RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

TUFFLEY, PLLC

2007 AUG -6 AM 10: 48

PUCO

Bloomfield Hills, MI Los Angeles, CA 21 E. Long Lake Rd., Suite 200 Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304

> Telephone: (248) 549-3900 Facsimile: (248) 593-5808

> > Alyssa J. Endelman Direct Dial (248) 203-2765 Email: aje@gd-llc.com

August 3, 2007

Via Overnight Mail

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Docketing Division 180 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215-3793

Re:

S.G. Foods, Inc., et al. vs Cleveland Electric Illuminating, et al.

PUCO Case Nos: 04-28-EL-CSS, etc. (Consolidated)

Our File No: 65000.0

Dear Docketing Division:

Enclosed please find an original and ten (10) copies of Complainants' Response to Respondents' Sixth Motion to Compel Discovery from Lexington and Respondents' Third Motion to Compel from Allianz and a Certificate of Service regarding same. Please file with the Commission relative to the above matter.

Thank you for your anticipated cooperation in this regard. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Very truly yours,

DENENBERG TUFFLEX, PLLC

Alvssa d Endelman

AJE/sm Enc.

cc:

Mark A. Whitt

David A. Kutik/Meggan Rawlin

Joel Levin

Paul W. Flowers

Edward F. Siegel

151590 1

W. Craig Bashein

Francis E. Sweeney

Gary D. Benz

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Data Processed 8.6.07

BEFORE

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Complaints of 3	S.G.)
Foods, Inc.; Miles Management Co	orp.,)
et al.; Allianz US Global Risk Insur	rance	
Company, et al.; Lexington Insuran	ice)
Company, et al,)
	Complainants,) Case Nos. 04-28-EL-CSS
	,) 05-803-EL-CSS
v.) 05-1011-EL-CSS
) 05-1012-EL-CSS
The Cleveland Electric Illuminating	Ŕ)
Company, Ohio Edison Company,)
Toledo Edison Company, and)
American Transmission Systems, Is	nc.)
	Respondents.))
	-	•

COMPLAINANTS' RESPONSE TO RESPONDENTS' SIXTH MOTION TO COMPEL DISCOVERY FROM LEXINGTON AND RESPONDENTS' THIRD MOTION TO COMPEL FROM ALLIANZ

NOW COME Complainants Lexington Insurance Company, Frankenmuth Mutual Insurance Company, Charter Oak Fire Insurance Company, The Automobile Insurance Company of Hartford, The Standard Fire Insurance Company, Travelers Indemnity Company of America, Travelers Indemnity Company of Connecticut, Travelers Indemnity Company, Travelers Property Casualty Company of America, Phoenix Insurance Company, St. Paul Mercury Insurance Company, St. Paul Mercury Insurance Company, St. Paul Surplus Lines Insurance Company, United States Fidelity & Guaranty, Allied Mutual Insurance Company, and Nationwide Mutual Insurance, as Subrogees of their insureds in Case Number 05-1012, by and through their attorneys, Denenberg Tuffley, PLLC, and in response to the Respondents' Sixth

Motion to Compel Discovery from Lexington and Respondents' Third Motion to Compel Discovery from Allianz say as follows:

Respondents have filed yet another Motion to Compel Discovery, this time directed to the Allianz Complainants (Case No. 05-1011) and the Lexington Complainants (Case No. 05-1012). This Response is filed on their behalf (they will be collectively referred to as the "Insurance Company Complainants").

Respondents allege that they are entitled to discovery (interrogatory answers and/or the production of documents) regarding the witnesses the Insurance Company Complainants intend to call as experts. The discovery sought requests expert opinions and the facts and basis for the opinions.

However, the Commission by way of its Scheduling Order and its Amended Scheduling Order has set out the process by which each of the parties will conduct expert discovery in this matter. The process set forth by the Commission is as follows: (1) by the filing of summaries of the expert's opinion and (2) the deposition of the experts. Notably the Scheduling Order was issued on October 26, 2006 after a conference between the Attorney Examiner and the parties. The Respondents did not object to the expert discovery process contained in the Scheduling Order nor did they indicate that in addition to (1) and (2) above that they wanted expert discovery by way of interrogatories and/or requests for production.

What this motion is truly about is Respondents' attempts to persuade the Insurance Company Complainants to agree to alter the Scheduling Order. Respondents have requested that the filing of expert summaries be staggered and that the expert disclosures comply with the requirements of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The credibility of Respondents' Motion is belied by its responses to similar expert interrogatories directed to them. On March 28, 2007, the

Respondents responded to the same interrogatory at issue in this motion by stating, "Respondents will disclose their experts and their opinions in accordance with the scheduling order in this case."

Therefore, the Respondents position is directly contradicted by their own reliance upon the expert disclosure procedure set forth in the Scheduling Order. The Insurance Company Complainants have relied upon the Scheduling Order to prepare their case. To now require the disclosures of expert summaries and the answers to expert opinions would be burdensome and disruptive.

Accordingly, for the foregoing reasons, The Insurance Company Complainants respectfully request that Respondents' Sixth/Third Motion to Compel Discovery be denied.

DENENBERG TUFFLEY, PLLC

By:

Alyssa I. Endelman Christina L. Pawlowski

Admitted Pro Hac Vice

Attorneys for Claimants Allianz, et al/Lexington, et al

21 E. Long Lake Road, Suite 200 Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304

(248) 549-3900; (248) 593-5808 (fax)

-and-

Leslie E. Wargo (P0073112)
Co-Counsel Claimants Allianz, et al/Lexington, et al 1800 Midland Building
101 Prospect Avenue West
Cleveland, Ohio 44115
(216) 696-1422

Dated: August 3, 2007

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Response to Respondents' Sixth/Third Motion to Compel was mailed by ordinary U.S. mail to the following persons this 3rd day of August, 2007.

David A. Kutik
Meggan Rawlin
JONES DAY
North Point
901 Lakeside Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44114
and via fax

Mark A Whitt
JONES DAY
325 John H. McConnell Blvd., Suite 600
Columbus, OH 43215-5017
and via fax

Edward Siegel Attorney at Law 5910 Landerbrook Drive, #200 Cleveland, OH 44124

Francis Sweeney, Jr. Attorney at Law 323 Lakeside Avenue, Suite 450 Cleveland, OH 44113

Paul Flowers PAUL W. FLOWERS CO., L.P.A. 50 Public Square #3500 Cleveland, OH 44113 Craig Bashein BASHEIN & BASHEIN CO. L.P.A. 50 Public Sq # 3500 Cleveland, OH 44113

Joel Levin LEVIN & ASSOCIATES, CO., L.P.A. The Tower at Erieview, Suite 1100 1301 East Ninth Street Cleveland, OH 44114

Gary D. Benz First Energy Corp. 76 S. Main Street Akron, OH 44308

151544 1