

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Star	)	Case No. 09-1217-EL-EEC
Forge and the Ohio Edison Company, For	)	
Approval of a Special Arrangement	)	
Agreement With a Mercantile Customer	)	
	)	

---

**MOTION TO INTERVENE  
BY THE  
OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

---

The Ohio Environmental Council (“OEC”) hereby moves to intervene in this case in which the Ohio Edison Company (“FirstEnergy”) and Ohio Star Forge (“Ohio Star”) seek joint approval of a special arrangement under Ohio Admin. Code 4901:1-39-08(B). Approval of this arrangement will allow Ohio Star to opt-out of paying FirstEnergy for the costs collected under Rider DSE2, and allow FirstEnergy to attribute the energy reductions associated with the projects undertaken by Ohio Star to the energy efficiency achievements required under R.C. 4928.66.

As more fully discussed in the accompanying memorandum, the Ohio Environmental Council (“OEC”) has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding, and the disposition of this case may impede its ability to protect that interest. The interests of OEC, Ohio’s largest non-profit environmental advocacy organization, are not currently represented by any existing party, and its participation in this proceeding will contribute to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved. OEC’s participation will not unduly delay the proceeding or unjustly prejudice any existing party. Accordingly, OEC hereby moves to intervene in this proceeding pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene.

Respectfully Submitted,

---

**s/Will Reisinger (Counsel of Record)**

Staff Attorney for the Ohio  
Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 - Fax  
[will@theOEC.org](mailto:will@theOEC.org)

Nolan Moser,  
Staff Attorney, Director of Energy and  
Clean Air Programs  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 - Fax  
[nolan@theOEC.org](mailto:nolan@theOEC.org)

Trent Dougherty  
Staff Attorney & Director of Legal  
Affairs  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 - Fax  
[trent@theOEC.org](mailto:trent@theOEC.org)

**Attorneys for the Ohio Environmental  
Council**

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Star	)	Case No. 09-1217-EL-EEC
Forge and the Ohio Edison Company, For	)	
Approval of a Special Arrangement	)	
Agreement With a Mercantile Customer	)	
	)	

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

---

R.C. Section 4903.221 provides that any “person who may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding may intervene in such proceeding.” The OEC is a non-profit, charitable organization comprised of a network of over 100 affiliated group members whose mission is to secure a healthier environment for all Ohioans. Throughout its 40-year history, OEC has been a leading advocate for fresh air, clean water, and sustainable land and energy use. OEC was an active participant in the effort that led to the inclusion of demand reduction and energy efficiency requirements in S.B. 221. OEC has a real and substantial interest in assuring that the applicants’ proposal will result in sufficient energy savings to justify Ohio Star’s opt-out of Rider DSE2. If the energy savings prove to be insufficient, there is a danger that FirstEnergy will not meet the energy savings required under R.C. 4928.66, nor will it have the benefit of the inclusion of Ohio Star under Rider DSE2 to afford measures which would result in compliance with the statutory requirements. Thus, there can be no question that OEC has an interest in and may be adversely affected by the disposition of this case.

R.C. 4903.221(B) outlines four factors that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene in a proceeding. First, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(1), the

Commission shall consider “The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor’s interest.” OEC is interested in ensuring that the energy efficiency and demand reduction benchmarks are met in a manner which comports with the letter and intent of S.B. 221. OEC, as an environmental advocacy organization, has a special interest in the outcome of this case because the implementation of this special arrangement directly impacts the quality of programs by which FirstEnergy intends to meet the energy efficiency benchmarks required under R.C. § 4928.66.

Second, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(2), the Commission shall consider “The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case.” This case involves the review of the reasonableness and lawfulness of the request for approval of a special arrangement between Ohio Star and FirstEnergy filed pursuant to Ohio Admin. Code 4901:1-39-08(B). OEC maintains that the approval of such special arrangements, while allowed under R.C. §4928.66(A)(2)(c), should be undertaken only after a thorough review of the proposed energy efficiency projects to be undertaken by a mercantile customer. The current application does not provide sufficient detail about the programs to determine whether approval is appropriate. Failure of any mercantile project to produce the stated energy efficiency savings could result in a failure of the electric distribution utility to comply with the statutory energy efficiency benchmarks. This would create hardship on Ohio’s air quality and on its consumers and economy.

Third, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(3), the Commission shall consider “Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.” OEC has significant experience dealing with electric utilities questions before the

Commission and will not seek to delay the proceeding. OEC's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay these proceedings.

Fourth, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(4), the Commission shall consider "Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues." OEC has actively participated in the implementation of the efficiency, renewable energy, and peak demand reduction benchmarks established by S.B. 221. As an active participant in cases before the Commission, the OEC has developed expertise that will contribute to the full development of the legal questions involved in this proceeding.

OEC also satisfies the intervention requirements outlined in the Commission's rules. The criteria for intervention established by O.A.C. 4901-1-11(B) are identical to those provided by R.C. 4903.221, with the exception that the rules add a fifth factor that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene. Pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-11(B)(5), the Commission shall consider "The extent to which the [intervenor's] interest is represented by existing parties." OEC's interest is not fully represented by the existing parties. OEC is the leading advocate for Ohio's environment. No other party to this proceeding has the mission of securing healthy air for all Ohioans, and no other party has been a continuous participant in cases before the Commission for the sole purpose of furthering this mission.

Finally, it is the Commission's stated policy "to encourage the broadest possible participation in its proceedings" (*see, e.g., Cleveland Elec. Illum. Co.*, Case No. 85-675-EL-AIR, Entry dated January 14, 1986, at 2). The Commission should not apply its intervention

criteria in a manner that would favor one environmental or consumer advocate to the exclusion of others.

OEC meets all the criteria established by R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11(B)(5) and therefore should be granted intervenor status in this proceeding.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene.

Respectfully Submitted,

---

**s/Will Reisinger (Counsel of Record)**

Staff Attorney for the Ohio  
Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 - Fax  
[will@theOEC.org](mailto:will@theOEC.org)

Nolan Moser,  
Staff Attorney & Director of Energy and  
Clean Air Programs  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 - Fax  
[nolan@theOEC.org](mailto:nolan@theOEC.org)

Trent Dougherty  
Staff Attorney & Director of Legal  
Affairs  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 - Fax  
[trent@theOEC.org](mailto:trent@theOEC.org)

**Attorneys for the Ohio Environmental  
Council**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following parties by first class or electronic mail this 5<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2010.

---

s/Will Reisinger

Kevin P. Shannon  
James F. Lang  
Calfee, Halter & Griswold, LLP  
1400 KeyBank Center  
800 Superior Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114  
[jlang@calfee.com](mailto:jlang@calfee.com)  
[kshannon@calfee.com](mailto:kshannon@calfee.com)

**Attorneys for the Ohio Edison Company**



**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**2/5/2010 5:04:53 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 09-1217-EL-EEC**

Summary: Motion Motion to Intervene with Memorandum in Support electronically filed by Mr. Will Reisinger on behalf of Ohio Environmental Council