

BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of	:	
Columbus Southern Power Company	:	
and Ohio Power Company for Authority	:	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO
to Establish a Standard Service Offer	:	Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
Pursuant to Section 4928.143, Revised	:	
Code, in the Form of an Electric	:	
Security Plan.	:	
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of	:	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM
Columbus Southern Power Company	:	Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
And Ohio power Company for Approval	:	
of Certain Accounting Authority.	:	

---

**MOTION OF NFIB/OHIO TO INTERVENE**

---

The Ohio Chapter of The National Federation of Independent Business (“NFIB/Ohio”), respectfully moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11, for leave to intervene in this proceeding. As is more fully set forth in the accompanying memorandum, NFIB/Ohio represents over 24,000 small-business owners and energy consumers of varying size and industry class in Ohio, with the typical small-business member employing twenty-five or fewer, and having gross annual revenue of less than one million dollars. NFIB/Ohio represents independent businesses on public policy and other issues important to its members. This proceeding represents a matter of great importance to NFIB/Ohio’s members who have a real and substantial interest in AEP Ohio’s proposed modified electric security plan (ESP), and they are so situated that disposition of this proceeding may, as a practical matter, impair or impede their ability to protect their interests.

On March 30, 2012, AEP-Ohio filed an application for a standard service offer pursuant to R.C. 4928.141. AEP-Ohio's application for a modified ESP was made in accordance with R.C. 4928.143. On April 2, 2012, the Attorney Examiner set a procedural schedule pursuant to which April 20, 2012 is the deadline to file motions to intervene. NFIB/Ohio's Motion is therefore timely filed under this case schedule established in this docket. NFIB/Ohio was granted intervention in AEP-Ohio's capacity charge proceeding and has been participating in the evidentiary hearing currently being conducted in that docket.

The specific grounds in support of this motion are more particularly set forth in the accompanying memorandum attached hereto and incorporated herein.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Roger P. Sugarman

Roger P. Sugarman (0012007)

KEGLER, BROWN, HILL & RITTER

A Legal Professional Association

65 East State Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Telephone: (614) 462-5400

Facsimile: (614) 464-2634

rsugarman@keglerbrown.com

*Attorneys for NFIB/Ohio*

**NFIB/OHIO'S MEMORANDUM  
IN SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION TO INTERVENE**

**I. Argument**

The rules of the Commission mandate intervention, upon timely motion made pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A), following a showing that:

- (2) the person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding, and the person is so situated that the disposition of the proceeding may, as a practical matter, impair or impede his or her ability to protect that interest, unless the person's interest is adequately represented by existing parties.

NFIB/Ohio satisfies each requirement of this rule (see also R.C. 4903.221(B)).

NFIB/Ohio has a "real and substantial interest in the proceeding" before this Commission – a proceeding which will allow AEP-Ohio, PUCO staff, the public, and other stakeholders to present testimony regarding AEP-Ohio's rate proposal contained in its modified electric security plan ("ESP"). The interests of NFIB/Ohio center on competition and the resulting costs to its members from the ESP to be established by the Commission through this proceeding. NFIB/Ohio has long championed the position that fostering competitive markets and limiting government intervention will free entrepreneurs to create jobs, make capital investments, and take risks that help grow their businesses. It should be unquestioned that the interests of NFIB/Ohio and its members are not currently represented by any existing party.

Alternatively, the rules of this Commission provide for permissive intervention under O.A.C. 4901-1-11(B), upon timely motion, following consideration of:

- (1) The nature of the person's interests;
- (2) The extent to which the person's interest is represented by existing parties;
- (3) The person's potential contribution to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved in the proceedings; and,

- (4) Whether granting the requested intervention would unduly delay the proceeding or unjustly prejudice any existing party.

Even were the Commission to determine that NFIB/Ohio does not satisfy the requirements for mandatory intervention, NFIB/Ohio nevertheless satisfies these requirements for permissive intervention. The nature of its interests are well known; the distinction of NFIB/Ohio's interests from those of other parties are clear; NFIB/Ohio will contribute to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved; and, granting intervention will not delay this proceeding, or cause prejudice to any existing party.

NFIB/Ohio's participation will help develop a full and complete record upon which the Commission may ultimately base its decision. Under the Commission's standards and statutory requirements for both mandatory and permissive intervention, NFIB/Ohio's participation with respect to the issues presented in this docket is therefore appropriate.

## **II. Conclusion**

For all the foregoing reasons, NFIB respectfully requests that its Motion for Intervention be granted, consistent with the considerations, provisions and requirements of R.C. 4903.221(B) and O.A.C. 4901-1-11.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Roger P. Sugarman

Roger P. Sugarman (0012007)  
KEGLER, BROWN, HILL & RITTER  
A Legal Professional Association  
65 East State Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone: (614) 462-5400  
Facsimile: (614) 464-2634  
rsugarman@keglerbrown.com

*Attorneys for NFIB/Ohio*

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing **MOTION OF NFIB/OHIO TO INTERVENE AND MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT** was served by electronic mail, this 19th day of April, 2012, upon the following parties, or their counsel of record to this action:

Matthew J. Satterwhite  
Steven T. Nourse  
Anne M. Vogel  
Jay E. Jadwin  
American Electric Power Service Corporation  
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
mjsatterwhite@aep.com  
stnourse@aep.com  
amvogel@aep.com  
jejadwin@aep.com

Jeanne W. Kingery  
Amy Spiller  
139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main  
P.O. Box 961  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com  
Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com

David F. Boehm  
Michael L. Kurtz  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com  
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com

Daniel R. Conway  
Christen M. Moore  
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur  
41 S. High Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
dconway@porterwright.com  
cmoore@porterwright.com

Rocco D'Ascenzo  
Elizabeth Watts  
139 East Fourth Street  
1303-Main  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
Elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com  
Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com

Gregory J. Poulos  
EnerNOC, Inc.  
101 Federal Street, Suite 1100  
Boston, MA 02110  
gpoulos@enernoc.com

Terry L. Etter  
Marueen R. Grady  
Jeffrey L. Small  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
10 W. Broad Street, 18th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3485  
etter@occ.state.oh.us  
grady@occ.state.oh.us  
small@occ.state.oh.us

Mark S. Yurick  
Zachary D. Kravitz  
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP  
65 East State Street, Suite 1000  
Columbus, OH 43215  
myurick@taftlaw.com  
zkravitz@taftlaw.com

Mark A. Hayden  
FirstEnergy Service Company  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308  
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

Glen Thomas  
1060 First Avenue, Ste. 400  
King of Prussia, PA 19406  
gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

David A. Kutik  
Jones Day  
North Point  
901 Lakeside Avenue  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
dakutik@jonesday.com

Richard L. Sites  
General Counsel & Senior Director of  
Health Policy  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3620  
ricks@ohanet.org

Terrence O'Donnell  
Christopher Montgomery  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291  
todonnell@bricker.com  
cmontgomery@bricker.com

James F Lang  
Laura C. McBride  
N. Trevor Alexander  
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP  
1400 KeyBank Center  
800 Superior Ave.  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
jlang@calfee.com  
lmcbride@calfee.com  
talexander@calfee.com

Andrew J. Campbell  
Mark A. Whitt  
Melissa L. Thompson  
Whitt Sturtevant LLP  
PNC Plaza, Suite 2020  
155 East Broad Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Campbell@whitt-sturtevant.com  
whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com  
thompson@whitt-sturtevant.com

Allison E. Haedt  
Jones Day  
P.O. Box 165017  
Columbus, OH 43216-5017  
aehaedt@jonesday.com

Chad A. Endsley  
Ohio Farm Bureau Federation  
280 North High Street  
P.O. Box 182383  
Columbus, OH 43218-2383  
cendsley@ofbf.org

Lisa G. McAlister  
Matthew W. Warnock  
Thomas J. O'Brien  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291  
lmcaster@bricker.com  
mwarnock@bricker.com  
tobrien@bricker.com

Laura Chappelle  
4218 Jacob Meadows  
Okemos, MI 48864  
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

Joel Malina  
Executive Director  
COMPLETE Coalition  
1317 F Street, NW  
Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20004  
malina@wexlerwalker.com

Brian P. Barger  
Brady, Coyle & Schmidt, Ltd.  
4052 Holland-Sylvania Road  
Toledo, OH 43623  
bpbarger@bcslawyers.com

Holly Rachel Smith  
Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC  
Hitt Business Center  
3803 Rectortown Road  
Marshall, VA 20115  
holly@raysmith.com

Michael R. Smalz  
Joseph V. Maskovyak  
Ohio Poverty Law Center  
555 Buttles Avenue  
Columbus, OH 43215  
msmalz@ohiopoveritylaw.org  
jmaskovyak@ohiopoveritylaw.org

Christopher J. Allwein  
Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC  
1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212  
Columbus, OH 43212  
callwein@wamenergyllaw.com

William L. Massey  
Covington & Burling, LLP  
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
wmassey@cov.com

Pamela A. Fox  
C. Todd Jones  
Christopher L. Miller  
Gregory H. Dunn  
Asim Z. Haque  
Stephen J. Smith  
Ice Miller LLP  
250 West Street  
Columbus, OH 43215  
pfox@hilliardohio.gov  
christopher.miller@icemiller.com  
gdunn@icemiller.com  
asim.haque@icemiller.com  
cmiller@szd.com

Douglas G. Bonner  
Emma F. Hand  
Keith C. Nusbaum  
Clinton A. Vince  
Daniel D. Barnowski  
SNR Denton US LLP  
1301 K Street NW  
Suite 600, East Tower  
Washington, DC 20005  
doug.bonner@snrdenton.com  
emma.hand@snrdenton.com  
keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com  
clinton.vince@snrdenton.com  
dan.barnowski@snrdenton.com

M. Howard Petricoff  
Michael J. Settineri  
Stephen M. Howard  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
52 East Gay Street  
P.O. Box 1008  
Columbus, OH 43216-1008  
mhpetricoff@vorys.com  
mjsettineri@vorys.com  
smhoward@vorys.com

Sandy Grace  
Assistant General Counsel  
Exelon Business Services Company  
101 Constitution Ave., NW  
Suite 400 East  
Washington, DC 20001  
sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Gary A Jeffries  
Assistant General Counsel  
Dominion Resources Services, Inc.  
501 Martindale Street, Suite 400  
Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817  
Gary.A.Jeffries@dom.com

Henry W. Eckhart  
1200 Chambers Road, Suite 106  
Columbus, OH 43212  
henryeckhart@aol.com

Steve W. Criss  
Manager, State Rate Proceedings  
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.  
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550  
Stephen.Chriss@wal-mart.com

David I. Fein  
Vice President, Energy Policy –  
Midwest  
Constellation Energy Group, Inc.  
Cynthia Fonner Brady  
Senior Counsel  
Constellation Energy Resources LLC  
550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300  
Chicago, IL 60661  
david.fein@constellation.com  
cynthia.brady@constellation.com

David M. Stahl  
Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP  
224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite  
1100  
Chicago, IL 60604  
dstahl@eimerstahl.com

Diem N. Kaelber  
Robert J. Walter  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1300  
Columbus, OH 43215  
kaelber@buckleyking.com  
walter@buckleyking.com



Jay L. Kooper  
Katherine Guerry  
Hess Corporation  
One Hess Plaza  
Woodbridge, NJ 07095  
jkooper@hess.com  
kguerry@hess.com

Allen Freifeld  
Samuel A. Wolfe  
Viridity Energy, Inc.  
100 West Elm Street, Suite 410  
Conshohocken, PA 19428  
afreifeld@viridityenergy.com  
swolfe@viridityenergy.com

Barth E. Royer  
Bell & Royer Co., LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, OH 43215-3927  
BarthRoyer@aol.com

Nolan Moser  
Trent A. Dougherty  
Cathryn Loucas  
Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, OH 43212-3449  
nolan@theoec.org  
trent@theoec.org  
cathy@theoec.org

Jacqueline Lake Roberts  
101 Federal Street, Suite 1100  
Boston, MA 02110  
jroberts@enernoc.com

Dane Stinson  
Bailey Cavalieri LLC  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100  
Columbus, OH 43215  
dane.stinson@baileycavalieri.com

Robert Korandovich  
KOREnergy  
P.O. Box 148  
Sunbury, OH 43074  
korenergy@insight.rr.com

Steve W. Chriss  
Manager, State Rate Proceedings  
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.  
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550  
Stephen.Chriss@wal-mart.com

Tara C. Santarelli  
Environmental Law & Policy Center  
1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201  
Columbus, OH 43212  
tsantarelli@elpc.org

Samuel C. Randazzo  
Joseph E. Oliker  
Frank P. Darr  
Matthew Pritchard  
McNees Wallace & Nurick  
21 East State Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
sam@mwncmh.com  
joliker@mwncmh.com  
fdarr@mwncmh.com  
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Benita Kahn  
Lija Kaleps-Clark  
Vorys Sater, Seymour and Pease LLC  
52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008  
Columbus, OH 43216-1008  
bakahn@vorys.com  
lkalepsclark@vorys.com

Vincent Parisi  
Matthew White  
Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.  
6100 Emerald Parkway  
Dublin, OH 43016  
vparisi@igsenergy.com  
mswhite@igsenergy.com

Kenneth P. Kreider  
David A. Meyer  
Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL  
One East Fourth Street, Suite 1400  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
kpkreider@kmlaw.com  
dmeyer@kmlaw.com

William Wright  
Werner Margard  
Thomas Lindgren  
John H. Jones  
Assistant Attorneys' General  
Public Utilities Section  
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
john.jones@puc.state.oh.us  
werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us  
thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us  
william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

Greta See  
Jonathan Tauber  
Attorney Examiner  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
greta.see@puc.state.oh.us  
jonathan.tauber@puc.state.oh.us

/s/ Roger P. Sugarman  
Roger P. Sugarman (0012007)

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**4/19/2012 4:26:10 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 11-0346-EL-SSO, 11-0348-EL-SSO, 11-0349-EL-AAM, 11-0350-EL-AAM**

Summary: Motion Motion of NFIB/Ohio to Intervene electronically filed by Mr. Roger P. Sugarman on behalf of The National Federation of Independent Business