#### **BEFORE**

### THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Commission's	)	
Investigation into Intrastate Carrier Access	)	Case No. 10-2387-TP-COI
Reform Pursuant to Sub. S. B. 162.	)	

## AT&T'S ADDITIONAL SUPPLEMENTAL REPLY COMMENTS

## I. Introduction

Pursuant to the Commission's Entry in this proceeding, dated January 18, 2011, the AT&T Entities<sup>1</sup> ("AT&T") through their counsel, hereby submit additional supplemental reply comments for the Commission's and the parties' consideration. The Commission sought comment on the Federal Communications Commission's ("FCC") Report and Order and Further Notice of Proposed Rulemaking ("FNPRM") in the USF and ICC Reform Proceeding *In the Matter of Connect America Fund et al.*, WC Docket No. 10-90 et al. ("Report and Order") released on November 18, 2011.

In addition to AT&T, ten parties filed additional supplemental comments on February 10. In our comments, AT&T recommended that in the near term, the Commission should focus on the prompt and accurate implementation of the July 1, 2012 intrastate rate changes prescribed in the FCC's Report and Order.

As AT&T noted in its initial comments, the Commission's focus should now be on how best to implement the FCC required changes. To that end, AT&T now proposes a course of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The AT&T Entities are The Ohio Bell Telephone Company d/b/a AT&T Ohio, AT&T Communications of Ohio, Inc., TCG Ohio, SBC Long Distance d/b/a AT&T Long Distance, SNET America, Inc. d/b/a AT&T Long Distance East, and New Cingular Wireless PCS, LLC d/b/a AT&T Mobility.

action for the Commission's consideration. The Commission well knows that there will be an extraordinary amount of information that will be turned over to the Commission in conjunction with tariff filings. It will be extremely difficult for the staff to review all of the data in a timely manner and ensure its accuracy given the July 1 effective date of the new intrastate access rates. Therefore, AT&T proposes that certain data should be filed by May 1, 2012, to allow the Commission and other interested parties the opportunity to conduct preliminary reviews of the July 1, 2012, state tariff filings.

Specifically, AT&T proposes that the Commission order all LECs (ILECs and CLECs) not already at parity to file by May 1 the following:

- 1) The LEC's intrastate demand for Transitional Intrastate Access Service, <sup>2</sup> by rate element, for fiscal year 2011.
- 2) The LEC's intrastate rates as of December 29, 2011 for Transitional Intrastate Access Service. As AT&T stated in its Additional Supplemental Comments (at p. 3), some carriers do not currently list their intrastate rates in their tariffs.
- 3) The LEC's interstate rates as of December 29, 2011 for Transitional Intrastate Access Service.
- 4) Along with the rates, LECs should explain how they intend to calculate July 1 access rates (or, if the LEC prefers, it can simply provide the calculation of new rates) and an

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> (j) Transitional Intrastate Access Service. A Transitional Intrastate Access Service means terminating End Office Access Service that was subject to intrastate access rates as of December 31, 2011; terminating Tandem-Switched Transport Access Service that was subject to intrastate access rates as of December 31, 2011; and originating and terminating Dedicated Transport Access Service that was subject to intrastate access rates as of December 31, 2011. See Report and Order, p. 507.

- explanation as to how it will meet the requirements set forth in the FCC's Report and Order.
- 5) If a LEC is using a different rate structure for intrastate and interstate rates, then the ILEC or CLEC must also provide a detailed explanation of how it intends to develop the new intrastate rates and how the calculation will meet the FCC's rate reduction requirements set forth in the FCC's Report and Order, including the intrastate demand used for calculations.

To the extent that a LEC maintains that the information is confidential, then the Protective Order issued in this docket by Attorney Examiner Entry dated February 14, 2011 (that protects confidential information filed on November 3, 2010) should apply to all confidential information in this case. Protective agreements entered into between carriers should likewise carry over and cover the new information.

By requiring all LECs to file the information noted above, all interested parties will have an opportunity to review LECs' data and LECs' rate development. AT&T would also like to take this opportunity to again urge the Commission to specify what happens if a carrier fails to file either the required data on May 1 or their proposed tariff pages on June 1. As AT&T mentioned in its Additional Supplemental Comments, the Massachusetts Department of Telecommunications and Cable Order on Compliance well addressed such a situation, where the regulators provided CLECs with an incentive to file necessary switched access rate reductions by putting CLECs on notice that their "old" access rates would be considered unjust and reasonable and carriers would not be required to pay them. (See Attachment 1 to AT&T's Additional Supplemental Comments)

The Commission must set forth a timely and accurate procedure in order to implement the terminating switched access and transport rate reductions ordered by the FCC. AT&T submits that the process proposed is clear and simple for Staff, carriers and interested parties for the purpose of meeting the July 1 implementation.

Respectfully submitted,

The AT&T Entities

By: /s/ Mary Ryan Fenlon

Mary Ryan Fenlon (Counsel of Record) Jon F. Kelly AT&T Services, Inc. 150 E. Gay St. Rm. 4-A Columbus, Ohio 43215 (614) 223-3302

Their Attorneys

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing was served by electronic mail on the parties listed below on this 24th day of February, 2012.

\_\_\_\_\_/s/ Mary R. Fenlon\_\_\_\_\_

Mary R. Fenlon

Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Terry Etter
Office of the Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
etter@occ.state.oh.us

Cincinnati Bell

Douglas E. Hart Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company LLC 441 Vine Street, Suite 4192 Cincinnati, OH 45202 dhart@douglasehart.com

Ohio Cable Telecommunications Association

Stephen M. Howard Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street Columbus, OH 43215 smhoward@vorys.com

Benita A. Kahn Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43215-1008 bakahn@vorys.com Verizon

Barth E. Royer Bell & Royer Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927 barthroyer@aol.com

David Haga, Assistant General Counsel Verizon 1320 North Courthouse Road Arlington, VA 22201 david.haga@verizon.com

Charles Carrathers Verizon 600 Hidden Ridge HQE03H51 Irving, TX 75308 chuck.carrathers@verizon.com

CenturyLink

Zsuzsanna E. Benedek CenturyLink 240 North Third Street, Suite 300 Harrisburg, PA 17101 sue.benedek@centurylink.com

Gary Baki Century Link 50 West Broad Street, Suite 3600 Columbus, OH 43215 gary.s.baki@embarq.com T-Mobile USA, Inc.

Garnet Hanly T-Mobile USA, Inc. 401 Ninth Street, NW, Suite 550 Washington, DC 20004 Garnet.Hanly@T-Mobile.com

Access Point, Inc.

Kate Dutton 100 Crescent Green, Suite 109 Cary, NC 27518 kate.dutton@accesspointinc.com

**ICORE** 

Gary M. Zingaretti 253 South Franklin Street Wilkes-Barre, PA 18701 gzing@icoreinc.com

ONVOY, INC.

Mary T. Buley 300 South Highway 169, Suite 700 Minneapolis, MN 55426 mary.buley@onvoy.com

Technologies Management, Inc.

Laura McGrath
Technologies Management, Inc.
2600 Maitland Center Parkway
Maitland, FL 32751
<a href="mailto:lmcgrath@tminc.com">lmcgrath@tminc.com</a>

Impact Network Solutions, Inc.

Nancy L. Myers Impact Network Solutions, Inc. 429 Trenton Avenue Findlay, OH 45840 myersn@impactnetwork.com

First Communications, Inc.

Mary Cegelski First Communications, Inc. 15278 Neo Parkway Garfield Heights, OH 44128 MCEGELSKI@firstcomm.com

**Frontier Communications** 

Rachel G. Winder
Ohio Government and Regulatory Affairs
17 South High Street, Suite 610
Columbus, OH 43215
Rachel.winder@ftr.com

Carolyn S. Flahive
Thompson Hine LLP
41 South High Street, Suite 1700
Columbus, OH 43215-6101
carolyn.flahive@thompsonhine.com

Kevin Saville, Associate General Counsel Frontier Communications 2378 Wilshire Blvd. Mound, MN 55364 Kevin.Saville@FTR.com

## Windstream

Williams Adams
Bailey Cavalieri LLC
10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100
Columbus, OH 43215-3422
William.Adams@baileycavalieri.com

Small Local Exchange Carriers Group Association

Norman J. Kenard Regina L. Matz Thomas, Long, Nielsen & Kennard P.O. Box 9500 Harrisburg, PA 17108 rmatz@thomaslonglaw.com nkennard@thomaslonglaw.com

The MACC Coalition

Thomas J. O'Brien Bricker & Eckler, LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com

### **Public Utilities Commission**

William Wright
Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Staff of the PUCO
180 E. Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
bill.wright@puc.state.oh.us

## Sprint Nextel

Diane C. Browning, Counsel State Regulatory Affairs Sprint Nextel 6450 Sprint Parkway Mailstop KSOPHN0314-3A459 Overland Park, KS 66251 diane.c.browning@sprint.com This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

2/24/2012 12:58:35 PM

in

Case No(s). 10-2387-TP-COI

Summary: Reply Comments of the AT&T Entities electronically filed by Ms. Mary K. Fenlon on behalf of AT&T Entities