## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

)

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company for Authority to Provide for a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. § 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric Security Plan

) Case No. 12-1230-EL-SSO

## MOTION FOR LEAVE TO INTERVENE OF EXELON GENERATION COMPANY, LLC AND CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY, INC.

Now come Exelon Generation Company, LLC and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. (jointly "Exelon"), who, pursuant to Section 4903.221, Revised Code and Rule 4901-1-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code, move for intervention in the above styled proceeding as full parties of record. The reasons supporting the intervention are contained in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

WHEREFORE, Exelon respectfully requests that the Commission grant this joint motion

for leave to intervene and that Exelon be made a full party of record.

Respectfully Submitted,

"Celeat

M. Howard Petricoff (0008287) Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street P. O. Box 1008 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008 Tel. (614) 464-5414 Fax (614) 464-6350

Attorneys for Exelon Generation Company, LLC and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE MOTION TO INTERVENE OF EXELON GENERATION COMPANY, LLC AND CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY, INC. AND COMMENT ON THE PROPOSED PROCEDURAL SCHEDULE

Section 4903.221, Revised Code and Rule 4901-1-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code,

establish the standard for intervention in the above-styled proceeding as a full party of record.

Rule 4901-1-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code states in part:

Upon timely motion, any person shall be permitted to intervene in a proceeding upon a showing that:

\* \* \*

(2) The person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding, and the person is so situated that the disposition of the proceeding may, as a practical matter, impair or impede his or her ability to protect that interest, unless the person's interest is adequately represented by existing parties.

In addition to establishment of a direct interest, the factors that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (the "Commission") considers in implementing the above rule are the nature of the intervenor's interest, the extent that interest is represented by existing parties, the intervenor's potential contribution to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved, and whether intervention would result in an undue delay of the proceeding. (See also R.C. 4903.221(B) upon which the above rule is authorized). A review of these factors in light of following facts supports granting Constellation's intervention.

Exelon Generation Company, LLC, which owns or controls approximately 30,000 MWs of generating facilities, is a subsidiary of Exelon Corporation, which is located at 10 S. Dearborn Street, Chicago, Illinois. Exelon Power Team is the wholesale marketing division of Exelon Generation Company and is a leading power marketer throughout the country. Exelon Energy Company ("Exelon Energy") is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Exelon Generation and is (i) an electric retail service provider in Illinois, Pennsylvania and Ohio; and (ii) a gas retail service

provider in Illinois, Michigan, Ohio and Pennsylvania. Exelon Generation Company, LLC will be focused on the impact of the application on the wholesale generation market.

Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. ("CNE") provides electricity and energy-related services to retail customers in Ohio as well as in 15 other states, the District of Columbia and two Canadian provinces and serves more than 15,000 megawatts of load and more than 10,000 customers. CNE holds a certificate as a competitive retail electric supplier ("CRES") from the Commission to engage in the competitive sale of electric service to retail customers in Ohio. CNE currently provides service to retail electric customers in the FirstEnergy service territory and in the State of Ohio.

In its application, Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company (collectively, "FirstEnergy") is requesting Commission approval of an Electric Security Plan ("ESP") pursuant to Section 4928.141, Revised Code. FirstEnergy characterizes the newly-filed ESP as a continuation of the ESP currently in effect, with modifications including the following: 1) potentially enabling the Companies to bid demand response resources and energy efficiency resources into the PJM 2015-2016 Base Residual Auction; 2) modifying the bid schedule previously approved in the Companies' current ESP so that the bids to occur in October 2012 and January 2013 will be for a three year period rather than a one year period; and 3) extending the recovery period for renewable energy credit costs over the life of the ESP plan.

Exelon has business interests in the State that will be affected by the outcome of the proceeding. As a potential supplier of electric power and energy to customers in the FirstEnergy service territory, Exelon has an interest in the instant proceeding as the Commission assesses whether the Application is consistent with Senate Bill 221. In addition, the Commission is being

3

asked to make other decisions that will affect the viability of the competitive electric market in Ohio in which Exelon Generation Company, LLC provides electric power and other products and services to wholesale customers and in which Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. is a supplier of electric power and energy to retail customers.

FirstEnergy is seeking Commission action essentially on the face of the Application, without the customary time that is allotted for testimony, hearings, or briefings in ESP cases. To that end, FirstEnergy has filed a Motion for Waiver of Rules, Request for Expedited Treatment, in which it seeks Commission action by May 2, 2012, and in no instance later than June 20, 2012. FirstEnergy contends that the Stipulation included in its Application resolves the vast majority of issues and concerns.

The desire for quick action in this case must be weighed against the fact that parties are being asked to forgo any changes to the FirstEnergy market structure for an additional two years. Although Exelon Generation appreciates and respects the stated goal of the expedited process, the Stipulation does not address any lessons learned or seek to make improvements to the competitive wholesale procurement process, and does not address any potential enhancements to the rules and regulations that govern the retail electric market structure. For example, with simple changes to the auction construct and the terms included in the Master Supply Agreement, the competitiveness of the auction and the prices of winning bids can be improved, which will ultimately inure to the benefit of Ohio consumers. Additionally, modifications can and should be made on the data, information, and operational issues that affect the viability and competitiveness of the retail electric market, similarly benefiting customers. The instant proceeding provides the Commission with an opportunity to address such issues for the improvement of the competitive retail and wholesale market. However, if the Commission chooses to approve the Stipulation for the overarching reasons articulated by the Applicants, the Commission should establish a means by which these issues can be addressed and resolved, whether it be through a separate docketed proceeding or through some other forum or process in which the Commission retains oversight.

This motion for intervention precedes any intervention deadline, which has not yet been set by the Commission, and should not unduly delay the instant proceedings. Finally, because of its unique expertise and participation in the competitive retail and wholesale markets in Ohio and across the country, Exelon will be able to assist in the development of a full and complete record to assist the Commission in its consideration of the Application.

WHEREFORE, Exelon respectfully requests that the Commission grant this motion for leave to intervene and that Exelon be made a full party of record. For purposes of receiving service in the proceeding, in addition to the undersigned, Exelon requests that the following persons be placed on the official service list:

Stephen Bennett Retail Policy Manager Exelon Generation Company, LLC 300 Exelon Way Kennett Square, PA 19348 Stephen.bennett@exeloncorp.com

David I. Fein Vice President, State Government Affairs - East Exelon Corporation 550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661 david.fein@constellation.com Sandy I-ru Grace Assistant General Counsel Exelon Business Services Company 101 Constitution Ave., N.W. Washington DC 20001 Sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Cynthia Brady Senior Counsel Constellation Energy Resources, LLC 550 West Washington, Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661 cynthia.brady@constellation.com Respectfully Submitted,

mo stat

M. Howard Petricoff (0008287) VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 East Gay Street P. O. Box 1008 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008 Tel. (614) 464-5414 Fax (614) 464-6350

Attorneys for Exelon Generation Company, LLC and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing document was served this 16<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2012 by electronic mail or, where indicated, by regular U.S. mail, postage prepaid, upon the persons listed below.

Worng

M. Howard Petricoff

Asim Z. Haque Ice Miller LLP 250 West Street Columbus, OH 43215 asim.haque@icemiller.com

Colleen L. Mooney OPAE 1431 Mulford Road Columbus, OH 43212 <u>cmooney2@columbus.rr.com</u>

Laura McBride Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP 1400 KeyBank Center 800 Superior Avenue Cleveland, OH 44114 Imcbride@calfee.com Matthew S. White IGS 6100 Emerald Parkway Dublin, OH 43016 mswhite@igsenergy.com

Joseph M. Clark Direct Energy / Vectren Source 6641 North High Street, Suite 200 Worthington, OH 43085 jmclark@vectren.com This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/16/2012 5:02:02 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-1230-EL-SSO

Summary: Motion Motion for Leave to Intervene electronically filed by M HOWARD PETRICOFF on behalf of Exelon Generation Company, LLC and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.