

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide	)	Case No. 12-1230-EL-SSO
for a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to	)	
R.C. § 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric	)	
Security Plan.	)	

---

**POST-HEARING BRIEF OF  
INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO**

---

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)  
Frank P. Darr  
Matthew R. Pritchard  
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC  
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-4228  
Telephone: (614) 469-8000  
Telecopier: (614) 469-4653  
sam@mwncmh.com  
fdarr@mwncmh.com  
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

**June 22, 2012**

**Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio**

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric	)	
Illuminating Company and The Toledo	)	
Edison Company for Authority to Provide	)	Case No. 12-1230-EL-SSO
for a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to	)	
R.C. § 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric	)	
Security Plan.	)	

---

**POST-HEARING BRIEF OF  
INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO**

---

On April 13, 2012, Ohio Edison Company ("OE"), The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company ("CEI"), and The Toledo Edison Company ("TE") (collectively, "FirstEnergy") filed an Application to establish a standard service offer ("SSO") in the form of an electric security plan ("ESP"). Concurrently with the filing of the Application, FirstEnergy and several signatory parties filed a Stipulation and Recommendation ("Stipulation") to set forth their understanding and agreement and to recommend approval of the Stipulation.

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") previously approved an ESP for FirstEnergy for the period of June 1, 2011 through May 31, 2014.<sup>1</sup> In *ESP II*, the Commission authorized FirstEnergy to set its SSO price for the period covered by *ESP II* by means of a forward-looking competitive bidding process ("CBP").<sup>2</sup> This forward-looking CBP has worked systematically to reduce electric bills for SSO

---

<sup>1</sup> *In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to Section 4928.143, Revised Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan*, Case No. 10-388-EL-SSO, Opinion and Order (Aug. 25, 2010) (hereinafter "*ESP II*").

<sup>2</sup> *ESP II*, Opinion and Order at 8, 34-35 (Aug. 25, 2010).

customers in line with conditions in the wholesale electric market and it provides clear price signals to customers so that they can compare the electric bills produced by the SSO option with offers from Competitive Retail Electric Service (“CRES”) providers, including governmental aggregators. The Stipulation recommended and the Application proposed to, in effect, continue and extend *ESP II* through May 31, 2016.<sup>3</sup> As discussed below, extension of *ESP II* is something that would happen by operation of law unless a new and lawful SSO is put in place as a successor to *ESP II*. The Stipulation and Application also provided additional terms and conditions for the CBP that will be utilized to establish the SSO price during the term of the ESP.

As indicated above, Section 4928.143(C)(2)(b), Revised Code, mandates that the terms and conditions of *ESP II* continue if nothing is done to bring a new SSO proposal to the Commission, the Commission rejects the Application or if the Application is withdrawn as a result of the Commission’s modification and approval.<sup>4</sup> Accordingly, the CBP process used to set the generation supply price portion of the SSO will likely continue one way or another. The Stipulation invites the Commission to take some of the guesswork out of the future and provide clarity regarding the structure of the CBP that will set SSO rates through May 31, 2016. In other words, the Application and the Stipulation offer the Commission an opportunity to apply the law in a common sense way and to provide consumers with reliable and actionable information that they can use to make good electricity choices.

---

<sup>3</sup> Application at 2.

<sup>4</sup> *In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant Section 4928.143, Revised Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan*, Case Nos. 11-346-EL-SSO, et al., Entry on Rehearing at 12 (Feb. 23, 2012).

When measured by the long-standing criteria the Commission has used to evaluate settlements and based on the law and evidence, the Stipulation warrants approval by the Commission. Accordingly, IEU-Ohio urges the Commission to approve the Stipulation thereby approving the proposed successor ESP.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Samuel C. Randazzo

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Matthew R. Pritchard

MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC

21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

**Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio**

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Post-Hearing Brief of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio*, was served upon the following parties of record this 22<sup>nd</sup> day of June 2012, *via* hand-delivery, electronic transmission, or first class mail, U.S. postage prepaid.

/s/ Samuel C. Randazzo

SAMUEL C. RANDAZZO

James W. Burk, Counsel of Record  
Arthur E. Korkosz  
FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308  
burkj@firstenergycorp.com  
korkosza@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang  
Laura C. McBride  
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP  
1405 East Sixth Street  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
jlang@calfee.com  
lmcbride@calfee.com

David A. Kutik  
JONES DAY  
901 Lakeside Avenue  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
dakutik@jonesday.com

**COUNSEL FOR OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE  
CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING  
COMPANY AND THE TOLEDO EDISON  
COMPANY**

Colleen L. Mooney  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
PO Box 1793  
Findlay, OH 45839-1793  
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

**COUNSEL FOR OHIO PARTNERS FOR  
AFFORDABLE ENERGY**

Joseph M. Clark, Counsel of Record  
Direct Energy  
6641 North High Street, Suite 200  
Worthington, OH 43085  
jmclark@vectren.com

Asim Z. Haque  
Christopher L. Miller  
Gregory H. Dunn  
Alan G. Starkoff  
Ice Miller LLP  
250 West Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
christopher.miller@icemiller.com  
asim.haque@icemiller.com  
Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com

**COUNSEL FOR DIRECT ENERGY SERVICES,  
LLC AND DIRECT ENERGY BUSINESS, LLC**

Larry S. Sauer, Counsel of Record  
Terry L. Etter  
Melissa R. Yost  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, OH 43215-3485  
sauer@occ.state.oh.us  
etter@occ.state.oh.us  
yost@occ.state.oh.us

**COUNSEL FOR THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO  
CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

Vincent Parisi  
Matthew White  
Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, OH 43016  
vparisi@igsenergy.com  
mswhite@igsenergy.com

Barth E. Royer  
Bell & Royer Co., LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, OH 43215-3927  
BarthRoyer@aol.com

**COUNSEL FOR INTERSTATE GAS SUPPLY,  
INC.**

M. Howard Petricoff  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
52 East Gay Street  
PO Box 1008  
Columbus OH 43216-1008  
mhpetricoff@vorys.com

Sandy I-ru Grace  
Assistant General Counsel  
Exelon Business Services Company  
101 Constitution Avenue N.W.  
Suite 400 East  
Washington, DC 20001  
sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Stephen Bennett  
Retail Policy Manager  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
300 Exelon Way  
Kennett Square, PA 19348  
Stephen.bennett@exeloncorp.com

David I. Fein  
Vice President, State Government Affairs-  
East  
Exelon Corporation  
550 West Washington Boulevard, Suite 300  
Chicago, IL 60661  
David.fein@constellation.com

Cynthia Brady  
Senior Counsel  
Constellation Energy Resources, LLC  
550 West Washington Boulevard, Suite 300  
Chicago, IL 60661  
Cynthia.brady@constellation.com

David M. Stahl (for Exelon)  
Eimer Stahl LLP  
224 S. Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100  
Chicago, IL 60604  
dstahl@eimerstahl.com

**COUNSEL FOR EXELON GENERATION  
COMPANY, LLC AND CONSTELLATION  
NEWENERGY, INC.**

Christopher J. Allwein, Counsel of Record  
Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC  
1373 Grandview Avenue, Suite 212  
Columbus, OH 43212  
callwein@wamenergylaw.com

Robb W. Kapla  
Sierra Club  
Environmental Law Program  
85 Second Street, Second Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94105-3459  
Robb.kapla@sierraclub.org

**COUNSEL FOR NATURAL RESOURCES  
DEFENSE COUNCIL AND THE SIERRA CLUB**

Leslie A. Kovacik  
City of Toledo  
420 Madison Avenue, Suite 100  
Toledo, OH 43604-1219  
leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov

Thomas R. Hays  
John Borrell  
Lucas County Prosecutor's Office  
700 Adams Street, Suite 251  
Toledo, OH 43604  
Trhayslaw@gmail.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE NORTHWEST OHIO  
AGGREGATION COALITION**

Glenn S. Krassen  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
1375 East Ninth Street, Suite 1500  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
gkrassen@bricker.com

Matthew W. Warnock  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
mwarnock@bricker.com

**COUNSEL FOR NORTHEAST OHIO PUBLIC  
ENERGY COUNCIL**

Judi L. Sobecki  
Randall V. Griffin  
The Dayton Power and Light Company  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, OH 45432  
Judi.sobecki@DPLINC.com  
Randall.griffin@DPLINC.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE DAYTON POWER AND  
LIGHT COMPANY**

David F. Boehm  
Michael L. Kurtz  
Jody M. Kyler  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com  
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com  
jklyer@BKLawfirm.com

**COUNSEL FOR OHIO ENERGY GROUP**

Lisa G. McAlister, Counsel of Record  
J. Thomas Siwo  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291  
lmcAlister@bricker.com  
tsiwo@bricker.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE OMA ENERGY GROUP**

Michael D. Dortch  
Kravitz Brown & Dorth, LLC  
65 East State Street, Suite 200  
Columbus, OH 43215  
mdortch@kravitzllc.com

**COUNSEL FOR AEP RETAIL ENERGY  
PARTNERS, LLC**

Trent Dougherty, Counsel of Record  
Cathryn N. Loucas  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview venue, Suite 201  
Columbus, OH 43212-3449  
Trent@theoec.org  
Cathy@theoec.org

**COUNSEL FOR THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL  
COUNCIL**

Jeanne W. Kingery  
Associate General Counsel  
Amy B. Spiller  
Deputy General Counsel  
Duke Energy Business Services LLC  
139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com  
Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

**COUNSEL FOR DUKE ENERGY COMMERCIAL  
ASSET MANAGEMENT, INC.**

Amy B. Spiller, Counsel of Record  
Deputy General Counsel  
Jeanne W. Kingery  
Associate General Counsel  
Duke Energy Business Services LLC  
139 East Fourth Street  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com  
Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com

**COUNSEL FOR DUKE ENERGY RETAIL SALES,  
LLC**

Matthew J. Satterwhite  
Steven T. Nourse  
Marilyn McConnell  
American Electric Power Service  
Corporation  
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
mjsatterwhite@aep.com  
stnourse@aep.com  
mmconnell@aep.com

**COUNSEL FOR OHIO POWER COMPANY**

M. Howard Petricoff  
Michael J. Settineri  
Lija Kaleps-Clark  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
52 East Gay Street  
PO Box 1008  
Columbus OH 43216-1008  
mhpetricoff@vorys.com  
mjsettineri@vorys.com  
lkalepsclark@vorys.com

**COUNSEL FOR RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY  
ASSOCIATION**

Gregory J. Poulos  
EnerNOC, Inc.  
471 E. Broad Street, Suite 1520  
Columbus, OH 43215  
gpoulos@enernoc.com

**COUNSEL FOR ENERNOC, INC.**

Theodore S. Robinson  
Citizen Power, Inc.  
2121 Murray Avenue  
Pittsburgh, PA 15217  
robinson@citizenpower.com

**COUNSEL FOR CITIZEN POWER, INC.**

Craig I. Smith  
15700 Van Aken Blvd, Suite #26  
Cleveland, OH 44120  
vttpmlc@aol.com

**COUNSEL FOR MATERIALS SCIENCE  
CORPORATION**

Mark S. Yurick  
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP  
65 E. State Street, Suite 1000  
Columbus, OH 43215-4213  
myurick@taftlaw.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE KROGER CO.**

Douglas M. Mancino  
McDermott Will & Emery LLP  
2049 Century Park East, Suite 3800  
Los Angeles, CA 90067-3218  
dmancino@mwe.com

Gregory K. Lawrence  
McDermott Will & Emery LLP  
28 State Street  
Boston, MA 02109  
glawrence@mwe.com

**COUNSEL FOR MORGAN STANLEY CAPITAL  
GROUP INC.**

Glenn S. Krassen  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
1001 Lakeside Avenue East, Suite 1350  
Cleveland, OH 44114-1142  
gkrassen@bricker.com

Matthew W. Warnock  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
mwarnock@bricker.com

**COUNSEL FOR OHIO SCHOOLS COUNCIL**

Morgan E. Parke, Counsel of Record  
Michael R. Beiting  
FirstEnergy Service Company  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308  
mparke@firstenergycorp.com  
beitingm@firstenergycorp.com

**COUNSEL FOR FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS  
CORP. ("FES")**



C. Todd Jones  
Gregory H. Dunn  
Christopher L. Miller  
Asim Z. Haque  
Ice Miller LLP  
250 West Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com  
christopher.miller@icemiller.com  
asim.haque@icemiller.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE ASSOCIATION OF  
INDEPENDENT COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES  
OF OHIO AND THE CITY OF GROVE CITY,  
OHIO**

Dane Stinson  
Bailey Cavalieri LLC  
One Columbus  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100  
Columbus, OH 43215  
dane.stinson@baileycavalieri.com

**COUNSEL FOR GEXA ENERGY-OHIO, LLC**

M. Howard Petricoff  
Stephen M. Howard  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
52 East Gay Street  
PO Box 1008  
Columbus OH 43216-1008  
mhpeticoff@vorys.com  
smhoward@vorys.com

Glen Thomas  
1060 First Avenue, Suite 400  
King of Prussia, PA 19406  
gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Laura Chappelle  
4218 Jacob Meadows  
Okemos, MI 48864  
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

**COUNSEL FOR PJM POWER PROVIDERS  
GROUP ("P3")**

Allen Freifeld  
Viridity Energy, Inc.  
100 West Elm Street, Suite 410  
Conshohocken, PA 19428  
afreifeld@viridityenergy.com

**COUNSEL FOR VIRIDITY ENERGY, INC.  
(PARTICIPANT IN "DEMAND RESPONSE  
COALITION")**

Justin M. Vickers  
Robert Kelter  
Environmental Law & Policy Center  
35 East Wacker Drive, Suite 1600  
Chicago, IL 60601  
jvickers@elpc.org  
rkelter@elpc.org

**COUNSEL FOR ENVIRONMENTAL LAW &  
POLICY CENTER ("ELPC")**

Matthew R. Cox  
McDonald Hopkins LLC  
600 Superior Avenue, East  
Suite 2100  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
mcox@mcdonaldhopkins.com

**COUNSEL FOR COUNCIL OF SMALLER  
ENTERPRISES ("COSE")**

Garrett A. Stone  
Michael K. Lavanga  
Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone, P.C.  
1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, NW  
8<sup>th</sup> Floor, West Tower  
Washington, DC 20007  
gas@bbrslaw.com  
mkl@bbrslaw.com

**COUNSEL FOR NUCOR STEEL MARION, INC.**

Robert J. Triozzi, Director of Law  
City of Cleveland  
Cleveland City Hall  
601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 106  
Cleveland, OH 44114-1077  
RTriozzi@city.cleveland.oh.us

**COUNSEL FOR THE CITY OF CLEVELAND**

Richard L. Sites  
General Counsel & Senior Director of  
Health Policy  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 E. Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3620  
ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O'Brien  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
tobrien@bricker.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE OHIO HOSPITAL  
ASSOCIATION ("OHA")**

Cheri B. Cunningham  
Director of Law  
City of Akron  
161 South High Street, Suite 202  
Akron, OH 44308  
CCunningham@AkronOhio.gov

Joseph Olikier  
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  
21 E. State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
joliker@mwncmh.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE CITY OF AKRON**

Christopher Horn  
3030 Euclid Avenue, Suite 406  
Cleveland, OH 44118  
chorn@mcscherrylaw.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE EMPOWERMENT CENTER  
OF GREATER CLEVELAND, CLEVELAND  
HOUSING NETWORK AND CONSUMERS  
PROTECTION ASSOCIATION**

Barth E. Royer  
Bell & Royer Co., LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, OH 43215-3927  
BarthRoyer@aol.com

**COUNSEL FOR THE CLEVELAND MUNICIPAL  
SCHOOL DISTRICT**

Thomas McNamee  
Public Utilities Section  
Ohio Attorney General's Office  
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us

**COUNSEL FOR THE STAFF OF THE PUBLIC  
UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

Mandy Willey  
Gregory Price  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
mandy.willey@puc.state.oh.us  
greg.price@puc.state.oh.us

**ATTORNEY EXAMINERS**

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**6/22/2012 3:06:21 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 12-1230-EL-SSO**

Summary: Brief of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio electronically filed by Mr. Samuel C.  
Randazzo on behalf of INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS OF OHIO GENERAL COUNSEL