

OCC EXHIBIT NO. _____

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Columbus Southern Power Company and)	
Ohio Power Company for Authority to)	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO
Establish a Standard Service Offer)	Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
Pursuant to Section 4928.143, Revised)	
Code, in the Form of an Electric Security)	
Plan.)	
In the Matter of the Application of)	
Columbus Southern Power Company and)	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM
Ohio Power Company for Approval of)	Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
Certain Accounting Authority.)	

**DIRECT TESTIMONY
OF
IBRAHIM SOLIMAN**

**On Behalf of
The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485**

May 4, 2012

List of Attachments

IS-A	Ibrahim Soliman	Testimony
IS-B	Option One	Annual Calculation
IS-C	Option One	OCC Monthly Calculation
IS-D	Option One	AEP Monthly Calculation
IS-E	Option Two	Annual Calculation
IS-F	Option Two	OCC Calculation
IS-G	Option Two	AEP Calculation

1 **I. INTRODUCTION**

2

3 ***Q1. PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME, ADDRESS AND POSITION.***

4 ***A1.*** My name is Ibrahim Soliman. My business address is 10 West Broad Street,
5 Suite 1800, Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485. I am employed by the Office of the
6 Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") as a Senior Regulatory Analyst.

7

8 ***Q2. WHAT IS YOUR EDUCATIONAL BACKGROUND?***

9 ***A2.*** I earned a Bachelor of Business Administration degree from Cairo University in
10 1976 with a major in accounting. I have completed many regulatory training
11 programs. I retired from the PUCO on July 2010 after 30 years of service. I am a
12 Certified Public Accountant ("CPA"), Certified Internal Auditor ("CIA"), and
13 Certified Management Accountant ("CMA").

14

15 ***Q3. PLEASE SUMMARIZE YOUR WORK EXPERIENCE.***

16 ***A3.*** I joined the OCC in January 2011 as a Senior Regulatory Analyst. Prior to my
17 employment with the OCC, I worked for the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
18 ("PUCO" or "Commission") from July 1980 until July 2010. During my thirty
19 years tenure with the Staff of the Commission ("Staff"), I held several positions as
20 Utility Auditor, Utility Supervisor, and Utility Administrator. My current duties
21 as an OCC Senior Regulatory Analyst include investigating and analyzing utility
22 applications for increases in rates. I also participate in other cases and
23 investigations in the electric, gas, and water industries.

1 ***Q4. HAVE YOU PREVIOUSLY SUBMITTED TESTIMONY BEFORE THIS***
2 ***COMMISSION?***

3 ***A4.*** Yes. During my employment with the Staff of the PUCO and with OCC I
4 submitted testimony before the Commission in several electric, gas, and water
5 cases as shown on Attachment IS-A.

6

7 ***Q5. WHAT DOCUMENTS HAVE YOU REVIEWED IN THE PREPARATION OF***
8 ***YOUR TESTIMONY?***

9 ***A5.*** I have reviewed the Modified Electric Security Plan (“Modified ESP”)
10 Application filed on March 30, 2012 by the Ohio Power Company (“AEP Ohio”
11 or “Company”); AEP Ohio’s supporting testimonies and associated workpapers;
12 and certain AEP Ohio responses to OCC Interrogatories.

13

14 I have also reviewed the filings made in Case Nos. 11-4920-EL-RDR and 4921-
15 EL-RDR, which include the AEP Ohio application and the Comments and Reply
16 Comments filed by parties to that case. Also, I have reviewed the Report of the
17 PUCO’s Consultant, Energy Ventures Analysis and Larkin & Associates, filed in
18 AEP Ohio’s Fuel Adjustment Clause (“FAC”) Audit cases.¹

¹ See In the Matter of the Case Nos. 10-268, 269, 870, 871, 1286, 1288-EL-FAC.

1 **II. PURPOSE OF TESTIMONY**

2

3 ***Q6. WHAT IS THE PURPOSE OF YOUR TESTIMONY IN THESE
4 PROCEEDINGS?***

5 ***A6. My testimony addresses the proper calculation of carrying charges on deferred
6 fuel.***

7

8 ***Q7. WHAT IS YOUR RECOMMENDATION REGARDING THE CALCULATION
9 OF CARRYING CHARGES ON THE DEFERRED FUEL EXPENSES
10 DURING THE ESP 1 DEFERRAL PERIOD (2009-2011)?***

11 ***A7. I recommend that the Commission adjust the deferred fuel principal amount by
12 the related Accumulated Deferred Income Tax ("ADIT") when computing
13 carrying costs. The ADIT represents a non-investor supplied fund. It is a cost-
14 free source of funds provided by federal and state governments and available to
15 the Company to finance the deferred fuel cost. Utility customers, therefore,
16 should not pay carrying charges to AEP Ohio on a source of funds that is without
17 cost to AEP Ohio. Also, I recommend that the Company be permitted to collect
18 only the deferred fuel balance, plus adjusted carrying charges, that the
19 Commission approves. OCC witness Duann provides testimony on the
20 appropriate amount of deferred fuel issue.***

1 ***Q8. IS YOUR RECOMMENDATION CONSISTENT WITH OTHER PARTIES'***

2 ***RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING THE ADIT ISSUE?***

3 ***A8.*** Yes. In the 2010 FAC Audit Report, the Auditors, Energy Ventures Analysis and
4 Larkin & Associated PLLC, recommended that the Commission should
5 reconsider the income tax savings related to the deductibility of fuel expenses,
6 and how the ADIT provides non-investor supplied capital that is financing a
7 portion of the deferred fuel balances. Also, the PUCO Staff's Comments and
8 Recommendations submitted April 3, 2012 in Cases 11-4920-EL-RDR and 11-
9 4921-EL-RDR, raised the same concern. The PUCO Staff in their comments
10 recommended that the ADIT reduce the principal deferred fuel balance for the
11 purposes of calculating the carrying cost at the end of each year of the ESP 1
12 period (2009-2011). Similar recommendations were made by Industrial Energy
13 Users-Ohio, Ohio Energy Group, and Ormet Primary Aluminum Corporation in
14 their Comments and Reply Comments.

15

16 ***Q9. WOULD YOU PLEASE EXPLAIN HOW THE ACCUMULATED***

17 ***DEFERRED INCOME TAX FOR AEP OHIO WAS CREATED?***

18 ***A9.*** The accumulated deferred income tax associated with the deductibility of total
19 fuel expenses was created during the deferral period (2009-2011). During that
20 period the Company deducted the entire fuel expense incurred from its taxable
21 income. This reduced the Company's tax obligations. On its books the Company
22 expensed a fuel expense amount equal to FAC fuel revenue and deferred the
23 under-recovered fuel expense. This treatment creates a temporary book-tax

1 timing difference. Accordingly, the Company achieved income tax savings
2 during the deferral period. These tax savings reduced the amount of money
3 needed to finance the deferred fuel cost. Therefore, for every \$1.00 that the
4 Company spent on fuel, it would have to borrow only \$0.65 and the remaining
5 \$0.35 is provided as a direct **reduction** in federal income tax.

6

7 ***Q10. HOW SHOULD THE ACCUMULATED DEFERRED INCOME TAX
8 REDUCE THE AMOUNT OF CARRYING CHARGES?***

9 ***A10.*** There are two approaches to address ADIT. Under the first approach, the
10 Commission could require the Company to recalculate the carrying charges by
11 reducing the principal deferred fuel balance before applying the carrying charge
12 rate at the end of each year of the ESP 1 period (2009-2011). That would reduce
13 the carrying charge portion of the deferred fuel balance. This approach would
14 flow through the tax savings in the year when fuel expense was incurred. See
15 Attachments IS-B, IS-C and IS-D for illustration. Under a second approach, the
16 Commission could direct the Company to calculate carrying charges net of ADIT
17 by reducing the unamortized deferred fuel balance by the unamortized ADIT
18 balance before applying the carrying charge rate during the recovery period. That
19 would also reduce the carrying charge portion of the deferred fuel balance. This
20 method normalizes the tax savings over the recovery period and would protect
21 customers by eliminating the financing of non-investor supplied funds. See
22 Attachments IS-E, IS-F and IS-G for illustration.

1 ***Q11. WHICH APPROACH DO YOU RECOMMEND THE COMMISSION***

2 ***ADOPT?***

3 ***A11.*** Both approaches reduce the fuel balance by the ADIT and associated carrying
4 charges. Both would protect customers from paying higher carrying charges on
5 non-investor supplied funds. The first approach reflects the tax savings
6 immediately in the calculation of the carrying charges while the second approach
7 amortizes the tax savings over the recovery period. I recommend that the
8 Commission adopt the second approach because it is consistent with GAAP and
9 the Commission policy on the treatment of ADIT associated with temporary
10 book-tax timing differences in the rate-setting process. It is also easy to calculate
11 and verify during the recovery period.

12

13 ***Q12. DID OTHER PARTIES PROPOSE SIMILAR RECOMMENDATIONS TO***
14 ***THE COMMISSION TO SOLVE THE ADIT ISSUE?***

15 ***A12.*** Yes. Comments filed in Case Nos. 11-4920-EL-RDR and 11-4921-EL-RDR, by
16 the PUCO Staff recommended ADIT adjustment to reduce the principal deferred
17 fuel balance for purposes of the carrying cost calculation at the end of each year
18 of the ESP 1 period (2009-2011). This approach is similar to approach one
19 discussed above. Industrial Energy Users-Ohio and Ohio Energy Group
20 recommended that the Company calculate carrying charges net of ADIT during
21 the amortization period. This approach is similar to approach two discussed
22 above. Also Ormet Primary Aluminum Corporation recommended that the tax
23 savings realized by the Company should be passed on to customers.

1 **III. OCC RECOMMENDATION**

2

3 ***Q13. WHAT IS YOUR RECOMMENDATION TO THE COMMISSION
4 REGARDING THE ACCURATE THE CALCULATION OF CARRYING
5 CHARGES SUBJECT TO RECOVERY FROM CUSTOMERS IN THE PIRR?***

6 ***A13.*** The Commission should disallow collecting from customers any extra carrying
7 charges on non-investor supplied capital. Ignoring the tax savings that the
8 Company was able to achieve would result in overcharging customers. I
9 recommend that the Commission adopt the second approach explained above.

10

11 **IV. CONCLUSION**

12

13 ***Q14. DOES THIS CONCLUDE YOUR TESTIMONY AT THIS TIME?***

14 ***A14.*** Yes. However, I reserve the right to incorporate new information that may
15 subsequently become available. I also reserve the right to supplement my
16 testimony in the event that AEP Ohio, PUCO Staff or other parties submit new
17 information or if additional information is provided through discovery.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing *Direct Testimony of Ibrahim Soliman* was served via electronic transmission to the persons listed below on this 4th day of May, 2012.

/s/ Maureen R. Grady

Maureen R. Grady
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

PARTIES SERVED

Werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us	jejadwin@aep.com
John.jones@puc.state.oh.us	mhpeticoff@vorys.com
lmcalister@bricker.com	smhoward@vorys.com
MWarnock@bricker.com	mjettineri@vorys.com
stnourse@aep.com	wmassey@cov.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com	henryeckhart@aol.com
tobrien@bricker.com	jesse.rodriguez@exeloncorp.com
fdarr@mwncomh.com	sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com
joliker@mwncomh.com	kpkreider@kmklaw.com
ghummel@mwncomh.com	dmeyer@kmklaw.com
ricks@ohanet.org	holly@raysmithlaw.com
msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org	BarthRoyer@aol.com
jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org	Gary.A.Jeffries@dom.com
Philip.sineneng@thompsonhine.com	gthomas@gtpowergroup.com
Dorothy.corbett@duke-energy.com	laurac@chappelleconsulting.net
myurick@taftlaw.com	Christopher.miller@icemiller.com
dconway@porterwright.com	Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com
cmoore@porterwright.com	Asim.Haque@icemiller.com
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com	sjsmith@szd.com
mkurtz@BKLLawfirm.com	tsantarelli@elpc.org
dboehm@BKLLawfirm.com	nolan@theoec.org
emma.hand@snrdenton.com	trent@theoec.org
doug.bonner@snrdenton.com	cathy@theoec.org
dan.barnowski@snrdenton.com	ned.ford@fuse.net
JLang@Calfee.com	goulos@enernoc.com
lmcbride@calfee.com	sfisk@nrdc.org
talexander@calfee.com	zkravitz@taftlaw.com
ssolberg@eimerstahl.com	ahaeidt@jonesday.com
aaragona@eimerstahl.com	dakutik@jonesday.com
dstahl@eimerstahl.com	callwein@wamenergylaw.com
whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com	Terrance.Mebane@ThompsonHine.com
thompson@whitt-sturtevant.com	bpbarger@bcslawyers.com

vparisi@igsenergy.com
mswhite@igsenergy.com
kaelber@buckleyking.com
walter@buckleyking.com
judi.sobecki@dplinc.com
randall.griffin@dplinc.com
Carolyn.Flahive@ThompsonHine.com
Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com
rjhart@hahnlaw.com
rremington@hahnlaw.com
djmichalski@hahnlaw.com
jhummer@uaoh.net
tlindsey@uaoh.net
ssalamido@coppertlaw.com
arthur.beeman@sndenton.com

cendsley@ofbf.org
dane.stinson@baileycavalieri.com
jmclark@vectren.com
sbruce@oada.com
rsugarman@keglerbrown.com
matt@matthewcoxlaw.com
mchristensen@columbuslaw.org
toddm@wamenergylaw.com
rburke@cpv.com
bkelly@cpv.com
eisenstatl@ dicksteinshapiro.com
lehfeldtr@ dicksteinshapiro.com
kinderr@ dicksteinshapiro.com
kwatson@coppertlaw.com
Thomas.millar@sndenton.com
James.rubin@sndenton.com

AEs: greta.see@puc.state.oh.us
Jonathan.tauber@puc.state.oh.us

ATTACHMENT IS-A

Ibrahim Soliman
Testimony Submitted

Date	Docket	Company
01/30/1986	85-554-EL-AIR	Toledo Edison
11/07/1988	88-170-EL-AIR et al.	Toledo Edison, CEI
01/23/1990	89-616-EL-AIT et al.	Columbia Gas
04/23/1990	89-1001-EL-AIR	Ohio Edison
01/23/1992	91-418-EL-AIR	Columbus Southern Power
07/13/1994	93-487-TP-ALT et al.	Ohio Bell
03/20/1995	94-0578-EL-CMR et al.	CEI
01/16/1996	95-0299-EL-AIR et al.	Toledo Edison, CEI
01/30/2008	07-0551-EL-AIR et al.	FirstEnergy (Ohio Edison, CEI, Toledo Edison)
08/22/2008	07-0829-GA-AIR et al.	East Ohio Gas
11/07/2008	08-0917-EL-SSO et al.	Columbus Southern Power, Ohio Power
04/20/2009	09-0038-GA-UNC	Dominion East Ohio
10/14/2009	09-0458-GA-RDR	Dominion East Ohio
04/05/2010	09-1875-GA-UNC	Dominion East Ohio
10/24/2011	10-351-EL-AIR	Columbus Southern Power
10/24/2011	10-352-EL-AIR	Ohio Power

Calculation of Carrying Charges Net of ADIT									
Numbers are in Millions									
Option one - Flow Through Method									
		DCC							
2009	2010	2011	Ending Balance as of 12/31/2011	2009	2010	2011	Ending Balance as of 12/31/2011		
(1) Deferred Fuel Balance Per Year *		100	120	130	350	100	120	130	
(2) Carrying cost plus Previous Fuel Balance		0	107.25	247.90	0.00	0	111.15	256.92	0.00
(3) Related Income Tax Savings (ADIT) (1) x 35%		35	42	45.5	0	0	0	0	
(4) Balance Financed by the Company (1) + (2) - (3)		65.00	185.25	332.40	350.00	100.00	231.15	386.92	350.00
(5) Carrying Charge Rate		11.15%	11.15%	11.15%	11.15%	11.15%	11.15%	11.15%	
(6) Carrying Cost (4) x (5)		7.25	20.66	37.06	64.97	11.15	25.77	43.14	80.07
(7) Ending Balance - Fuel & Carrying Cost (1)+(6)		107.25	247.90	414.97	414.97	111.15	256.92	430.07	430.07

OCC							
Recovery Period							
2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Total Over Collection
(1) Deferred Fuel Balance	414.97	364.64	311.58	255.66	196.70	134.56	69.06
(2) Annual Payment - Principal	50.33	53.05	55.93	58.95	62.14	65.51	69.05
(3) Annual - Interest	20.54	17.82	14.95	11.92	8.73	5.37	1.82
(4) Total Annual Payment (2) + (3)	70.872	70.872	70.872	70.872	70.872	70.872	496.10
(5) Balance Subject to Carrying Charge (1) - (2) / 2	389.80	338.11	283.62	226.18	165.63	101.81	34.53
(6) Carrying Charge Rate	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%
(7) Carrying Cost (5 x (6)	20.54	17.82	14.95	11.92	8.73	5.37	1.82
(8) Ending Balance (1) - (2) + (3)	364.64	311.58	255.66	196.70	134.56	69.06	0.00

AEP							
Recovery Period							
2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Total Payment
(1) Deferred Fuel Balance	430.07	377.90	322.92	264.96	203.86	139.46	71.57
(2) Annual Payment - Principal	52.16	54.98	57.96	61.10	64.40	67.89	71.57
(3) Annual - Interest	21.29	18.47	15.49	12.35	9.05	5.56	1.89
(4) Total Annual Payment (2) + (3)	73.451	73.451	73.451	73.451	73.451	73.451	514.16
(5) Balance Subject to Carrying Charge (1) - (2) / 2	403.98	350.41	293.94	234.41	171.66	105.51	35.78
(6) Carrying Charge Rate	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%
(7) Carrying Cost (5 x (6)	21.29	18.47	15.49	12.35	9.05	5.56	1.89
(8) Ending Balance (1) - (2) + (3)	377.90	322.92	264.96	203.86	139.46	71.57	0.00

* Estimated Numbers are used for illustration, However Actual Numbers will be used when they are available.

60	12/1/2016	139,824,178.85	5,917,874.81	5,303,813.62	614,061.19	134,520,365.22
61	1/1/2017	134,520,365.22	5,917,874.81	5,327,106.21	590,768.60	129,193,259.02
62	2/1/2017	129,193,259.02	5,917,874.81	5,350,501.08	567,373.73	123,842,757.93
63	3/1/2017	123,842,757.93	5,917,874.81	5,373,998.70	543,876.11	118,468,759.24
64	4/1/2017	118,468,759.24	5,917,874.81	5,397,599.51	520,275.30	113,071,159.73
65	5/1/2017	113,071,159.73	5,917,874.81	5,421,303.97	496,570.84	107,649,855.76
66	6/1/2017	107,649,855.76	5,917,874.81	5,445,112.53	472,762.28	102,204,743.23
67	7/1/2017	102,204,743.23	5,917,874.81	5,469,025.65	448,849.16	96,735,717.59
68	8/1/2017	96,735,717.59	5,917,874.81	5,493,043.78	424,831.03	91,242,673.80
69	9/1/2017	91,242,673.80	5,917,874.81	5,517,167.40	400,707.41	85,725,506.40
70	10/1/2017	85,725,506.40	5,917,874.81	5,541,396.96	376,477.85	80,184,109.44
71	11/1/2017	80,184,109.44	5,917,874.81	5,565,732.93	352,141.88	74,618,376.51
72	12/1/2017	74,618,376.51	5,917,874.81	5,590,175.77	327,699.04	69,028,200.74
73	1/1/2018	69,028,200.74	5,917,874.81	5,614,725.96	303,148.85	63,413,474.78
74	2/1/2018	63,413,474.78	5,917,874.81	5,639,383.97	278,490.84	57,774,090.81
75	3/1/2018	57,774,090.81	5,917,874.81	5,664,150.26	253,724.55	52,109,940.55
76	4/1/2018	52,109,940.55	5,917,874.81	5,689,025.32	228,849.49	46,420,915.23
77	5/1/2018	46,420,915.23	5,917,874.81	5,714,009.62	203,865.19	40,706,905.61
78	6/1/2018	40,706,905.61	5,917,874.81	5,739,103.65	178,771.16	34,967,801.96
79	7/1/2018	34,967,801.96	5,917,874.81	5,764,307.88	153,566.93	29,203,494.08
80	8/1/2018	29,203,494.08	5,917,874.81	5,789,622.80	128,252.01	23,413,871.28
81	9/1/2018	23,413,871.28	5,917,874.81	5,815,048.89	102,825.92	17,598,822.39
82	10/1/2018	17,598,822.39	5,917,874.81	5,840,586.65	77,288.16	11,758,235.74
83	11/1/2018	11,758,235.74	5,917,874.81	5,866,236.56	51,638.25	5,891,999.18
84	12/1/2018	5,891,999.18	5,917,874.81	5,891,999.11	25,875.70	0.07
OCC		497,101,484.04	414,965,485.67	82,135,998.37		
AEP		515,189,910.48	430,065,164.22	85,124,746.26		
Over Collection		18,088,426.44	15,099,678.55	2,988,747.89		

60	12/1/2016	144,912,072.54	6,133,213.22	5,496,807.70	636,405.52	139,415,264.84
61	1/1/2017	139,415,264.84	6,133,213.22	5,520,947.85	612,265.37	133,894,316.99
62	2/1/2017	133,894,316.99	6,133,213.22	5,545,194.01	588,019.21	128,349,122.98
63	3/1/2017	128,349,122.98	6,133,213.22	5,569,546.65	563,666.57	122,779,576.33
64	4/1/2017	122,779,576.33	6,133,213.22	5,594,006.25	539,206.97	117,185,570.08
65	5/1/2017	117,185,570.08	6,133,213.22	5,618,573.26	514,639.96	111,566,996.82
66	6/1/2017	111,566,996.82	6,133,213.22	5,643,248.16	489,965.06	105,923,748.66
67	7/1/2017	105,923,748.66	6,133,213.22	5,668,031.42	465,181.80	100,255,717.24
68	8/1/2017	100,255,717.24	6,133,213.22	5,692,923.53	440,289.69	94,562,793.71
69	9/1/2017	94,562,793.71	6,133,213.22	5,717,924.95	415,288.27	88,844,868.76
70	10/1/2017	88,844,868.76	6,133,213.22	5,743,036.17	390,177.05	83,101,832.59
71	11/1/2017	83,101,832.59	6,133,213.22	5,768,257.67	364,955.55	77,333,574.92
72	12/1/2017	77,333,574.92	6,133,213.22	5,793,589.94	339,623.28	71,539,984.98
73	1/1/2018	71,539,984.98	6,133,213.22	5,819,033.45	314,179.77	65,720,951.53
74	2/1/2018	65,720,951.53	6,133,213.22	5,844,588.71	288,624.51	59,876,362.82
75	3/1/2018	59,876,362.82	6,133,213.22	5,870,256.19	262,957.03	54,006,106.63
76	4/1/2018	54,006,106.63	6,133,213.22	5,896,036.40	237,176.82	48,110,070.23
77	5/1/2018	48,110,070.23	6,133,213.22	5,921,929.83	211,283.39	42,188,140.40
78	6/1/2018	42,188,140.40	6,133,213.22	5,947,936.97	185,276.25	36,240,203.43
79	7/1/2018	36,240,203.43	6,133,213.22	5,974,058.33	159,154.89	30,266,145.10
80	8/1/2018	30,266,145.10	6,133,213.22	6,000,294.40	132,918.82	24,265,850.70
81	9/1/2018	24,265,850.70	6,133,213.22	6,026,645.69	106,567.53	18,239,205.01
82	10/1/2018	18,239,205.01	6,133,213.22	6,053,112.71	80,100.51	12,186,092.30
83	11/1/2018	12,186,092.30	6,133,213.22	6,079,695.96	53,517.26	6,106,396.33
84	12/1/2018	6,106,396.33	6,133,213.22	6,106,395.96	26,817.26	0.37
	AEP	515,189,910.48	430,065,164.22	85,124,746.26		
	OCC	497,101,484.04	414,965,485.67	82,135,998.37		
	Over Collection	18,088,426.44	15,099,678.55	2,988,747.89		

Calculation of Carrying Charges Net of ADIT

Numbers are in Millions
Option Two - Normalization Method

	OCC		ASP		
	2009	2010	2011	Ending Balance as of 12/31/2011	
(1) Deferred Fuel Balance Per Year *	100	120	130	350	100
(2) Carrying cost Plus Previous Fuel Balance	0	111.15	256.92	0.00	0
(3) Related Income Tax Savings (ADIT) (1) x 35%	35	42	45.5	122.5	0
(4) Balance Subject to Carrying Charge (1) + (2)	100.00	231.15	386.92	227.50	100.00
(5) Carrying Charge Rate	11.15%	11.15%	11.15%	11.15%	11.15%
(6) Carrying Cost (4) x (5)	11.15	25.77	43.14	80.07	11.15
(7) Ending Balance - Fuel & Carrying Cost (1)+(2)+(6)	111.15	256.92	430.07	430.07	111.15
	OCC		ASP		
Recovery Period	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
(1) Deferred Fuel Balance	430.07	375.26	318.44	259.49	198.29
(2) ADIT Balance	122.5	105	87.5	70	52.5
(3) Deferred Fuel Balance net of ADIT (1) - (2)	307.57	270.26	230.94	189.49	145.73
(4) Annual Payment - Principal	54.80	56.82	58.95	61.19	63.56
(5) Annual - Interest	14.76	12.75	10.62	8.37	6.01
(6) Total Annual Payment (4) + (5)	69.568	65.568	69.568	69.568	69.568
(7) Balance Subject to Carrying Charge (3) - (4) / 2	280.16	241.46	201.46	158.89	114.01
(8) Carrying Charge Rate	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%
(9) Carrying Cost (7) x (8)	14.76	12.75	10.62	8.37	6.01
(10) Ending Balance (3) - (4) + (5)	375.26	318.44	259.49	198.29	134.73
	OCC		ASP		
Recovery Period	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
(1) Deferred Fuel Balance	430.07	377.90	322.92	264.96	203.86
(2) ADIT Balance	0	0	0	0	0
(3) Deferred Fuel Balance net of ADIT (1) - (2)	430.07	377.90	322.92	264.96	203.86
(4) Annual Payment - Principal	52.16	54.98	57.96	61.10	64.40
(5) Annual - Interest	21.29	18.47	15.49	12.35	9.05
(6) Total Annual Payment (4) + (5)	73.451	73.451	73.451	73.451	73.451
(7) Balance Subject to Carrying Charge (3) - (4) / 2	403.98	350.41	293.94	234.41	171.66
(8) Carrying Charge Rate	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%	5.27%
(9) Carrying Cost (7) x (8)	21.29	18.47	15.49	12.35	9.05
(10) Ending Balance (3) - (4) + (5)	377.90	322.92	264.96	203.86	139.46

* Estimated Numbers are used for illustration. However Actual Numbers will be used when they are available.

77	5/1/2018	46,073,037.60	11,666,666.92	34,406,370.68	5,844,558.70	5,693,457.39	151,101.31	40,379,580.21
78	6/1/2018	40,379,580.21	10,208,333.59	30,171,246.62	5,844,558.70	5,712,056.64	132,502.06	34,667,523.57
79	7/1/2018	34,667,523.57	8,750,000.26	25,917,523.31	5,844,558.70	5,730,737.58	113,821.12	28,936,785.99
80	8/1/2018	28,936,785.99	7,291,666.93	21,645,119.06	5,844,558.70	5,749,500.55	95,058.15	23,187,285.44
81	9/1/2018	23,187,285.44	5,833,333.60	17,353,951.84	5,844,558.70	5,768,345.93	76,212.77	17,418,939.51
82	10/1/2018	17,418,939.51	4,375,000.27	13,043,939.24	5,844,558.70	5,787,274.07	57,284.63	11,631,665.44
83	11/1/2018	11,631,665.44	2,916,666.94	8,714,998.50	5,844,558.70	5,806,285.33	38,273.37	5,825,380.11
84	12/1/2018	5,825,380.11	1,458,333.61	4,367,046.50	5,844,558.70	5,825,380.09	19,178.61	0.02
OCC					490,942,930.88	430,065,164.56	60,877,766.24	
AEP					515,189,910.48	430,065,164.22	85,124,746.26	
Over Collection					24,246,979.68	(0.35)	24,246,980.03	

77	5/1/2018	48,110,070.23	-	48,110,070.23	6,133,213.22	5,921,929.83	211,283.39	42,188,140.40
78	6/1/2018	42,188,140.40	-	42,188,140.40	6,133,213.22	5,947,936.97	185,276.25	36,240,203.43
79	7/1/2018	36,240,203.43	-	36,240,203.43	6,133,213.22	5,974,058.33	159,154.89	30,266,145.10
80	8/1/2018	30,266,145.10	-	30,266,145.10	6,133,213.22	6,000,294.40	132,918.82	24,265,850.70
81	9/1/2018	24,265,850.70	-	24,265,850.70	6,133,213.22	6,026,645.69	106,567.53	18,239,205.01
82	10/1/2018	18,239,205.01	-	18,239,205.01	6,133,213.22	6,053,112.71	80,100.51	12,186,092.30
83	11/1/2018	12,186,092.30	-	12,186,092.30	6,133,213.22	6,079,695.96	53,517.26	6,106,396.33
84	12/1/2018	6,106,396.33	-	6,106,396.33	6,133,213.22	6,106,395.96	26,817.26	0.37
	AEP			515,189,910.49	430,065,164.22	85,124,746.26		
	OCC			490,942,930.80	430,065,164.56	60,877,766.24		
	Over Collection			24,246,979.68	(0.35)	24,246,980.03		

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

5/4/2012 4:20:19 PM

in

Case No(s). 11-0346-EL-SSO, 11-0348-EL-SSO, 11-0349-EL-AAM, 11-0350-EL-AAM

Summary: Testimony Direct Testimony of Ibrahim Soliman on Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel electronically filed by Patti Mallarnee on behalf of Grady, Maureen