**BEFORE**

**THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric Security Plan. | )  )  )  )  )  )  ) | Case No. 23-301-EL-SSO |

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING COMPANY AND THE TOLEDO EDISON COMPANY’S MOTION FOR INTERIM RELIEF TO CONDUCT SSO AUCTIONS AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED TREATMENT**

**BY**

**NORTHWEST OHIO AGGREGATION COALITION**

**OHIO MANUFACTURERS’ ASSOCIATION ENERGY GROUP**

**AND**

**OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS’ COUNSEL**

# INTRODUCTION

The relief requested in the Utilities’ Motion is relief that can be taken and should be taken as requested. Moreover, holding the standard service offer (“SSO”) auction is also cause for the PUCO to approve the Joint Motion for Limited Stay filed by OCC, Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition and the Ohio Manufacturers’ Association Energy Group (“Joint Movants”).

Joint Movants filed the Motion for Limited Stay of consideration of one rider of the Utilities’ fifth electric security plan to protect consumers after new information came to light *i.e*., former PUCO Chair Samuel Randazzo’s indictment for bribery and embezzlement.[[1]](#footnote-2) The Joint Movants sought to protect consumers’ right to a fair process by staying consideration and approval of Rider DCR as part of ESP V and staying any consideration of implementing modifications or increases to Rider DCR as part of the new ESP, because of the likelihood that “expenses underlying criminal activities admitted to by FirstEnergy Corp. and now alleged to have occurred by Randazzo”[[2]](#footnote-3) are embedded in Rider DCR and were recovered from customers. Joint Movants advised the PUCO that their Motion could be granted without harm to consumers as FirstEnergy could continue current Rider DCR and move forward with a competitively bid SSO auction, regardless of the stay. The limited stay requested by Joint Movants was only to stay consideration of re-approving and implementing, or modifying or increasing Rider DCR under and as part of ESP V. The Utilities’ Motion asking to move forward with the auction confirms that this option exists and that the Utilities are willing to undertake such steps. The PUCO should therefore grant both the Joint Motion and the Utilities’ Motion.

# ARGUMENT

Allowing FirstEnergy to conduct SSO auctions is consistent with Joint Movants’ Motion for a Limited Stay. Joint Movants therefore do not oppose FirstEnergy’s Motion for interim relief. In fact, the Motion for interim relief is consistent with the Joint Movants’ request to protect consumer’s right to a fair and thorough and deliberate process—just as the Commission stated it would do in other cases when it granted stays of those proceedings.[[3]](#footnote-4) A limited stay of considering re-approving and implementing as part of ESP V, or modifying or increasing Rider DCR as part of ESP V would protect consumers from inappropriate charges being passed on to customers through Rider DCR that may be tied to FirstEnergy’s “unparalleled corruption of Ohio’s democratic process.”[[4]](#footnote-5)As Joint Movants explained in their Memorandum in Support of the Motion for a Limited Stay, the SSO auctions are a consumer protection mechanism which can and should continue to occur even if Joint Movants’ Motion is granted. Joint Movants further explained that the PUCO’s ability to authorize continuing SSO auctions weighs in favor of granting the limited stay requested by Joint Movants.[[5]](#footnote-6)

# CONCLUSION

Allowing FirstEnergy to conduct interim SSO auctions pending the Commission’s thorough review of its ESP V Application is consistent with protecting consumers from any inappropriate Rider DCR charges being passed on to customers while the H.B. 6 investigations and criminal indictments are pending. Therefore, Joint Movants support FirstEnergy’s request and recommend that it be granted.

Respectfully submitted,

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| */s/ Thomas R. Hays*  Thomas R. Hays (0054062)  Counsel of Record  8355 Island Lane  Maineville, Ohio 43039  Telephone: (419) 410-7069  [trhayslaw@gmail.com](mailto:trhayslaw@gmail.com)  (willing to accept service by e-mail)  *Counsel for The Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition*  */s/ Kimberly W. Bojko*  Kimberly W. Bojko (0069402)  Counsel of Record  Emma Y. Easley (0102144)  Carpenter Lipps LLP  280 North High Street, Suite 1300  Columbus, Ohio 43215  Telephone: (614) 365-4100  [bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  [easley@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:easley@carpenterlipps.com)  (willing to accept service by e-mail)  *Counsel for the Ohio Manufacturers’ Association Energy Group* | Maureen R. Willis (0020847)  Ohio Consumers’ Counsel    /s/ *John Finnigan*  John Finnigan (0018689)  Counsel of Record  Robert Eubanks (0073386)  William J. Michael (0070921)  Assistant Consumers’ Counsel  Alex Hickey  Thomas Zuehlke  Certified Legal Interns  **Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**  65 East State Street, Suite 700  Columbus, Ohio 43215  Telephone [Finnigan]: (614) 466-9585  Telephone [Eubanks]: (614) 466-1292  Telephone [Michael]: (614) 466-1291  Telephone [Hickey]: (614) 466-9549  Telephone [Zuehlke]: (614) 466-9569  [john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:john.finnigan@occ.ohio.gov)  [robert.eubanks@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:robert.eubanks@occ.ohio.gov)  [william.michael@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:william.michael@occ.ohio.gov)  [alex.hickey@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:alex.hickey@occ.ohio.gov)  [thomas.zuehlke@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:thomas.zuehlke@occ.ohio.gov)  (willing to accept service by e-mail) |

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this Memorandum in Support of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and the Toledo Edison Company’s Motion for Interim Relief to Conduct SSO Auctions and Request for Expedited Treatment was served on the persons stated below via electronic transmission, this 20th day of December 2023.

*/s/ John Finnigan*

John Finnigan

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

The PUCO’s e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the following parties:

**SERVICE LIST**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| [thomas.lindgren@ohioago.gov](mailto:thomas.lindgren@ohioago.gov)  [amy.botschnerobrien@ohioago.gov](mailto:amy.botschnerobrien@ohioago.gov)  [rhiannon.howard@ohioago.gov](mailto:rhiannon.howard@ohioago.gov)  [mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com)  [jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com)  [rdove@keglerbrown.com](mailto:rdove@keglerbrown.com)  [nbobb@keglerbrown.com](mailto:nbobb@keglerbrown.com)  [Stacie.Cathcart@igs.com](mailto:Stacie.Cathcart@igs.com)  [Michael.Nugent@igs.com](mailto:Michael.Nugent@igs.com)  [cgrundmann@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:cgrundmann@spilmanlaw.com)  [dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com)  [slee@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:slee@spilmanlaw.com)  [todd.schafer@outlook.com](mailto:todd.schafer@outlook.com)  [mjsettineri@vorys.com](mailto:mjsettineri@vorys.com)  [glpetrucci@vorys.com](mailto:glpetrucci@vorys.com)  [aasanyal@vorys.com](mailto:aasanyal@vorys.com)  [dparram@brickergraydon.com](mailto:dparram@brickergraydon.com)  [rmains@brickergraydon.com](mailto:rmains@brickergraydon.com)  [dromig@nationwideenergypartners.com](mailto:dromig@nationwideenergypartners.com)  [brian.gibbs@nationwideenergypartners.com](mailto:brian.gibbs@nationwideenergypartners.com)  [paul@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:paul@carpenterlipps.com)  [mpritchard@mcneeslaw.com](mailto:mpritchard@mcneeslaw.com)  [awalke@mcneeslaw.com](mailto:awalke@mcneeslaw.com)  [tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)  [katherine.hollingsworth@lasclev.org](mailto:katherine.hollingsworth@lasclev.org)  [sjagers@ohiopovertylaw.org](mailto:sjagers@ohiopovertylaw.org)  [mwalters@proseniors.org](mailto:mwalters@proseniors.org)  [dmanor@ablelaw.org](mailto:dmanor@ablelaw.org)  [rnader@communitylegalaid.org](mailto:rnader@communitylegalaid.org)  Attorney Examiners:  [megan.addison@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:megan.addison@puco.ohio.gov)  [greg.price@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:greg.price@puco.ohio.gov)  [jacqueline.st.john@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:jacqueline.st.john@puco.ohio.gov) | [bknipe@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:bknipe@firstenergycorp.com)  [cwatchorn@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:cwatchorn@firstenergycorp.com)  [talexander@beneschlaw.com](mailto:talexander@beneschlaw.com)  [mkeaney@beneschlaw.com](mailto:mkeaney@beneschlaw.com)  [khehmeyer@beneschlaw.com](mailto:khehmeyer@beneschlaw.com)  [dproano@bakerlaw.com](mailto:dproano@bakerlaw.com)  [ahaque@bakerlaw.com](mailto:ahaque@bakerlaw.com)  [eprouty@bakerlaw.com](mailto:eprouty@bakerlaw.com)  [pwillison@bakerlaw.com](mailto:pwillison@bakerlaw.com)  [dstinson@brickergraydon.com](mailto:dstinson@brickergraydon.com)  [gkrassen@nopec.org](mailto:gkrassen@nopec.org)  [josephmeissner@yahoo.com](mailto:josephmeissner@yahoo.com)  [trhayslaw@gmail.com](mailto:trhayslaw@gmail.com)  [leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov](mailto:leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov)  [bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  [easley@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:easley@carpenterlipps.com)  [mkl@smxblaw.com](mailto:mkl@smxblaw.com)  [jrb@smxblaw.com](mailto:jrb@smxblaw.com)  [little@litohio.com](mailto:little@litohio.com)  [hogan@litohio.com](mailto:hogan@litohio.com)  [ktreadway@oneenergyllc.com](mailto:ktreadway@oneenergyllc.com)  [jdunn@oneenergyllc.com](mailto:jdunn@oneenergyllc.com)  [trent@hubaydougherty.com](mailto:trent@hubaydougherty.com)  [emcconnell@elpc.org](mailto:emcconnell@elpc.org)  [cpirik@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:cpirik@dickinsonwright.com)  [todonnell@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:todonnell@dickinsonwright.com)  [kshimp@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:kshimp@dickinsonwright.comm)  [eowoyt@vorys.com](mailto:eowoyt@vorys.com)  [whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com](mailto:whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com)  [ctavenor@theOEC.org](mailto:ctavenor@theOEC.org)  [Becky.Merola@calpinesolutions.com](mailto:Becky.Merola@calpinesolutions.com)  [jlaskey@norris-law.com](mailto:jlaskey@norris-law.com)  [knordstrom@theOEC.org](mailto:knordstrom@theOEC.org)  [jlang@calfee.com](mailto:jlang@calfee.com)  [mbarbara@calfee.com](mailto:mbarbara@calfee.com)  [jpetroff@lawforlabor.com](mailto:jpetroff@lawforlabor.com)  [jmcinerney@lawforlabor.com](mailto:jmcinerney@lawforlabor.com)  [junger@spilmanlaw.com](mailto:junger@spilmanlaw.com)  joe.oliker@igs.com  [jlang@calfee.com](mailto:jlang@calfee.com)  [mbarbara@calfee.com](mailto:mbarbara@calfee.com)  [tlong@mcneeslaw.com](mailto:tlong@mcneeslaw.com)  [rkelter@elpc.org](mailto:rkelter@elpc.org)  nwallace@elpc.org  cadieux@carpenterlipps.com |

1. *In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric Security Plan*, Case No. 23-301-EL-SSO, Motion and Memorandum in Support, Motion at 1 (Dec. 6, 2023). Cite to Entry, Case No. 19-361-EL-RDR (Dec. 30, 2020) at 9. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. *Id.*, Motion at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. *Id.*, Memorandum in Support at 13. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. *Retirement Sys. of City of St. Louis v. Jones*, Case No. 2:20-cv-4813, Order of Final Settlement Approval at 17 (Aug. 23, 2022) (Emphasis added). [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
5. *Id.*, Memorandum in Support at p. 13., *see also In the Matter of the Application of the Dayton Power and Light Company to Establish a Standard Service Offer in the Form of an Electric Security Plan*, Case No. 08-1094-EL-SSO, Entry (March 22, 2017). [↑](#footnote-ref-6)