

EnerNOC, Inc 101 Federal Street Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 Tel: 617 224 9900 Fax: 617 224 9910 www.enernoc.com info@enernoc.com

January 14, 2010

Via Electronic Filing

Ms. Renee Jenkins Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street, 13th Floor Columbus, OH 43215

Re: FirstEnergy - PUCO Case Nos. O9-580-EL-EEC, 09-581-EL-EEC, 09-582-EL-EEC, 09-1942-EL-EEC, 09-1943-EL-EEC, 09-1944-EL-EEC, 09-1947-

EL-POR, 09-1948-EL-POR, 09-1949-EL-POR

Dear Ms. Jenkins:

Enclosed is a corrected Motion to Intervene filed by EnerNOC, Inc. This filing is intended to replace to Motion to Intervene filed January 13, 2010.

Very truly yours,

Jacqueline Lake Roberts, Counsel of Record 101 Federal Street, Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 Telephone: (740) 927-3344

iroberts@enernoc.com

Enclosure

cc: Parties of Record

#### **BEFORE**

# THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)		
Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric	)		
Illuminating Company, and the Toledo	)	Case Nos.	09-1947-EL-POR
Edison Company for Approval of Their	)		09-1948-EL-POR
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand	)		09-1949-EL-POR
Reduction Program Portfolio Plans for	)		
2010 through 2012 and Associated Cost	)		
Recovery Mechanisms.	)		
In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)		
Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric	)	Case Nos.	09-1942-EL-EEC
Illuminating Company, and the Toledo	)		09-1943-EL-EEC
Edison Company for Approval of Their	)		09-1944-EL-EEC
Initial Benchmark Reports.	)		

# MOTION TO INTERVENE BY ENERNOC, INC.

EnerNOC, Inc. (EnerNOC) moves to intervene in these cases where the proposed program portfolio to satisfy statutory benchmarks<sup>1</sup> concerns the implementation of cost-effective energy efficiency and peak demand reduction programs. EnerNOC provides demand response and energy efficiency programs to Ohio retail customers. The programs Ohio Edison Company, Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and Toledo Edison Company (collectively, FirstEnergy or Companies)<sup>2</sup> compete with programs offered by EnerNOC in Ohio.

<sup>2</sup> FirstEnergy also filed its reports in Case Nos. 09-580-EL-EEC, 09-581-EL-EEC and 09-582-EL-EEC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See, R.C. Chapter 4911, R.C. 4903.221, and Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11.

The reasons the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission) should grant EnerNOC's Motion are further set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted, ENERNOC, INC.

Jacqueline Lake Roberts, Counsel of Record 101 Federal Street, Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 Telephone: (740) 927-3344

jroberts@enernoc.com

.

#### **BEFORE**

# THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)		
Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric	)		
Illuminating Company, and the Toledo	)	Case Nos.	09-1947-EL-POR
Edison Company for Approval of Their	)		09-1948-EL-POR
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand	)		09-1949-EL-POR
Reduction Program Portfolio Plans for	)		
2010 through 2012 and Associated Cost	)		
Recovery Mechanisms.	)		
In the Matter of the Application of Ohio	)		
Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric	)	Case Nos.	09-1942-EL-EEC
Illuminating Company, and the Toledo	)		09-1943-EL-EEC
Edison Company for Approval of Their	)		09-1944-EL-EEC
Initial Benchmark Reports.	)		

# **MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

These cases involve the Companies' Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Program Portfolio Plan (Portfolio Plan) and Initial Benchmark Reports. EnerNOC may be adversely affected by, and has a direct interest in, the outcome of these cases. EnerNOC provides demand response and energy efficiency services to Ohio retail customers and the programs offered in the Portfolio Plan directly compete with EnerNOC's offering. R.C. 4903.221 provides, in part, that any person "who may be adversely affected" by a PUCO proceeding is entitled to seek intervention in that proceeding. EnerNOC's interests may be adversely affected by these cases because the terms and conditions of the programs proposed by

Companies in the Portfolio Plan. Therefore, this element of the intervention standard in R.C. 4903.221 is satisfied.

R.C. 4903.221(B) requires the Commission to consider the following criteria in ruling on motions to intervene:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest;
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceeding; and
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.

First, the nature and extent of EnerNOC's interest is to provide demand response and energy efficiency services to the customers of FirstEnergy. This interest is different from that of any other party and especially different from that of the utility.

Second, EnerNOC's legal position relates to how demand response and energy efficiency services should be provided to Ohio retail customers. Ohio retail customers should be allowed to participate in any programs offered in Ohio and there should be no financial incentive for retail customers to participate in FE's programs over others. This position is directly related to the merits of the cases pending before the Commission.

Third, EnerNOC's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.

EnerNOC has extensive experience practicing before state and federal commissions. This will allow for the efficient processing of these cases.

Fourth, EnerNOC's intervention will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues. EnerNOC has and will develop information that this Commission should consider for equitably and lawfully deciding the cases in the public interest.<sup>3</sup>

EnerNOC meets the criteria set forth in R.C. 4903.221, Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11, and the Commission should grant EnerNOC's Motion to Intervene.

Respectfully submitted, ENERNOC, INC.

Jacqueline Lake Roberts, Counsel of Record 101 Federal Street, Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 Telephone: (740) 927-3344

jroberts@enernoc.com

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> EnerNOC also satisfies the intervention criteria in the Ohio Administrative Code (which are subordinate to the criteria that EnerNOC satisfies in the Ohio Revised Code). To intervene, a party should have a "real and substantial interest" according to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(A)(2), which EnerNOC has demonstrated.

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of this *Motion to Intervene* was served on the persons identified below, *via* First Class Mail, postage prepaid, this 14th day of January 2010.

Jacqueline Lake Roberts Senior Manager Regulatory Affairs and Public Policy

#### **SERVICE LIST**

Kathy J. Kolich Arthur E. Korkosz Ebony L. Miller FirstEnergy Service Company 76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308

Duane Luckey Attorney General's Office Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 E. Broad St., 6th Fl. Columbus, OH 43216

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Tervor Alexander
Kevin P. Shannon
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114

Henry W. Eckhart 50 West Broad Street, #2117 Columbus, OH 43215 Attorney for the Natural Resources Defense Council Will Reisinger
Trent Doughtery
Nolan Moser
1207 Grandview Avenue, Ste. 201
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
Attorneys for Staff the Ohio Environmental Council

Todd Jones Christopher Miller Andre Porter Gregory Dunn Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA 250 West Street Columbus, OH 43215 Attorneys for the AICUO

David C. Rinebolt Colleen L. Mooney Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy 231 West Lima Street Findlay, OH 45839-1793

Michael E. Heintz 1207 Grandview Ave., Ste. 201 Columbus, OH 43204 Attorney for Environmental Law and Policy Center

Samuel C. Randazzo Lisa G. McAlister Joseph M. Clark McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, OH 43215 Attorneys for Industrial Users Energy-Ohio

David F. Boehm, Esq.
Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh St., Ste. 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Attorneys for the Ohio Energy Group

Joseph P. Meissner The Legal Aid Society of Cleveland 1223 West 6th St. Cleveland, OH 44113

Attorney for: Neighborhood Environmental Coalition,

Consumers for Fair Utility Rates,

The Empowerment Center of Greater Cleveland and Cleveland Housing Network

.

Jeffrey L. Small Gregory J. Poulos Christopher J. Allwein Assistant Consumers' Counsel Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485 This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

1/14/2010 2:27:05 PM

in

Case No(s). 09-1947-EL-POR, 09-1948-EL-POR, 09-1949-EL-POR

Summary: Motion (replacement) Motion to Intervene of EnerNOC, Inc. electronically filed by Ms. Jacqueline Lake Roberts on behalf of EnerNOC, Inc.