# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Ohio Power Company for Approval	)	Case No. 12-1126-EL-UNC
of Full Legal Corporate Separation	)	
and Amendment to Its Corporate	)	
Separation Plan	)	

### REPLY OF INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Oliker
Matthew R. Pritchard
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17<sup>TH</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Telephone: (614) 469-8000
Telecopier: (614) 469-4653
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

August 3, 2012

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Ohio Power Company for Approval	)	Case No. 12-1126-EL-UNC
of Full Legal Corporate Separation	)	
and Amendment to Its Corporate	)	
Separation Plan	)	

#### REPLY OF INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO

On March 30, 2012, Ohio Power Company ("OP")<sup>1</sup> filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") an Application for Approval of Full Legal Corporate Separation and Amendment to Its Corporate Separation Plan ("Application"). On July 9, 2012, the Commission issued an Entry requesting that Intervenors submit Objections to the Application.

On July 27, 2012, the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC"), FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. ("FES"), Ohio Manufacturers Association Energy Group ("OMAEG"), the Kroger Company ("Kroger"), Commission Staff, and Industrial Energy Users of Ohio ("IEU-Ohio") submitted Objections. The Objections hold a common theme: The Application fails to provide the information required by the Commission's rules, where information is provided it conflicts with the statutory and rule requirements, and the Application fails to satisfy the burden of demonstrating that the generating asset transfer is just, reasonable, and in the public interest.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> As a result of a merger, OP includes the operations of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company ("CSP") which are presently separate divisions within the OP structure.

Accordingly, because OP's Application is substantially inadequate, the Commission should reject it and require OP to refile<sup>2</sup> an application that complies with the statutory requirements and the Commission's rules. At a minimum, the Commission should require OP to provide the information required by the Commission's rules and set the Application for hearing.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph E. Oliker

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Oliker
Matthew R. Pritchard
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17<sup>TH</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Telephone: (614) 469-8000
Telecopier: (614) 469-4653
sam@mwncmh.com

sam@mwncmh.com fdarr@mwncmh.com joliker@mwncmh.com mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Section 4928.17(B), Revised Code.

### **Certificate of Service**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Reply of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio*, was served upon the following parties of record this 3rd day of August, 2012, *via* electronic transmission, hand-delivery or first class U.S. mail, postage prepaid.

/s/ Joseph E. Oliker Joseph E. Oliker

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
American Electric Power Service
Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com

#### **COUNSEL FOR OHIO POWER COMPANY**

Maureen R. Grady, Counsel of Record Assistant Consumers' Counsel Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215-3485 grady@occ.state.oh.us

### COUNSEL FOR OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

Amy B. Spiller, Counsel of Record Deputy General Counsel Jeanne W. Kingery Associate General Counsel 139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main PO Box 961 Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960 Amy.Spiller@duker-energy.com Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com

COUNSEL FOR DUKE ENERGY RETAIL SALES, LLC AND DUKE ENERGY COMMERCIAL ASSET MANAGEMENT, INC. Mark A. Hayden
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander (0080713)
Calfee, Halter & Griswold, LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114
ilang@calfee.com
Imcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik
Allison E. Haedt
Jones Day
901 Lakeside Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44114
dakutik@jonesday.com
aehaedt@jonesday.com

### COUNSEL FOR FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS CORP.

Robert A. McMahon, Counsel of Record Eberly McMahon LLC 2321 Kemper Lane, Suite 100 Cincinnati, OH 45206 BMcMahon@emh-law.com Rocco D'Ascenzo
Associate General Counsel
Elizabeth Watts
Associate General Counsel
139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Elizabeth.Watts@duke-energy.com
Rocco.D'Ascenzo@duke-energy.com

#### COUNSEL FOR DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

Michael L. Kurtz
David F. Boehm
Jody M. Kyler
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com
jklyer@BKLlawfirm.com

#### **COUNSEL FOR OHIO ENERGY GROUP**

Joseph M. Clark
Manager, Government and Regulatory
Affairs
Direct Energy Services, LLC
6641 North High Street, Suite 200
Worthington, OH 43085
Joseph.Clark@directenergy.com

## COUNSEL FOR DIRECT ENERGY SERVICES, LLC AND DIRECT ENERGY BUSINESS, LLC

Kurt P. Helfrich Ann B. Zallocco Thompson Hine LLP 41 South High Street, Suite 1700 Columbus, OH 43215-6101 Kurt.Helfrich@ThompsonHine.com Ann.Zallocco@ThompsonHine.com

#### COUNSEL FOR BUCKEYE POWER, INC.

Lisa G. McAlister, Counsel of Record Matthew W. Warnock
J. Thomas Siwo
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Imcalister@bricker.com
mwarnock@bricker.com
tsiwo@bricker.com

#### COUNSEL FOR THE OMA ENERGY GROUP

Richard L. Sites
General Counsel & Senior Director of
Health Policy
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3620
ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O'Brien Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com

## COUNSEL FOR THE OHIO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
PO Box 1008
Columbus OH 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com

Stephen Bennett
Retail Policy Manager
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
300 Exelon Way
Kennett Square, PA 19348
Stephen.bennett@exeloncorp.com

David M. Stahl
Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP
224 S. Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100
Chicago, IL 60604
dstahl@eimerstahl.com

David I. Fein
Vice President, State Government AffairsEast
Exelon Corporation
550 West Washington, Blvd., Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60661
david.fein@constellation.com

Cynthia Brady
Senior Counsel
Constellation Energy Resources, LLC
550 West Washington, Blvd., Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60661
cynthia.brady@constellation.com

COUNSEL FOR EXELON GENERATION COMPANY, LLC AND CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY, INC.

Mark S. Yurick
Zachary D. Kravitz
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, OH 43215
myurick@taftlaw.com
zkravitz@taftlaw.com

#### COUNSEL FOR THE KROGER CO.

William Wright
Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Public Utilities Section
180 E. Broad Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

COUNSEL FOR THE STAFF OF THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

Sarah Parrot
Attorney Examiner
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Sarah.Parrot@puc.state.oh.us

#### ATTORNEY EXAMINER

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

8/3/2012 4:22:47 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-1126-EL-UNC

Summary: Reply of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio electronically filed by Mr. Joseph E. Oliker on behalf of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio