

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke
Energy Ohio for Certification as an Ohio
Renewable Energy Resource Generating
Facility

Case No. 09-1877-EL-REN

**MOTION TO INTERVENE
BY
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

This case concerns the alternative energy requirements established by Senate Bill 221 (S.B. 221). R.C. 4928.64(B)(2) provides that electric utilities shall generate at least half of their alternative energy “from renewable energy resources.” Pursuant to its Application for Certification as an Eligible Ohio Renewable Energy Resource Generating Facility, Duke Energy Ohio is requesting that the Commission certify its Miami Fort Generating Station as a renewable generation facility utilizing a biomass fuel type. As more fully discussed in the accompanying memorandum, the Ohio Environmental Council (“OEC”) has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding to ensure that the RECs are properly calculated and that this Application is properly scrutinized in light of the letter and intent of S.B. 221. The interests of OEC, Ohio’s largest non-profit environmental advocacy organization, are not represented by any existing party, and its participation in this proceeding will contribute to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved. OEC’s participation will not unduly delay the proceeding or unjustly prejudice any existing party.

Accordingly, OEC hereby moves to intervene in this proceeding pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene in the above captioned matter.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/Nolan Moser (Counsel of Record)

Staff Attorney, Director of Energy
and Clean Air Programs
The Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone
(614) 487-7510 - Fax
nolan@theOEC.org

Will Reisinger,
Staff Attorney for the Ohio
Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone
(614) 487-7510 - Fax
will@theOEC.org

Attorneys for The Ohio
Environmental Council

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke
Energy Ohio for Certification as an
Eligible Ohio Renewable Energy Resource
Facility

Case No. 09-1877-EL-REN

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT
BY
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

I. MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

R.C. Section 4903.221 provides that any “person who may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding may intervene in such proceeding.” The OEC is a non-profit, charitable organization comprised of a network of over 100 affiliated member groups whose mission is to secure a healthier environment for all Ohioans. Throughout its 40-year history, OEC has been a leading advocate for fresh air, clean water, and sustainable land and energy use. OEC was an active participant in the effort that led to the passage of S.B. 221, including the inclusion of energy efficiency and renewable generation requirements. OEC has a real and substantial interest in assuring that the renewable generation benchmarks established by R.C. 4928.64(B)(2) are properly calculated and that robust, long-term sources of renewable electricity generation are sited in Ohio. The attainment or non-attainment of these benchmarks will have a direct effect on the air quality within Ohio and the amount of renewable generation distributed in the state. There can be no question that OEC has an interest in and may be adversely affected by the disposition of this case.

R.C. 4903.221(B) outlines four factors that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene in a proceeding. First, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(1), the Commission shall consider “The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor’s interest.” OEC has several distinct interests in the disposition of this case. OEC is interested in the proper calculation of utility RECs to ensure that those calculations comport with the letter and intent of S.B. 221. As one of the first applications for RECs for biomass-based generation in Ohio, the disposition of this case will inform how future applications are considered by the Commission. Pursuant to R.C. 4928.65, this facility could potentially also be eligible for a higher REC unit level. The higher value of the potential RECs for biomass based generation demands higher scrutiny of Duke’s Application. Conceptually, each biomass-based REC displaces other renewable generation and therefore should be carefully scrutinized. OEC, as an environmental advocacy organization, has a special interest in the outcome of this case because of the direct impact that decisions on the calculation of RECs will have on the current and future effectiveness of S.B. 221, and thus, the further deployment of cleaner sources of electricity.

Second, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(2), the Commission shall consider “The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case.” Although OEC does not outline detailed legal arguments in this section, OEC maintains that Duke’s request for certification pursuant to R.C. 4928.64 should be subject to high scrutiny. RECs must not be granted for non-renewable generation. Further, as stated above, R.C. 4928.65 allows a utility to receive RECs at a higher REC rate than other sources of renewable energy.

Third, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(3), the Commission shall consider “Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.” OEC has significant experience dealing with electric utilities questions before the Commission and will not seek to delay the proceeding. OEC has been consistently involved in the development and enactment of S.B. 221 and the associated rules, including as a party in numerous cases before the Commission. OEC’s intervention will not unduly prolong or delay these proceedings; to the contrary, OEC’s expertise and unique interest will add value to the development of this case.

Fourth, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(4), the Commission shall consider “Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.” OEC has actively participated in the implementation of the efficiency, peak demand reduction, and renewable energy benchmarks established by S.B. 221. As an active participant in cases before the Commission, the OEC has developed expertise that will contribute to the full development of the legal questions involved in this proceeding. Finally, as Ohio’s leading environmental advocate, OEC will be able to assure that the environmental impacts of benchmark calculations are fully developed.

OEC also satisfies the intervention requirements outlined in the Commission’s rules. The criteria for intervention established by O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A) are identical to those provided by R.C. 4903.221, with the exception that the rules add a fifth factor that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene. Pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A)(5), the Commission shall consider “The extent to which the [intervenor’s] interest is represented by existing parties.” OEC’s interest is not fully represented by the

existing parties. OEC is the leading advocate for Ohio's environment. No other party to this proceeding has the mission of securing healthy air for all Ohioans, and no other party has been a continuous participant in cases before the Commission for the specific purpose of furthering this mission.

Finally, we point out that it is the Commission's stated policy "to encourage the broadest possible participation in its proceedings" (*see, e.g., Cleveland Elec. Illum. Co.*, Case No. 85-675-EL-AIR, Entry dated January 14, 2986, at 2). The Commission should not apply its intervention criteria in a manner that would favor one environmental or consumer advocate to the exclusion of others.

OEC meets all the criteria established by R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A)(5) and therefore should be granted intervenor status in this proceeding.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene in the above captioned matter.

Respectfully Submitted,

**/s/Nolan Moser (Counsel of
Record)**

Staff Attorney, Director of Energy
and Clean Air Programs
The Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone
(614) 487-7510 - Fax
nolan@theOEC.org

Will Reisinger,
Staff Attorney for the Ohio
Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone
(614) 487-7510 - Fax
will@theOEC.org

Attorneys for The Ohio
Environmental Council

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following parties by electronic mail this 14th day of December, 2009.

/s/Nolan Moser

SERVICE LIST

Katie A. Kiefer
Duke Energy Ohio
5319 Belclare Road
Cincinnati, Ohio 45247
Katie.Kiefer@Duke-Energy.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

12/14/2009 5:14:16 PM

in

Case No(s). 09-1877-EL-REN

Summary: Motion Motion to Intervene and Memorandum in Support electronically filed by Mr. Nolan M Moser on behalf of The Ohio Environmental Council