

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Ohio Power Company and Columbus)	Case No. 10-2376-EL-UNC
Southern Power Company for Authority)	
to Merge and Related Approvals.)	

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Columbus Southern Power Company and)	
Ohio Power Company for Authority to)	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO
Establish a Standard Service Offer)	Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code,)	
in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.)	

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Columbus Southern Power Company and)	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM
Ohio Power Company for Approval of)	Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
Certain Accounting Authority.)	

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Columbus Southern Power Company to)	Case No. 10-343-EL-ATA
Amend its Emergency Curtailment)	
Service Riders.)	

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Ohio Power Company to Amend its)	Case No. 10-344-EL-ATA
Emergency Curtailment Service Riders.)	

In the Matter of the Commission Review)	
Of the Capacity Charges of Ohio Power)	Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC
Company and Columbus Southern)	
Power Company.)	

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Columbus Southern Power Company)	Case No. 11-4920-EL-RDR
for Approval of a Mechanism to Recover)	
Deferred Fuel Costs Ordered Under)	
Ohio Revised Code 4928.144)	

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Ohio Power Company for Approval of a)	
Mechanism to Recover Deferred Fuel)	Case No. 11-4921-EL-RDR
Costs Ordered Under Ohio Revised)	
Code 4928.144)	

**INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO'S ADDITIONAL EXHIBIT TO KEVIN
MURRAY'S TESTIMONY**

Samuel C. Randazzo, Esq.
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Olikier
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC
21 East State Street, Suite 1700
Columbus, OH 43215-4228
Telephone: 614-469-8000
Telecopier: 614-469-4653
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com

October 13, 2011

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Exhibit KMM- 11

Ohio Power Company

ESP

Prices are \$ per MWH

	2012	2013	Jan 2014- May 2014	June 2014- May 2015	June 2015- May 2016	Wtd Average
Generation Service Price						
1 Standard Offer Generation Service Rider (2012 Rates) (A)	23.30	24.50	26.00	26.00	72.32	
2 Fuel Adjustment Clause Rider (2012 Estimate) (A)	33.00	33.00	33.00	33.00	0.00	
3 Transmission Adjustment (B)	2.10	2.10	2.10	2.10	0.00	
4 Provider of Last Resort Charge (A)	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
5 Enhanced Service Reliability Rider (C)	0.71	0.71	0.71	0.71	0.71	
6 gridSMART® Rider (C)	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
7 Environmental Investment Carrying Cost Rider (A)	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
8 Generation Resource Rider (D)	0.00	0.18	0.26	0.26	0.26	
9 Alternative Energy Rider	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	
10 Distribution Investment Rider	1.80	2.18	2.60	2.60	0.00	
11 Generation NERC Compliance Cost Recovery Rider	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
12 Facility Closure Cost Recovery Rider	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
13 Carbon Capture and Sequestration Rider	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
14 Plug-In Electric Vehicle Tariff / Costs	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
15 Storm Damage Recovery Mechanism	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	
16 Pool Termination or Modification Provision	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	
17 350 MW Customer-sited CHP, WHP, DG	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	
18	60.91	62.67	64.67	64.67	73.29	65.32

MRO

Current ESP Full Fuel

19 Standard Offer Generation Service (2011 Rate) (B)	21.56	21.56	21.56	21.56	21.56	
20 2001-2008 Environmental Carrying Costs	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
21 Fuel Adjustment Clause Rider (2012 Rate) (A)	33.00	33.00	33.00	33.00	33.00	
22 Transmission Adjustment (A)	2.10	2.10	2.10	2.10	2.10	
23 2011 Provider Last Resort Charge (F)	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
24 Environmental Investment Carrying Cost Rider (F)	0.96	0.96	0.96	0.96	0.96	
25	57.62	57.62	57.62	57.62	57.62	
26	90%	80%	70%	66%	56%	
27	51.86	46.10	40.33	37.91	32.15	
28 Market Rate Offer	57.47	57.47	57.47	72.32	72.32	
29 Alternative Energy Requirement (E)	0.54	0.79	0.79	1.03	1.28	
30	58.01	58.26	58.26	73.35	73.60	
31	10%	20%	30%	34%	44%	
32	5.80	11.65	17.48	25.09	32.53	
33 Weighted MRO	57.66	57.75	57.81	63.00	64.68	60.49
34 ESP Benefit	-3.25	-4.92	-6.86	-1.67	-8.61	-4.83

Source

- (A) Exhibit DMR-1
- (B) David M. Roush Work Papers
- (B) Exhibit AEM-2
- (D) Exhibit DMR-8, Exhibit PJN-4 7/1/11 Supplemental Testimony
- (E) Exhibit LJ-1
- (F) Exhibit DMR-1 Application Testimony

Exhibit KMM- 11

Columbus Southern Power Company

ESP

Prices are \$ per MWH

	2012	2013	Jan 2014- May 2014	June 2014- May 2015	June 2015- May 2016	Wtd Average
Generation Service Price						
1 Standard Offer Generation Service Rider (2012 Rates) (A)	26.30	27.60	29.20	29.20	72.32	
2 Fuel Adjustment Clause Rider (2012 Estimate) (A)	33.30	33.30	33.30	33.30	0.00	
3 Transmission Adjustment (B)	2.24	2.24	2.24	2.24	0.00	
4 Provider of Last Resort Charge (A)	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
5 Enhanced Service Reliability Rider (C)	0.62	0.62	0.62	0.62	0.62	
6 gridSMART® Rider (C)	0.37	0.37	0.37	0.37	0.37	
7 Environmental Investment Carrying Cost Rider (A)	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
8 Generation Resource Rider (D)	0.00	0.18	0.26	0.26	0.26	
9 Alternative Energy Rider	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	
10 Distribution Investment Rider	1.80	2.18	2.60	2.60	0.00	
11 Generation NERC Compliance Cost Recovery Rider	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
12 Facility Closure Cost Recovery Rider	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
13 Carbon Capture and Sequestration Rider	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
14 Plug-In Electric Vehicle Tariff / Costs	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
15 Storm Damage Recovery Mechanism	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	
16 Pool Termination or Modification Provision	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	
17 350 MW Customer-sited CHP, WHP, DG	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	
18	64.63	66.49	68.59	68.59	73.57	68.35

MRO

Current ESP Full Fuel						
19 Standard Offer Generation Service (2011 Rate) (B)	20.21	20.21	20.21	20.21	20.21	
20 2001-2008 Environmental Carrying Costs	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
21 Fuel Adjustment Clause Rider (2012 Rate) (A)	33.30	33.30	33.30	33.30	33.30	
22 Transmission Adjustment (A)	2.24	2.24	2.24	2.24	2.20	
23 2011 Provider Last Resort Charge (F)	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
24 Environmental Investment Carrying Cost Rider (F)	0.92	0.92	0.92	0.92	0.92	
25	56.67	56.67	56.67	56.67	56.63	
26	90%	80%	70%	66%	56%	
27	51.00	45.34	39.67	37.29	31.60	
28 Market Rate Offer	57.47	57.47	57.47	72.32	72.32	
29 Alternative Energy Requirement (E)	0.54	0.79	0.79	1.03	1.28	
30	58.01	58.26	58.26	73.35	73.60	
31	10%	20%	30%	34%	44%	
32	5.80	11.65	17.48	25.09	32.53	
33 Weighted MRO	56.80	56.99	57.15	62.37	64.13	59.80
34 ESP Benefit	-7.83	-9.50	-11.45	-6.22	-9.44	-8.55

Source

- (A) Exhibit DMR-1
- (B) David M. Roush Work Papers
- (B) Exhibit AEM-2
- (D) Exhibit DMR-8, Exhibit PJN-4 7/1/11 Supplemental Testimony
- (E) Exhibit LJIT-1
- (F) Exhibit DMR-1 Application Testimony

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Industrial Energy Users-Ohio's Additional Exhibit to Kevin Murray's Testimony* was served upon the following parties of record this 13th day of October 2011, *via* electronic transmission, hand-delivery or first class U.S. mail, postage prepaid.

/s/ Frank P. Darr
Frank P. Darr

Matthew J. Satterwhite
Steven T. Nourse
Anne M. Vogel
American Electric Power Service
Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
stnourse@aep.com
amvogel@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur
Huntington Center
41 S. High Street
Columbus, OH 43215
dconway@porterwright.com

**ON BEHALF OF COLUMBUS SOUTHERN
POWER COMPANY AND OHIO POWER
COMPANY**

Dorothy K. Corbett
Amy Spiller
139 East Fourth Street
1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Dorothy.Corbett@duke-energy.com
Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Philip B. Sineneng
Terrance A. Mebane
THOMPSON HINE LLP
41 S. High St., Suite 1700
Columbus, OH 43215
Philip.Sineneng@ThompsonHine.com
Terrance.Mebane@ThompsonHine.com

**ON BEHALF OF DUKE ENERGY RETAIL SALES,
LLC**

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com

ON BEHALF OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

Gregory J. Poulos
EnerNOC, Inc.
101 Federal Street, Suite 1100
Boston, MA 02110
gpoulos@enernoc.com

ON BEHALF OF ENERNOC, INC.

Janine L. Migden-Ostrander
Terry L. Etter
Maureen R. Grady
Jeffrey L. Small
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 W. Broad Street, 18th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
etter@occ.state.oh.us
grady@occ.state.oh.us
small@occ.state.oh.us

**ON BEHALF OF THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO
CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

Richard L. Sites
General Counsel & Senior Director of
Health Policy
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3620
ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O'Brien
BRICKER & ECKLER, LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
tobrien@bricker.com

OH BEHALF OF OHIO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION

John W. Bentine
Mark S. Yurick
Zachary D. Kravitz
Chester Willcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, OH 43215
jbentine@cwsllaw.com
myurick@cwsllaw.com
zkravitz@cwsllaw.com

ON BEHALF OF THE KROGER CO.

Terrence O'Donnell
Christopher Montgomery
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
todonnell@bricker.com
cmontgomery@bricker.com

ON BEHALF OF PAULDING WIND FARM II LLC

David C. Rinebolt
Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45840
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com
drinebolt@ohiopartners.org

**ON BEHALF OF OHIO PARTNERS FOR
AFFORDABLE ENERGY**

Mark A. Hayden
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik
Jones Day
North Point
901 Lakeside Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44114
dakutik@jonesday.com

Allison E. Haedt
Jones Day
P.O. Box 165017
Columbus, OH 43216-5017
aehaedt@jonesday.com

John N. Estes III
Paul F. Wight
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP
1440 New York Ave., N.W.
Washington, DC 20005
jestes@skadden.com
paul.wight@skadden.com

**ON BEHALF OF FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS
CORP.**

Michael R. Smalz
Joseph V. Maskovyak
Ohio Poverty Law Center
555 Buttlers Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215
msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org
jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

**ON BEHALF OF THE APPALACHIAN PEACE
AND JUSTICE NETWORK**

Lisa G. McAlister
Matthew W. Warnock
Thomas O'Brien
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
lmcaster@bricker.com
mwarnock@bricker.com
tobrien@bricker.com

ON BEHALF OF OMA ENERGY GROUP

Jay E. Jadwin
American Electric Power Service
Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
jejadwin@aep.com

**ON BEHALF OF AEP RETAIL ENERGY
PARTNERS LLC**

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43215-1008
mhpeticoff@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com

**ON BEHALF OF PJM POWER PROVIDERS
GROUP AND THE RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY
ASSOCIATION**

Glen Thomas
1060 First Avenue, Ste. 400
King of Prussia, PA 19406
gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Laura Chappelle
4218 Jacob Meadows
Okemos, MI 48864
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

**ON BEHALF OF PJM POWER PROVIDERS
GROUP**

M. Howard Petricoff
Michael Settineri
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43215-1008
mhpeticoff@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com

William L. Massey
Covington & Burling, LLP
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20004
wmassey@cov.com

Joel Malina
Executive Director
COMPLETE Coalition
1317 F Street, NW
Suite 600
Washington, DC 20004
malina@wexlerwalker.com

ON BEHALF OF THE COMPETE COALITION

Henry W. Eckhart
1200 Chambers Road, Suite 106
Columbus, OH 43212
henryeckhart@aol.com

Shannon Fisk
Natural Resources Defense Council
2 N. Riverside Plaza, Suite 2250
Chicago, IL 60606
sfisk@nrdc.org

Christopher J. Allwein
Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC
1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212
Columbus, OH 43212
callwein@williamsandmoser.com

**ON BEHALF OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES
DEFENSE COUNCIL AND THE SIERRA CLUB**

M. Howard Petricoff
Michael J. Settineri
Stephen M. Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008
mhpeticoff@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com

**ON BEHALF OF CONSTELLATION
NEWENERGY, INC., CONSTELLATION ENERGY
COMMODITIES GROUP, INC., DIRECT ENERGY
SERVICES, LLC**

David I. Fein
Vice President, Energy Policy – Midwest
Constellation Energy Group, Inc.
Cynthia Fonner Brady
Senior Counsel
Constellation Energy Resources LLC
550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60661
david.fein@constellation.com
cynthia.brady@constellation.com

**ON BEHALF OF CONSTELLATION
NEWENERGY, INC. AND CONSTELLATION
ENERGY COMMODITIES GROUP, INC.**

Pamela A. Fox
C. Todd Jones,
Christopher L. Miller,
Gregory H. Dunn
Asim Z. Haque
Schottenstein Zox and Dunn Co., LPA
250 West Street
Columbus, OH 43215
pfox@hillardohio.gov
cmiller@szd.com
gdunn@szd.com
ahaque@szd.com

**ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF HILLIARD, OHIO,
THE CITY OF GROVE CITY, OHIO AND THE
ASSOCIATION OF INDEPENDENT COLLEGES
AND UNIVERSITIES OF OHIO**

Sandy I-ru Grace
Assistant General Counsel
Exelon Business Services Company
101 Constitution Ave., NW
Suite 400 East
Washington, DC 20001
sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Jesse A. Rodriguez, Esq.
Public Policy & Affairs Manager
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
300 Exelon Way
Kennett Square, PA 19348
jesse.rodriquez@exeloncorp.com

M. Howard Petricoff
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008
mhpeticoff@vorys.com

David M. Stahl
Arin C. Aragona
Scott C. Solberg
Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP
224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100
Chicago, IL 60604
dstahl@eimerstahl.com
aaragona@eimerstahl.com
ssolberg@eimerstahl.com

Anastasia Polek-O'Brien
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
10 S. Dearborn Street, 49th Floor
Chicago, IL 60603

**ON BEHALF OF EXELON GENERATION
COMPANY, LLC**

Gary A Jeffries
Assistant General Counsel
Dominion Resources Services, Inc.
501 Martindale Street, Suite 400
Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817
Gary.A.Jeffries@aol.com

ON BEHALF OF DOMINION RETAIL, INC.

Kenneth P. Kreider
David A. Meyer
Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL
One East Fourth Street
Suite 1400
Cincinnati, OH 45202
kpkreider@kkmklaw.com
dmeyer@kkmklaw.com

Holly Rachel Smith
Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC
Hitt Business Center
3803 Rectortown Road
Marshall, VA 20115
holly@raysmithlaw.com

Steve W. Chriss
Manager, State Rate Proceedings
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550
Stephen.Chriss@wal-mart.com

**ON BEHALF OF WAL-MART STORES EAST, LP
AND SAM'S EAST, INC.**

Barth E. Royer (Counsel of Record)
Bell & Royer Co., LPA
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215-3927
BarthRoyer@aol.com

Tara C. Santarelli
Environmental Law & Policy Center
1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212
tsantarelli@elpc.org

**ON BEHALF OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL LAW &
POLICY CENTER**

Nolan Moser
Trent A. Dougherty
Camille Yancy
Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
nolan@theoec.org
trent@theoec.org
camille@theoec.org

**ON BEHALF OF THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL
COUNCIL**

Douglas G. Bonner
Emma F. Hand
Keith C. Nusbaum
Clinton A. Vince
Daniel D. Barnowski
SNR Denton US LLP
1301 K Street NW
Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
doug.bonner@snrdenton.com
emma.hand@snrdenton.com
keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com
clinton.vince@snrdenton.com
daniel.barnowski@snrdenton.com

**ON BEHALF OF ORMET PRIMARY ALUMINUM
CORPORATION**

Jay L. Kooper
Katherine Guerry
Hess Corporation
One Hess Plaza
Woodbridge, NJ 07095
jkooper@hess.com
kguerry@hess.com

ON BEHALF OF HESS CORPORATION

Allen Freifeld
Samuel A. Wolfe
Viridity Energy, Inc.
100 West Elm Street, Suite 410
Conshohocken, PA 19428
afreifeld@viridityenergy.com
swolfe@viridityenergy.com

Jacqueline Lake Roberts,
Counsel of Record
101 Federal Street, Suite 1100
Boston, MA 02110
jroberts@enernoc.com

**ON BEHALF OF CPOWER, INC., VIRIDITY
ENERGY, INC., ENERGYCONNECT INC.,
COMVERGE INC., ENERWISE GLOBAL
TECHNOLOGIES, INC., AND ENERGY
CURTAILMENT SPECIALISTS, INC.**

Robert Korandovich
KOREnergy
P.O. Box 148
Sunbury, OH 43074
korenergy@insight.rr.com

ON BEHALF OF KORENERGY

Benita Kahn
Lija Kaleps-Clark
Vorys Sater, Seymour and Pease LLC
52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008
bakahn@vorys.com
lkalepsclark@vorys.com

William Wright
Werner Margard
Thomas Lindgren
John H. Jones
Assistant Attorneys' General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
john.jones@puc.state.oh.us
werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us
thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us
william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

**ON BEHALF OF THE PUBLIC UTILITIES
COMMISSION OF OHIO**

Mark A. Whitt
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 Plaza, Suite 1300
280 North High Street
Columbus, OH 43215
whitt@carpenterlipps.com

Vincent Parisi
Matthew White
Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, OH 43016
vparisi@igsenergy.com
mswhite@igsenergy.com

**ON BEHALF OF INTERSTATE GAS SUPPLY,
INC.**

Greta See
Jon Tauber
Rebecca Hussey
Attorney Examiner
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

ATTORNEY EXAMINERS

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

10/13/2011 9:25:06 AM

in

Case No(s). 10-0343-EL-ATA, 10-0344-EL-ATA, 10-2376-EL-UNC, 10-2929-EL-UNC, 11-0346-EL-SSO,

Summary: Exhibit (Additional Exhibit) to Kevin Murray's Testimony electronically filed by Mr. Frank P Darr on behalf of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio