

BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

ATTORNEYS AT LAW
36 EAST SEVENTH STREET
SUITE 1510
CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202
TELEPHONE (513) 421-2255
TELECOPIER (513) 421-2764

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

2007 OCT 15 AM 11:56

PUCO

FILE

**Via Telefax Transmission and
Overnight Mail**

October 12, 2007

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
PUCO Docketing
180 E. Broad Street, 10th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

In re: Docket No. 07-796-EL-ATA and 07-797-EL-AAM

Dear Sir/Madam:

Please find enclosed an original and twenty (20) copies of REPLY COMMENTS OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP to be filed in the above-referenced matter.

Copies have been served on all parties on the attached certificate of service. Please place this document of file.

Respectfully yours,



David F. Boehm, Esq.
Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.
Kurt J. Boehm, Esq.
BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

MLKkew
Encl.

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.
Technician TM Date Processed 10/15/2007

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that true copy of the foregoing was served by regular mail, unless otherwise noted, this 12th day of October, 2007 the following:

Cleveland Electric Illuminating Co
Harvey Wagner VP And Controller
76 S. Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

FirstEnergy Corp.
Leila Vespoli
76 S. Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

Ohio Edison Company
Harvey Wagner, VP & Contr
76 S. Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

Toledo Edison Company
Harvey Wagner, VP And Controller
76 S. Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

Giannantonio, Rick C Senior Attorney

FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main St
Akron Oh 44308

Heydorn, Robert
Hoover, Heydorn & Herrnstein
527 Portage Trail
Cuyahoga Falls Oh 44221

Goldberg, Paul
Counsel For City Of Oregon
5300 Seaman Road
Oregon Oh 43616

Burk, James Attorney-At-Law
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

Hadick, Stephen N.
76 S. Main Street
8th Floor
Akron Oh 44308

*Kelly, Susan M Ms.
PJM Interconnection
955 Jefferson Avenue
Norristown Pa 19403

Kolich, Kathy
Attorney At Law
FirstEnergy Corp
76 South Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

*Petricoff, Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymour And Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
Columbus Oh 43215

Greenberg, Freddi
1603 Orrington Ave
Suite 1050
Evanston Il 60201

Allotta, Joseph
Allotta And Fraley Co., L.P.A.
2222 Centennial Road
Toledo Oh 43617

Stinson, Dane Esq.
Bailey Cavalieri LLC
10 W. Broad St. Suite 2100
Columbus Oh 43215

*Moser, Nolan M Mr.
The Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Ave.
Columbus Oh 43212-3449

Robinson, Evelyn
Green Mountain Energy Company
1721 Leighton Drive
Reynoldsburg Oh 43068

*Gibbon, John Law Director
City Of Cleveland Heights
Tower At Erieview
1301 E. 9th St, Ste 3500
Cleveland Oh 44114-1821

*Lewis, Franklin Attorney At Law
City Of Cleveland
601 Lakeside Avenue Room 106
Cleveland Oh 44114

*Sites, Richard Attorney At Law
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street 15th Floor
Columbus Oh 43215-3620

Haefner, Joseph
City Of Stow
3760 Darrow Road
Stow Oh 44224

Sanders , Judith
Bell, Royer & Sanders Co., LPA
33 S. Grant Ave
Columbus Oh 43215

Krassen, Glenn Attorney At Law
Bricker & Eckler LLP
1375 East Ninth Street Suite 1500
Cleveland Oh 44114-1718

Singh, Bobby
Chester, Willcox & Saxbe LLP
65 E. State Street Suite 1000
Columbus Oh 43215

Liebman, Helen Esq.
Jones Day
P.O. Box 165017
Columbus Oh 43216-5017

Bentine, John
Chester, Wilcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 East State Street Suite 1000
Columbus Oh 43215-4213

Feld, Stephen
Senior Attorney
FirstEnergy Corp.
76 South Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

Vento, Phyllis
Asst. Director Of Law
City Of Euclid
585 E. 222nd Street

Hotz, Ann
Attorney At Law
Office Of Consumers' Counsel 10 W. Broad
Street, Suite 1800
Columbus Oh 43215

Euclid Oh 44123-2099

Citizens Coalition
Joseph Meissner
1223 West Sixth Street
Cleveland Oh 44113

Royer, Barth
Bell, Royer & Sanders Co., L.P.A.
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus Oh 43215-3900

Dominion Retail, Inc.
Gary A. Jeffries
501 Martindale Street Suite 400

Pittsburgh Pa 15212-5817

Small, Jeffrey
Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street
Suite 1800
Columbus Oh 43215-3485

Ohio Hospital Association
Richard L. Sites
155 E. Broad Street 15th Floor
Columbus Oh 43215-3620

Mcadams, Sheilah
City Of Maumee
204 W. Wayne Street
Maumee Oh 43537

Ohio Manufactured Housing Assoc.

201 Bradenton Avenue Suite 100
Dublin Oh 43017

O'brien, Thomas Attorney-At-Law
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus Oh 43215

Ohio Partners For Affordable Energy
Mooney Colleen L
1431 Mulford Rd
Columbus Oh 43212

Rinebolt, David
Law Director
231 West Lima Street P.O. Box 1793
Findlay Oh 45839-1793

Utility Workers Union Of America, Local 270
Robert N Fronek President
4205 Chester Ave Cleveland Oh 44103-3615

*Condo, Joseph
Calpine Corporation
Senior Counsel
250 Parkway Drive, Ste 380
Lincolnshire Il 60069

Bob Schmitt Homes Inc
Kevin Corcoran
8501 Woodbridge Court

Gruber, William
Attorney At Law
2714 Leighton Road

North Ridgeville Oh 44039

Calpine Corporation
Patrick J Kealy, Esq.
717 Texas Street
Houston TX 77002-2761

Citizen Power
David Hughes, Ex. Dir.
2121 Murray Avenue Third Floor
Pittsburgh Pa 15217

Robert J. Triozzi, Director Of Law
City Hall, Room 106 601 Lakeside Drive
Cleveland Oh 44114

City Of Oregon
Paul S. Goldberg, Law Director
5330 Seaman Road
Oregon Oh 43616

City Of Perrysburg
Mark Frye, Consultant
300 Sycamore Ln
Perrysburg Oh 43551

City Of Sylvania
James E. Moan
4930 Holland-Sylvania Road
Sylvania Oh 43560

City Of Toledo
Leslie A. Kovacik, Senior Attorney
420 Madison Avenue Fourth Floor
Toledo Oh 43604

Columbus Southern Power
Sandra K. Williams
1 Riverside Plaza 29th Floor
Columbus Oh 43215

Shaker Heights Oh 44120

Smith, Craig
Attorney At Law
2824 Coventry Rd.
Cleveland Oh 44120

Zigli, William
Trial Attorney
601 Lakeside Avenue Room 106
Cleveland Oh 44114-1077

City Of Cleveland Heights
John Gibbon
40 Severance Circle
Cleveland Heights Oh 44118

City Of Perrysburg
Peter D. Gwyn, Law Direct
300 Sycamore Ln
Perrysburg Oh 43551

City Of Stow
Dano L. Koehler, Service Director
3760 Darrow Road
Stow Oh 44224-4094

Cleveland Housing Network
2999 Payne Avenue
Cleveland Oh 44114

Direct Energy Services, LLC
John Comoll
1111 W. 22nd Street Suite 810
Oakbrook II 60523

Consumers For Fair Utilities Rates
Tim Walters
4115 Bridge Avenue
Cleveland Oh 44113

Davis, Dolores J
42 Orchard Street
Newton Falls Oh 44444

Empowerment Center Of Greater
3030 Euclid Avenue Unit 100
Cleveland Oh 44115

FirstEnergy Corp.
Leila Vespoli
76 S. Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

Ibew Local 1194
Attn. Dave Childers
17 West Church St. P.O. Box 145
Milan Oh 44846

Integritys Energy Services Inc
Teresa Ringenbach Regulat
600 Superior Ave., Suite 1300
Cleveland Oh 44114

Kubit, Scott T.
Henry W Eckhart
50 West Broad Street #2117
Columbus Oh 43215

Meissner, Joseph
Director Of Urban Development
Attorney At Law 1223 West Sixth Street
Cleveland Oh 44113

Lucas Co., Board Of County Commissioners

Lance M. Keiffer, Asst. Prosecuting Attorney
711 Adams Street
Toledo Oh 43624

Millard, Steven
200 Tower City Center
50 Public Square
Cleveland Oh 44113

Meissner, Joseph
Director Of Urban Development
Attorney At Law 1223 West Sixth Street
Cleveland Oh 44113

Burk, James Attorney-At-Law
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron Oh 44308

Ibew Local 245
Attn. Larry Tscherne
705 Lime City Rd.
Rossford Oh 43460

Integritys Energy Services, Inc.
Daniel Verbanac, Coo
1716 Lawrence Drive
De Pere Wi 54115

Lake Townships Trustees
Thomas R. Hays
3315 Centennial Road Suite A2
Sylvania Oh 43560-9419

Keiffer, Lance
Assistant Prosecuting Attorney
711 Adams Street 2nd Floor
Toledo Oh 43624-1680

Midamerican Energy Company
Barbara Hawbaker, Balancing & Settlement Analyst
4299 Nw Urbandale Drive
Urbandale Ia 50322

National Energy Marketers Association
Craig G. Goodman, Esq.
3333 K Street N.W. Suite 110
Washington Dc 20007

Neighborhood Environmental Coalition
Rev. Mike Frank, Co-Chair
5920 Engle Ave.
Cleveland Oh 44127

Neighborhood Environmental Coalition
Rev. Mike Frank, Co-Chair
5920 Engle Ave.
Cleveland Oh 44127

Nera Economic Consulting
Chantale Lacasse
1166 Avenue Of The Americas
New York Ny 10036

Ruxin, Paul
Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue
North Point 901 Lakeside Avenue
Cleveland Oh 44114

Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council

583 East Aurora Road
Macedonia Oh 44056-1837

Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council

583 East Aurora Road
Macedonia Oh 44056-1837

Petricoff, M.
Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease
52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008
Columbus Oh 43216-1008

Goodman, Craig
National Energy Marketers Assoc.
3333 K Street, N.W. Suite 110
Washington Dc 20007

Keiffer, Lance
Assistant Prosecuting Attorney
711 Adams Street 2nd Floor
Toledo Oh 43624-1680

Kovacik, Leslie
Department of Public Utilities
420 Madison Avenue Suite 100
Toledo Oh 43604

Weir, Shari
Ohio Citizen Action
614 W. Superior Ave. Suite 1200
Cleveland Oh 44113-1306

Smalz, Michael Attorney At Law
Ohio State Legal Service Assoc.
555 Buttles Avenue
Columbus Oh 43215-1137

Ballenger, Brian J. Law Director
Ballenger & Moore Co., L.P.A.
3401 Woodville Road Suite C
Toledo Oh 43619

O'brien, Thomas Attorney-At-Law
Bricker & Eckler Llp
100 South Third Street
Columbus Oh 43215

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition
One Government Center, Suite 2250
Toledo Oh 43604

Ohio Citizen Action
614 W. Superior Ave. Suite 1200
Cleveland Oh 44113-1306

Ohio Home Builders Association
Attn: Todd Geletka
17 S. High St. Suite 700
Columbus Oh 43215

Ohio Hospital Association
Richard L. Sites
155 E. Broad Street 15th Floor
Columbus Oh 43215-3620

Ohio Partners For Affordable Energy
David Rinebolt
337 South Main Street 4th Floor, Suite 5, P.O.
Box 1793
Findlay Oh 45839-1793

Pjm Power Providers Group
1060 First Avenue Suite 400
King Of Prussia Pa 19406

Reliant Resources, Inc, C/O William S.
Newcomb, Jr
Vorys, Sater, Seymour And Pease Llp
52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008
Cols Oh 43216-1008

Scully, Sandra H
3430 Avalon Rd
Cleveland Oh 44120-3752

Strategic Energy, L.L.C.

Petricoff, M.
Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease
52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008
Columbus Oh 43216-1008

Village Of Holland
Paul A. Skaff, Assistant Solicitor
353 Elm Street
Perrysburg Oh 43551

Leyden, Shawn Attorney At Law
Pseg Energy Resources & Trade Llc
80 Park Plaza 19th Fl
Newark Nj 07102

Eric L. Burkland, President
33 North High Street
Columbus Oh 43215-3005

Palmer Energy
Mark Frye, Noac Consultant
2455 N. Reynolds Road
Toledo Oh 43615

Schneid, Thomas J
25105 Randall Dr.
North Olmsted Oh 44070-3455

St. Charles Hospital
Mr. Kent Meyers
2600 Navarre Avenue
Oregon Oh 43616

Vallourec & Mannesmann Tubes Corp.

Carl W. Boyd
Two Gateway Center
Pittsburgh Pa 15222

Peter J. Brickfield
1025 Thomas Jefferson Street
Nw Suite 800 West
Washington Dc 20007



David F. Boehm, Esq.
Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.
Kurt J. Boehm, Esq.

**BEFORE THE
PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In The Matter Of The Application Of Ohio Edison :
Company The Cleveland Electric Illuminating : Case Nos. 07-796-EL-ATA
Company And The Toledo Edison Company To : 07-797-EL-AAM
Establish a Competitive Bidding Process :

REPLY COMMENTS OF THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

Comes now the Ohio Energy Group (“OEG”) and submits the following Comments in Reply to the Comments filed by the parties in the above-captioned matter.

1. Constellation Mischaracterizes The Competitive Bidding Results In Other States As “Successful.”

Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc. (“Constellation”) support FirstEnergy’s proposed competitive bidding process on the basis that it is consistent with the “*successful competitive procurement mechanisms that have been utilized in other markets.*”¹ Constellation cites Illinois, Maryland, New Jersey and Delaware as examples of other markets that have conducted successful competitive bidding mechanisms.² Although success is a subjective term, it is unlikely that the electric consumers in Illinois, Maryland, New Jersey and Delaware would consider the reverse auctions conducted in those states “successful.”

¹ Comments of Constellation NewEnergy, p. 5.

² Id.

As discussed in OEG's Comments, in March of 2007, the results of the Illinois reverse auction were so disastrous that the Illinois Attorney General filed a complaint with FERC alleging that ComEd and Ameren engaged in price manipulation in the Illinois reverse auction. This complaint and enormous pressure from consumers led to a \$1 billion Rate Relief Reform Package providing refunds and credits to consumers.³ The Reform Package replaces the reverse auction with a sealed-bid/negotiations process run by a new independent state agency.

The Maryland experience with the a reverse auction competitive bidding process was equally devastating and may likewise lead to a state reform package. The prices produced by the Maryland reverse auction were about 20 percent above wholesale prices at the time of the auction.⁴ Following Illinois' lead, Maryland Governor Martin O'Malley has asked the Maryland Public Service Commission to investigate whether the wholesale rates for electricity in Maryland exceed federal standards for reasonableness.

In a letter to the Chairman of the Maryland Commission, Governor O'Malley stated that that it is not enough for the state's utilities to show that they followed Maryland's regulatory procedures when they participated in auctions for power supplies. Federal law also requires that the wholesale prices they pay - and pass on to customers - must be "just and reasonable." Governor O'Malley wrote.

*"The State of Illinois has filed a complaint with the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC) charging that FERC failed to exercise its duty to determine whether the wholesale prices procured by servicing utilities to provide standard offer service in that state were 'just and reasonable... Maryland needs to know whether a comparable cause of action exists here.'"*⁵

³ Foster Electric Report, 7/25/07 Foster Electric Rep., 2007 WLNR 14682339.

⁴ O'Malley questions rate fairness: PSC is asked to determine whether electricity prices are 'reasonable', Baltimore Sun, Paul Adams and Andrew A. Green (July 27, 2007)

⁵ Id.

Reverse auctions held recently in New Jersey and Delaware have likewise led to very high prices. Electricity costs increased by 55 percent in New Jersey and 59 percent in Delaware after recent reverse auctions.⁶

Respectfully submitted,



David F. Boehm, Esq.

Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.

Kurt J. Boehm, Esq.

BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Ph: 513.421.2255 Fax: 513.421.2764

E-Mail: dboehm@BKLawfirm.com

mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com

kboehm@BKLawfirm.com

COUNSEL FOR THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

October 12, 2007

⁶ Electric rate jolt coming: BGE auction tomorrow to be reflected in sharply higher bills in July Baltimore Sun, Paul Adams (February 20, 2006)