

### CITIZEN POWER

Public Policy Research Education and Advocacy

July 1, 2009

Docketing Division Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Re:

Case No. 09-384-EL-EEC, 09-385-EL-EEC, 09-386-EL-EEC

**Dear Docketing Division:** 

Enclosed please find for filing an original and (10) ten copies of the Motion of Citize Power, Inc., to Intervene, Memorendum in Support, and Motion to Practice Pro Hac Vice Before the Commission.

if you have any questions, please contact me at (412) 421-7029.

Sincerely,

Theodore S. Robinson, Esquire

mul Mals

Staff Attorney Citizen Power 2121 Murray Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15217

**Attachment** 

PUCO

7009.III - | PH 4: 01

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Date Processed O . O .

In the Matter of the Energy Efficiency	)	Case No. 09-384-EL-EEC
and Peak Demand Reduction Program	)	09-385-BL-EEC
Portfolio of Ohio Edison Company,	Ś	09-386-EL-EEC
The Cleveland Electric Illuminating	)	
Company, and The Toledo Edison	j	11
Company.	Ś	

# MOTION OF CITIZEN POWER, INC., TO INTERVENE, MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT AND MOTION TO PRACTICE PRO HAC VICE BEFORE THE COMMISSION

Theodore S. Robinson
Citizen Power
2121 Murray Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15217
Telephone: (412) 421 7029

Fax: (412) 421-6162

e-mail: robinson@citizenpower.com

July 1, 2009

Counsel for Citizen Power

In the Matter of the Energy Efficiency	)	Case No. 09-384-EL-EEC
and Peak Demand Reduction Program	)	09-385- <b>HL</b> EEC
Portfolio of Ohio Edison Company,	)	09-386-BLEEC
The Cleveland Electric Illuminating	)	· I
Company, and The Toledo Edison	)	11
Company.	)	11

#### MOTION TO INTERVENE OF CITIZEN POWER, INC.

Citizen Power, Inc., ("Citizen Power") hereby respectfully moves the Public

Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission"), pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and Section

4901-1-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code, to intervene in the above-captioned case,
with the full powers and rights granted by the Commission specifically, by statute and by
the provisions of the Ohio Administrative Code to intervening parties.

Citizen Power is a not-for-profit research, education and advocacy organization (i.e. under Section 501 (c) (3) of the U. S. Internal Revenue Code), with offices in Ohio and Pennsylvania. A more detailed description of Citizen Power, the reasons for its intervention, and why such intervention should be granted by the Commission are set forth in the Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

Theodore S. Robinson

Citizen Power

2121 Murray Avenue

Pittsburgh, PA 152 7
Telephone: (412) 421-7029
FAX: (412) 421-6152
e-mail: robinson@ditzenpower.com

In the Matter of the Energy Efficiency	)	Case No. 09-384-EL	EEC
and Peak Demand Reduction Program	)	09-385- <b>H</b> L	EEC
Portfolio of Ohio Edison Company,	)	09-386-HL	EEC
The Cleveland Electric Illuminating	<b>)</b>		
Company, and The Toledo Edison	j		
Company.	j		1

#### MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Citizen Power respectfully submits that it should be permitted to intervene in these matters according to R.C. 4903.221 and the Commission's Rules and Regulations contained in Section 4901-1-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code. Moreover, Citizen Power should be permitted to intervene with the full powers and rights granted by the Commission specifically, by statute and by the provisions of the Ohio Althinistrative Code to intervening parties.

Citizen Power, Inc. is a not-for-profit research, education and advocacy organization (i.e. under Section 501 (c) (3) of the U. S. Internal Revenue Gode), with offices in Ohio (at 2424 Dock Road, Madison, Ohio 44057), and Pennsylvania (at 2121 Murray Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15217). Citizen Power has established an Energy Education Project with the primary mission of promoting energy policies that protect the environment and low-income customers. David Hughes is the Executive Director of Citizen Power, Kelli O'Neill and Ronald O'Connell are Directors of Citizen Power, and each is a customer of The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, an operating company of FirstEnergy.

Citizen Power has a long history of involvement in electric regulatory matters. In the period from 1986 through 1989, Citizen Power, then known as "Corporated Citizens," intervened at the Commission in the Perry 1 and Beaver Valley 2 investigations concerning the prudence of the construction costs for the two nuclear power plants, and the case concerning the base rates of Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company. Citizen Power also intervened before the FERC in the FirstEnergy merger case Docket No. ER 97-413). Furthermore, Citizen Power was granted intervention and actively participated in the FirstEnergy Transition Case before this Commission (Case Nos. 99-1212-EL-ETP, 99-1213-EL-ETP, and 99-1214-EL-ETP), the FirstEnergy ESP Case (Case No. 08-935-EL-SSO), and the FirstEnergy MRO Case (08-936-EL-SSO).

Citizen Power has a direct, real, and substantial interest in this prodeeding. The above-captioned proceeding will directly affect how FirstEnergy satisfiel dertain energy efficiency requirements that resulted from enactment of S.B. 221. As part of its mission, Citizen Power has advocated for clean and affordable energy in multiple regulatory and legal proceedings. Thus, the interests of Citizen Power may be "adversely affected" by these proceedings, satisfying the intervention standard in R.C. 4903.221.

Citizen Power also meets the standard for intervention under R. J. 4903.221(B), which provides that the Commission shall consider in ruling on an interfection application:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervendr's interest;
- The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its **(2)** probable relation to the merits of the case;

- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceeding; and
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.

First, as evidenced above, the nature and extent of Citizen Power's interest in these proceedings are substantial. As an advocate for the cleaner use of energy, Citizen Power has a specific interest that this proceeding holds FirstEnergy to specific energy efficiency requirements. Second, Citizen Power's legal positions include, but are not limited to, the proposition that past measures taken by a utility before S.B. 221 was enacted should not be counted towards fulfilling energy efficiency requirements. Third, since the proceeding has just started, granting Citizen Power's motion to intervene will not unduly prolong or delay the proceeding. Fourth, Citizen Power will contribute to the just, equitable, and expeditious resolution of the issues that are raised in these proceedings.

Citizen Power also meets the standard for intervention under Section 4901-1-11(B)(1)-(4) of the Ohio Administration Code, which is almost identical to the criteria under R.C. 4903.221(B). Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B)(5) states that the Commission shall consider the "extent to which the person's interest is represented by existing parties." While Citizen Power does not concede the lawfulness of this factor, Citizen Power satisfies this criterion in that it is specifically concerned about both environmental impacts and that FirstEnergy's proposals to satisfy certain energy efficiency requirements may reduce the opportunity for implementation of needed energy efficiency programs aimed at low-income customers.

For the reasons stated above, Citizen Power requests the Commission grant Citizen Power's motion to intervene.

Respectfully submitted,

Theodore S. Robins

Citizen Power

2121 Murray Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 152 7

Telephone: (412) 421 7029

FAX: (412) 421-6152 e-mail: robinson@ditzenpower.com

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion to Intervene and Memorandum of Support and the attached Motion to Admit *Pro Hac Vice* was served electronically or by regular U.S. Mail upon the parties of record identified below in these cases on this 1st day of July, 2009.

Theodore S. Robinson, Esq.

Kathy J. Kolich FirstEnergy Service Company 76 South Main Street Akron, Ohio 44308

#### Attorney for FirstEnergy

Henry W. Eckhart 50 West Broad Street #2117 Columbus, Ohio 43215

Attorney for The Natural Resources
Defense Council

Duane Luckey
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 E. Broad St., 9th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Jeffery Small
Ohio Consumers' Council
10 W. Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-348

Will Reisinger 1207 Grandview Ave. Suite 201 Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449

Attorney for the OEC

In the Matter of the Energy Efficiency	)	Case No. 09-384-EL-EEC
and Peak Demand Reduction Program	)	09-385-EL EEC
Portfolio of Ohio Edison Company,	j	09-386-HL EEC
The Cleveland Electric Illuminating	)	<b>\ \</b>
Company, and The Toledo Edison	· )	<b>i i</b>
Company.	)	<b>i</b>

### MOTION TO ADMIT THEODORE S. ROBINSON TO PRACTICE PRO HAC VICE BEFORE THE COMMISSION

Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-08(B) of the Ohio Administrative Code, William M. Ondrey Gruber (0005950), an attorney licensed to practice in the State of Ohio, respectfully petitions the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") to permit Theodore S. Robinson to practice *pro hac vice* before the Commission in the above-referenced proceedings. Mr. Robinson represents Citizen Power, a non-profit corporation registered in Ohio and Pennsylvania and working for safe, clean and affordable energy.

Mr. Robinson graduated from the University of Pittsburgh School of Law in May 2006, cum laude, and has been an active member of the Pennsylvania Bar since

December of 2006, Member No. 203852. Mr. Robinson's representation of Citizen

Power includes the support of Citizen Power's activities related to the State of Ohio's utility services, including those relating to activities that the Commission has jurisdiction over.

Wherefore, William M. Ondrey Gruber requests that Theodore 3. Robinson be permitted to practice before the Commission in the aforementioned proceedings.

Respectfully submitted,

William M. Ondre

Attorney-at-Law

(Registration No. 00(5950) 2714 Leighton Road Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120 (216) 371-3570

È-Mail: GruberWI @aol.com