

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Columbus southern Power Company and

Ohio Power company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer

Pursuant to § 4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.

In the Matter of the Application of

Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power company for Approval of

Certain Accounting Authority.

Case Nos. 11-346-EL-SSO

11-348-EL-SSO

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIN
2011 AUG-4 PH 4: 52
PUCO

: Case Nos. 11-349-EL-AAM

11-350-EL-AAM

# PREFILED TESTIMONY OF JODI J. BAIR

ON BEHALF OF THE STAFF OF THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO UTILITIES DEPARTMENT

STAFF EX.

August 4, 2011

#### PERSONAL DATA

- 2 1. Q. Please state your name and business address.
- A. My name is Jodi Bair. My business address in 180 East Broad Street,

  Columbus, Ohio, 43215.

5

1

- 6 2. Q. By whom are you employed and in what capacity?
- A. I am employed by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio. My title is the Director of the Utilities Department at the Commission.

9

10 3. Q. What is you educational and professional background?

A. I earned my Bachelor of Arts degree from Vanderbilt University and I 11 received my juris doctor degree from St. Thomas University School of 12 Law. In June 1994 I began working for the Office of the Ohio Attorney 13 General as an Assistant Attorney General. I was assigned to the Public 14 Utilities Division and represented the Staff of the Commission and the 15 Commission in legal proceedings. In 2006, I began working for the 16 Commission as an Assistant Director in the Utilities Department and in 17 2009; I was promoted to Director of the department. As Director, I am 18 responsible for four divisions at the Commission - Accounting and 19 Electricity, Capital Recovery and Financial Analysis, Telecommunications 20 and Rates and Tariffs, Energy and Water. 21

22

- 1 4. Q. Have you submitted testimony before as a witness before a regulatory commission?
- 3 A. No.

4

#### 5 **PURPOSE OF TESTIMONY**

- 6 5. Q. What is the purpose of your testimony?
- A. The purpose of my testimony is to address AEP-Ohio's request to establish a non-bypassable rider to recover costs associated with closing generation plants.

10

11

#### **BACKGROUND**

- 12 6. Q. As part of AEP'S application in this proceeding, has the company requested
  13 that customers pay for generation-related facility closure costs?
- 14 A. Yes. As explained by AEP witness Thomas, AEP generation facilities may
  15 close due to a plant's age, a planned retirement, or safety, economic or
  16 environmental issues during the ESP. The Company requests that the
  17 Commission approve a rider to recover the actual costs, net of salvage.
  18 AEP proposes to make an annual filing with the PUCO for review and

In the Matter of the Applications of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of Electric Security Plans, Case Nos. 11-346-EL-SSO, 11-348-EL-SSO (2011 ESP Cases) (Testimony of AEP witness Laura J. Thomas at 23) (January 27, 2011).

recovery the subsequent year. This requested rider would apply to actual closure costs for any generation-related facility closed during the period of the proposed ESP.<sup>2</sup>

4

5

1

2

3

#### GENERATING PLANT SHUT DOWN COST RECOVERY RIDER

- Would a Rider for the recovery of facility closure costs be consistent with Ohio utility regulation?
- A. No. The current governing law, Section 4928, Ohio Rev. Code (S.B. 221) 8 has no provision for the recovery of generation facility plant closure costs. 9 R.C. 4928.143(B)(2)(c) states that, "[b]efore the commission authorizes any 10 surcharge pursuant to this division, it may consider, as applicable, the 11 effects of any decommissioning, deratings, and retirements." This language 12 directs the Commission to consider the effects of retirements before grant-13 ing a rider to recover the costs of the new plant. Nowhere does the law 14 provide authority to recover the costs of retirements. 15

16

- 17 8. Q. Has AEP had the opportunity to seek recovery of plant closure costs?
- 18 A. Yes. The law that existed prior to S.B. 221, S.B. 3, explicitly provided a
  19 mechanism for electric companies to recover costs associated with separat20 ing the distribution, transmission, and generation functions of the utility and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 2011 ESP Cases (Testimony of AEP witness Laura J. Thomas at 25) (January 27, 2011).

transitioning into a competitive market. S.B. 3's intent was to move electric companies to a competitive environment; however, the law recognized that there may be costs associated with transitioning to a competitive market, so electric companies were permitted to recover transition costs.

5

1

2

3

4

6 9. Q. Did AEP request recovery of transition costs?

Yes. In AEP's electric transition plan, it initially requested recovery of 7 Α. \$291.43 million for stranded, generation transition charges (GTCs)<sup>3</sup>. 8 According to S.B. 3, AEP had "the opportunity to receive transition reve-9 nues that may assist it in making the transition to a fully competitive retail 10 electric generation market." As part of the stipulation in that electric П transition plan (ETP) case, the company decided to forego recovery of any 12 GTCs.<sup>5</sup> Company witness Baker, when testifying in support of the stipula-13 tion stated that "as part of the overall settlement and the agreement, the 14 Companies dropped their claims for recovery of stranded generation 15

In the Matter of the Applications of Columbus Southern Power company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Their electric Transition Plans and for Receipt of Transition Revenues, Case Nos. 99-1729-EL-ETP and 99-1730-EL-ETP (Opinion and Order at 15-16) (September 28, 2000).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Ohio Rev. Code Ann. § 4928.37(A)(1) (West 2011).

In the Matter of the Applications of Columbus Southern Power company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Their electric Transition Plans and for Receipt of Transition Revenues, Case Nos. 99-1729-EL-ETP and 99-1730-EL-ETP (Opinion and Order at 16) (September 28, 2000).

1 costs." Ohio law only allowed recovery of transition costs through the end of 2010.<sup>7</sup>

3

4 10. Q. AEP believes that the Commission's order in the current ESP permits the

Company to recover costs of plant closure, do you believe the order pro
vides that authority?

7 A. No. AEP, under the currently-approved ESP, requested authority to come 8 before the Commission during the ESP term and request recovery of early generation plant closure costs.<sup>8</sup> The Commission did not approve AEP's 9 ability to recover these costs, the Commission stated that is was, "not con-10 vinced that it is appropriate to approve the Companies' request for recovery 11 of net cost associated with an unanticipated shut down." In that case, the 12 Company requested exactly what it requests in this case. The Commission 13 denied the request for recovery of an unanticipated shut down recovery. 10 14

In the Matter of the Applications of Columbus Southern Power company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Their electric Transition Plans and for Receipt of Transition Revenues, Case Nos. 99-1729-EL-ETP and 99-1730-EL-ETP (Opinion and Order at 16) (September 28, 2000); Tr. III at 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ohio Rev. Code Ann. § 4928.40 (West 2011).

In the Matter of the Applications of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of an Electric Security Plans; and Amendments to its Corporate Separation Plans, Case Nos. 08-917-EL-SSO, 08-918-EL-SSO (2008 ESP Cases) (Application at 19) (July 31, 2008).

<sup>9</sup> *Id.* (Opinion and Order at 53) (March 18, 2009).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> *Id*.

In the present case, AEP witness Thomas, when asked if the Company is able to determine exactly which facility closure will occur during the proposed ESP period, answered, "No. The evolution of environmental requirements is uncertain" And that "the timing for compliance with new rules is unknown." The company requests a rider based upon un-quantified anticipated costs. This request should be denied again by the Commission.

The Commission's decision in the SSO cases also expanded the Companies' request for recovery of net cost associated with an unanticipated shut down. Staff witness Hess testified that the company cannot impose upon customers the cost of a specific uneconomic plant without accounting for the positive economic value of the rest of the companies generation plants.<sup>13</sup> In its Opinion and Order, the Commission stated that it "is not convinced that it is appropriate to approve the Companies' request for recovery of net cost associated with an unanticipated shut down. Despite the arguments of the Companies to the contrary, we are persuaded by the

<sup>2011</sup> ESP Cases (Testimony of AEP witness Laura J. Thomas at 23) (January 27, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> *Id.* 

<sup>2008</sup> ESP Cases (Prefiled Testimony of J. Edward Hess (Staff Ex. 1) at 8.

arguments of the Staff that there may be offsetting positive value associated with the Companies generation fleet."<sup>14</sup>

3

2

l

4 11. Q. Did the Commission authorize AEP to establish an accounting mechanism to separate net early closure cost?

A. Yes. The Commission denied AEP's request to establish a cost recovery 6 7 mechanism for an un-anticipated shut down; however, granted the Companies the authority to establish the accounting mechanism to separate net 8 early closure cost.<sup>15</sup> The Commission stated that "[a]s to the Companies' 9 request for authority to file with the Commission to determine the appropri-10 ate treatment associated with an earlier-than-anticipated shut down, the 11 Commission finds this aspect of the application to be reasonable and, 12 accordingly, the request should be granted." AEP ignores the Commis-13 sion's specific denial of the Companies' request to recover costs and 14 ignores the Commission's consideration of the possibility of considering 15 that there may be offsetting positive value associated with the Companies' 16 generation fleet that must be analyzed if there is a request to recover shut 17 down costs for a specific facility. 18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> 2008 ESP Cases (Opinion and Order at 53) (March 18, 2009).

<sup>15</sup> *Id.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> *Id.* 

- 1 12. Q. If the Commission approves the Companies' request to establish a rider to
  2 recover the costs of shutting down generation units, do you believe that the
  3 rider should be by-passable?
- A. No. If the Commission approves such a rider, it should be established on a by-passable basis because it is generation-related.

7 13. Q. Does this conclude your testimony?

8 A. Yes.

6

9

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing Prefiled Testimony of Jodi J.

**Bair**, submitted on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, was served by regular U.S. mail, postage prepaid, or hand-delivered, upon the following Parties of Record, this 4<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2011.

John H./Jones

Assistant Attorney General

#### Parties of Record:

Matthew J. Satterwhite Steven T. Nourse American Electric Power 1 Riverside Plaza Columbus, OH 43215 mjsatterwhite@aep.com stnourse@aep.com

Daniel Conway

Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur 41 South High Street Columbus, OH 4321 <a href="mailto:dconway@porterwright.com">dconway@porterwright.com</a>

ON BEHALF OF COLUMBUS SOUTHERN POWER COMPANY AND OHIO POWER COMPANY

Colleen L. Mooney

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy 231 West Lima Street Findlay, OH 45840 <a href="mailto:cmooney2@columbus.rr.com">cmooney2@columbus.rr.com</a>

ON BEHALF OF OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY

**Dorothy Corbett** 

Duke Energy Ohio
139 East Fourth Street
Suite 1303
P.O. Box 960
Cincinnati, OH 45201
dorothy.corbett@duke-energy.com

Philip P. Sineneng

Thompson Hine 41 South High Street, Suite 1700 Columbus, OH 43215 Phillip.sineneng@thompsonhine.com

ON BEHALF OF DUKE ENERGY RETAIL SALES

Michael Smalz

Joseph Maskovyak
Ohio Poverty Law Center
555 Buttles Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215-1137
msmalz@ohiopovertlaw.org
jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

ON BEHALF OF THE APPALACHIAN PEACE AND JUSTICE NETWORK

#### David Boehm Michael L. Kurtz

Boehm Kurtz &Lowry 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OH 45202 dboehm@bkllawfirm.com mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com

#### ON BEHALF OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

#### John Bentine Mark Yurick

Chester Willcox & Saxbe 65 East State Street Suite 100 Columbus, OH 43215 jbentine@cwslaw.com myurick@cwslaw.com

#### ON BEHALF OF THE KROGER CO.

#### Lisa G. McAlister Matthew W. Warnock

Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 <a href="mailto:lmcalister@bricker.com">lmcalister@bricker.com</a> <a href="mailto:mwarnock@bricker.com">mwarnock@bricker.com</a>

#### ON BEHALF OF OMA ENERGY GROUP

#### Jay E. Jadwin

American Electric Power Service Corp. 1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215 jedjadwin@aep.com

## ON BEHALF OF AEP RETAIL ENERGY PARTNERS

#### Terry Etter Maureen R. Grady

Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215
etter@occ.state.oh.us
grady@occ.state.oh.us

## ON BEHALF OF THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

#### Richard L. Sites

Ohio Hospital Association 155 East Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215 <u>ricks@ohanet.com</u>

#### Thomas J. O'Brien

Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com

## ON BEHALF OF OHIO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION

#### Terrence O'Donnell Christopher Montgomery

Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215 todonnell@bricker.com emontgomery@bricker.com

## ON BEHALF OF PAULDING WIND FARM II AND THE DISTRIBUTED WIND ENERGY ASSOCIATION

#### **Gregory Poulos**

EnerNOC, Inc. 101 Federal Street Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 gpoulos@enernoc.com

#### ON BEHALF OF ENERNOC, INC.

#### Tara Santarelli

Environmental Law & Policy Center 1207 Grandview Avenue Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212 tsantarelli@elpc.org

## ON BEHALF OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL LAW & POLICY CENTER

#### Glen Thomas

1060 First Avenue Suite 400 King of Prussia, PA 19406 gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

#### Laura Chappelle

4218 Jacob Meadows
Okemos MI 48864
laurac@chappellconsulting.net

## ON BEHALF OF PJM POWER PROVIDERS GROUP

#### William L. Massey

Covington & Burling
1201 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004
wmassey@cov.com

#### Joel Malina

Compete Coalition 1317 F Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 2004 malina@wexlerwalker.com

## ON BEHALF OF THE COMPETE COALITION

#### Mark A. Hayden

FirstEnergy Corp.
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

#### James F. Lang Laura McBride

N. Trevor Alexander
Calfee Halter & Griswold
800 Superior Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44114
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

#### David Kutik

Jones Day North Point 901 Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44114 dakutik@jonesday.com

#### Allison E. Haedt

Jones Day P.O. Box 165017 Columbus, OH 43216-5017 aehaedt@jonesday.com

### ON BEHALF OF FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS CORP.

#### M. Howard Petricoff Stephen M. Howard

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease 52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43215-1008 mhpetricoff@vorys.com smhoward@vorys.com

#### ON BEHALF OF PJM POWER PROVIDERS GROUP AND THE RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY ASSOCIATION

Douglas G. Bonner
Emma F. Hand
Keith C. Nusbaum
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal
1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 600 East Tower
Washington, D.C. 20005
doug.bonner@snrdenton.com
emma.hand@snrdenton.com
keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com

## ON BEHALF OF ORMET PRIMARY ALUMINUM CORPORATION

Michael J. Settineri
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43215-1008
<a href="mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com">mhpetricoff@vorys.com</a>
mjsettineri@vorys.com

M. Howard Petricoff

On Behalf of Constellation
NewEnergy, Inc., Constellation Energy
Commodities Group, Inc., and The
Compete Coalition

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Oliker
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
sam@mcwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com

#### On Behalf of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Henry W. Eckhart 1200 Chambers Road Suite 106 Columbus, OH 43212 henryeckhart@aol.com

# Shannon Fisk Natural Resources Defense Council 2 North Riverside Plaza, Suite 2250

Chicago, IL 60606 sfisk@nrdc.org

David Fein

#### ON BEHALF OF THE NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL AND THE SIERRA CLUB

# Cynthia Fonner Brady Constellation Energy Resources 550 West Washington Boulevard Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661 david.fein@constellation.com cynthia.brady@constellation.com

ON BEHALF OF CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY, INC. AND CONSTELLATION ENERGY COMMODITIES GROUP, INC.

Barth Royer
Bell & Royer
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215-3927
barthroyer@aol.com

#### Gary A. Jeffries

Dominion Resources Services, Inc. 501 Martindale Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817 gary.a.jeffries@aol.com

ON BEHALF OF DOMINION RETAIL

#### Pamela A. Fox/C. Todd Jones Steven J. Smith/Christopher Miller Gregory Dunn/Asim Haque

Schottenstein Zox and Dunn 250 West Street, Suite 500 Columbus, OH 43215 pfox@szd.com cmiller@szd.com gdunn@szd.com ahaque@szd.com

ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF HILLIARD, OHIO, THE CITY OF GROVE CITY, OHIO, AND THE ASSOCIATION OF INDEPENDENT COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES OF OHIO

#### Kenneth P. Kreider

Keating Muething & Klekamp One East Fourth Street Suite 1400 Cincinnati, OH 45202 gkreider@kmklaw.com

#### **Holly Rachel Smith**

Hitt Business Center 3803 Rectortown Road Marshall, VA 20115-3338 holly@raysmithlaw.com

#### Steve W. Chriss

Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. Bentonville, AR 72716-0550 stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com

ON BEHALF OF WAL-MART STORES EAST AND SAM'S EAST

#### **Sandy Grace**

Exelon Business Services Company 101 Constitution Avenue, N.W. Suite 400 East Washington, D.C. 20001 <a href="mailto:sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com">sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com</a>

#### Jesse A. Rodriguez

Exelon Generation Company 300 Exelon Way Kennett Square, PA 19348 jesse.rodriguez@exeloncorp.com

#### M. Howard Petricoff

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease 52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43215-1008 mhpetricoff@vorys.com

David M. Stahl Arin C. Aragona Scott C. Solberg

Elmer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg 224 South Michigan Avenue Suite 1100 Chicago, IL 60604

#### Anastasia Polek-O'Brien

Exelon Generation Company 10 South Dearborn Street, 49<sup>th</sup> Floor Chicago, IL 60603

## ON BEHALF OF EXELON GENERATION COMPANY

#### Nolan Moser Trent A. Dougherty

Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212-3449 nolan@theoec.org trent@theoec.org

On Behalf of The Ohio Environmental Council