

Norman J. Kennard Direct Dial: 717.255.7627 nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

April 11, 2012

Barcy McNeal, Secretary of the Commission Attn: Docketing Division Public Utility Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215-3793

## Re: In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation into Intrastate Carrier Access Reform Pursuant to S.B. 162; Case No. 10-2387-TP-COI

Dear Secretary McNeal:

In accordance with the Commission's February 29 and March 8, 2012 Entries in the above-referenced matter, New Knoxville Telephone Company ("NKT") hereby files its calculations supporting the mandated reductions to its intrastate access rates. The attached calculations have been redacted to protect data NKT considers confidential and proprietary. NKT is contemporaneously filing the confidential, unredacted calculations under seal, via Federal Express, pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D), along with a related Motion for Protective Order.

NKT does not have non-access reciprocal compensation rates that are above the Company's interstate access rates at this time.

If you are in need of anything additional, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

THOMAS, LONG, NIESEN & KENNARD Notrran J. Kennard By:

cc: Per Certificate of Service

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

:

In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation into Intrastate Carrier Access Reform Pursuant to S.B. 162

Case No. 10-2387-TP-COI

## MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER OF NEW KNOXVILLE TELEPHONE COMPANY

New Knoxville Telephone Company ("NKT"), pursuant to the regulations of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO" or "Commission") at Ohio Adm. Code §4901-1-24 and the Commission's Entry in the above matter dated February 29, 2012 at Paragraph 6, files this Motion for Protective Order to preserve the confidential and proprietary nature of certain of the information to be filed by NKT in response to said Entry. The basis for this motion is set forth in the accompanying memorandum in support. NKT submits that the non-disclosure of this confidential and proprietary information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49, Ohio Revised Code.

In conformance with Rule 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code, NKT has or will file only such information redacted as is essential to prevent disclosure of confidential and proprietary information and has or will file three (3) unredacted copies of the documents for which confidential protection is sought under seal.

NKT recognizes that pursuant to PUCO regulation 4901-1-24(F), unless otherwise ordered, any order prohibiting disclosure of the information for which confidential treatment was

sought or granted essentially will automatically expire after 18 months. While the actual figures provided by NKT may change due to the passage of time, NKT submits that the sensitive nature of the information will not. Accordingly, in this Motion, NKT also requests that the Commission or its authorized representative not only grant a Protective Order as requested herein, but also provide that such Order shall remain in effect and the information not automatically become public.

For the reasons stated more fully in the accompanying memorandum, NKT requests that its Motion for Protective Order as described herein be granted.

Respectfully submitted,

THOMAS, LONG, NIESEN & KENNARD

Norman J. Kennard, PA ID No. 29921 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500 (717) 255-7600

Attorneys for the New Knoxville Telephone Company

Date: April 11, 2012

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

:

In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation into Intrastate Carrier Access Reform Pursuant to S.B. 162

Case No. 10-2387-TP-COI

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF NEW KNOXVILLE TELEPHONE COMPANY'S MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

By Entry dated February 29, 2012, the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO" or "Commission") has requested certain information be submitted. The Commission also noted in the February 29<sup>th</sup> Entry that: "To the extent that an ILEC or CLEC seeks confidential treatment of portions of the information supporting its application, the appropriate motion should be filed pursuant to Rule 4901-1-24, Ohio Administrative Code, interested entities should enter into the necessary protective agreements to the extent that there is interest in reviewing information that has been designated as being confidential."

New Knoxville Telephone Company ("NKT") seeks confidential protection for all information designated as confidential and/or proprietary in the accompanying filing (along with any and all copies, including electronic copies) be protected from public disclosure. The confidential information consists of NKT's required access reduction calculations required by the Commission's February 29, 2012 and March 8, 2012 Entries. The access quantity and total revenue figures constitute NKT confidential trade secret information and are deserving of protection as the Commission contemplated in paragraph 6 of the February 29, 2012 Entry.

The demand and revenue information filed by NKT is proprietary and confidential information, is competitively sensitive and not otherwise subject to public disclosure. Given the

competitive environment of today's telecommunications industry, disclosure of such competitively sensitive and confidential information would be harmful to NKT, giving its competitors a competitive advantage through disclosure of information not otherwise made publicly available and adversely affecting NKT's ability both to conduct business with other carriers and compete against them. As such, this information also qualifies for confidential protection as a trade secret pursuant to Section 1333.61(D) of the Revised Code.

The Commission has previously recognized the sensitive nature of information required to be filed in access restructuring proceedings in both this proceeding, as well as the proceeding at Case No. 97-632-TP-COI, involving the Commission Investigation of the Intrastate Universal Service Discounts, and the proceeding at Case No. 00-127-TP-COI, involving the Commission's Investigation into the Modification of Intrastate Access Charges, where NKT and other carriers sought and the Commission granted confidential protection of financially sensitive information.<sup>1</sup> Moreover, as stated above, the Commission has already recognized in the current docket the potential disclosure of competitively sensitive information in its data requests, and invited the filing of a motion for protective order to the extent necessary.

NKT has narrowly tailored its request to seek confidential protection of only that data that is not available within the public domain and the release of which would be injurious to it. Accordingly, NKT respectfully requests that its Motion for Protective Order be granted.

Moreover, as noted in the Motion, NKT requests that in its Order the Commission also provide that Section 4901-1-24(F) of its regulations will not apply and that the protection afforded will not automatically expire after 18 months. While the actual numbers provided in the confidential responses to the data requests may change over time, disclosure reveals not only the actual numbers, but also their relative relation to each other, a factor not derivable from public

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See e.g. In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation Into the Modification of Intrastate Access Charges, Case No. 00-127-TP-COI, January 11, 2001 Opinion and Order at 2, footnote 3.

information and therefore which remains a confidential piece of information that upon disclosure will provide meaningful information to competitors and other interests adversarial to NKT. For these reasons, NKT requests the Commission also provide in a protective order that the confidential protection afforded this limited data will continue.

Respectfully submitted,

THOMAS, LONG, MESEN & KENNARD

Norman J. Kennard, PA ID No. 29921 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500 (717) 255-7600

Attorneys for New Knoxville Telephone Company

Dated: April 11, 2012

**New Knoxville Telephone Company** 2012 Transitional Access Rate Calculation

### 10-2387-TP-COI Redacted

Rev. Rate

0.032630

\$

State Term M	OU			
	XS at Interstate:	anna an	1	
Total Term A				
	Delta Reduction	zaruu () ee hees kai poor samaa sa waa (Kaiki (Kaiki ee sa pomus		
<b>Carrier</b> Com	mon Line (Termina	ating)		
· · · · · ·	Rate	Revenue	Allocation	Revised Rev Req
Interstate	\$ - [	an finansi ya kata na k		
Intrastate	\$ 0.042800			
Local Switch	ing			
L	Rate			
Interstate	\$ 0.044902			
Intrastate	\$ 0.040400			
Info Surchar	ge (stated at MOU	rate)		
•	Rate			
Interstate	\$ 0.000494			
Intrastate	\$ 0.000198			
Transport fac	cility (14 miles x 22	<u>%</u> )		

Intrastate	\$ 0.040400	no change
Info Surcharg	ge (stated at MOU rate)	
	Rate	
Interstate	\$ 0.000494	
Intrastate	\$ 0.000198	no change
Transport fac	ility (14 miles x 22%)	
	Rate	
Interstate	\$ 0.000402	
Intrastate	\$ 0.000090	no change
Transport Te	rm	
	Rate	
Interstate	\$ 0.002090	no change
Intrastate	\$ 0.000443	
TIC - Termin	ating	

	Rate	Revenue	
Interstate	\$ -	u <sup>n</sup> a en antien an	
Intrastate	\$ 0.015055	5	

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing has been served electronically to the persons listed below, this 11<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2012.

Mary Ryan Fenlon Jon F. Kelly AT&T Services, Inc. 150 East Gay Street, Room 4-C Columbus, OH 43215 mf1842@att.com, jk2961@att.com

Douglas E. Hart 441 Vine Street, Suite 4192 Cincinnati, OH 45202 <u>dhart@douglasehart.com</u>

Charles Carrathers Verizon 600 Hidden Ridge HQE03H51 Irving, TX 75038 chuck.carrathers@verizon.com

William A. Adams, Esquire Bailey Cavalieri LLC 10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100 Columbus, OH 43215-3422 William.Adams@baileycavalieri.com

Stephen M. Howard, Esquire Benita A. Kahn, Esquire Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street Columbus, OH 43216-1008 <u>smhoward@vorys.com</u> bekahn@vorys.com

Terry L. Etter Assistant Consumers' Counsel 10 W. Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215 <u>etter@occ.state.oh.us</u> William Wright Assistant Attorney General; Chief, Public Utilities Section 180 E. Broad Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215 bill.wright@puc.state.oh.us

Garnet Hanley, Esquire T-Mobile USA, Inc. 401 9<sup>th</sup> Street, NW, Suite 550 Washington, DC 20004 <u>Garnet.Hanly@T-Mobile.com</u>

David Haga Verizon 1320 North Courthouse Road Arlington, VA 22201 david.haga@verizon.com

Diane C. Browning, Esquire Sprint Nextel 6450 Sprint Parkway Overland Park, KS 66251 diane.c.browning@sprint.com

Thomas O'Brien, Esquire Bricker and Eckler, LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215 tobrien@bricker.com

Barth E. Royer Bell & Royer 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927 barthroyer@aol.com Kevin Saville, Esquire Frontier Communications Corporation 2378 Wilshire Boulevard Mound, MN 55364 <u>kevin.saville@ftr.com</u> Zsuzsanna E. Benedek, Esquire CenturyLink 240 North Third Street, Suite 300 Harrisburg, PA 17101 <u>sue.benedek@centurylink.com</u>

Norman & Kennard, Esquire, PA ID No. 29921 THOMAS, LONG, NIESEN & KENNARD 212 Locust Street, Suite 500 Harrisburg, PA 17108-9500 (717) 255-7600

Attorneys for the New Knoxville Telephone Company

# This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/11/2012 5:10:00 PM

in

Case No(s). 10-2387-TP-COI

Summary: Notice New Knoxville Telephone Company calculations supporting mandated reductions to its intrastate access rates (public version), Motion for Protective Order and Memorandum in Support electronically filed by Ms. Teresa L Thomas on behalf of Small Local Exchange Carriers Group