**BEFORE**

**THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric Security Plan. | )  )  )  )  )  )  ) | Case No. 23-301-EL-SSO |

**JOINT REPLY TO FIRSTENERGY’S MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION TO MOTION FOR LIMITED STAY OF RIDER DCR IN ESP V DISTRIBUTION RIDERS**

**BY**

**NORTHWEST OHIO AGGREGATION COALITION**

**OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS’ COUNSEL**

**AND**

**OHIO MANUFACTURERS’ ASSOCIATION ENERGY GROUP**

# I. INTRODUCTION

FirstEnergy filed a Memorandum Contra to the Motion for Limited Stay filed by the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel, Ohio Manufacturers’ Association Energy Group and the Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition (“Joint Movants”). FirstEnergy’s Memorandum Contra is virtually identical to the one filed by Ohio Energy Group’s (“OEG”), which Joint Movants responded to on December 26, 2023. Both filings are without merit and should be denied.

FirstEnergy initially states that the relief requested by Joint Movants’ Motion is “based on speculation and conjecture.”[[1]](#footnote-2) FirstEnergy further argues that Joint Movants incorrectly assert that FirstEnergy engaged in a scheme to defraud customers related to settlement payments from the ESP IV case, because nothing in the indictment supports Joint Movants’ claim.[[2]](#footnote-3)

In response, Joint Movants note that OEG made a nearly identical argument in its Memorandum Contra.[[3]](#footnote-4) Joint Movants incorporate their response made to OEG’s argument on this point,[[4]](#footnote-5) and will not repeat that argument here.

FirstEnergy further argues that the Joint Movants’ Motion should be denied because the potential loss of revenue from Rider DCR, which could result from a stay, could harm FirstEnergy and its consumers.[[5]](#footnote-6) FirstEnergy’s argument is nearly identical to the argument raised in OEG’s Memorandum Contra.[[6]](#footnote-7) Joint Movants respond to FirstEnergy’s argument by incorporating their response to the same argument raised by OEG.[[7]](#footnote-8)

# II. CONCLUSION

The PUCO should reject FirstEnergy’s and OEG’s arguments and grant Joint Movants’ Motion for Limited Stay.

Respectfully submitted,

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Maureen R. Willis (0020847)  Ohio Consumers’ Counsel    /s/ *John Finnigan*  John Finnigan (0018689)  Counsel of Record  Robert Eubanks (0073386)  William J. Michael (0070921)  Assistant Consumers’ Counsel  Alex Hickey  Thomas Zuehlke  Certified Legal Interns  **Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**  65 East State Street, Suite 700  Columbus, Ohio 43215  Telephone [Finnigan]: (614) 466-9585  Telephone [Eubanks]: (614) 466-1292  Telephone [Michael]: (614) 466-1291  Telephone [Hickey]: (614) 466-9549  Telephone [Zuehlke]: (614) 466-9569  [john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov)  [robert.eubanks@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:robert.eubanks@occ.ohio.gov)  [william.michael@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:william.michael@occ.ohio.gov)  [alex.hickey@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:alex.hickey@occ.ohio.gov)  [thomas.zuehlke@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:thomas.zuehlke@occ.ohio.gov)  (willing to accept service by e-mail) | */s/ Thomas R. Hays*  Thomas R. Hays (0054062)  Counsel of Record  8355 Island Lane  Maineville, Ohio 43039  Telephone: (419) 410-7069  [trhayslaw@gmail.com](mailto:trhayslaw@gmail.com)  (willing to accept service by e-mail)  *Counsel for The Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition*  */s/ Kimberly W. Bojko*  Kimberly W. Bojko (0069402)  Counsel of Record  Emma Y. Easley (0102144)  Carpenter Lipps LLP  280 North High Street, Suite 1300  Columbus, Ohio 43215  Telephone: (614) 365-4100  [bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  [easley@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:easley@carpenterlipps.com)  (willing to accept service by e-mail)  *Counsel for the Ohio Manufacturers’ Association Energy Group* |

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this Joint Reply to FirstEnergy’s Memorandum in Opposition to Motion for Limited Stay of Rider DCR in ESP V Distribution Riders was served on the persons stated below via electronic transmission, this 28th day of December 2023.

*/s/ John Finnigan*

John Finnigan

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

The PUCO’s e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the following parties:

**SERVICE LIST**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| [thomas.lindgren@ohioago.gov](mailto:thomas.lindgren@ohioago.gov)  [amy.botschnerobrien@ohioago.gov](mailto:amy.botschnerobrien@ohioago.gov)  [rhiannon.howard@ohioago.gov](mailto:rhiannon.howard@ohioago.gov)  [mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com)  [jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com)  [rdove@keglerbrown.com](mailto:rdove@keglerbrown.com)  [nbobb@keglerbrown.com](mailto:nbobb@keglerbrown.com)  [Stacie.Cathcart@igs.com](mailto:Stacie.Cathcart@igs.com)  [Michael.Nugent@igs.com](mailto:Michael.Nugent@igs.com)  [cgrundmann@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:cgrundmann@spilmanlaw.com)  [dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com)  [slee@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:slee@spilmanlaw.com)  [todd.schafer@outlook.com](mailto:todd.schafer@outlook.com)  [mjsettineri@vorys.com](mailto:mjsettineri@vorys.com)  [glpetrucci@vorys.com](mailto:glpetrucci@vorys.com)  [aasanyal@vorys.com](mailto:aasanyal@vorys.com)  [dparram@brickergraydon.com](mailto:dparram@brickergraydon.com)  [rmains@brickergraydon.com](mailto:rmains@brickergraydon.com)  [dromig@nationwideenergypartners.com](mailto:dromig@nationwideenergypartners.com)  [brian.gibbs@nationwideenergypartners.com](mailto:brian.gibbs@nationwideenergypartners.com)  [paul@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:paul@carpenterlipps.com)  [mpritchard@mcneeslaw.com](mailto:mpritchard@mcneeslaw.com)  [awalke@mcneeslaw.com](mailto:awalke@mcneeslaw.com)  [tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)  [katherine.hollingsworth@lasclev.org](mailto:katherine.hollingsworth@lasclev.org)  [sjagers@ohiopovertylaw.org](mailto:sjagers@ohiopovertylaw.org)  [mwalters@proseniors.org](mailto:mwalters@proseniors.org)  [dmanor@ablelaw.org](mailto:dmanor@ablelaw.org)  [rnader@communitylegalaid.org](mailto:rnader@communitylegalaid.org)  Attorney Examiners:  [megan.addison@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:megan.addison@puco.ohio.gov)  [greg.price@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:greg.price@puco.ohio.gov)  [jacqueline.st.john@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:jacqueline.st.john@puco.ohio.gov) | [bknipe@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:bknipe@firstenergycorp.com)  [cwatchorn@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:cwatchorn@firstenergycorp.com)  [talexander@beneschlaw.com](mailto:talexander@beneschlaw.com)  [mkeaney@beneschlaw.com](mailto:mkeaney@beneschlaw.com)  [khehmeyer@beneschlaw.com](mailto:khehmeyer@beneschlaw.com)  [dproano@bakerlaw.com](mailto:dproano@bakerlaw.com)  [ahaque@bakerlaw.com](mailto:ahaque@bakerlaw.com)  [eprouty@bakerlaw.com](mailto:eprouty@bakerlaw.com)  [pwillison@bakerlaw.com](mailto:pwillison@bakerlaw.com)  [dstinson@brickergraydon.com](mailto:dstinson@brickergraydon.com)  [gkrassen@nopec.org](mailto:gkrassen@nopec.org)  [josephmeissner@yahoo.com](mailto:josephmeissner@yahoo.com)  [trhayslaw@gmail.com](mailto:trhayslaw@gmail.com)  [leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov](mailto:leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov)  [bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  [easley@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:easley@carpenterlipps.com)  [mkl@smxblaw.com](mailto:mkl@smxblaw.com)  [jrb@smxblaw.com](mailto:jrb@smxblaw.com)  [little@litohio.com](mailto:little@litohio.com)  [hogan@litohio.com](mailto:hogan@litohio.com)  [ktreadway@oneenergyllc.com](mailto:ktreadway@oneenergyllc.com)  [jdunn@oneenergyllc.com](mailto:jdunn@oneenergyllc.com)  [trent@hubaydougherty.com](mailto:trent@hubaydougherty.com)  [emcconnell@elpc.org](mailto:emcconnell@elpc.org)  [cpirik@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:cpirik@dickinsonwright.com)  [todonnell@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:todonnell@dickinsonwright.com)  [kshimp@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:kshimp@dickinsonwright.comm)  [eowoyt@vorys.com](mailto:eowoyt@vorys.com)  [whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com](mailto:whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com)  [ctavenor@theOEC.org](mailto:ctavenor@theOEC.org)  [Becky.Merola@calpinesolutions.com](mailto:Becky.Merola@calpinesolutions.com)  [jlaskey@norris-law.com](mailto:jlaskey@norris-law.com)  [knordstrom@theOEC.org](mailto:knordstrom@theOEC.org)  [jlang@calfee.com](mailto:jlang@calfee.com)  [mbarbara@calfee.com](mailto:mbarbara@calfee.com)  [jpetroff@lawforlabor.com](mailto:jpetroff@lawforlabor.com)  [jmcinerney@lawforlabor.com](mailto:jmcinerney@lawforlabor.com)  [junger@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:junger@spilmanlaw.com)  joe.oliker@igs.com  [jlang@calfee.com](mailto:jlang@calfee.com)  [mbarbara@calfee.com](mailto:mbarbara@calfee.com)  [tlong@mcneeslaw.com](mailto:tlong@mcneeslaw.com)  [rkelter@elpc.org](mailto:rkelter@elpc.org)  nwallace@elpc.org  cadieux@carpenterlipps.com |

1. FirstEnergy Memorandum Contra at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. *Id.*  [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. OEG Memorandum Contra at 1-2. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. Joint Movants’ Reply to OEG Memorandum Contra at 2-5. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
5. FirstEnergy Memorandum Contra at 3-4. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
6. OEG Memorandum Contra at 3-4. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
7. Joint Movants’ Reply to OEG Memorandum Contra at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)