

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

2012 A	CCEIVED-O	(8)
رم	PRIOPR	3: 3c
P - COI	0.0	-0

In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation into Intrastate Carrier Access Reform Pursuant to Sub. S.B. 162

) Case No. 10 - 2387 - TP - COI

### MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D), Kalida Telephone Company, Inc. ("Kalida") hereby moves the Commission for a protective order regarding the confidential information that it is filing contemporaneously with this Motion, specifically the unredacted version of its calculations supporting the mandated reductions in its intrastate access rates (the "Confidential Information"). Specifically, Kalida seeks to protect its FY 2011 Intrastate Demand figures (the "MOU") and related revenues derived from the MOU.

Kalida requests that the Commission issue such order as is necessary to protect the Confidential Information. Non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code because the Commission and its Staff will have full access to the Confidential Information in order to fulfill their statutory obligations.

The bases for this Motion may be found in the attached Memorandum of Support.

Respectfully submitted,

KALIDA TELEPHONE COMPANY, INC.

By:

Carolyn S. Flahive (0072404)

THOMPSON HINE LLP 41 S. High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-3200 Facsimile: (614) 469-3361

Its Counsel

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Pate Processed APR 10 2012

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation	)
into Intrastate Carrier Access Reform Pursuant	) Case No. 10 - 2387 - TP - CO
to Sub, S.B. 162	<b>)</b> .

# MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

In accordance with the Commission's March 20, 2012 Entry in this proceeding, Kalida is concurrently filing its calculations supporting the mandated reductions to its intrastate access rates. One element of the calculations is Kalida's FY 2011 Intrastate Demand (the "MOU"), which Kalida considers to be confidential and proprietary data. Further, the calculations include related revenue information that is derived from the MOU (together, the MOU and the related derived revenues shall be referred to herein as the "Confidential Information"). Because Kalida considers the MOU and derived revenues to be confidential, the unredacted version of the calculations has been filed under seal as required by Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-24(D).

The Confidential Information includes detail about Kalida's finances and operations that would be of significant interest to competitors. Consequently, that data constitutes confidential information that should not be disclosed in the public record.

The Confidential Information constitutes trade secrets as defined in Revised Code §1333.61(D). The information (1) derives economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use, and (2) is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

The Ohio Supreme Court adopted six factors to be used in determining whether a trade secret claim meets the statutory definition:

- 1) The extent to which the information is known outside the business;
- 2) The extent to which it is known to those inside the business, i.e., by the employees;
- 3) The precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information;
- 4) The savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors;
- 5) The amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information; and
- 6) The amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information.

State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Ins., 80 Ohio St.3d 513, 524-525 (1997).

With the exception of Kalida's billing vendor, the Confidential Information is not known outside of Kalida and is known within Kalida only to senior managers and a limited number of employees with a particular need to know. Kalida has taken precautions to guard the secrecy of the Confidential Information by limiting its dissemination. Disclosure of the Confidential Information would harm Kalida's competitive position in the marketplace. (See attached Affidavit of Chris J. Phillips, Manager.)

The protection of trade secret information from public disclosure is consistent with the purposes of Title 49 because the Commission and its Staff have access to the information.

Granting protection of the Confidential Information requested herein will not impair the Commission's regulatory responsibilities.

Confidential treatment of the calculations is therefore both appropriate and required by Ohio law and the Commission's rules. For the foregoing reasons, Kalida prays that its Motion for Protective Order be granted.

### Respectfully submitted,

### KALIDA TELEPHONE COMPANY, INC.

By: Carolyn S. Flahive (0072404)

THOMPSON HINE LLP 41 S. High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, Ohio 43215 Telephone: (614) 469-3200 Facsimile: (614) 469-3361

Its Counsel

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Commission's Investigation	)
into Intrastate Carrier Access Reform Pursuant	) Case No. 10 - 2387 - TP - COI
to Sub. S.B. 162	)

#### AFFIDAVIT OF CHRIS J. PHILLIPS

STATE OF OHIO

#### COUNTY OF PUTNAM

**NOW COMES** Chris J. Phillips, being first duly cautioned and sworn, deposes and says as follows:

- I am Manager of Kalida Telephone Company, Inc. ("Kalida"); PO Box 267, Kalida, OH
   45853. I am authorized to make this Affidavit on behalf of Kalida, and do so in the ordinary discharge of my responsibilities.
- I have personal knowledge of all relevant matters pertaining to the calculations that
   Kalida filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio on April 10, 2012, including
   the MOU and related revenue data.
- 3. Kalida considers the MOU and related revenue data (together, the "Confidential Information") to be confidential.
- 4. The Confidential Information is not otherwise available to the general public, and includes detail about Kalida's finances and operations that would be of significant interest to competitors. Consequently, Kalida is requesting that the Confidential Information not be disclosed to the public.
- 5. The Confidential Information derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means, by other persons who can derive economic value from its disclosure or use.

- 6. With the exception of Kalida's billing vendor, the Confidential Information is provided only to Kalida's senior management and a restricted list of employees who have a particular need to know the Information.
- 7. The Confidential Information is indicative of Kalida's operations and, therefore, public disclosure of the Confidential Information would place Kalida at a competitive and economic disadvantage.
- The Confidential Information is the subject of efforts by Kalida that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

FURTHER AFFIANT SAYETH NAUGHT.

Putnam County Comm. Exp. 9/22/16 Chris J. Phillips Chris J. Phillips

Sworn to before me and subscribed in my presence this of April, 2012.

Notary Public

703540.1

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

It is hereby certified that a true copy of the foregoing was served via electronic mail to

the persons listed below this 10th day of April, 2012.

Terry Etter
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
etter@occ.state.oh.us

Douglas E. Hart Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company LLC 441 Vine Street, Suite 4192 Cincinnati, OH 45202 dhart@douglasehart.com

Barth E. Royer
Bell & Royer Co., LPA
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215-3927
barthroyer@aol.com

Garnet Hanly T-Mobile USA, Inc. 401 Ninth Street, NW, Suite 550 Washington, DC 20004 garnet.hanly@t-mobile.com

William Adams
Bailey Cavalieri LLC
10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100
Columbus, OH 43215-3422
William.Adams@BaileyCavalieri.com

Norman J. Kennard
Regina L. Matz
Teresa Thomas
Thomas, Long, Niesen & Kennard
212 Locust St., Suite 500
P.O. Box 9500
Harrisburg, PA 17108
nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com
rmatz@thomaslonglaw.com

Mary Ryan Fenlon
Jon F. Kelly
AT&T Services, Inc.
150 East Gay Street, Room 4C
Columbus, OH 43215
mfl842@att.com
jk2961@att.com

David Haga Verizon 1320 North Courthouse Road Arlington, VA 22201 david.haga@verizon.com

Zxuzsanna E. Benedek CenturyLink 240 North Third Street, Suite 300 Harrisburg, PA 17101 sue.benedek@centurylink.com

Thomas J. O'Brien Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 453215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com

Richard R. Parsons Kravitz Brown & Dortch LLC 65 East State Street, Suite 200 Columbus, OH 43215 rparsons@kravitzll.com

Kate Dutton
Access Point, Inc.
1100 Crescent Green, Suite 109
Cary, NC 27518
kate.dutton@accesspointinc.com

Mary T. Buley 300 South Highway 169, Suite 700 Minneapolis, MN 55426 mary.buley@onvoy.com

Diane C. Browning
Sprint Nextel
6450 Sprint Parkway
Mailstop KSOPHN0314-3A459
Overland Park, KS 66251
diane.c.browning@sprint.com

Kevin Saville
Frontier Communications Corporation
2378 Wilshire Boulevard
Mound, MN 55364
kevin.saville@ftr.com

Gary M. Zingaretti
ICORE
253 South Franklin Street
Wilkes-Barre, PA 18701
gzing@icoreinc.com

Mary Cegelski
First Communications, Inc.
15278 Neo Parkway
Garfield Heights, OH 44128
mcegelski@firstcomm.com

D. Anthony Mastando Vice President, Regulatory Affairs 7037 Old Madison Pike Huntsville, AL 35806 tony.mastando@corp.earthlink.com Sandi Murphy
First Telecom Services, LLC
3340 West Market Street
Akron, Ohio 44333
smurphy@firstcomm.com

Benita Kahn
Stephen M. Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease, LLP
52 E. Gay Street, PO Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008
bakahn@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com

Gary Baki CenturyLink 50 W. Broad Street, Suite 3600 Columbus, OH 43215 gary.s.baki@centurylink.com

William Wright
Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

Laura McGrath
Technologies Management, Inc.
2600 Maitland Center Parkway
Maitland, FL 32751
lmcgrath@tminc.com

Carolyn S. Flahiye