FILE

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

N OF OHIO

Case No. 10-2376-EL-UNC

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company for Authority to Merge and Related Approvals.

### COMMENTS OF THE OHIO MANUFACTURERS' ASSOCIATION

#### I. BACKGROUND

On October 18, 2010, Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company (collectively "AEP Ohio") filed an application for Commission approval to merge pursuant to an Agreement and Plan of Merger ("Merger Agreement"). On February 9, 2011, the Commission issued an Entry requesting comments that "specifically identify and discuss the issues which the Commission should consider." The Commission requested initial comments by February 25, 2011 and reply comments by March 11, 2011. In accordance with the Commission's request the Ohio Manufacturers' Association provides the following comments.

#### II. COMMENTS

As the Commission noted in its February 9, 2011 Entry, it must ensure that the merger will promote the public interest and not adversely affect any class of AEP Ohio customer within the Commission's jurisdiction. While AEP Ohio has indicated that the merger will have little to no affect on customers or the control of Columbus Southern Power Company, there are potentially significant impacts on Ohio customers. It is

This is to cortify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a cise file locument delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Date Processed

simply that the real potential impacts associated with the merger are being addressed in other cases.

As the Commission is aware, AEP Ohio currently has numerous cases before the Commission including an application for approval of an electric security plan ("ESP") and a prefiling notice of an application to increase distribution rates. As a result of the merger, but addressed in those cases, there will be a consolidation of tariffs between the two operating companies. Additionally, AEP Ohio has also indicated that it has provided notice to the other members of its AEP Interconnection Agreement ("AEP Pool") that AEP Ohio wants to terminate the existing agreement on three years notice. Again, the major implications of this change will likely be addressed in the ESP case and not this merger case. Nonetheless, at the very least, as a result of the merger, the AEP Pool membership will be reduced from five to four as a result of AEP Ohio's proposed merger and, thus, the AEP Interconnection Agreement will need to be modified.

Additionally, AEP Ohio has represented that the merger will not have a detrimental impact on customers as to cost of service or in the adequacy and reliability of service. Further, AEP Ohio states that because the operating companies have been managed and operated jointly for years and that the merger will provide additional efficiencies in the form of the reduction of administrative requirements, annual fees paid and regulatory efficiencies. These issues are also likely to be addressed in the ESP and distribution rate cases rather than in this proceeding.

Regardless of which case before the Commission the ramifications of the merger are addressed in, the Commission should ensure that there is not a detrimental impact

on customers as a result of the merger. Parties are in process of reviewing the ESP application and AEP Ohio will file its distribution rate application next week. Consequently, at the present time, there is not enough information available to determine the impact of the merger combined with the other aspects of AEP Ohio's proposals. Accordingly, OMAEG recommends that the Commission continue its investigation into the impacts of AEP Ohio's merger proposal in the context of the ESP case and distribution rate case, among others, and keep this case open as a placeholder until all parties have sufficient information to determine the real impacts of the proposed merger.

Respectfully submitted on behalf of The Ohio Manufacturers' Association

Lisa G. McAlister

Thomas J. O'Brien Matthew W. Warnock

**BRICKER & ECKLER LLP** 

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

Telephone: (614) 227-2300

Facsimile: (614) 227-2390

E-mail: <u>lmcalister@bricker.com</u>

tobrien@bricker.com mwarnock@bricker.com

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing Comments of the

Ohio Manufacturers' Association was served upon the parties of record listed below this

day of February 2011 via first class mail and electronic mail.

Lisa G. McAlister

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
American Electric Power Service
Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur
Huntington Center
41 South High Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
dconway@porterwright.com

Samuel Randazzo
Joseph Oilker
Frank Darr
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com

Dorothy K. Corbett
Duke Energy Retail Sales LLC
139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dorothy.corbett@duke-energy.com

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com

Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45839
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

Maureen R. Grady
Terry L. Etter
Jodi Kyler
Office of the Ohio Consumer's Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215
grady@occ.state.oh.us
etter@occ.statc.oh.us
kyler@occ.state.oh.us

Thomas J. O'Brien Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 tobrien@bricker.com Richard L. Sites
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
ricks@Qhanet.org

David I. Fein
Cynthia Fonner Brady
550 West Washington, Blvd., Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60661
david.fein@constellation.com
cynthia.brady@constellation.com

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Peas LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com

Clinton A. Vince
Douglas G. Bonner
Daniel D. Barnowski
Emma F. Hand
Keith C. Nusbaum
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street NW
Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
clinton.vince@snrdenton.com
douglas.bonner@snrdenton.com
dan.bamowski@snrdenton.com
emma.hand@snrdenton.com

John Bentine
Mark S. Yurick
Chester Willcox & Saxbe LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, Ohio 43215
jbentine@cwslaw.com
myurick@cwslaw.com

Mark A. Hayden
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

David A. Kutik
Grant W. Garber
Jones Day
325 John H. McConnell Blvd., Suite 600
Columbus, OH 43215-2673
Telephone: (614)469-3939
Facsimile: (614)461-4198
gwgarber@jonesday.com
dakutik@jonesday.com

William Wright
Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Public Utilities Section
108 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

Jeff Jones
Greta See
Attorney Examiners
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Jeff.jones@puc.state.oh.us
Greta.See@puc.state.oh.us