### **BEFORE**

### THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Columbus Southern Power Company	)	
and Ohio Power Company for Authority	)	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO
to Establish a Standard Service Offer	)	Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code,	)	
in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.	)	
In the Matter of the Application of	)	
Columbus Southern Power Company	)	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM
and Ohio Power Company for Approval	)	Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
of Certain Accounting Authority.	)	

## MOTION TO INTERVENE

BY

# DUKE ENERGY COMMERCIAL ASSET MANAGEMENT, INC.

Now comes Duke Energy Commercial Asset Management, Inc., (DECAM) and moves to intervene, as a full party of record, in the above-captioned proceedings, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11. The issues in this proceeding relate to the Commission's review of a proposed standard service offer by Ohio Power Company (AEP Ohio). The resolution of issues in this proceeding will directly impact the ability of suppliers to compete in the wholesale market. DECAM, as an active participant in auctions to supply power to standard service offer customers or Ohio utilities, therefore has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding that is not adequately represented by existing parties.

Wherefore, for the reasons more fully set forth in the attached memorandum in support, DECAM respectfully requests that the Commission grant this motion to intervene.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY COMMERCIAL ASSET MANAGEMENT, INC.

Amy B. Spiller (Counsel of Record)

Deputy General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery

Associate General Counsel

139 East Fourth Street

1303-Main

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

(513) 287-4359 (telephone)

Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com

Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com

## Memorandum in Support

R.C. 4928.141 requires each electric utility, such as AEP Ohio, to provide a standard service offer (SSO) "of all competitive retail electric services necessary to maintain essential electric service to consumers, including a firm supply of electric generation service." AEP Ohio currently provides that SSO in the form of an electric security plan (ESP), approved under R.C. 4928.143.

R.C. 4903.221(B) sets forth several criteria that the Commission is required to consider in ruling on applications to intervene. Those criteria are listed as follows:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest;
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings;
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.

The Commission has, itself, added additional detail to the intervention requirements through the promulgation of O.A.C. 4901-1-11. That rule, in paragraph (A), requires that the Commission allow intervention by a person who has a "real and substantial interest in the proceeding" and who "is so situated that the disposition of the proceeding may . . . impair or impede [its] ability to protect that interest, unless the person's interest is adequately represented by existing parties." The rule goes on to list several factors that the Commission is required to consider in determining whether a potential intervenor meets that standard:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest.
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case.
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.

- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.
- (5) The extent to which the person's interest is represented by existing parties.

DECAM is the owner and operator of approximately 3,000 MW of gas-fired generation assets, located predominantly in the PJM-market footprint. DECAM is authorized by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission to sell energy, capacity, and related products at wholesale. DECAM is also a wholesale auction participant, competing to provide full-service requirements and other products in response to wholesale auction solicitations. DECAM's business will be impacted by the determination of the terms of AEP Ohio's SSO. Thus, DECAM has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding that is directly related to the merits of the case. No existing party represents DECAM's interests. Further, DECAM's participation will contribute to the development of the issues and an equitable resolution.

As the deadline for intervention has not passed, intervention by DECAM will not unduly prolong or delay this proceeding. DECAM would also respectfully suggest that its intervention will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues, based on its experience in the marketplace and understanding of competitive needs in general.

DECAM therefore respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene and that it be made a full party of record.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY COMMERCIAL ASSET MANAGEMENT, INC.

Amy B. Spiller (Counsel of Record)

Deputy General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery

Associate General Counsel

139 East Fourth Street

1303-Main

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

(513) 287-4359 (telephone)

Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com

Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was delivered via U.S. mail (postage prepaid), personal, or electronic mail delivery on this the day of April, 2012, to the following:

Jeanne W. Kingery

Daniel R. Conway Porter Wright Morris & Arthur Huntington Center 41 S. High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 dconway@porterwright.com

Counsel for Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company

Samuel C. Randazzo Joseph E. Oliker Frank P. Darr MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus. OH 43215

sam@mwncmh.com joliker@mwncmh.com fdarr@mwncmh.com

Counsel for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
Ann M. Vogel
American Electric Power Co

American Electric Power Corporation 1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-2373

stnourse@aep.com mjsatterwhite@aep.com amvogel@aep.com

Counsel for Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company

David F. Boehm, Esq. Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com

Counsel for the Ohio Energy Group

Thomas J. O'Brien BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com Richard L. Sites OHIO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION 155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3620 ricks@ohanet.org

Counsel for Ohio Hospital Association

Counsel for Ohio Hospital Association

Terry L Etter
Michael E. Idzkowski
Maureen R. Grady
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
etter@occ.state.oh.us
idzkowski@occ.state.oh.us
grady@occ.state.oh.us

Colleen L Mooney Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy 231 West Lima Street Findlay, OH 45839-1793 <a href="mailto:cmoonev2@columbus.rr.com">cmoonev2@columbus.rr.com</a>

Ohio Consumers' Counsel

David A. Kutik
Allison E. Haedt
Jones Day
901 Lakeside Ave
Cleveland OH 44114
dakutik@jonesday.com
aehaedt@jonesday.com

Counsel for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave,
Cleveland, OH 44114
ilang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

Mark A. Hayden FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY 76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308 Terrence O'Donnell Christopher Montgomery BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 todonnell@bricker.com cmontgomery@bricker.com

haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

Counsel for Paulding Wind Farm II LLC

Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

Michael R. Smalz Joseph V Maskovyak Ohio Poverty Law Center 555 Buttles Avenue Columbus, OH 43215

msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

Counsel for the Appalachian Peace and Justice Network
Jay E. Jadwin
American Electric Power Service
Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29<sup>th</sup> Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
jejadwin@aep.com

Counsel for AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC

Lisa G. McCallister
Matthew W. Warnock
BRICKER & ECKLER LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
lmcalister@bricker.com
mwarnock@bricker.com

Counsel for OMA Energy Group

Jay L Kooper Katherine Guerry Hess Corporation One hess Plaza Woodbridge, NJ 07095

jkooper@hess.com kguerry@hess.com M. Howard Petricoff Stephen M. Howard Michael J. Settineri

Lija Kaleps-Clark

Benita Kahn

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay St

Columbus, OH 43215 mhpetricoff@vorys.com smhoward@vorys.com mjsettineri@vorys.com

lkalepsclark@vorys.com

bakahn@vorys.com

Counsel for The PJM Power Providers

Group

Counsel for Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and

**Constellation Energy Commodities** 

Group, Inc.

Counsel for the COMPETE Coalition

Counsel for the Retail Energy Supply Association

Counsel for Exelon Generation Company, LLC

Laura Chappelle 4218 Jacob Meadows Okemos, Michigan 48864

laurac@chappelleconsulting.com

Glen Thomas

1060 First Ave, Suite 400 King of Prussia, PA 19406

gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Robert Korandovich

**KOREnergy** PO Box 148

Sunbury, OH 43074

korenergy@insight.rr.com

Cynthia Fonner Brady

David Fein

Constellation Energy Group

550 West Washington Blvd, Suite 300

Chicago IL 60661

Cynthia.a.fonner@constellation.com David.fein@constellation.com

Allen Freifeld Samuel A. Wolfe Viridity Energy, Inc. 100 West Elm St, Suite 410 Conshohocken PA 19428

<u>afreifeld@viridityenergy.com</u> <u>swolfe@viridityenergy.com</u>

Joel Malina COMPETE Coalition 1317 F Street, NW, Suite 600 Washington, DC 20004

malina@wexlerwalker.com

Pamela A. Fox Christopher L. Miller Gregory H. Dunn Asim Z. Haque Ice Miller 250 West Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

pfox@hilliardohio.gov cmiller@icemiller.com gdunn@icemiller.com ahaque@icemiller.com

Counsel for the city of Hilliard, Ohio

Counsel for the city of Grove City, Ohio

Counsel for AICUO

William L. Massey Covington & Burling, LLP 1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Washington, DC. 20004

wmassey@cov.com

Counsel for the COMPETE Coalition

Henry W. Eckhart 2100 Chambers Road, Suite 106 Columbus, Ohio 43212 henryeckhart@aol.com

Counsel for Natural Resources Defense Council, and Sierra Club

Sandy I-ru Grace Exelon Business Services Company 101 Constitution Avenue N.W. Suite 400 East Washington, DC 20001

Sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Counsel for Exelon Generation Company, LLC

Jesse A, Rodriguez,

Exelon Generation Company, LLC

300 Exelon Way

Kennett Square, PA 19348

Gregory M Poulos

EnerNOC

101 Federal St Suite 1100

Boston, MA 02110

Jesse.rodriguez@exeloncorp,com

gpoulos@enernoc.com

Counsel for Exelon Generation Company,

LLC

Counsel for ENERNOC, Inc.

Kenneth P. Kreider David A. Meyer Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL

One East Fourth Street

**Suite 1400** 

Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Steve W. Chriss Wal-Mart Stores, Inc 2001 SE 10<sup>th</sup> St

Bentonville, AR 72716

Stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com

kpkreider@kmklaw.com dmeyer@kmklaw.com

Counsel for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam's East, Inc.

Holly Rachel Smith

Hitt Business Center 3803 Rectortown Rd Marshall, VA 20115 Barth E. Royer

BELL & ROYER CO., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927

holly@raysmithlaw.com

BarthRoyer@aol.com

Counsel for Dominion Retail, Inc.

Gary A. Jeffries

Dominion Resources Services, Inc. 501 Martindale Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817

Tara C. Santarelli

Environmental Law & Policy Center

1207 Grandview Ave.

Suite 201

Columbus, Ohio 43212 tsantarelli@elpc.org

Garv.A.Jeffries@dom.com

Counsel for Dominion Retail, Inc.

Counsel for the Environmental Law &

Policy Center

Trent A. Dougherty Cathryn N. Loucas Nolan Moser Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449

cathy@theoec.org nolan@theoec.org trent@theoec.org

Counsel for OEC

Mark Yurick Zachary D. Kravitz Taft, Stettinius & Hollister LLP 65 East State St, Suite 1000 Columbus OH 43215

<u>myurick@taftlaw.com</u> <u>zkravitz@taftlaw.com</u>

Counsel for the Kroger Co.

David M. Stahl Arin C. Aragona Scott C. Solberg Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP 224 South Michigan Ave, Suite 1100 Chicago IL 60604

dstahl@eimerstahl.com aaragona@eimerstahl.com ssolberg@eimerstahl.com

Counsel for Exelon Generation Company LLC

Emma F Hand Douglas G. Bonner SNR Denton 1301 K Street NW Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005

emma.hand@snrdenton.com doug.bonner@snrdenton.com

Counsel for Ormet Primary Aluminum Corporation

Shannon Fisk 2 North Riverside Plaza, Suite 2250 Chicago, IL 60606

sfisk@nrdc.org

Werner L. Margard III
John Jones
William Wright
Thomas Lindgren
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad St, 6<sup>th</sup> floor
Columbus OH 43215

Werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us john.jones@puc.state.oh.us William.wright@puc.state.oh.us thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us

Counsel for Staff

Diem N. Kaelber Robert Walter 10 West Broad St, Suite 1300 Columbus OH 43215 <u>kaelber@buckleyking.com</u> walter@buckleyking.com Brian P. Barger 4052 Holland-Sylvania Road Toledo, Ohio 43623 bpbarger@bcslawyers.com

Counsel for Ohio Restaurant Association

Counsel for the Ohio Construction Materials Coalition

Chad Endsley Ohio Farm Bureau Federation 280 North High Street P.O. Box 182383 Columbus, OH 43218-2383 Dane Stinson BAILEY CAVALIERI LLC 10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100 Columbus, Ohio 43215

cendsley@ofbf.org

Dane.stinson@baileycavalieri.com

Counsel for Ohio Farm Bureau Federation

Counsel for The Ohio Association of School Business Officials, The Ohio School Boards Association, The Buckeye Association of School Administrators and The Ohio Schools Council

Vincent Parisi Matthew White Interstate Gas Supply, Inc. 6100 Emerald Parkway Dublin, Ohio 43016 Mark A. Whitt Melissa L. Thompson Whitt Sturtevant LLP PNC Plaza, Suite 2020 155 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

vparisi@igsenergy.com mswhite@igsenergy.com

whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com thompson@whitt-sturtevant.com

Counsel for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

Counsel for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.