BEFORE

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to Section 4928.143, Revised Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan, Accounting Modifications and Tariffs for Generation Service. | ) ) ) ) ) )  ) | Case No. 14-841-EL-SSO |
| In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio for Authority to Amend its Certified Supplier Tariff, P.U.C.O. No. 20. | ) ) ) | Case No. 14-842-EL-ATA |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

# DUKE ENERGY OHIO’S MEMORANDUM CONTRA

# JOINT MOTION FOR A PREHEARING CONFERENCE TO ADDRESS PENDING MOTIONS AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED RULING

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Pursuant to the provisions of O.A.C. 4901-1-12(C), Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (Duke Energy Ohio or Company) hereby files its memorandum contra (Memorandum Contra) a Joint Motion for a Prehearing Conference to Address Pending Motions and Request for Expedited Ruling (Joint Motion), filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission) on July 28, 2014, by the several of the intervenors in these proceedings (Joint Movants).[[1]](#footnote-1)

While Duke Energy Ohio is ready to participate in a prehearing conference, should the Commission determine that such a conference is necessary, Duke Energy Ohio disagrees with the rationale for the Joint Motion and with the requested prehearing conference date.

Joint Movants seek to force the Commission to rule on all pending motions on Joint Movants’ schedule, rather than allowing the Commission to proceed as it deems appropriate. Although the Commission is indisputably aware of the motions in question, as well as their content, Joint Movants have chosen to detail all of those filings yet again. This approach is a waste of the Commission’s valuable time and resources.

Joint Movants, in attempting to support this tactic, also misstate reality in their attempt to summarize the arguments in pending motions. Most egregious is their false assertion that Duke Energy Ohio “has refused to provide most intervenors with information that it alone has determined deserves confidential treatment. The PUCO’s rules were promulgated to prevent such actions.”[[2]](#footnote-2) The truth is that:

* Duke Energy Ohio has refused to release its proprietary information under contractual terms that experience has shown to be ineffective in preventing misuse of such information.
* OCC has refused even to consider signing a confidentiality agreement that differs from the version previously used.
* Negotiations over the terms of a confidentiality agreement continued with another party, with both sides compromising to reach a reasonable outcome.
* Without an effective confidentiality agreement, the information that Duke Energy Ohio believes to be proprietary cannot be released.
* As of the filing of the Joint Motion, only threeof the fourteen movants had even requested a confidentiality agreement with the Company.[[3]](#footnote-3) The circumstances involving OCC with regard to terms of a confidentiality agreement are well known and will not be restated here. The only other movants to have sought a confidentiality agreement have yet to provide substantive comments.
* As of the filing of this Joint Motion, only five of the fourteen movants had tendered discovery upon Duke Energy Ohio and thus have affirmatively sought any information, whether confidential or public, that would assist them in evaluating the Company’s application from the perspective of their individual business interests.

It is not, as Joint Movants assert, that Duke Energy Ohio refuses to provide the agreement. Rather, of those few Joint Movants that have even broached the subject of a confidentiality agreement, they either refuse to compromise or have not followed up with the Company, and it is under these circumstances that Duke Energy Ohio refuses to release its confidential information publicly.

Duke Energy Ohio does not disagree that a prehearing conference is one method by which the Commission could decide these issues. However, it seems unlikely, after the plethora of motions that have been filed, that any more argument is necessary. The more typical written order would suffice.

If the Commission does wish to schedule a prehearing conference, sufficient notice would be necessary in order to ensure that all interested parties have the opportunity to have counsel present. Joint Movants have asked the Commission to schedule such a conference for the week of July 28, 2014. As the Motion was only filed on July 28, 2014, this is an astonishing request. Given such short notice, many of Duke Energy Ohio’s necessary participants would not be available.

Duke Energy Ohio respectfully submits that the Commission should deny the Joint Motion.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

/s/ Jeanne W. Kingery

Amy B. Spiller (Counsel of Record)

Deputy General Counsel

Rocco O. D’Ascenzo

Associate General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery

Associate General Counsel

Elizabeth H. Watts

Associate General Counsel

139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main

P.O. Box 961

Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960

(513) 287-4359 (telephone)

(513) 287-4385 (facsimile)

Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was delivered by U.S. mail (postage prepaid), personal, or electronic mail, on this 30th day of July, 2014, to the parties listed below.

/s/ Jeanne W. Kingery

Jeanne W. Kingery

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Steven Beeler  Thomas Lindgren  Ryan O’Rourke  Assistant Attorneys General  Public Utilities Section  180 East Broad St., 6th Floor  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [Steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us)  [Thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us)  [Ryan.orouke@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Ryan.orouke@puc.state.oh.us)  **Counsel for Staff of the Commission** |  | David F. Boehm  Michael L. Kurtz  Jody M. Kyler Cohn  Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  [dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com)  [mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com)  [jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com)  **Counsel for the Ohio Energy Group** |
| Kevin R. Schmidt  88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [schmidt@sppgrp.com](mailto:schmidt@sppgrp.com)  **Counsel for the Energy Professionals of Ohio** |  | Mark A. Hayden  Jacob A. McDermott  Scott J. Casto  FirstEnergy Service Company  76 South Main Street  Akron, Ohio 44308  [haydenm@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:haydenm@firstenergycorp.com)  [jmcdermott@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:jmcdermott@firstenergycorp.com)  scasto@firstenergycorp.com  **Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.** |
| Maureen R. Grady  Joseph P. Serio  Edmund “Tad” Berger  Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel  10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485  [Maureen.grady@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:Maureen.grady@occ.ohio.gov)  [Joseph.serio@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:Joseph.serio@occ.ohio.gov)  [Edmund.berger@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:Edmund.berger@occ.ohio.gov)  **Counsel for the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel** |  | Judi L. Sobecki  The Dayton Power and Light Company  1065 Woodman Drive  Dayton, Ohio 45432  [Judi.sobecki@aes.com](mailto:Judi.sobecki@aes.com)  **Counsel for The Dayton Power and Light Company** |
| Kimberly W. Bojko  Mallory M. Mohler  Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  280 Plaza, Suite 1300  280 North High Street  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [Bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:Bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  [Mohler@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:Mohler@carpenterlipps.com)  **Counsel for the Ohio Manufacturers’ Association** |  | Joseph Oliker  Matthew White  6100 Emerald Parkway  Dublin, Ohio 43016  [joliker@igsenergy.com](mailto:joliker@igsenergy.com)  [mswhite@igsenergy.com](mailto:mswhite@igsenergy.com)  **Counsel for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.** |
| Joseph M. Clark  Direct Energy  21 East State Street, 19th Floor  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [joseph.clark@directenergy.com](mailto:joseph.clark@directenergy.com)  **Counsel for Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC** |  | Gerit F. Hull  Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellot, LLC  1717 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  12th Floor  Washington, DC 20006  [ghull@eckertseamans.com](mailto:ghull@eckertseamans.com)  **Counsel for Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC** |
| Samuel C. Randazzo  Frank P. Darr  Matthew R. Pritchard  McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  21 East State Street, 17th Floor  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [sam@mwncmh.com](mailto:sam@mwncmh.com)  [fdarr@mwncmh.com](mailto:fdarr@mwncmh.com)  [mpritchard@mwncmh.com](mailto:mpritchard@mwncmh.com)  **Counsel for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio** |  | Colleen L. Mooney  Cathryn N. Loucas  Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  231 West Lima Street  Findlay, Ohio 45839-1793  [cmooney@ohiopartners.org](mailto:cmooney@ohiopartners.org)  [cloucas@ohiopartners.org](mailto:cloucas@ohiopartners.org)  **Counsel for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy** |
| Trent Dougherty  1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  [tdougherty@theOEC.org](mailto:tdougherty@theOEC.org)  **Counsel for the Ohio Environmental Council** |  | Steven T. Nourse  Matthew J. Satterwhite  Yazen Alami  American Electric Power Service Corporation  1 Riverside Plaza 29th Floor  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [stnourse@aep.com](mailto:stnourse@aep.com)  [mjsatterwhite@aep.com](mailto:mjsatterwhite@aep.com)  [yalami@aep.com](mailto:yalami@aep.com)  **Counsel for Ohio Power Company** |
| Andrew J. Sonderman  Margeaux Kimbrough  Kegler Brown Hill & Ritter LPA  Capitol Square, Suite 1800  65 East State Street  Columbus, Ohio 43215-4294  [asonderman@keglerbrown.com](mailto:asonderman@keglerbrown.com)  [mkimbrough@keglerbrown.com](mailto:mkimbrough@keglerbrown.com)  **Counsel for People Working Cooperatively, Inc.** |  | Christopher J. Allwein  Todd M. Williams  Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC  1500 West Third Avenue, Suite 330  Columbus, Ohio 43212  [callwein@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:callwein@wamenergylaw.com)  [toddm@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:toddm@wamenergylaw.com)  **Counsel for the Sierra Club** |
| Rebecca L. Hussey  Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  280 Plaza, Suite 1300  280 North High Street  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [Hussey@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:Hussey@carpenterlipps.com)  **Counsel for The Kroger Company** |  | Douglas E. Hart  441 Vine Street  Suite 4192  Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  [dhart@douglasehart.com](mailto:dhart@douglasehart.com)  **Counsel for The Greater Cincinnati Health Council** |
| M. Howard Petricoff  Michael J. Settineri  Gretchen L. Petrucci  Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP  52 East Gay Street  P.O.Box 1008  Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008  [mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  [mjsettineri@vorys.com](mailto:mjsettineri@vorys.com)  [glpetrucci@vorys.com](mailto:glpetrucci@vorys.com)  **Counsel for Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and Exelon Generation Company,**  **LLC** |  | Cynthia Fonner Brady  Exelon Business Services Company  4300 Winfield Road  Warrenville, Illinois 60555  [Cynthia.brady@constellation.com](mailto:Cynthia.brady@constellation.com)  **For Constellation NewEnegy, Inc.** |
| David I. Fein  Vice President, State Government  Affairs - East  Exelon Corporation  10 South Dearborn Street, 47th Floor  Chicago, Illinois 60603  [David.fein@exeloncorp.com](mailto:David.fein@exeloncorp.com)  **For Exelon Corporation** |  | Lael Campbell  Exelon  101 Constitution Avenue, NW  Washington, DC 2001  [Lael.Campbell@constellation.com](mailto:Lael.Campbell@constellation.com)  **For Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.** |
| M. Howard Petricoff  Special Assistant Attorney General  Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP  52 East Gay Street  P.O. Box 1008  Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008  [mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  **Counsel for Miami University and the University of Cincinnati** |  | M. Howard Petricoff  Michael J. Settineri  Gretchen L. Petrucci  Vorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP  52 East Gay Street  P.O.Box 1008  Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008  [mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  [mjsettineri@vorys.com](mailto:mjsettineri@vorys.com)  [glpetrucci@vorys.com](mailto:glpetrucci@vorys.com)  **Counsel for the Retail Energy Supply Association** |
| Nicholas McDaniel  Environmental Law & Policy Center  1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201  Columbus, Ohio 43212  [NMcDaniel@elpc.org](mailto:NMcDaniel@elpc.org)  **Counsel for the Environmental Law &**  **Policy Center** |  | Gregory J. Poulos  EnerNOC, Inc.  471 E. Broad Street, Suite 1520  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [gpoulos@enernoc.com](mailto:gpoulos@enernoc.com)  **Counsel for EnerNOC, Inc.** |
| Samantha Williams  Natural Resources Defense Council  20 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 1600  Chicago, Illinois 60606  [swilliams@nrdc.org](mailto:swilliams@nrdc.org)  **Counsel for the Natural Resources Defense Council** |  | Thomas J. O'Brien  Bricker & Eckler LLP  100 South Third Street  Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291  [tobrien@bricker.com](mailto:tobrien@bricker.com)  **Counsel for the City of Cincinnati** |
| Rick D. Chamberlain  Behrens, Wheeler, & Chamberlain  6 N.E. 63rd Street, Suite 400  Oklahoma City, OK 73105  [rchamberlain@okenergylaw.com](mailto:rchamberlain@okenergylaw.com)  **Counsel for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam’s East, Inc.** |  | Donald L. Mason  Michael R. Traven  Roetzel & Andress, LPA  155 E. Broad Street, 12th Floor  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [dmason@ralaw.com](mailto:dmason@ralaw.com)  [mtraven@ralaw.com](mailto:mtraven@ralaw.com)  **Counsel for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam’s East, Inc.** |

1. The Joint Movants comprise the City of Cincinnati, Constellation NewEnergy Inc., Environmental Law and Policy Center, Exelon Generation Company LLC, Industrial Energy Users-Ohio, Interstate Gas Supply, Inc., the Kroger Company, Natural Resources Defense Council, the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel (OCC), Ohio Environmental Council, Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy, People Working Cooperatively, Retail Energy Supply Association, and Sierra Club. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Joint Motion, pg. 3. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. As the Company had standard confidentiality agreements available at the technical conference, additional Movants may have also picked up copies. However, no other Movants have discussed the matter with Company counsel. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)