

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke       )  
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval of       ) Case No. 09-757-EL-ESS  
Proposed Reliability Standards.       )

---

**MOTION TO INTERVENE  
BY  
THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

---

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") moves to intervene in this case in which Duke Energy Ohio ("Duke" or "Company") has filed an Application proposing new reliability performance standards that are part of the Electric Service and Safety Standards ("ESSS"). Each of the Ohio Electric Distribution Utilities ("EDUs") was required by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO" or "Commission") to file such proposed standards.<sup>1</sup> OCC moves to intervene on behalf of all of the approximately 585,000 residential utility consumers of Duke. The reasons the "Commission" should grant OCC's Motion to Intervene ("Motion") are further set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

The Commission should grant OCC's Motion to Intervene in order to afford OCC the opportunity to comment on Duke's proposed reliability standards and assist in correcting any deficiencies in the proposed standards, consistent with such comments.

---

<sup>1</sup> *In re the Commission's Review of Chapters 4901:1-9, 4901:1-10, 4901:1-21, 4901:1-22, 4901:1-23, 4901:1-24, and 4901:1-25, of the Ohio Administrative Code*, Case No. 06-653-EL-ORD, Entry on Rehearing at 9-10 (May 6, 2009) ("ESSS Case").

Respectfully submitted,

JANINE L. MIGDEN-OSTRANDER  
CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

*/s/ Richard C. Reese*

---

Richard C. Reese, Counsel of Record

Jeffrey L. Small

Joseph P. Serio

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

**Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel**

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

Telephone: (614) 466-8574

[reese@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:reese@occ.state.oh.us)

[small@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:small@occ.state.oh.us)

[serio@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:serio@occ.state.oh.us)

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke       )  
Energy Ohio, Inc., for Approval of       ) Case No. 09-757-EL-ESS  
Proposed Reliability Standards.       )

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

---

**I. INTRODUCTION**

On May 6, 2009, the Commission issued an Entry on Rehearing requiring the EDUs to file proposed new standards within 60 days following the effective date of the new ESSS.<sup>2</sup> The standards relate to the frequency and duration of outages experienced on the EDU's electric distribution systems, and are required by Ohio Adm. Code 4901:1-10-10(B)(4). In proposing the standards, the EDUs are required to take into account factors that include the historical performance of their distribution facilities, system design, and the results of customer perception surveys.<sup>3</sup> The procedural requirements that the Commission, and other parties must follow in considering the new outage-related reliability standards, as well as the procedures the EDUs must follow in proposing the new standards are set forth in Ohio Adm. Code 4901:1-10-10(B)(6).

OCC moves to intervene in this case in order to, among other matters, provide comments at a later date in the proceeding regarding adjustments that should be made to Duke's proposed standards and changes that should be made to the method by which

---

<sup>2</sup> Id. at 9-10.

<sup>3</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901:1-10-10(B)(4)(a) and (b).

the Company develops its proposed standards. OCC has authority under Ohio law to represent the interests of the approximately 585,000 residential utility consumers of Duke, pursuant to R.C. Chapter 4911.

## **II. ARGUMENT**

R.C. 4903.221 provides, in part, that any person “who may be adversely affected” by a PUCO proceeding is entitled to seek intervention in that proceeding. The interests of Ohio’s residential consumers may be “adversely affected” by this case, especially if the consumers were unrepresented in a proceeding that involves standards that directly impact the quality of service received by the consumers of the EDUs. Thus, this element of the intervention standard in R.C. 4903.221 is satisfied.

R.C. 4903.221(B) requires the Commission to consider the following criteria in ruling on motions to intervene:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor’s interest;
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceeding; and
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.

First, the nature and extent of OCC’s interest is representing the residential consumers of Duke in order to help ensure that appropriate electric reliability standards are adopted by the Commission. This interest is different than that of any other party and especially different than that of the utilities whose advocacy includes the financial interest of stockholders.

Second, OCC's advocacy for consumers will include advancing the position that Duke's initial filing in this case does not adequately support the Company's proposed new reliability standards. OCC's position is therefore directly related to the merits of this case that is pending before the PUCO, the authority with regulatory control of the terms under which public utilities provide their services.

Third, OCC's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay the proceedings. OCC, with its longstanding expertise and experience in PUCO proceedings, will duly allow for the efficient processing of the case with consideration of the public interest.

Fourth, OCC's intervention will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues. OCC was significantly involved in the ESSS rulemaking making that adopted new criteria for the calculation of outage-related standards. From this experience as well as other involvement in reliability-related matters, the OCC has information and will develop additional information that the PUCO should consider for equitably and lawfully deciding the case in the public interest.

OCC also satisfies the intervention criteria in the Ohio Administrative Code (which are subordinate to the criteria that OCC satisfies in the Ohio Revised Code). To intervene, a party should have a "real and substantial interest" according to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(A)(2). As the residential utility consumer advocate, OCC has a very real and substantial interest in this case which will determine just what standards constitute reasonable benchmarks for the frequency and duration of outages experienced by residential consumers of Duke.

In addition, OCC meets the criteria of Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B)(1)-(4). These criteria mirror the statutory criteria in R.C. 4903.221(B) that OCC already has addressed and that OCC satisfies.

Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B)(5) states that the Commission shall consider the “extent to which the person’s interest is represented by existing parties.” While OCC does not concede the lawfulness of this criterion, OCC satisfies this criterion in that it uniquely has been designated as the state representative of the interests of Ohio’s residential utility consumers. That interest is different from, and not represented by, any other entity in Ohio.

Moreover, the Supreme Court of Ohio confirmed OCC’s right to intervene in PUCO proceedings, in ruling on an appeal in which OCC claimed the PUCO erred by denying its intervention. The Court found that the PUCO abused its discretion in denying OCC’s intervention and that OCC should have been granted intervention.<sup>4</sup>

### **III. CONCLUSION**

OCC meets the criteria set forth in R.C. 4903.221, Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11, and the precedent established by the Supreme Court of Ohio for intervention. Duke’s residential consumers expect and pay for reliable service. The proposed new reliability standards should assist in ensuring that Duke’s consumers receive the level of service for which they pay. The Commission should grant OCC’s Motion to Intervene.

---

<sup>4</sup> See *Ohio Consumers’ Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm.*, 111 Ohio St.3d 384, 2006-Ohio-5853, ¶¶13-20 (2006).

Respectfully submitted,

JANINE L. MIGDEN-OSTRANDER  
CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

/s/ Richard C. Reese

Richard C. Reese, Counsel of Record

Jeffrey L. Small

Joseph P. Serio

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

**Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel**

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

Telephone: (614) 466-8574

[reese@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:reese@occ.state.oh.us)

[small@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:small@occ.state.oh.us)

[serio@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:serio@occ.state.oh.us)

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this *Motion to Intervene* was served on the persons stated below *via* regular U.S. Mail Service, postage prepaid, this 25th day of November 2009.

/s/ Richard C. Reese

Richard C. Reese

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

### **SERVICE LIST**

Elizabeth Watts  
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.  
155 East Broad Street, Suite 2100  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Anita Schafer  
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.  
139 East Fourth Street, P.O. Box 960  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Duane Luckey  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 East Broad Street, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Harvey L. Wagner  
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Co.  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, Ohio 44308

Dona Seger-Lawson  
Joseph Strines  
Dayton Power & Light Company  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, Ohio 45432

Miller  
Perry Local Schools  
4201 Harsh Avenue SW  
Massillon, Ohio 44646



Stephen M. Howard  
Vorys, Sater Seymour & Pease LLP  
52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008  
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

Lisa McAlister  
McNees, Wallace & Nurick  
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4228

Marvin Resnik  
American Electric Power Serv. Corp.  
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Judi Sobecki  
Dayton Power & Light Company  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, Ohio 45432

Daniel Neilsen  
Samuel C. Randazzo  
McNees, Wallace & Nurick LLC  
Fifth Third Center, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
21 East State Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Howard Petricoff  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease LLP  
52 East Gay Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Irda Hoxa Hinders  
Dayton Power & Light Company  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, Ohio 45432

Teresa Orahood  
Bricker & Eckler  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291

Mrs. Amy Ewing  
Greater Cincinnati Health Council  
2100 Sherman Avenue, Suite 100  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45212

Matthew Satterwhite  
Steven Nourse  
American Electric Power Serv. Corp.  
1 Riverside Plaza  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Marc Gerken, P.E.  
American Municipal Power-Ohio Inc  
1111 Schrock Road Suite 100  
Columbus, Ohio 43229-1155

Selwyn J. R. Dias  
Columbus Southern Power Company  
88 East Broad Street, Suite 800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3550

John Bentine  
Chester, Wilcox & Saxbe, LLP  
65 East State Street, Suite 1000  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213

Cynthia A. Fonner  
Constellation Energy Group, Inc.  
550 W. Washington Blvd, Suite 300  
Chicago, Illinois 60661

Nicole Stika  
Steven Millard  
Cose Group Services Inc  
100 Public Square, Suite 210  
Cleveland, Ohio 44113-2291

Paul Colbert  
Cincinnati Gas & Electric  
139 East Fourth Street  
2500 Atrium II Bldg  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960

James Burk  
FirstEnergy Service Company  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, Ohio 44308

Lou D'Alessandris  
FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.  
341 White Pond Drive  
Akron, Ohio 44320

Amy Ewing  
Greater Cincinnati Hospital Council  
2100 Sherman Avenue, Suite 100  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45212

Jason Keyes  
Keyes & Fox LLP  
1721 21<sup>st</sup> Avenue East  
Seattle, Washington 98112

Glenn Krassen  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
1375 East Ninth Street, Suite 1500  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-1718

Barth Royer  
Bell & Royer Co, LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927

Nolan Moser  
Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449

Dale Arnold  
Ohio Farm Bureau Federation, Inc.  
P.O. Box 182383  
Columbus, Ohio 43218

Thomas Froehle  
McNees, Wallace & Nurick LLC  
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4228

Richard Sites  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 East Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3620

Gregory Dunn  
Schottenstein, Zox & Dunn Co. LPA  
250 West Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Dana McDaniel  
City of Dublin  
5800 Shier Rings Road  
Dublin, Ohio 43016

Michael R. Smalz  
Appalachian People's Action Coalition  
Ohio State Legal Service Assoc  
555 Buttles Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Noel Morgan  
Communities United for Action  
Legal Aid Society of Southwest Ohio  
215 East Ninth Street, Suite 200  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Sandra Brummitt  
Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.  
100 Constellation Way, Suite 600C  
Baltimore, MD 21202

Tim Walters  
Consumers for Fair Utilities Rates  
4115 Bridge Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44113

Counsel of Smaller Enterprises  
The Higbee Building  
100 Public Square, Suite 210  
Cleveland, Ohio 44113

Ron Cerniglia  
Direct Energy Services LLC  
40 Columbine Drive  
Glenmont, NY 12077

Gary A. Jeffries  
Dominion Retail, Inc.  
120 Tredegar Street  
Richmond, VA 23219

Ellis Jacobs  
Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition  
333 West First Street, Suite 500B  
Dayton, Ohio 45402

David C. Rinebolt  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
P.O. Box 1793  
Findlay, Ohio 45839-1793

The Kroger Company  
1014 Vine Street  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-1100

Empowerment Center of Greater Cleveland  
3030 Euclid Avenue Unit 100  
Cleveland, Ohio 44115

Greater Cincinnati Health Council  
2100 Sherman Avenue #100  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45212

Joseph M. Clark  
McNees, Wallace & Nurick LLC  
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Amy Klavitar  
Integrus Energy Services, Inc.  
500 W. Madison Street, Suite 3300  
Chicago, Illinois 60661

James Russell  
National Assoc of Industrial and Office  
Properties, Central Ohio Chapter  
470 Olde Worthington Road Suite 200  
Westerville, Ohio 43082

Sally Bloomfield  
Ohio Advanced Energy  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291

Samuel C. Randazzo  
Industrial Energy Users-Ohio  
21 East State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Ebony L. Miller  
FirstEnergy Service Company  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, Ohio 44308

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**11/25/2009 3:59:00 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 09-0757-EL-ESS**

Summary: Motion Motion to Intervene by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel electronically filed by Mrs. Mary V. Edwards on behalf of Reese, Richard C. Mr. and Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel