

FILE

BEFORE THE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

11
RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV
2011 SEP 28 PM 4:45
PUCO

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Columbus Southern Power Company and)	
Ohio Power Company for Authority to)	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO
Establish a Standard Service Offer)	Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code,)	
In the form of an Electric Security Plan.)	

In the Matter of the Application of)	
Columbus Southern Power Company and)	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM
Ohio Power Company for Approval of)	Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
Certain Accounting Authority.)	

COLUMBUS SOUTHERN POWER COMPANY AND OHIO POWER COMPANY'S
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDERS

Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company, pursuant to Rule 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code (O.A.C.), respectfully request that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio issue protective orders keeping confidential the portions of the Testimony of Michael M. Schnitzer and Kevin M. Murray, filed September 27, 2011, that are the subject of and were filed contemporaneously with FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.'s ("FES") and Industrial Energy Users-Ohio's ("IEU-Ohio") respective September 27, 2011 motions for protective order. The reasons supporting this motion (and also supporting the motions made by FES and IEU-Ohio) are provided in the attached memorandum in support.

This is to certify that the images appearing are an
accurate and complete reproduction of a case file
document delivered in the regular course of business.
Technician JD Date Processed 9-28-11

Respectfully submitted,

Steven T. Nourse / per authorization
DR

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
American Electric Power
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-2373
Telephone: (614) 716-1608
Facsimile: (614) 716-2950
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur
41 S. High Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Telephone: (614) 227-2100
Facsimile: (614) 227-2270
dconway@porterwright.com

Counsel for Columbus Southern Power
Company and Ohio Power Company

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company (collectively, “AEP Ohio” or “the Companies”) request that the portions of the Testimony of Michael M. Schnitzer and Kevin M. Murray, which FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. (“FES”) and Industrial Energy Users-Ohio (“IEU-Ohio”) filed contemporaneously with their respective September 27, 2011 motions for protective order, be protected from public disclosure. The information for which protection is sought includes detailed discussion of AEP Ohio’s forecast for fuel expenditures and related analyses, information describing shopping data and current shopping levels, and projected costs of the Companies’ Turning Point project, which the Companies produced to FES during discovery pursuant to a protective agreement between the parties, as well as information reflecting AEP Ohio’s capacity position analysis, which the Companies produced to both FES and IEU-Ohio during discovery pursuant to protective agreements.

The information is the product of original research and development by AEP Ohio, has been kept confidential, and, as a result, retains substantial economic value to the Companies by being kept confidential. It would be costly and time-consuming for third parties to replicate the information on their own. Allowing unfettered public access to the information would give third parties inappropriate access to competitively sensitive business information about the Companies. With respect to the Companies’ fuel expenditures forecast, public disclosure would enable third parties to replicate AEP Ohio’s forecasted expenditures at little or no cost. With respect to the shopping data, Turning Point costs, and capacity position analysis, public disclosure would inhibit AEP Ohio’s ability to negotiate, as both a seller and buyer of capacity, the best price possible for its customers and shareholders. Accordingly, release of the information to the public

would significantly reduce, if not eliminate, the value that the information has by being kept confidential and, thus, would cause harm to AEP Ohio.

Rule 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code provides that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (the "Commission") or certain designated employees may issue an order to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commission's Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of the information and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code.

The criteria used to determine what the Commission should keep confidential is well established, and the Commission also long ago recognized its statutory obligation to protect trade secrets:

The Commission is of the opinion that the "public records" statute must also be read in pari materia with Section 1333.31, Revised Code ("trade secrets" statute). The latter statute must be interpreted as evincing the recognition, on the part of the General Assembly, of the value of trade secret information.

In re: General Telephone Co., Case No. 81-383-TP-AIR (Entry, February 17, 1982).

Likewise, the Commission has facilitated the protection of trade secrets in its rules. See O.A.C. § 4901-1-24(A)(7). The Uniform Trade Secrets Act defines "trade secret" to mean:

information, including the whole or any portion or phase of any scientific or technical information, design, process, procedure, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any business information or plans, financial information or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

(1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.

- (2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

R.C. § 1333.61(D).

This definition clearly reflects the state policy favoring the protection of trade secrets such as the information that is the subject of this motion. Courts of other jurisdictions have held that not only does a public utilities commission have the authority to protect the trade secrets of the companies subject to its jurisdiction, the trade secrets statute creates a duty to protect them. New York Tel. Co. v. Pub. Serv. Comm. N.Y., 56 N.Y. 2d 213 (1982). Indeed, for the Commission to do otherwise would be to negate the protections the Ohio General Assembly has granted to all businesses, including public utilities, and now the new entrants who will be providing power, through the Uniform Trade Secrets Act. The Commission has previously carried out its obligations in this regard in numerous proceedings. See, e.g., Elyria Tel. Co., Case No. 89-965- TP-AEC (Finding and Order, September 21, 1989); OhioBell Tel. Co., Case No. 89-718-TP-ATA (Finding and Order, May 31, 1989); Columbia Gas of Ohio. Inc., Case No. 90-17-GA-GCR (Entry, August 7, 1990).

In Pyromatics, Inc. v. Petruziello., 7 Ohio App. 3d 131, 134-135 (Cuyahoga County 1983), the Court of Appeals, citing Koch Engineering Co. v. Faulconer, 210 U.S.P.Q. 854, 861 (Kansas 1980), delineated factors to be considered in recognizing a trade secret:

- (1) The extent to which the information is known outside the business,
- (2) the extent to which it is known to those inside the business, i.e., by the employees,
- (3) the precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information,
- (4) the savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors,
- (5) the amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information, and
- (6) the amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information.

These factors were adopted by the Supreme Court of Ohio in State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept of Ins. (1997), 80 Ohio St3d 513,524-525.

Applying these factors to the information contained in the relevant portions of the testimony offered by Mr. Schnitzer and Mr. Murray demonstrates that protection from disclosure is appropriate. As noted above, the information includes a detailed description of AEP Ohio's forecast for fuel expenditures and related analyses, information describing shopping data and current shopping levels, and projected costs of the Companies' Turning Point project, as well as information reflecting AEP Ohio's capacity position analysis. The information is the product of original research and development, has been kept confidential, and, as a result, retains substantial economic value to the Companies by being kept confidential. It would be costly and time-consuming for third parties to replicate the information on their own, without access to the information. Allowing unfettered public access to the information would give third parties inappropriate access to competitively sensitive business information about the Companies. With respect to the Companies' fuel expenditures forecast, public disclosure would enable third parties to replicate AEP Ohio's forecasted expenditures at little or no cost. With respect to the shopping data, Turning Point costs, and capacity position analysis, public disclosure would inhibit AEP Ohio's ability to negotiate, as both a seller and buyer of capacity, the best price possible for its customers and shareholders. Accordingly, release of the information to the public would significantly reduce, if not eliminate, the value that the information has by being kept confidential and, thus, would cause harm to AEP Ohio.

For the reasons provided above, AEP Ohio requests that the Commission grant its motion, FES's motion for protective order, and IEU-Ohio's motion for protective order to maintain the confidentiality of the information contained in the portions of the Testimony of

Michael M. Schnitzer and Kevin M. Murray that FES and IEU-Ohio filed contemporaneously with their respective September 27, 2011 motions, by ordering that the testimony excerpts and exhibits be kept under seal.

Respectfully Submitted,

Steven T. Nourse / per authorization
DR C

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
American Electric Power
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-2373
Telephone: (614) 716-1608
Facsimile: (614) 716-2950
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur
41 S. High Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Telephone: (614) 227-2100
Facsimile: (614) 227-2270
dconway@porterwright.com

Counsel for Columbus Southern Power
Company and Ohio Power Company

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing *Columbus Southern Power Company's and Ohio Power Company's Motion for Protective Orders* has been served upon the below-named counsel and Attorney Examiners via electronic mail this 28th day of September, 2011.


Daniel R. Conway

Samuel C. Randazzo
Joseph E. Olikier
Frank P. Darr
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

Amy B. Spiller
Dorothy K. Corbett
Associate General Counsel
139 East Fourth Street
1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Philip B. Sineneng
Carolyn Flahive
Terrance A. Mebane
Thompson Hine LLP
41 South High Street
Suite 1700
Columbus, OH 43215

David C. Rinebolt
Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45839-1793

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Kurt J. Boehm
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Richard L. Sites
General Counsel & Senior Director
of Health Policy
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3620

Thomas J. O'Brien
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291

John W. Bentine
Mark S. Yurick
Zachary Kravitz
Chester Willcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus Ohio 43215

Greta See
Jeff Jones
Attorney Examiners
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 E. Broad St., 12th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

Steve W. Chriss
Manager, State Rate Proceedings
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
2001 SE 10th Atrreet
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550

Terrence O'Donnell
Christopher Montgomery
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291

Lisa G. McAlister
Matthew W. Warnock
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008

William L. Massey
Covington & Burling, LLP
1201 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20004

Mark A. Hayden
Kathy J. Kolich
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexandor
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114

Michael R. Smalz
Joseph V. Maskovyak
Ohio Poverty Law Center
555 Buttles Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215

Jay E. Jadwin
American Electric Power Service Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

Michael J. Settineri
Benita Kahn
Lija Kaleps-clark
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Henry W. Eckhart
2100 Chambers Road, Suite 106
Columbus, OH 43212

Pamela A. Fox
Law Director, the City of Hilliard, Ohio

Jesse A. Rodriguez
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
300 Exelon Way
Kennett Square, PA 19348

Christopher L. Miller
Gregory H. Dunn
Asim Z. Haque
Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA
250 West Street
Columbus, OH 43215

Sandy I-ru Grace
Exelon Business Services Company
101 Constitution Avenue NW
Suite 400 East
Washington, DC 20001

Kenneth P. Kreider
David A. Meyer
Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL
One East Fourth Street
Suite 1400
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Barth E. Royer
Bell & Royer Co., LPA
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215-3927

Tara C. Santarelli
Environmental Law & Policy Center
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212

Trent A. Dougherty
Nolan Moser
William I. Reisinger
Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212

Holly Rachel Smith
Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC
3803 Rectortown Road
Marshall, VA 20115

Shannon Fisk
2 North Riverside Plaza, Ste. 2250
Chicago, IL 60606

Emma F. Hand
Douglas G. Bonner
Keith Nusbaum
Clinton A. Vince
Daniel D. Barnowski
SNR Denton US LLP
1301 K Street, Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005-3364

Jay L. Kooper
Katherine Guerri
Krystyn Noeth
Hess Corporation
One Hess Plaza
Woodbridge, NJ 07095

David A. Kutik
Jones Day
North Point
901 Lakeside Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44114

Allison E. Haedt
Jones Day
P.O. Box 165017
Columbus, OH 43216-5017

Gary A. Jeffries
Dominion Resources Services, Inc.
501 Martindale Street, Suite 400
Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817

David I. Fein
Cynthia Fonner Brady
Constellation Energy Resources
550 W. Washington St.
Chicago, IL 60661

Robert Korandovich
KOREnergy
P.O. Box 148
Sunbury, OH 43074

William Wright
Werner Margard
Thomas Lindgren
Stephen A. Reilley
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
180 E. Broad St., 6th Fl.
Columbus, OH 43215

Jacqueline Lake-Roberts
Gregory J. Poulos
EnerNOC, Inc.
101 Federal Street, Suite 1100
Boston, MA 02110

Grant Gaber
Jones Day
P.O. Box 165017
Columbus, OH 43215

Paul F. Wight
John N. Estes, III
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Macgher & Flom
1440 New York Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20005

Allen Freifeld
Samuel A. Wolfe
Viridity Energy, Inc.
100 West Elm St., Ste. 410
Coshohocken, PA 19428

Constance Whyte Reinhard
Assistant General Counsel
Exelon Business Services Company
10 S. Dearborn Street
Chicago, IL 60603

J. Kennedy & Associates
570 Colonial Park Dr., Ste. 305
Roswell, GA 30075

Jennifer Duffer
Armstrong & Okey, Inc.
222 E. Town St., 2nd Fl.
Columbus, OH 43215

John Mascio
325 North 4th St., Lower Level
Steubenville, OH 43952