**BEFORE THE**

**PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio )

Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric ) Case Nos. 12-2190-EL-POR

Illuminating Company, and The Toledo ) 12-2191-EL-POR

Edison Company For Approval of Their ) 12-2192-EL-POR

Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand )

Reduction Program Portfolio Plans for )

2013 to 2015 )

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

**INITIAL COMMENTS OF INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO**

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

 Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record) (Reg. No. 0016386)

Frank P. Darr (Reg. No. 0025469)

Matthew R. Pritchard (Reg. No. 0088070)

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

fdarr@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

October 20, 2014 Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

# BEFORE THE

**PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio )

Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric ) Case Nos. 12-2190-EL-POR

Illuminating Company, and The Toledo ) 12-2191-EL-POR

Edison Company For Approval of Their ) 12-2192-EL-POR

Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand )

Reduction Program Portfolio Plans for )

2013 to 2015 )

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

**INITIAL COMMENTS OF INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO**

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

# Introduction

 The Ohio Edison Company, the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and the Toledo Edison Company (“FE”) filed an application to amend their energy efficiency and peak demand reduction (“EE/PDR”) portfolio plans on September 24, 2014.[[1]](#footnote-1) Because the plans are a necessary first step to providing additional relief to energy intensive customers, Industrial Energy Users-Ohio (“IEU-Ohio”) urges the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) to approve the Application promptly.

# Legal Changes Effected by Substitute Senate Bill 310

In 2008, Ohio adopted electricity portfolio mandates with compliance requirements that commenced in 2009.[[2]](#footnote-2) The compliance requirements for the supply-side “alternative energy resource” mandate (“AER”, consisting of “renewable energy resources” and “advanced energy resources”) apply to electric distribution utilities (“EDUs”) and competitive retail electric service (“CRES”) providers. The compliance requirements for the EE/PDR mandates apply to only EDUs. To address those requirements, Commission rules require EDUs to have three-year EE and PDR mandate compliance plans.[[3]](#footnote-3) EDUs may seek to and have received authorization to pass the cost of the mandates on to retail electric consumers.[[4]](#footnote-4)

On May 28, 2014, the General Assembly enacted Substitute Senate Bill 310 (“SB 310”). Providing for a temporary freeze in the escalating EE/PDR requirements, SB 310 inserts the unescalated cumulative 2014 EE (4.2%) and PDR (4.75%) compliance requirements as the EE and PDR compliance requirements for 2015 and 2016.[[5]](#footnote-5) It also provides an EDU with two options regarding its current portfolio plans. An EDU may continue to implement its existing plan with no amendments through the end of 2016 (even if the current plan ends prior to December 31, 2016) or an EDU may amend its plan by submitting an amendment to the Commission.[[6]](#footnote-6) If an EDU chooses to amend its plan, it must file an application with the Commission no later than thirty days after the effective date of SB 310.[[7]](#footnote-7) The Commission is required to approve or amend and approve the application not later than sixty days after the application is filed.[[8]](#footnote-8) If the Commission takes no action on the application before January 1, 2015, the plan shall be deemed approved as amended in the application and shall take effect on January 1, 2015 and expire on December 31, 2016.[[9]](#footnote-9)

Additionally, SB 310 provides a streamlined opportunity for energy intensive customers[[10]](#footnote-10) to opt out of the benefits and costs of the EE/PDR compliance process (including cost recovery).[[11]](#footnote-11) For eligible customers served by an EDU that amends its current compliance plan, the streamlined opt-out opportunity begins January 1, 2015.[[12]](#footnote-12)

# FE’s Amended Plan

 As required by Commission rules, the FirstEnergy EDUs filed an application for approval of their energy portfolio plans for 2013 through 2015 on July 31, 2012. On March 20, 2013, the Commission issued an Opinion and Order approving the plans with modifications. On September 24, 2014, FE filed an application to amend the EDUs’ portfolio plans for 2015 through 2016 in compliance with the requirements of Section 6(B) of SB 310.

FE proposes amended plans that will continue a subset of programs under the existing plan, implement a new program authorized by SB 310, and suspend several programs in the existing plans.[[13]](#footnote-13) As demonstrated by the Application, the amended portfolio plans contain programs that will permit FE to exceed the portfolio requirements for 2015 and 2016 required by SB 310.[[14]](#footnote-14) Estimated compliance with the EE requirements will average 125% for the EDUs; estimated compliance with the PDR requirements will average 414%.[[15]](#footnote-15)

The Commission has previously approved the programs that are included in the amended plans in six days of hearing. During that initial proceeding, the parties and the Commission had the opportunity to test the original application and the Commission determined that the application with modifications was lawful. New programs included in the amended plans are responsive to statutory requirements or are currently the subject of a pending application and conditioned on approval of the latter application.[[16]](#footnote-16) The expected costs of the remaining programs should be reduced when the amended plans are approved.[[17]](#footnote-17)

In summary, the amended application is authorized by SB 310, and the resulting plan will result in compliance with the applicable EE/PDR requirements. Accordingly, the amended plans should be approved.

# timely approval of the amended application is reasonable

Beginning January 1, 2015, energy intensive customers may opt out of the opportunity and ability to obtain direct benefits and pay the recovery mechanism associated of the amended plans.[[18]](#footnote-18) In order to assess whether to make that election, they need an understanding of the programs and costs of the amended plans. Thus, the Commission should approve the amended application promptly so that Ohio’s energy intensive customers may assess and act on their decision to opt out.

 Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Frank P. Darr

 Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record) (Reg. No. 0016386)

Frank P. Darr (Reg. No. 0025469)

Matthew R. Pritchard (Reg. No. 0088070)

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

fdarr@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

 **Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Initial Comments of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio* was served upon the following parties of record this 20th day of October 2014 *via* hand-delivery, electronic transmission, or first class mail, U.S. postage prepaid.

 /s/ Frank P. Darr

 Frank P. Darr

Kathy J. Kolich (Counsel of Record)

Carrie M. Dunn

First Energy Service Company

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

kjkolich@firstenergycorp.com

edunn@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang

Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP

The Calfee Building

1405 East 6th Street

Cleveland, OH 44114

jlang@calfee.com

**Attorneys for Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Company, and The Toledo Edison Company**

Colleen L. Mooney

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

231 West Lima Street

Findlay, OH 45839-1793

cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

**On Behalf of Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy**

Richard L. Sites

General Counsel & Senior Director of Health Policy

Ohio Hospital Association

155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3620

ricks@ohanet.org

J. Thomas Siwo

Thomas J. O’Brien

Bricker & Eckler, LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

tobrien@bricker.com

tsiwo@bricker.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Hospital Association**

Todd M. Williams (Counsel of Record)

Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC

Two Maritime Plaza, Third Floor

Toledo, OH 43604

toddm@wamenergylaw.com

**On Behalf of Advanced Energy Economy Ohio**

Christopher J. Allwein

Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC

1371 Grandview Ave., Suite 212

Columbus, OH 43212

callwein@wamenergylaw.com

Manuel Somoza

Sierra Club

Environmental Law Program

85 Second Street, Second Floor

San Francisco, CA 94105-3459

manuel.somoza@sierraclub.org

Rebecca J. Riley

Natural Resources Defense Council

2 N. Riverside Plaza, Suite 2250

Chicago, IL 60606

rriley@nrdc.org

**On Behalf of the Sierra Club and The Natural Resources Defense Council**

Michael L. Kurtz

Kurt J. Boehm

Jody M. Kyler

Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry

36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510

Cincinnati, OH 45202

mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com

kboehm@BKLlawfirm.com

jkyler@BKLlawfirm.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Energy Group**

Gregory J. Poulos

EnerNOC, Inc.

471 East Broad Street, Suite 1520

Columbus, OH 43215

gpoulos@enernoc.com

**On Behalf of EnerNOC, Inc.**

Justin Vickers

Robert Kelter

Environmental Law & Policy Center

35 East Wacker Drive, Suite 1600

Chicago, IL 60601-2110

jvickers@elpc.org

rkelter@elpc.org

Trent A. Dougherty

Environmental Law & Policy Center

1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus, OH 43212

trent@theoec.org

**On Behalf of the Environmental Law & Policy Center and Ohio Environmental Council**

Bruce J. Weston

Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

Kyle L. Kern

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, OH 43215-3485

kern@occ.state.oh.us

**On Behalf of The Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**

Theodore S. Robinson

Citizen Power

2121 Murray Ave.

Pittsburgh, PA 15217

robinson@citizenpower.com

**On Behalf of Citizen Power**

Robert A. Brundrett (0086538)

The Ohio Manufacturer’s Association

33 N. High Street

Columbus, OH 43215

rbrundrett@ohiomfg.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Manufacturer’s Association**

Michael K. Lavanga

Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone, P.C.

1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W.

8th Floor, West Tower

Washington, DC 20007

mkl@bbrslaw.com

**On Behalf of Nucor Steel Marion, Inc.**

Glenn S. Krassen

Bricker & Eckler LLP

1001 Lakeside Avenue East, Suite 1350

Cleveland, OH 44114

gkrassen@bricker.com

Matthew W. Warnock

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215

mwarnock@bricker.com

**On Behalf of Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council**

William Wright

Devin Parram

Attorney General’s Office

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad St., 6th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us

william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

**On Behalf of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

Gregory Price

Mandy Willey Chiles

Attorney Examiners

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad Street

Columbus, OH 43215

gregory.price@puc.state.oh.us

mandy.willey@puc.state.oh.us

**Attorney Examiners**

1. Verified Application for Approval of Amended Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Plans for 2015 through 2016 (Sept. 24, 2014) (“Application”). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. R.C. 4928.64 & 4928.66. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Rule 4901:1-39-04(A), Ohio Administrative Code (“OAC”). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Rule 4901:1-39-07, OAC. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. R.C. 4928.66. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. SB 310, § 6(A). [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. *Id*., § 6(B)(1). [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. *Id*. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. *Id*. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. *Id*., § 5 (definition of “customer” has the same meaning as in R.C. 4928.6610). R.C. 4928.6610(A) provides:

"Customer" means any customer of an electric distribution utility to which either of the following applies:

(1) The customer receives service above the primary voltage level as determined by the utility's tariff classification.

(2) The customer is a commercial or industrial customer to which both of the following apply:

(a) The customer receives electricity through a meter of an end user or through more than one meter at a single location in a quantity that exceeds forty-five million kilowatt hours of electricity for the preceding calendar year.

(b) The customer has made a written request for registration as a self-assessing purchaser pursuant to section 5727.81 of the Revised Code. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. R.C. 4928.6610 to 4928.6616. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. SB 310, § 8. Industrial customers served by an EDU that does not amend its current compliance plan are eligible to take advantage of the streamlined opt-out beginning on January 1, 2017. R.C. 4928.6611. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Application at 1-2. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Application at 4-5 and Attachment 1. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. *Id*., Attachment 1. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. Application at 1 & 8. *See* R.C. 4928.662. [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Application at 8. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. SB 310, § 8. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)