  
[cmooney2@columbus.rr.com](mailto:cmooney2@columbus.rr.com)

Robert Kelter  
Justin M. Vickers  
Environmental Law & Policy Center  
35 East Wacker Drive, Suite 1600  
Chicago, IL 60601  
[jvickers@elpc.org](mailto:jvickers@elpc.org)  
[rkelter@elpc.org](mailto:rkelter@elpc.org)  
Attorneys for the Environmental Law  
& Policy Center

Kathy J. Kolich  
Carrie M. Dunn  
FirstEnergy Service Company  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308  
[kjkolich@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:kjkolich@firstenergycorp.com)  
[cdunn@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:cdunn@firstenergycorp.com)  
Attorneys for FirstEnergy Service  
Company

Kyle L. Kern  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel  
Office of the Ohio Consumers'  
Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, OH 43216  
[kern@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:kern@occ.state.oh.us)

Thomas J. O'Brien  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[tobrien@bricker.com](mailto:tobrien@bricker.com)  
Attorney for Ohio Hospital  
Association

Samuel C. Randazzo  
Frank P. Darr  
Joseph E. Olier  
Matthew R. Pritchard  
McNEES WALLACE & NURICK  
LLC  
21 East State Street, 17<sup>TH</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[sam@mwncmh.com](mailto:sam@mwncmh.com)  
[fdarr@mwncmh.com](mailto:fdarr@mwncmh.com)  
[joliker@mwncmh.com](mailto:joliker@mwncmh.com)  
[mpritchard@mwncmh.com](mailto:mpritchard@mwncmh.com)  
Attorneys for Industrial Energy  
Users-Ohio

Richard L. Sites  
General Counsel & Senior Director of  
Healthy Policy  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 East Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
[ricks@ohanet.org](mailto:ricks@ohanet.org)

Gregory Price  
Mandy Willey  
Attorney Examiners  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 East Broad Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
[gregory.price@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:gregory.price@puc.state.oh.us)  
[mandy.willey@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:mandy.willey@puc.state.oh.us)



**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**9/4/2012 4:05:21 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 12-2191-EL-POR, 12-2192-EL-POR, 12-2190-EL-POR**

Summary: Motion Corrected Motion to Intervene on behalf of AEE Ohio electronically filed by Mr. Todd M Williams on behalf of Advanced Energy Economy Ohio