

FILE

11

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV
2011 JUL 18 AM 9:26
PUCO

BEFORE

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to Section 4928.143, Revised Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan, Accounting Modifications and Tariffs for Generation Service.)) Case No. 11-3549-EL-SSO

In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio for Authority to Amend its Certified Supplier Tariff, P.U.C.O. No. 20.)) Case No. 11-3550-EL-ATA

In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio for Authority to Amend its Corporate Separation Plan.)) Case No. 11-3551-EL-UNC

**DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.'S
MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO CINCINNATI BELL, INC.'S
MOTION FOR LEAVE TO INTERVENE AND
MOTION TO INTERVENE**

I. Introduction

On June 20, 2011, Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (Duke Energy Ohio) filed an application for authority to establish a standard service offer, pursuant to section 4928.143, Ohio Revised Code, in the form of an electric security plan. On June 22, 2011, the attorney examiners issued a procedural schedule that established, among other things, an deadline of July 6, 2011, for the filing of motions to intervene. On July 15, 2011, Cincinnati Bell, Inc., (Cincinnati Bell) moved for leave and to intervene. For the reasons explained below, Duke Energy Ohio submits that the Commission should deny the Cincinnati Bell motion to intervene.

II. Argument

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.
Technician Amj Date Processed 7/18/11

A. Cincinnati Bell Does Not Have Standing to Intervene

In its motion for leave and motion to intervene, Cincinnati Bell asserts that it has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding, that it is so situated that the disposition of these proceedings without its participation may impede or impair its ability to protect its interests and that its participation will contribute to the just and expeditious resolution of the interests involved. Finally, Cincinnati Bell argues that its interests are not represented by any other existing party to the proceeding.

Ohio Administrative Code (O.A.C.) 4901-1-11 sets forth the elements a party must demonstrate in order to be permitted to intervene in a proceeding before the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission). It is important to note that the elements set forth in 4901:1-1-11(A)(2) that Cincinnati Bell has recited in its motion are cumulative and not a la carte:

(A) Upon timely motion, any person shall be permitted to intervene in a proceeding upon a showing that:

(1) A statute of this state or the United States confers a right to intervene.

(2) The person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding, and the person is so situated that the disposition of the proceeding may, as a practical matter, impair or impede his or her ability to protect that interest, unless the person's interest is adequately represented by existing parties.

Cincinnati Bell claims that it has an interest in this proceeding that cannot be adequately represented by the current parties. In asserting this contention, however, Cincinnati Bell expressly fails to identify any interests that it may have that warrant such intervention. Rather, Cincinnati Bell states that other entities with whom it is associated – subsidiaries or affiliates – have an interest in this case. As this statement undeniably confirms, Cincinnati Bell does not

have any interest in this proceeding. Further, it could not be the real party in interest, with standing to assert the claims or defenses of other entities.

Importantly, allowing Cincinnati Bell to intervene on behalf of entities that are not parties to this proceeding undeniably prejudices Duke Energy Ohio in the prosecution of its application, including discovery. By way of example, Duke Energy Ohio could unfairly be denied access to documents and other relevant information where such information is not within the possession, custody, or control of Cincinnati Bell. Rather, to obtain discovery, including depositions, Duke Energy Ohio would need to seek the issuance of subpoenas to compel information from entities that are not parties to this proceeding. The illogic of such a convoluted procedure demonstrates the inappropriateness of allowing a party without standing to intervene.

B. Cincinnati Bell's Interests Are Adequately Represented

To the extent Cincinnati Bell's purported justification for intervening relates to charges for electric service that are paid by its affiliates, Duke Energy Ohio observes that such an interest is more than adequately represented by those entities to have timely intervened, on their own behalf, in this proceeding. Indeed, the Greater Cincinnati Health Council, the Ohio Energy Group, Industrial Energy Users-Ohio, Ohio Manufacturing Association, The Kroger Company, and Wal-Mart and Sam's LLP, to name a few, have an interest in the non-residential rates sought to be charged by Duke Energy Ohio and, through their capable counsel, can more than adequately represent the interest allegedly of concern to Cincinnati Bell's subsidiaries.

To the extent Cincinnati Bell's asserts that its subsidiaries are concerned with residential rates, such an interest is also adequately represented by parties such as the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel, the City of Cincinnati, People Working Cooperatively, and Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy.

Cincinnati Bell cannot fulfill the requirements of 4901:1-11, O.A.C. Intervening as a corporation on behalf of that corporation's affiliates affirmatively demonstrates a lack of standing. Cincinnati Bell notes that it was not a party to Duke Energy Ohio's most recent standard service offer case and thus was not served a notice of this case. Indeed, Cincinnati Bell has not intervened in any of Duke Energy Ohio's rate cases in recent history. The reason for this is that if it has any interest at all in these cases, those interests are already protected by other parties.

III. Conclusion

In summary, the Cincinnati Bell's motion for leave and to intervene is based on the fallacious notion that it has standing in this proceeding and that it is necessary for Cincinnati Bell to represent interest its affiliates may have, if any. For the reasons set forth above, Cincinnati Bell's motion for leave and to intervene should be denied.

Respectfully submitted,

Elizabeth H. Watts

Amy B. Spiller
Deputy General Counsel
Elizabeth H. Watts
Associate General Counsel
Rocco O. D'Ascenzo
Associate General Counsel
Duke Energy Business Services LLC
Counsel for Duke Energy Ohio

Cincinnati Office:
2500 Atrium II
139 East Fourth Street
PO Box 960
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was delivered via U.S. mail (postage prepaid), personal, or electronic mail delivery on this 18th day of 2011, to the following:

Steven Beeler
John Jones
Assistant Attorney Generals
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us
John.jones@puc.state.oh.us

**Counsel for the Staff of the Public Utilities
Commission of Ohio**

Thomas J. O'Brien
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
tobrien@bricker.com

Counsel for the City of Cincinnati

Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com

**Counsel for the Retail Energy Supply
Association**

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Olikier
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 E. State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com

Counsel for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Kurt J. Boehm
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com
kboehm@bkllawfirm.com

Counsel for Ohio Energy Group

Douglas E. Hart
441 Vine Street, Suite 4192
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
dhart@douglasshart.com

**Counsel for The Greater Cincinnati Health
Council**

Jeffrey L. Small
Joseph P. Serio
Melissa R. Yost
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
small@occ.state.oh.us
serio@occ.state.oh.us
yost@occ.state.oh.us

Trent A. Dougherty
Nolan Moser
E. Camille Yancey
Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
trent@theoec.org
nolan@theoec.org
camille@theoec.org

Lisa G. McAlister
Matthew W. Warnock
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215
lmcaster@bricker.com
mwarnock@bricker.com

Mary Christensen
Christensen & Christensen, LLP
8760 Orion Place, Suite 300
Columbus, OH 43240
mchristensen@columbuslaw.org

**Counsel for People Working Cooperatively,
Inc.**

Counsel for Ohio Manufacturers Association

John W. Bentine, Esq.
Mark S. Yurick, Esq.
Zachary D. Kravitz, Esq.
Chester, Wilcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213
jbentine@cwslaw.com
myurick@cwslaw.com
zkravitz@cwslaw.com

Tara C. Santarelli
Environmental Law & Policy Center
1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212
tsantarelli@elpc.org

**Counsel for the Environmental Law &
Policy Center**

Counsel for the Kroger Company

M. Howard Petricoff
Michael J. Settineri
Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O.Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
misettineri@vorys.com

David I. Fein
Vice President, Energy Policy- Midwest
Constellation Energy Group, Inc.
550 West Washington Blvd, Ste 300
Chicago, IL 60661
David.fein@constellation.com

For Constellation Energy Group, Inc.

**Counsel for Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and
Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc.**

Cynthia Fonner Brady
Constellation Energy Resources, LLC
550 West Washington Blvd, Ste 300
Chicago, IL 60661
Cynthia.brady@constellation.com

For Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and
Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc.

Allison Haedt
Jones Day
325 John H McConnell Blvd, Ste 600
Columbus OH 43215-2673
aehaedt@jonesday.com

Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corporation

David A. Kutik
Jones Day
North Point
901 Lakeside Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44114
dakutik@jonesday.com

Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corporation

Ann M. Vogel
American Electric Power Service
Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus OH 43215
amvogel@aep.com

Counsel for AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC

Matthew Satterwhite
Erin Miller
American Electric Power Service Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus OH 43215
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
ecmiller1@aep.com

**Counsel for Columbus Southern Power
Company and Ohio Power Company**

Mark A. Hayden
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

**Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions
Corporation**

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
tallexander@calfee.com

**Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions
Corporation**

Gregory Poulos
EnerNOC, Inc.
101 Federal Street, Suite 1100
Boston, MA 02110
gpoulos@enernoc.com

Counsel for EnerNOC, Inc.

Douglas E. Hart
441 Vine Street, Suite 4192
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
dhart@douglasshart.com

Counsel for Eagle Energy, LLC

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpeticoff@vorys.com

Counsel for PJM Power Providers Group

Laura Chappelle
Chappelle Consulting
4218 Jacob Meadow
Okemos, MI 48864
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

For PJM Power Providers Group

Teresa Ringenbach
Senior Manager - Government and Regulatory
Affairs (Midwest)
Direct Energy, LLC
9605 El Camino Lane
Plain City, OH 43064
teresa.ringenbach@directenergy.com

For Direct Energy

M. Howard Petricoff
Michael Settineri
Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpeticoff@vorys.com

Counsel for COMPETE Coalition

Joseph M. Clark
Vectren Retail, LLC d/b/a Vectren Source
6641 North High Street, Suite 200
Worthington, OH 43085
jmclark@vectren.com

**Counsel for Vectren Retail, LLC d/b/a
Vectren Source**

Glen Thomas
GT Power Group
1060 First Ave, Ste 400
King of Prussia, PA 19406
gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

For PJM Power Providers Group

Dane Stinson
Bailey Cavalieri LLC
10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Dane.Stinson@BaileyCavalieri.com

Counsel for Direct Energy

M. Howard Petricoff
Special Assistant Attorney General
Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpeticoff@vorys.com

**Counsel for Miami University and the
University of Cincinnati**

William L. Massey
Covington & Burling, LLP
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC. 20004
wmassey@cov.com

Counsel for COMPETE Coalition

Joel Malina
Executive Director
COMPETE Coalition
1317 F Street, NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20004
malina@wexlerwalker.com

Counsel for COMPETE Coalition

Andrew J. Sonderman
Margeaux Kimbrough
Kegler Brown Hill & Ritter LPA
Capitol Square, Suite 1800
65 East State Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
asonderman@keglerbrown.com
mkimbrough@keglerbrown.com

Counsel for Duke Energy Retail Sales, LLC

John W. Bentine
Chester Wilcox and Saxbe LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, Ohio 43215
jbentine@cwslaw.com

Christopher Allwein
Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC
1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212
Columbus, Ohio 43212
callwein@williamsandmoser.com

**Counsel for
American Municipal Power, Inc.**

**Counsel for the Natural Resources Defense
Council**

Vincent Parisi
Matthew White
Interstate Gas Supply, Inc
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin OH 43016
vparisi@igsenergy.com
mswhite@igsenergy.com

M. Howard Petricoff
Lija Kaleps- Clark
Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com

Counsel for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

**Counsel for Exelon Generation Company,
LLC**

Jesse Rodriguez
Public Policy & Affairs Manager
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
300 Exelon Way
Kennett Square, PA 19348
Jesse.rodriguez@exeloncorp.com

Sandy I-ru Grace
Exelon Business Services Company
101 Constitution Ave NW
Washington DC 20001
Sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

For Exelon Generation Company, LLC

**Counsel for Exelon Generation Company,
LLC**

David Stahl
Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP
224 S Michigan Ave, Ste 1100
Chicago, IL 60604
dstahl@eimerstahl.com

Anastasia O'Brien
Vice President and Deputy General Counsel
10 South Dearborn St, 49th Floor
Chicago, IL 60603
Anastasia.obrien@exeloncorp.com

Counsel for Exelon Generation Company, LLC

**Counsel for Exelon Generation Company,
LLC**

Kevin Osterkamp
Roetzel & Andress LPA
155 East Broad Street, 12th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
kosterkamp@ralaw.com

Counsel for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam's East, Inc.

Barth E. Royer
Bell & Royer Co., LPA
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927
BarthRoyer@aol.com

Counsel for Dominion Retail, Inc.

Rick D. Chamberlain
Behrens, Wheeler, & Chamberlain
6 N.E. 63rd Street, Suite 400
Oklahoma City, OK 73105
Rdc_law@swbell.net

Counsel for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam's East, Inc.

Gary A. Jeffries
Dominion Resources Services, Inc.
501 Martindale St, Suite 400
Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817
Garv.A.Jeffries@dom.com

Counsel for Dominion Retail, Inc.