FILE FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W. 10 North Ludlow Street Dayton, Ohio 45402 937-227-3700 Fax 937-227-3717

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (937) 227-3747 jsharkey@ficlaw.com

September 9, 2009

<u>VIA FEDERAL EXPRESS</u>

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio **Docketing Division** Attention: Renee Jenkins 180 E. Broad Street 10th Floor Columbus, OH 43215

> Re: DP&L Case Nos. 08-1094-EL-SSO, et al.

Dear Docketing Clerk:

Enclosed for filing are an original and twenty (20) copies of The Dayton Power and Light Company's Memorandum in Opposition to the Motion to Establish a Procedural Schedule and Hearing Date by The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel in the abovecaptioned matter.

Very truly yours,

/Sharkey

JSS/tes Enclosures

> This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of busines, Date Processed SP 10 2008 rechnician .



TRUSTED WISDOM, EXTRAORDINARY RESULTS.

ficlaw.com

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

2009 SEP 10 AM 10: 21

PUCO

A CO AMBO SI

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of

Case No. 08-1094-EL-SSO

The Dayton Power and Light Company for

Approval of Its Electric Security Plan

.

In the Matter of the Application of

Case No. 08-1095-EL-ATA

Case No. 08-1096-EL-AAM

The Dayton Power and Light Company for

Approval of Revised Tariffs

•

In the Matter of the Application of

The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority

:

Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code Section 4905.13

Taisuant to omo 1007. Codo Socion 150

Case No. 08-1097-EL-UNC

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for

Approval of Its Amended Corporate

Separation Plan

:

THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY'S MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO THE MOTION TO ESTABLISH A PROCEDURAL SCHEDULE AND HEARING DATE BY THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") has filed a Motion to Establish a Procedural Schedule and Hearing Date, in which OCC asks the Commission to set dates for a technical conference, the filing of comments and testimony, and a hearing. The Commission should deny OCC's Motion for the following separate and independent reasons:

First, OCC's Motion violates the February 24, 2009 Stipulation and Recommendation in this matter that OCC signed and the Commission approved. That Stipulation provides that DP&L would develop and file independent business cases for its AMI and Smart Grid plans. Stipulation, ¶ 4. That Stipulation establishes a clear procedure for the filing and review of DP&L's plans:

- Prior to filing, "DP&L shall consult with interested Signatory Parties to seek their advice with regard to the costs and benefits of the Company's AMI and Smart Grid business cases." Stipulation, ¶ 4.b.
- "The AMI and Smart Grid business cases that demonstrate a positive benefit cost analysis will be filed in this docket no later than September 1, 2009." Stipulation, ¶ 4.b.
- DP&L's filing shall be "reviewed by the Commission's Staff and approved by the Commission. Staff will endeavor to complete its review in the fourth quarter of 2009 so that the rider may be implemented January 1, 2010." Stipulation, ¶ 4.b.

The Stipulation thus establishes a clear procedure for review of DP&L's filing. That procedure does not include a technical conference, the filing of testimony or a hearing.¹

Stipulation, ¶ 2 confirms that the parties did not intend to conduct a hearing to review DP&L's amended AMI and Smart Grid plans. Stipulation, ¶ 2 addresses DP&L's fuel rider, and expressly provides that annual adjustments to the fuel rider "will be subject to due process, including audits and hearings." There is no similar provision in Stipulation, ¶ 4 (which addresses AMI and Smart Grid), demonstrating that the parties to the Stipulation (including OCC) did not intend for DP&L's AMI or Smart Grid plans to be reviewed in a full hearing.

OCC signed the Stipulation, and agreed to a process by which DP&L's revised AMI and Smart Grid plans would be reviewed. DP&L does not object if OCC wishes to file specific comments on DP&L's plans. However, the Commission should not alter the procedural process to which OCC agreed.

¹ OCC's request for a technical conference (p. 3) is unnecessary for the additional reason that Stipulation, ¶ 4.b provides that DP&L shall meet and confer with the parties to discuss DP&L's filing, which OCC concedes (pp. 3-4) has occurred.

Second, OCC's reliance (Motion, pp. 2-3) on this Commission's August 19, 2009

Entry in a Duke Energy Ohio case (09-543-GE-UNC) is misplaced. In the prior related proceeding, Duke and OCC (and others) signed a Stipulation that provided that Rider DR-IM (to recover Duke's Smart Grid investment) "shall be initially set at zero. Thereafter, such charge shall be subject to an applicable annual second quarter due process." October 27, 2008

Stipulation and Recommendation, ¶ 11.a (Case No. 08-920-EL-SSO). That Duke Stipulation specifically provided that the review shall "includ[e] an opportunity for hearing." Id. ¶ 11.

Accord: Duke Stipulation and Recommendation, ¶ 14 (Case No. 07-589-GA-AIR) (providing for a "hearing" to review Duke's Smart Grid plan for gas). The parties to Duke's Stipulations thus agreed to a procedure that included a hearing. The parties to DP&L's Stipulation did not.

OCC's reliance on the Commission's Entry in the Duke matter is thus misplaced.

Third, there is not enough time to conduct a hearing. The Stipulation in this matter provides that DP&L's Infrastructure Investment Rider ("IIR") is to be implemented by January 1, 2010. It is not possible to conduct a hearing on December 7, 2009 (OCC's requested date), complete post-hearing briefing, complete Commission review of the record and arguments made, and still implement the IIR by January 1, 2010. (The reason that there is not sufficient time to conduct a hearing, of course, is that the parties to the Stipulation did not intend for there to be a hearing and did not leave time in the agreed schedule for one.)

Fourth, there is no need for a hearing. DP&L's initial application included extensive information regarding DP&L's AMI and Smart Grid plans.² OCC deposed DP&L's

² DP&L Application, Book II, Chapter 3 (AMI plan); DP&L Application, Book II, Chapter 4 (Smart Grid plan); Direct Testimony of Karen Garrison (describing DP&L's information technology plans); Direct Testimony of Jeffrey E. Teuscher (describing DP&L's AMI and Smart Grid plans).

witnesses, and OCC filed testimony on DP&L's AMI and Smart Grid plans.³ DP&L's AMI and Smart Grid plans did not change materially from its initial filing. OCC thus has more than enough information that it can use to file comments on DP&L's AMI and Smart Grid plans. Further, the Commission and its Staff now have extensive experience regarding AMI and Smart Grid, and additional testimony and a hearing would not assist the Commission or its Staff to review DP&L's plans.

In short, the Stipulation in this case -- which OCC signed and the Commission approved -- establishes a procedure to review DP&L's revised AMI and Smart Grid plans. That procedure does not include a technical conference, the filing of testimony, or a hearing. If OCC has comments on DP&L's revised AMI and Smart Grid plans, then OCC should file those comments immediately. The Commission, however, should not set dates for a technical conference, for the filing of testimony, or for a hearing.

³ Direct Testimony Stephen W. Pullins. That testimony was withdrawn pursuant to Stipulation, ¶ 34. While the testimony thus has no evidentiary value, the fact that OCC filed that testimony demonstrates that OCC understands DP&L's plans.

Respectfully submitted,

Judi L. Sobecki (0067186)

THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY

1065 Woodman Drive

Dayton, OH 45432

Telephone: (937) 259-7171 Telecopier: (937) 259-7178 Email: judi.sobecki@dplinc.com

Charles J. Favuki (0010417)

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

R. Holtzman Hedrick (0078424)

FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W.

10 North Ludlow Street

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3705 Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power and

Light Company

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing The Dayton Power and Light Company's Memorandum in Opposition to the Motion to Establish a Procedural Schedule and Hearing Date by The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 9th day of September, 2009:

Samuel C. Randazzo, Esq. Lisa G. McAlister, Esq. Joseph M. Clark, Esq. MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Jacqueline L. Roberts, Esq.
Michael E. Idzkowski, Esq.
Richard Reese, Esq.
Gregory J. Poulos, Esq.
OFFICE OF OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215

David C. Rinebolt, Esq.
Colleen L. Mooney, Esq.
OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE
ENERGY
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45839-1793

Henry Eckhart, Esq. 50 West Broad Street, Suite 2117 Columbus, OH 43215-3301

Robert Ukeiley, Esq.
LAW OFFICE OF ROBERT UKEILEY
435R Chestnut Street, Suite 1
Berea, KY 40403

Attorneys for Sierra Club Ohio Chapter

John W. Bentine, Esq.
Matthew S. White, Esq.
Mark S. Yurick, Esq.
CHESTER WILLCOX & SAXBE LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, OH 43215

Attorneys for The Kroger Company

David Boehm, Esq. Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OH 45202-4454

Attorney for Ohio Energy Group, Inc.

M. Howard Petricoff, Esq.
Stephen M. Howard, Esq.
Michael J. Settineri, Esq.
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND
PEASE LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Cynthia A. Fonner, Esq.
Senior Counsel
CONSTELLATION ENERGY
RESOURCES, LLC
550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60661

Attorneys for Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc. Ned Ford 539 Plattner Trail Beavercreek, OH 45430

Richard L. Sites, Esq.
General Counsel and Senior Director of
Health Policy
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3620

Attorney for The Ohio Hospital Association

Craig I. Smith, Esq. Attorney at Law 2824 Coventry Road Cleveland, OH 44120

Attorney for Cargill, Incorporated

John J. Danish, Esq.
Christopher L. Miller, Esq.
Gregory H. Dunn, Esq.
Andre T. Porter, Esq.
SCHOTTENSTEIN ZOX & DUNN CO., LPA
250 West Street
Columbus, OH 43215

Attorneys for The City of Dayton

M. Howard Petricoff, Esq.
Stephen M. Howard, Esq.
Michael J. Settineri, Esq.
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE
LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Attorneys for Honda of America Mfg., Inc.

David I. Fein Vice President, Energy Policy - Midwest CONSTELLATION ENERGY GROUP, INC. 550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661

Tasha Hamilton
Manager, Energy Policy
CONSTELLATION ENERGY GROUP, INC.
111 Market Place, Suite 600
Baltimore, MD 21202

Larry Gearhardt, Esq.
Chief Legal Counsel
OHIO FARM BUREAU FEDERATION
280 North High Street
P.O. Box 182383
Columbus, OH 43218-2383

Attorney for The Ohio Farm Bureau Federation

Thomas J. O'Brien, Esq. BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291

Attorney for The Ohio Manufacturers' Association

Barth E. Royer, Esq. BELL & ROYER CO., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927

Gary A. Jeffries, Esq.
Dominion Resources Services, Inc.
501 Martindale Street, Suite 400
Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817

Attorneys for Dominion Retail, Inc.

Barth E. Royer, Esq. BELL & ROYER CO., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927

Nolan Moser, Esq. Air & Energy Program Manager The Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212-3449

Trent A. Dougherty, Esq. The Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212-3449

Todd Williams, Esq. 4534 Douglas Road Toledo, OH 43613

Attorneys for The Ohio Environmental Council

Ellis Jacobs Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc. 333 West First Street, Suite 500B Dayton, OH 45402

Attorney for The Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

Thomas Lindgren, Esq. Thomas McNamee, Esq. Assistant Attorneys General 180 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215

Office of the Ohio Attorney General

336340.1