

RECEIVED -DECKETING TOW

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO 2811 MAR 14 PM 5: 09

In the Matter of the Application of Columbus )
Southern Power Company and Ohio Power )
Company for Authority to Establish a Standard )
Service Offer Pursuant to Section 4928.143, )
Revised Code, in the Form of an Electric )
Security Plan )
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus )
Southern Power Company and Ohio Power )
Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM
Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM
Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM

#### MOTION TO INTERVENE OF THE CITY OF HILLIARD, OHIO

The City of Hilliard, Ohio ("Hilliard") on behalf of itself and its residential and commercial citizens hereby moves the Public Utility Commission of Ohio ("Commission") to intervene as a full party of record in the above captioned proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code ("R.C.") Section 4903.221 and Ohio Administrative Code ("OAC") Rule 4901-1-11.

As set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support, Hilliard submits that it has a real and substantial interest in these proceedings, that its interests cannot be adequately represented by any other party, and that the Public Utility Commission of Ohio's ("Commission") disposition of the proceedings will impair or impede its ability to protect those interests. Hilliard further submits that the legal positions and issues that it will advance are relevant to the merits of the proceedings and that it intends to contribute in a unique manner to the full development and equitable resolution of the proceedings. Finally, Hilliard submits that granting this Motion will not unduly delay the proceedings or unjustly prejudice any existing party.

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete repreduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Date Processed MAR 1 5 7011

{H2177752.1 }

For these reasons, as explained more fully herein, Hilliard respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene in the above captioned proceedings.

Respectfully Submitted,

Pamela A. Fox (0055803)

Direct Dial: (614) 876-7361 E-mail: pfox@hilliardohio.gov

Law Director, the City of Hilliard, Ohio

Christopher L. Miller (0063259)

Counsel of Record

Direct Dial: (614) 462-5033

E-mail: cmiller@szd.com

Gregory H. Dunn (0007353)

Direct Dial: (614) 462-2339

E-mail: gdunn@szd.com

Asim Z. Haque (0081880) Direct Dial: (614) 462-1072

E-mail: ahaque@szd.com

E-man. anaqueuszu.com

Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA

250 West Street

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(614) 462-2700 (Main Number)

(614) 222-4707 (Facsimile)

Attorneys for the City of Hilliard, Ohio

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE MOTION TO INTERVENE OF THE CITY OF HILLIARD, OHIO

#### I. PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND

The above captioned proceedings were initiated by Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company (collectively "the Companies"). The Companies initiated these proceedings in order to obtain Commission review and approval of its Standard Service Offer ("SSO") to be completed via the Electric Security Plan ("ESP") proposed jointly by the Columbus Southern Power Company (11-346-EL-SSO) and by the Ohio Power Company (11-348-EL-SSO). The Companies conduct combined business in the state of Ohio under the trade name AEP Ohio.

By Entry dated February 2, 2011, the Commission established a procedural schedule for its consideration of the ESP requiring that adversely impacted parties file motions to intervene by Mach 14, 2011. Thus, Hilliard's submission of this Motion is timely.

#### II. BASIS FOR INTERVENTION

#### a. Standard of Review

R.C. section 4903.221 and OAC Rule 4901-1-11 set forth the standards pursuant to which Hilliard may intervene in the above-captioned Commission proceedings. R.C. section 4903.221 confers the statutory right to intervene in a Commission proceeding to any party "who may be adversely affected by a proceeding." Additionally, OAC Rule 4901-1-11 provides that:

Upon timely motion, any person shall be permitted to intervene in a proceeding upon a showing that: . . .[t]he person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding, and the person is so situated that the disposition of the proceeding may, as a practical matter, impair or impede his or her ability to protect that

interest, unless the person's interest is adequately represented by existing parties.

Upon filing a timely motion demonstrating a real and substantial interest and upon demonstrating that the proceeding will impair or impede the ability to protect the interest, a party is entitled to an Order granting its intervention request. In determining whether a party is entitled to intervene, the Commission shall consider:

(1) the nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest; (2) the legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case; (3) whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceeding; (4) whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues; and (5) the extent to which the person's interest is represented by existing parties.

(See R.C. 4903.221(B) and OAC 4901-1-11(B)).

b. Hilliard Has A Real And Substantial Interest In This Proceeding That Cannot Be Represented By Any Other Party, And The Disposition Of These Proceedings Will Impair Those Interests.

Currently, Hilliard utilizes electric service from the Companies to illuminate municipal traffic signals, a number of proprietary street lights, as well as to power certain municipal buildings and facilities. On an annual basis, Hilliard expends in excess of Five Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$500,000.00) with the Companies on just the first two aforementioned electric uses. Additionally, Hilliard uses the Companies exclusively to provide electric service to power and operate all of its municipally owned buildings and facilities. Annual expenditures for those applications are still currently being reviewed and calculated. Hilliard is certain that the results of that internal review will reveal that the additional buildings and facilities electric service expenditures for those items are quite significant. Thus, Hilliard is an extremely large user of the Companies' services and this proceeding and the results thereof will have a significant

impact on the cost and manner in which Hilliard continues to obtain and pay for its electric service.

The above captioned proceedings will also have a real, substantial, and adverse impact on Hilliard residential customers. Almost the entirety of Hilliard residential customers rely upon the Companies for electric service. Similar to residents in many Ohio cities and metropolitan areas, Hilliard residential customers are currently dealing with high unemployment rates and low wages. Hilliard has a special interest, if not a duty, to ensure that the electricity requirements of its residents are continually served by readily available dependable electric service which is attainable at reasonable prices which are affordable to its economically challenged population.

In addition to the impact on Hilliard and on residential customers, the proceedings will also have a real, substantial, and adverse impact on Hilliard's commercial citizens using the Companies' electric service. Any proposed cost increases and service modifications will have an economic development and job retention impact on a local economy that cannot afford to lose current jobs or opportunities for future growth.

Electricity price and service modifications caused by the proposed SSO will impact Hilliard's budget and citizens both residential and commercial. Additionally, as initially proposed, these cases may materially modify the terms and conditions under which Hilliard and its residents obtain electric service in a manner favoring the interests of the Companies and to the detriment of the City and its residents.

Accordingly, Hilliard will focus its participation in the proceedings on matters specifically impacting the City and its economically challenged residential citizens as well as commercial citizens. Specifically, these matters may include, among other things, the SSO's impact on pricing, deferrals, surcharges, tariffs for economic development, special and unique

rider applications, energy efficiency issues, and renewable and/or alternative energy issues that particularly impact the City and its citizens.

### III. <u>CONCLUSION</u>

For the reasons set forth above, Hilliard respectfully requests that the Commission grant its request to intervene in the above-captioned proceedings. Hilliard's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay the proceedings. In contrast, Hilliard's intervention will contribute to the full development the factual issues to be resolved in the proceedings. Finally, no other party to the proceedings is capable of representing the interests of Hilliard as well as its residential and commercial citizens.

Respectfully Submitted,

Pamela A. Fox (0055803)

Direct Dial: (614) 876-7361 E-mail: pfox@hilliardohio.gov

Law Director, the City of Hilliard, Ohio

Christopher L. Miller (0063259)

Counsel of Record

Direct Dial: (614) 462-5033

E-mail: cmiller@szd.com

Gregory H. Dunn (0007353)

Direct Dial: (614) 462-2339

E-mail: gdunn@szd.com

Asim Z. Haque (0081880)

Direct Dial: (614) 462-1065

E-mail: ahaque@szd.com

Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA

250 West Street

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(614) 462-2700 (Main Number)

(614) 222-4707 (Facsimile)

Attorneys for the City of Hilliard, Ohio

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing Motion to Intervene was served upon the parties of record listed below this \_\_\_\_\_ day of March, 2011 via first class mail and electronic mail.

Asim Z. Haque

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
American Electric Power Service Corp.
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
<a href="mailto:stnourse@aep.com">stnourse@aep.com</a>
mjsatterwhite@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur
Huntington Center
41 South High Street
Columbus, OH 43215
dconway@porterwright.com

Samuel Randazzo
Joseph Oilker
Frank Darr
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
<a href="mailto:sam@mwncmh.com">sam@mwncmh.com</a>
joliker@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com

Amy B. Spiller
Dorothy K. Corbett
Duke Energy Retail Sales LLC
139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45202
amy.spiller@duke-energy.com
dorothy.corbett@duke-energy.com

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com

Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45839
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

Terry L. Etter
Michael E. Idzkowski
Maureen R. Grady
Office of the Ohio Consumer's Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215
etter@occ.state.oh.us
idzkowski@occ.state.oh.us
grady@occ.state.oh.us

Thomas J. O'Brien
Terrence O'Donnell
Christopher Montgomery
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215
tobrien@bricker.com
todonnell@bricker.com
cmontgomery@bricker.com

Richard L. Sites
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
ricks@Qhanet.org

Michael R. Smalz
Ohio Poverty Law Center
555 Buttles Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215
msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44114
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

Mark A. Hayden
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

John Bentine
Mark S. Yurick
Chester Wilcox & Saxbe LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, OH 43215
jbentine@cwslaw.com
myurick@cwslaw.com

Jay E. Jadwin
American Electric Power Service Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Telephone: (614) 716-1606
Fax: (614) 716-2950
jejadwin@aep.com