

**FILE**

BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

RECEIVED-BOOKETING DIV  
2008 DEC 11 PM 1:58  
PUCO

9

In the Matter of the Application of :  
The Dayton Power and Light Company : Case No. 08-1094-EL-SSO  
for Approval of Its Electric Security Plan. :

In the Matter of the Application of :  
The Dayton Power and Light Company : Case No. 08-1095-EL-ATA  
for Approval of Revised Tariffs. :

In the Matter of the Application of :  
The Dayton Power and Light Company :  
for Approval of Certain Accounting : Case No. 08-1096-EL-AAM  
Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code :  
§ 4905.13. :

In the Matter of the Application of :  
The Dayton Power and Light Company : Case No. 08-1097-EL-UNC  
for Approval of Its Amended Corporate :  
Separation Plan. :

---

MOTION TO INTERVENE  
AND  
REQUEST FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION TO INTERVENE OUT OF TIME  
OF  
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL

---

By the above-styled applications, The Dayton Power and Light Company seeks approval of an electric security plan pursuant to Amended Substitute Senate Bill No. 221 ("SB 221") and certain related measures. As more fully discussed in the accompanying memorandum, The Ohio Environmental Council ("OEC") has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding, and is so situated that the disposition of this proceeding may, as a practical matter, impair or impede its ability to protect that interest. Further, OEC's interest in this proceeding is not represented by any existing party, and its participation in this proceeding will contribute to a just and

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.  
Technician TM Date Processed 12/11/2008

expeditious resolution of the issues involved without unduly delaying the proceeding or unjustly prejudicing any existing party. Accordingly, OEC hereby moves to intervene in this proceeding pursuant to Section 4903.221, Revised Code, and Rule 4901-1-11, Ohio Administrative Code.

OEC recognizes that the procedural entry issued in this proceeding on November 26, 2008 established December 10, 2008 as the due date for motions to intervene. Although OEC has intervened in each of the other SB 221 SSO cases now pending before the Commission, undersigned counsel was heretofore unaware of the November 26, 2008 entry in these dockets. Thus, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission entertain its motion to intervene, notwithstanding that it is filed one day after the specified due date. Granting OEC leave to file its motion to intervene out of time would be consistent with the Commission's policy of encouraging the broadest possible participation in its proceedings (*see, e.g., Cleveland Elec. Illum. Co.*, Case No. 85-675-EL-AIR, Entry dated January 14, 1986, at 2), and would be consistent with the disposition of similar requests to file motions to intervene out of time in other SSO proceedings [*see Duke Energy Ohio*, Case No. 08-920-EL-SSO (Entry dated September 17, 2008), at 4]. Further, in view of the procedural posture of the case, no party will be prejudiced by granting OEC's request. If its motion to intervene is granted, OEC will, of course, accept the record as it finds it.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its request for leave to file out of time and grant its motion to intervene.

Respectfully submitted,

  
Barth E. Royer (Counsel of Record)

Bell & Royer Co. LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927  
(614) 228-0704 – Telephone  
(614) 228-0201 – Fax  
[BarthRoyer@aol.com](mailto:BarthRoyer@aol.com) – Email

Nolan Moser  
Air & Energy Program Manager  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 – Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 – Fax  
[nmoser@theOEC.org](mailto:nmoser@theOEC.org) – Email

Trent A. Dougherty  
Staff Attorney  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 – Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 – Fax  
[trent@theOEC.org](mailto:trent@theOEC.org) – Email

Todd Williams  
4534 Douglas Rd  
Toledo, OH 43613  
(614) 487-7506 – Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 – Fax  
[williams.toddm@gmail.com](mailto:williams.toddm@gmail.com) – Email

Attorneys for  
The Ohio Environmental Council

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of :  
The Dayton Power and Light Company : Case No. 08-1094-EL-SSO  
for Approval of Its Electric Security Plan. :

In the Matter of the Application of :  
The Dayton Power and Light Company : Case No. 08-1095-EL-ATA  
for Approval of Revised Tariffs. :

In the Matter of the Application of :  
The Dayton Power and Light Company :  
for Approval of Certain Accounting : Case No. 08-1096-EL-AAM  
Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code :  
§ 4905.13. :

In the Matter of the Application of :  
The Dayton Power and Light Company : Case No. 08-1097-EL-UNC  
for Approval of Its Amended Corporate :  
Separation Plan. :

---

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT  
OF  
MOTION TO INTERVENE  
OF  
THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

---

Section 4903.221, Revised Code, provides that any “person who may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding may intervene in such proceeding.” The Ohio Environmental Council (“OEC”) is a non-profit, charitable organization comprised of a network of over 100 affiliated group members, whose mission is to secure a healthier environment for all Ohioans. Over its 40-year history, OEC, relying on scientific principles, has been a leading advocate for fresh air, clean water, and sustainable land use before the legislature and administrative agencies, as well as in the courts. In keeping with its mission, OEC was an

active participant in the effort that led to the inclusion of energy efficiency mandates and renewable and alternative energy standards in SB 221, and has a real and substantial interest in assuring that these benchmarks are appropriately recognized in the electric security plan ultimately approved in this case. Thus, there can be no question that OEC may be adversely affected by this proceeding.

Further, not only does OEC satisfy the underlying statutory test, but it also satisfies the standards governing intervention set forth in the Commission's rules.

Rule 4901-1-11(A), Ohio Administrative Code ("OAC"), provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

(A) Upon timely motion, any person shall be permitted to intervene in a proceeding upon a showing that:

(2) The person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding, and the person is so situated that the disposition of the proceeding may, as a practical matter, impair or impede his ability to protect that interest, unless the person's interest is adequately represented by existing parties.

OEC plainly has a real and substantial interest in a proceeding that will impact Ohio's environment. Moreover, at this juncture, none of the pending motions to intervene in these cases have been granted. Thus, by definition, no existing parties adequately represent OEC's interest.

Although OEC does not believe this to be a close question, each of the specific considerations that the Commission may, by rule, take into account in applying the Rule 4901-1-11(A)(2), OAC, standard, also fully support granting OEC's motion to intervene. Rule 4901-1-11(B), OAC, provides as follows:

In deciding whether to permit intervention under paragraph (A)(2) of this rule, the commission, the legal director, the deputy legal director, or an attorney examiner shall consider:

(1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest;

- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case.
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.
- (5) The extent to which the person's interest is represented by existing parties;

First, as explained above, OEC's interest in the proposals contained in these applications relating to the energy efficiency mandates and renewable and alternative energy standards set forth in SB 221 is obviously direct and substantial. Second, although OEC must necessarily await further developments before determining the specific positions it will adopt with respect to these issues, OEC will certainly advocate that the measures ultimately adopted for meeting these benchmarks be effective and consistent with the legislative intent underlying SB 221. Third, in view of the fact that the proceeding has just commenced, granting OEC's motion to intervene will not unduly delay or prolong the proceeding. Fourth, OEC will bring substantial technical expertise to bear on these issues. Finally, not only are there no existing parties that represent OEC's interest, but it would be inconsistent with the Commission's stated policy "to encourage the broadest possible participation in its proceedings" (*see, e.g., Cleveland Elec. Illum. Co.*, Case No. 85-675-EL-AIR, Entry dated January 14, 1986, at 2) to apply the Rule 4901-1-11(B)(5) standard in a manner that would favor one environmental advocate over others. Thus, granting OEC intervenor status is consistent with all the considerations set out in Rule 4901-1-11(B), OAC.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene.

Respectfully submitted,



Barth E. Royer (Counsel of Record)  
Bell & Royer Co. LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927  
(614) 228-0704 – Telephone  
(614) 228-0201 – Fax  
[BarthRoyer@aol.com](mailto:BarthRoyer@aol.com) – Email

Nolan Moser  
Air & Energy Program Manager  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 – Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 – Fax  
[nmoser@theOEC.org](mailto:nmoser@theOEC.org) – Email

Trent A. Dougherty  
Staff Attorney  
The Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
(614) 487-7506 – Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 – Fax  
[trent@theOEC.org](mailto:trent@theOEC.org) – Email

Todd Williams  
4534 Douglas Rd  
Toledo, OH 43613  
(614) 487-7506 – Telephone  
(614) 487-7510 – Fax  
[williams.toddm@gmail.com](mailto:williams.toddm@gmail.com) – Email

Attorneys for  
The Ohio Environmental Council

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following parties by first class mail, postage prepaid, this 11<sup>th</sup> day of December 2008.



Barth E. Royer

Judi L. Sobecki  
The Dayton Power and Light Company  
1065 Woodman Drive  
Dayton, OH 45432

David F. Boehm  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Charles J. Faruki  
Jeffrey S. Sharkey  
Faruki Ireland & Cox P.L.L  
500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W.  
10 North Ludlow Street  
Dayton, OH 45402

John W. Bentine  
Mark S. Yurick  
Matthew S. White  
Chester, Willcox & Saxbe LLP  
65 East State Street, Suite 1000  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213

Samuel C. Randazzo  
Joseph M. Clark  
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  
21 East State Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-4228

M. Howard Petricoff  
Stephen M. Howard  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour And Pease LLP  
52 East Gay St.  
P. O. Box 1008  
Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Janine L. Migden-Ostrander  
Jacqueline L. Roberts  
Ann Hotz  
Richard Reese  
Michael E. Idzkowski  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

Cynthia A. Fonner  
Senior Counsel  
Constellation Energy Group, Inc.  
550 W. Washington Street, Suite 300  
Chicago, IL 60661

Dave Rinebolt  
Colleen Mooney  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street, P.O. 1793  
Findlay, OH 45839-1793

Henry W. Eckhart  
50 West Broad Street, Suite 2117  
Columbus, OH 43215

Richard L. Sites  
General Counsel and Senior Director of  
Health Policy  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 East Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3620



Christopher L. Miller  
Gregory H. Dunn  
Andre T. Porter  
Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA  
250 West Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Thomas J. O'Brien  
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, OH 43215-4291

Craig I. Smith  
2824 Coventry Road  
Cleveland, Ohio 44120

Larry Gearhardt  
Ohio Farm Bureau Federation  
280 North High Street, P.O. Box 182383  
Columbus, OH 43218-2383