## **BEFORE THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD**

In the Matter of the Application ) of Black Fork Wind Energy, LLC for ) a Certificate to Install Numerous ) Electricity Generating Wind Turbines in ) **Crawford and Richland Counties, Ohio** )

Case No. 10-2865-EL-BGN

## NOTICE OF FILING APPLICANT'S AUGUST 15, 2011 SUPPLEMENTAL **RESPONSES TO STAFF'S JUNE 22, 2011 DATA REQUSTS**

On August 15, 2011, Black Fork Wind Energy, LLC ("Black Fork" or "the Applicant")

submitted supplemental responses to Staff's June 22, 2011 data requests on sound/noise

clarifications. Copies of the Applicant's supplemental responses are attached hereto for filing on the docket.

Respectfully submitted,

M. Howard Petricoff (0008287) Stephen M. Howard (0022421) Michael J. Settineri (0073369)

VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND	PEASE	E LLP	
52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008			70
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008		2011	EC
(614) 464-5414		Ξ	7
(614) 719-4904 (fax)	70	I AUG	(ED
mhpetricoff@vorys.com	<u>(</u>	23	RECEIVED-00
smhoward@vorys.com	$\overline{O}$		
mjsettineri@vorys.com		PH	Ê
	$\circ$	<del></del>	OCKETING
		ö	G D
Attorneys for Black Fork Wind Energy	y, LLC		DIV

Attorneys for Black Fork Wind Energy, LLC

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file Cocusant dolivered in the regular course of phyloses. techerist, e..... Date Process AUG 2 3 2011

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of the foregoing document was served by hand delivery upon John Jones and Stephen Reilly, Assistant Attorneys General, Public Utilities Section, 180 E. Broad Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor, Columbus, OH 43215 and via U.S. Mail upon the following persons listed below this 23rd day of August 2011:

Debra Bauer and Bradley Bauer 7298 Remlinger Road Crestline, Ohio 44827-9775

Gary Biglin 5331 State Route 61 South Shelby, Ohio 44875

Karel A. Davis 6675 Champion Road Shelby, Ohio 44875

Carol and Loren Gledhill 7256 Remlinger Road Crestline, Ohio 44827-9775

Brett A. Heffner 3429 Stein Road Shelby, Ohio 44875

Ohio Farm Bureau Federation Chad A. Endsly 280 North High Street PO Box 182383 Columbus, Ohio 43218

Grover Reynolds 7179 Remlinger Road Crestline, Ohio 44827-9775 Margaret and Nick Rietschlin 4240 Baker Road Crestline, Ohio 44827-9775

Orla Collier III Benesch, Friedlander, Coplan & Arnoff LLP 41 South High Street, 26<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215

Mary Studer 6716 Remlinger Road Crestline, Ohio 44827-9775

John Warrington 7040 SR 96 Tiro, Ohio 44887

Thomas Karbula 3026 Solinger Road Crestline, Ohio 44827-9775

Alan and Catherine Price 7956 Remlinger Road Crestline, Ohio 44827-9775

Michael J. Settineri



Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP Legal Counsel 52 East Gay St. PO Box 1008 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

614.464.6400 | www.vorys.com

Founded 1909

Michael J. Settineri Direct Dial (614) 464-5462 Direct Fax (614) 719-5146 Email mjsettineri@vorys.com

August 15, 2011

# VIA HAND-DELIVERY

Mr. John H. Jones Assistant Attorney General Public Utilities Section 180 E. Broad St., 6th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

> Re: OPSB Case No. 10-2865-EL-BGN Black Fork Wind Energy, LLC

Dear Mr. Jones:

Please find enclosed Black Fork Wind Energy, LLC's supplemental responses to data requests 7, 8, 22 and 23 from Staff's June 22, 2011 data requests on sound. Please call me or Scott Hawken, Black Fork Wind Energy Project Manager, if there are any questions.

Sincerely,

Michael J. Settineri

MJS/drd Enclosure cc: Jon Pawley (w/ encl.)

## Black Fork Wind Energy Project Case No. 10-2865-EL-BGN August 15, 2011 Supplemental Responses (7, 8, 22 and 23) to June 22, 2011 Data Requests

Sound/Noise clarifications - Black Fork Wind Energy project

June 22, 2011

7. Pg. 73 - Please provide the low frequency sound values (SPL, dB, Hz) expected to be produced by the GE and Siemens turbines.

The Applicant requested this information from the manufacturers of the GE and Siemens turbines. The manufacturers responded that they consider this information proprietary and will only provide that data in connection with an executed turbine supply contract.

8. Pg. 73 - For all turbine technologies under consideration; please provide the A-weighted and C-weighted sound pressure levels, as well as one-third octave band measurements for the 20 and 25 Hz bands. Separately, evaluate the data for low frequency noise and impulsivity in accordance with the methodologies set forth in IEC 61400-11, Annex A, A.3 *Low Frequency Noise* and A.4 *Impulsivity*.

The Applicant requested this information from the manufacturers of the GE and Siemens turbines. The manufacturers responded that they consider this information proprietary and will only provide that data in connection with an executed turbine supply contract.

The following are additional questions that were asked at the Staff site visit:

22. What is the tonal audibility for the Vestas V-100?

The Applicant requested this information from the manufacturer of the Vestas V-100 turbine. The manufacturer responded that it considers this information proprietary and will only provide the data in connection with an executed turbine supply contract.

23. What is the cut-in and cut-off speeds for the proposed turbines?

The cut-in and cut-off speeds for the turbines are listed as follows:

Vestas V-100: 3 meters/second and 20 meters/second; Siemens SWT 2.3: 3-4 meters/second and 25 meters/second; and GE 1.6 XLE: 3 meters/second and 24 meters/second.



Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP Legal Counsel 52 East Gay St. PO Box 1008 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

614.464.6400 | www.vorys.com

Founded 1909

Michael J. Settineri Direct Dial (614) 464-5462 Direct Fax (614) 719-5146 Email mjsettineri@vorys.com

August 15, 2011

## VIA HAND-DELIVERY

Mr. John H. Jones Assistant Attorney General Public Utilities Section 180 E. Broad St., 6th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

> Re: OPSB Case No. 10-2865-EL-BGN Black Fork Wind Energy, LLC

Dear Mr. Jones:

Please find enclosed Black Fork Wind Energy, LLC's supplemental response to data request #21 from Staff's June 22, 2011 data requests on sound. Please call me or Scott Hawken, Black Fork Wind Energy Project Manager, if there are any questions.

Sincerely,

Michael J. Settineri

MJS/drd Enclosure cc: Jon Pawley (w/ encl.)

## Black Fork Wind Energy Project Case No. 10-2865-EL-BGN August 15, 2011 Supplemental Responses to June 22, 2011 Data Request # 21

Sound/Noise clarifications – Black Fork Wind Energy project

June 22, 2011

21. Please provide the coordinates (Lat/Lon) for the batch plant(s); provide the sound power level(s); provide the sound pressure level(s) at 50 feet; model the sound at the nearest non-participating residence and provide the expected hours of plant operation.

The approximate coordinates for the center of the batch plant are:

```
Latitude 40.855349 N/Longitude 82.76099 W
```

The estimated sound power levels for the equipment and various activities at the concrete batch plant are provided in the attached table.

The nearest non-participating residence is approximately 2,200 feet south of the concrete batch plant location. The table below provides the sound pressure levels for the concrete batch plant sources at 50 feet and at the nearest non-participating residence (2,200 feet). The sound pressure level, should all sources be occurring simultaneously is 85 dBA at 50 feet and 42 dBA at 2200 feet. The cement blower dominates the sound levels; when the cement blower is not operating, the sound levels are reduced to 82 dBA at 50 feet and 38 dBA at 2200 feet. It should be noted that the estimated sound levels are at the upper range of what is expected as it is unlikely that these activities would be occurring concurrently.

	Sound Press	ure Level (dBA)
Source	At 50 ft.	At 2200 ft.
Concrete Truck Mixing	79	35
Cement Blower	83	40
Cement Blower Truck Idling	69	26
Truck Passby	70	26
Backup Alarm	77	34
Concrete Truck Discharging	67	23

The concrete batch plant will operate during construction hours, which are anticipated to occur between 7 a.m. and 7 p.m.

Courses				Free	Frequency (	y (Hz)				Overall Level	Overall Level
321000	31.5	63	125	250	005	1000	2000	4006	0008	(qB)	(dBA)
Cement Blower	116.8	113.2	107.3	114.2	113.5	110.9	101 6	92.6	80	121 4	114.6
Cement Blower Truck - Idling	102.6	102.6	97.6	66 66	96.7	97	919	85 6	72.8	107.9	100.4
Concrete Truck - Mixing	95.6	100 9	109	105.8	104.6	106.4	104.5	966	87	113.8	110.3
Concrete Truck - Discharging	103.8	105 1	89.2	92.9	94.8	95 1	91.3	85.3	73.3	108.3	98.6
Backup Alarm	100.5	98.9	99.7	1011	98.2	108.4	97.3	88.6	76.8	110.9	109 2
Truck Passby	•0	103 6	93.8	963	1001	961	93.7	88 7	8.77	106.7	101.4

Response to Data Request 21 – Batch Plant Component Sound Power Levels