## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company for Authority to Merge and Related Approvals	) ) )	Case No. 10-2376-EL-UNC
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.	) ) ) )	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority	) ) )	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company to Amend its Emergency Curtailment Service Riders	) ) )	Case No 10-343-EL-ATA
In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company to Amend its Emergency Curtailment Service Riders	) ) )	Case No. 10-344-EL-ATA
In the Matter of the Commission Review of the Capacity Charges of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company	of) ) )	Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company for Approval of a Mechanism to Recover Deferred Fuel Costs Ordered Under Ohio Revised Code 4928 144	) ) ) )	Case No 11-4920-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Approval of a Mechanism to Recover Deferred Fuel Costs Ordered Under Ohio Revised Code 4928 144	) ) ) )	Case No 11-4921-EL-RDR

COLUMBUS SOUTHERN POWER COMPANY'S AND OHIO POWER COMPANY'S MEMORANDUM CONTRA INTERSTATE GAS SUPPLY, INC.'S MOTION TO INTERVENE

Columbus Southern Power Company (CSP) and Ohio Power Company (OPCo) (collectively, the "Companies" or "AEP Ohio") oppose the untimely Motion to Intervene filed by Interstate Gas Supply, Inc. (IGS) in this matter

As the Commission is aware, on September 7, 2011, the Companies filed a Stipulation joined by numerous intervenors, the Companies, and Commission Staff, which resolves these varied pending proceedings. A hearing on the Stipulation commenced October 3, and is currently underway.

# The Commission's Orders and the Administrative Code Rules Do Not Permit IGS's Untimely Intervention

Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-11(D), Ohio Admin. Code, a motion to intervene "will not be considered timely if it is filed later than five days prior to the scheduled date of hearing or any specific deadline established by order of the commission." Division (F) of that rule provides that "[a] motion to intervene which is not timely will be granted only under extraordinary circumstances." IGS does not dispute that the deadlines for intervention in each of these captioned proceedings passed many months ago, and that its request is significantly out of time. For the following reasons, IGS has not met the standard for untimely intervention, and its motion should be denied.

First, IGS's motion to intervene does not identify any extraordinary circumstances that excuse its request to intervene at this eleventh hour. That IGS recently filed an application to become a certified retail electric supplier is not extraordinary, and plainly is not a circumstance justifying intervention *after* a Stipulation has been filed. AEP Ohio and all of the intervenors would be substantially prejudiced if a party that did not participate in the settlement negotiations were now permitted to challenge the Stipulation.

Second, allowing IGS to intervene at this advanced stage would not contribute to the resolution of these cases, and may in fact delay the proceedings. Thousands of discovery and data requests have been exchanged, volumes of testimony have been submitted, and the hearing on the Stipulation is underway. Allowing IGS to intervene and get up to speed now can only cause unwarranted delay.

Third, IGS has not established that it has any unique knowledge, experience or expertise to offer to the Commission. IGS's interests are adequately represented by the numerous existing intervenors who are CRES providers in the state of Ohio.

Last, allowing IGS to intervene because of a change entirely within its control would create an untenable precedent for future late interventions.

#### IGS Failed to Service AEP Ohio's Counsel of Record

IGS's motion to intervene should be denied for the additional reason that it failed to serve the motion on Steven T. Nourse, AEP Ohio's designated Counsel of Record, as required by Section 4901-1-05, Ohio Administrative Code. Mr. Nourse was not an addressee on the electronic service copy of the motion sent to various parties on October 11, 2011, nor did he receive service from counsel for IGS in any other manner as required by the Commission's procedural rules.

#### Conclusion

Allowing IGS's motion for leave to intervene out of time, absent extraordinary circumstances or any justification whatsoever would be disruptive and distracting, and would set bad precedent. For all of the foregoing reasons, the Commission should deny IGS's request for intervention.

### Respectfully Submitted,

//s/ Ann M. Vogel

Steven T. Nourse, Counsel of Record

Matthew J. Satterwhite

Anne M. Vogel

American Electric Power Service Corporation 1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Telephone: (614) 716-1606

Telephone: (614) 716-1608

Fax: (614) 716-2950

Email: stnourse@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway

Porter Wright Morris & Arthur

Huntington Center

41 South High Street

Columbus, Ohio 42315

Fax: (614) 227-2100

dconway@porterwright.com

Counsel for Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of Columbus Southern Power Company's and Ohio Power Company's Memorandum Contra Interstate Gas Supply, Inc 's Motion to Intervene was served by electronic mail upon the individuals listed below this 12<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2011

//s/ Anne M. Vogel
Anne M. Vogel

"Bair, Jodi" < Jodi Bair@puc state oh us>, "Bentine, John" <ibentine@cwslaw.com>, "Fortney, Bob" <Bob Fortney@puc state oh us>, "McCarter, Doris" < Doris McCarter@puc.state.oh.us>, "Montgomery, Christopher" <cmontgomery@bricker.com>, "O'Donnell, Terrence" <todonnell@bricker.com>, "Randazzo, Sam" <sam@mwncmh.com>, "Reilly, Stephen" < Stephen Reilly@puc state oh us>, "Sineneng, Philip" < Philip Sineneng@thompsonhine com>, "Wright, Bill" <bill wright@puc state oh us>, aaragona@eimerstahl.com, ahaque@szd com, Amy Spiller@duke-energy.com, barthroyer@aol.com, callwein@williamsandmoser.com, cmiller@szd.com, cmooney2@columbus.rr.com, cvince@sonnenschein.com, cynthia brady@constellation com, dakutik@jonesday.com, david fein@constellation.com, dbarnowski@sonnenschein.com, dboehm@bkllawfirm.com, dclark1@aep.com, dconway@porterwright.com, dmeyer@kmklaw.com, doug bonner@snrdenton com, drinebolt@aol com, dstahl@eimerstahl com, emma hand@snrdenton.com, etter@occ state oh us, fdarr@mwncmh.com, gary a jeffries@dom com, gdunn@szd.com, gpoulos@enernoc.com, grady@occ.state.oh.us

greta see@puc state oh us,

gthomas@gtpowergroup.com, gwgaber@jonesday.com, haydenm@firstenergycorp.com, henryeckhart@aol.com, holly@raysmithlaw com, jeff jones @puc state oh us, jejadwin@aep com, jesse rodriguez@exeloncorp com, jestes@skadden com, ilang@calfee com, imaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw org, john jones@puc state oh us, joliker@mwncmh com, iroberts@enernoc com, kbowman@mwncmh com, keith nusbaum@snrdenton com, korenergy@insight rr.com, kpkreider@kmklaw com, laurac@chappelleconsulting net, lmcalister@bricker.com, lmcbride@calfee.com, malina@wexlerwalker.com, mhpetricoff@vorys.com, misatterwhite@aep com, misettineri@vorys.com, mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com, msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org, mwarnock@bricker com, myurick@cwslaw.com, ned ford@fuse.net, nolan@theoec.org, paul wight@skadden com, pfox@hilliardohio.gov, rgannon@mwncmh.com, ricks@ohanet org, rplawrence@aep.com, sandy grace@exeloncorp com, sfisk@nrdc org, small@occ oh us, smhoward@vorys.com, stephen chriss@wal-mart.com, stnourse@aep.com, talexander@calfee.com, Terrance Mebane@thompsonhine com>, Thomas Lindgren < thomas lindgren@puc state oh us, tobrien@Bricker com,

trent@theoec org, tsantarelli@elpc org, Werner Margard@puc state oh us, will@theoec org, wmassey@cov.com, zkravitz@cwslaw.com, afreifeld@viridityenergy.com, aehaedte@jonesday.com, amvogel@aep.com, carolyn flahive@thompsonhine.com, bingham@occ.state.oh.us, dorothy corbett@duke-energy com, jkooper@hess.com, BAKahn@vorys.com, lkalepsclark@vorys.com, kguerry@hess com, swolfe@veridityenergy com, ssolberg@eimerstahl.com, camille@theoec.org, Daniel Shields@puc state oh us, dsullivan@nrdc org, joseph dominguez@exeloncorp com, Tammy Turkenton@puc state oh us, mallarnee@occ.state.oh.us, whitt@carpenterlipps.com vparisi@igsenergy.com mswhite@igsenergy.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

10/13/2011 2:35:26 PM

in

Case No(s). 10-2376-EL-UNC, 11-0346-EL-SSO, 11-0348-EL-SSO, 11-0349-EL-AAM, 11-0350-EL-AAN

Summary: Memorandum CSP and OPC Memorandum Contra Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.'s Motion to Intervene electronically filed by Anne M Vogel on behalf of American Electric Power Company, Inc.