# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Columbus Southern Power Company and	)	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO
Ohio Power Company for Authority to	)	Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant	)	
to Section 4928.143, Revised Code, in the	)	
Form of an Electric Security Plan	)	
In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Columbus Southern Power Company and	)	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM
Ohio Power Company for Approval of	)	Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
Certain Accounting Authority	)	

## MOTION TO INTERVENE OF DIRECT ENERGY SERVICES, LLC AND DIRECT ENERGY BUSINESS, LLC

Pursuant to Section 4903.221, Revised Code and Rule 4901-1-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code, Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC ("Direct Energy") moves for intervention in the above-styled proceeding as a full party of record. The reasons supporting the intervention are contained in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

WHEREFORE, Direct Energy respectfully requests that the Commission grant this Motion to Intervene and that Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC be made a full party of record.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Joseph M. Clark
Joseph M. Clark
6641 North High Street, Suite 200
Worthington, Ohio 43085
Tel. (614) 781-1896
Fax (812) 492-9275
jmclark@vectren.com

Attorney for Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE MOTION TO INTERVENE OF DIRECT ENERGY SERVICES, LLC AND DIRECT ENERGY BUSINESS, LLC

Section 4903.221, Revised Code and Rule 4901-1-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code, establish the standard for intervention in the above-styled proceeding as a full party of record.

Rule 4901-1-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code states in part:

Upon timely motion, any person shall be permitted to intervene in a proceeding upon a showing that:

\* \* \*

(2) The person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding, and the person is so situated that the disposition of the proceeding may, as a practical matter, impair or impede his or her ability to protect that interest, unless the person's interest is adequately represented by existing parties.

In addition to establishment of a direct interest, the factors that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (the "Commission") considers in implementing the above rule are the nature of the intervenor's interest, the extent that interest is represented by existing parties, the intervenor's potential contribution to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved, and whether intervention would result in an undue delay of the proceeding. (See also R.C. 4903.221(B) upon which the above rule is authorized). A review of these factors in light of following facts supports granting Direct Energy's intervention.

Direct Energy holds Certificate No.'s 00-019(5) and 00-0005(5) as a competitive retail electric supplier ("CRES") from the Commission to engage in the competitive sale of electric service to retail customers in Ohio. Direct Energy currently provides service to retail electric customers in the AEP-Ohio service area and has done so since 2002. Direct Energy has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding. Specifically, Direct Energy has a significant interest in several parts of the Application by AEP-Ohio, including but not limited to, the capacity charge paid by CRES to serve customers, the proposed energy auctions to serve standard service offer

customer load, AEP-Ohio's proposed corporate separation plan, and the various riders proposed

by AEP-Ohio.

The issues impacting Direct Energy, as identified above, demonstrate the depth of Direct

Energy's real and substantial interest in this case. Direct Energy will advance legal positions

which are directly relevant to the merits of the case and Direct Energy's position. Additionally,

Direct Energy's intervention is timely and will not unduly delay the instant proceedings. Direct

Energy's unique expertise and participation in the competitive retail and wholesale markets in

Ohio and across the country will significantly contribute to the development of a full and

complete record to assist the Commission in its consideration of the Application. Finally, Direct

Energy's direct and unique pecuniary interest in this proceeding cannot be represented by other

intervenors.

WHEREFORE, Direct Energy respectfully requests that the Commission grant this

Motion to Intervene and that it be made a full party of record.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Joseph M. Clark

Joseph M. Clark

6641 North High Street, Suite 200

Worthington, Ohio 43085

Tel. (614) 781-1896

Fax (812) 492-9275

jmclark@vectren.com

Attorney for Direct Energy Services, LLC and

Direct Energy Business, LLC

3

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing Motion to Intervene of Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC was served this 17<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2012 by electronic mail upon the persons listed below.

> /s/ Joseph M. Clark Joseph M. Clark

Matthew J. Satterwhite Steven T. Nourse Anne M. Vogel American Electric Power Service Corporation 1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215 misatterwhite@aep.com stnourse@aep.com amvogel@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway Porter Wright Morris & Arthur **Huntington Center** 41 S. High Street Columbus, OH 43215 dconway@porterwright.com

## On Behalf of Ohio Power Company ("AEP-Ohio")

Samuel C. Randazzo Joseph E. Oliker Frank P. Darr Matthew Pritchard McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC 21 E. State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215 sam@mwncmh.com joliker@mwncmh.com fdarr@mwncmh.com mpritchard@mwncmh.com

William Wright Werner Margard Thomas Lindgren John H. Jones Assistant Attorneys' General **Public Utilities Section** 180 East Broad Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215 john.jones@puc.state.oh.us werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

## On Behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities **Commission of Ohio**

Terry L. Etter Maureen R. Grady Jeffrey L. Small Assistant Consumers' Counsel 10 W. Broad St., Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215-3485 etter@occ.state.oh.us grady@occ.state.oh.us

small@occ.state.oh.us

On Behalf of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

## On Behalf of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

David F. Boehm Michael L. Kurtz Boehm, Kurtz & Lowery 36 E. 7<sup>th</sup> St., Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OH 45202 dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com

### On Behalf of the Ohio Energy Group

Gregory J. Poulos EnerNOC, Inc. 101 Federal Street, Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 gpoulos@enernoc.com

## ON BEHALF OF ENERNOC, INC.

Mark S. Yurick Zachary D. Kravitz Chester Willcox & Saxbe, LLP 65 East State Street, Suite 1000 Columbus, OH 43215 myurick@cwslaw.com zkravitz@cwslaw.com

### ON BEHALF OF THE KROGER CO.

Amy B. Spiller 139 East Fourth Street 1303-Main Cincinnati, OH 45202 Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Jeanne W. Kingery 155 East Broad Street, 21<sup>st</sup> Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com

### On Behalf of Duke Energy Retail Sales

Richard L. Sites General Counsel & Senior Director of Health Policy Ohio Hospital Association 155 East Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3620 ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O'Brien BRICKER & ECKLER, LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com

### OH BEHALF OF OHIO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION

Terrence O'Donnell Christopher Montgomery BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 todonnell@bricker.com cmontgomery@bricker.com

### ON BEHALF OF PAULDING WIND FARM II LLC

Lisa G. McAlister
Matthew W. Warnock
Thomas O'Brien
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Imcalister@bricker.com
mwarnock@bricker.com
tobrien@bricker.com

### ON BEHALF OF OMA ENERGY GROUP

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43215-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com

### ON BEHALF OF PJM POWER PROVIDERS GROUP AND THE RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY ASSOCIATION

M. Howard Petricoff
Michael Settineri
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43215-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com

William L. Massey Covington & Burling, LLP 1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Washington, DC 20004 wmassey@cov.com

Joel Malina
Executive Director
COMPLETE Coalition
1317 F Street, NW
Suite 600
Washington, DC 20004
malina@wexlerwalker.com

### ON BEHALF OF THE COMPETE COALITION

Jay E. Jadwin American Electric Power Service Corporation 1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215 jejadwin@aep.com

## ON BEHALF OF AEP RETAIL ENERGY PARTNERS LLC

Glen Thomas 1060 First Avenue, Ste. 400 King of Prussia, PA 19406 gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Laura Chappelle 4218 Jacob Meadows Okemos, MI 48864 laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

### ON BEHALF OF PJM POWER PROVIDERS GROUP

Henry W. Eckhart 1200 Chambers Road, Suite 106 Columbus, OH 43212 henryeckhart@aol.com

Christopher J. Allwein Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC 1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212 Columbus, OH 43212 callwein@williamsandmoser.com

ON BEHALF OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL AND THE SIERRA CLUB Barth E. Royer Bell & Royer Co. LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, Ohio barthroyer@aol.com

Gary A Jeffries Assistant General Counsel Dominion Resources Services, Inc. 501 Martindale Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817 Gary.A.Jeffries@aol.com

### ON BEHALF OF DOMINION RETAIL, INC.

Pamela A. Fox
C. Todd Jones,
Christopher L. Miller,
Gregory H. Dunn
Asim Z. Haque
Schottenstein Zox and Dunn Co., LPA
250 West Street
Columbus, OH 43215
pfox@hillardohio.gov
cmiller@szd.com
gdunn@szd.com
ahaque@szd.com

ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF HILLIARD, OHIO, THE CITY OF GROVE CITY, OHIO AND THE ASSOCIATION OF INDEPENDENT COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES OF OHIO M. Howard Petricoff
Michael J. Settineri
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com

David I. Fein
Vice President, Energy Policy – Midwest
Constellation Energy Group, Inc.
550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60661
David.fein@constellation.com

Cynthia Former Brady Senior Counsel Constellation Energy Resources, LLC 550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661 Cynthia.brady@constellation.com

# ON BEHALF OF CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY, INC., CONSTELLATION ENERGY COMMODITIES GROUP, INC.

Sandy I-ru Grace Assistant General Counsel Exelon Business Services Company 101 Constitution Ave., NW Suite 400 East Washington, DC 20001 sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

M. Howard Petricoff Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008 mhpetricoff@vorys.com

David M. Stahl Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP 224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100 Chicago, IL 60604 dstahl@eimerstahl.com

ON BEHALF OF EXELON GENERATION COMPANY, LLC

Jay L. Kooper Katherine Guerry Hess Corporation One Hess Plaza Woodbridge, NJ 07095 jkooper@hess.com kguerry@hess.com

### ON BEHALF OF HESS CORPORATION

Douglas G. Bonner
Emma F. Hand
Keith C. Nusbaum
Clinton A. Vince
Daniel D. Barnowski
SNR Denton US LLP
1301 K Street NW
Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
doug.bonner@snrdenton.com
emma.hand@snrdenton.com
keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com
clinton.vince@snrdenton.com
daniel.barnowski@snrdenton.com

## ON BEHALF OF ORMET PRIMARY ALUMINUM CORPORATION

Allen Freifeld Samuel A. Wolfe Viridity Energy, Inc. 100 West Elm Street, Suite 410 Conshohocken, PA 19428 afreifeld@viridityenergy.com swolfe@viridityenergy.com

Jacqueline Lake Roberts, Counsel of Record 101 Federal Street, Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 jroberts@enernoc.com Nolan Moser
Trent A. Dougherty
Camille Yancy
Cathryn Loucas
Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
nolan@theoec.org
trent@theoec.org
camille@theoec.org
cathy@theoec.org.

## ON BEHALF OF THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL

Kenneth P. Kreider
David A. Meyer
Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL
One East Fourth Street
Suite 1400
Cincinnati, OH 45202
kpkreider@kmklaw.com

Holly Rachel Smith Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC Hitt Business Center 3803 Rectortown Road Marshall, VA 20115 holly@raysmithlaw.com

dmeyer@kmklaw.com

Steve W. Chriss Manager, State Rate Proceedings Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. Bentonville, AR 72716-0550 Stephen.Chriss@wal-mart.com

# ON BEHALF OF WAL-MART STORES EAST, LP AND SAM'S EAST, INC.

Mark A. Whitt
Melissa L. Thompson
Whitt Sturtevant LLP
PNC Plaza, Suite 2020
155 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
whit@whitt-sturtevant.com
thompson@whitt-sturtevant.com

Vincent Parisi Matthew White Interstate Gas Supply, Inc. 6100 Emerald Parkway ON BEHALF OF CPOWER, INC., VIRIDITY ENERGY, INC., ENERGY CONNECT INC., COMVERGE INC., ENERWISE GLOBAL TECHNOLOGIES, INC., AND ENERGY CURTAILMENT SPECIALISTS, INC.

Robert Korandovich KOREnergy P.O. Box 148 Sunbury, OH 43074 korenergy@insight.rr.com

#### ON BEHALF OF KORENERGY

Benita Kahn Lija Kaleps-Clark Vorys Sater, Seymour and Pease LLC 52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008 bakahn@vorys.com lkalepsclark@vorys.com

# ON BEHALF OF OHIO CABLE TELECOMMUNICATIONS ASSOCIATION

Chad A. Endsley Chief Legal Counsel Ohio Farm Bureau Federation 280 North High Street, P.O. Box 182383 Columbus, OH 43218-2383 cendsley@ofbf.org.

# ON BEHALF OF THE OHIO FARM BUREAU FEDERATION

Robert A. McMahon Eberly McMahon 2321 Kemper Lane, Suite 100 Cincinnati, Ohio 45206

Rocco D'Ascenzo
Elizabeth Watts
139 East Fourth Street
1303-Main
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
Elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com
Rocco.d'ascenzo@duke-energy.com

### On Behalf of Duke Energy Ohio

Dublin, OH 43016 vparisi@igsenergy.com mswhite@igsenergy.com

### ON BEHALF OF INTERSTATE GAS SUPPLY, INC.

Brian P. Barger Brady, Coyle & Schmidt, LTD 4052 Holland-Sylvania Rd. Toledo, OH 43623 bpbarger@bcslawyers.com

## ON BEHALF OF THE OHIO CONSTRUCTION MATERIALS COALITION

Dane Stinson
BAILEY CAVALIERI LLC
10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100
Columbus, OH 43215

ON BEHALF OF THE OHIO ASSOCIATION OF SCHOOL BUSINESS OFFICIALS, THE OHIO SCHOOL BOARDS ASSOCIATION, THE OHIO SCHOOLS COUNCIL AND THE BUCKEYE ASSOCIATION OF SCHOOL ADMINISTRATORS

Diem N. Kaelber Robert J Walter 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1300 Columbus, Ohio 43215 kaelber@buckleyking.com walter@buckleyking.com

## ON BEHALF OF OHIO RESTAURANT ASSOCIATION

Amy B. Spiller 139 East Fourth Street 1303-Main Cincinnati, OH 45202 Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Jeanne W. Kingery 155 East Broad Street, 21<sup>st</sup> Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com

# On Behalf of Duke Energy Commercial Asset Management, Inc.

Greta See Jon Tauber Attorney Examiner Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215

### **ATTORNEY EXAMINERS**

Michael R. Smalz Joseph V. Maskovyak Ohio Poverty Law Center 555 Buttles Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215 msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

# On Behalf of the Appalachian Peace and Justice Network

David A. Kutik Allison E. Haedt Jones Day 901 Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, Ohio 44114 <u>dakutik@jonesday.com</u> aehaedt@jonesday.com

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Avenue
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

Mark A. Hayden FirstEnergy Service Company 76 South Main Street Akron, Ohio 44308 haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

### On Behalf of FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

Tara C. Santarelli (0084255) Environmental Law & Policy Center 1207 Grandview Ave. Suite 201 Columbus, Ohio 43212 E-mail: tsantarelli@elpc.org

# On Behalf of the Environmental Law & Policy Center

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

4/17/2012 8:41:19 AM

in

Case No(s). 11-0346-EL-SSO, 11-0348-EL-SSO, 11-0349-EL-AAM, 11-0350-EL-AAM

Summary: Motion to Intervene of Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC electronically filed by Mr. Joseph Clark on behalf of Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC