**BEFORE**

**THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In The Matter of the Procurement of Standard Service Offer Generation as Part of the Third Electric Security Plan for Customers of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company. | :  :  :  :  :  : | Case No. 12-2742-EL-UNC |

**MOTION FOR A PROTECTIVE ORDER**

SUBMITTED ON BEHALF OF THE STAFF OF

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

Comes now the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Staff) and requests that both the Report of the Commission’s Consultant Regarding FirstEnergy’s October 2013 Standard Service Offer Auction and the Notification of CBP Auction Results be kept confidential pursuant to O.A.C. Rule 4901-1-24 for the reasons set forth in the attached memorandum in support.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

**Thomas W. McNamee**

Assistant Attorney General

Public Utilities Section

180 East Broad Street

Columbus, OH 43215-3793

614.466.4396 (telephone)

614.644.8764 (facsimile)

[thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us)

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

Staff requests that the Commission keep both the Report of the Commission’s Con­sultant Regarding FirstEnergy’s October 2013 Standard Service Offer Auction and the Notification of CBP Auction Results confidential and that they not be publicly released. This information identifies the details of various bids and parties making the bids in the October 2013 FirstEnergy auction. This information is highly competitively sensitive. Public disclosure of this information would be highly prejudicial to the bidding parties and to the viability of any future auction in Ohio. Keeping this material confi­den­tial is consistent with the Commission’s actions in prior auction matters. A redacted ver­sion of the Notification of CBP Auction Results has been filed publicly in this docket.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

**Thomas W. McNamee**

Assistant Attorney General

Public Utilities Section

180 East Broad Street

Columbus, OH 43215-3793

614.466.4396 (telephone)

614.644.8764 (facsimile)

[thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us)

# **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I certify that a true copy of the foregoing **Motion for a Protective Order** sub­mitted on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Com­mission of Ohio was served by regular U.S. mail, postage prepaid, or via electronic mail, upon the following parties of record, this 23rd day of October, 2013.

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

**Thomas W. McNamee**

Assistant Attorney General

**Parties of Record:**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Samuel C. Randazzo  Joseph M. Clark  McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  21 East State St., 17th Floor  Columbus, OH 43215  [sam@mwncmh.com](mailto:sam@mwncmh.com)  [jclark@mwncmh.com](mailto:jclark@mwncmh.com)  Colleen L. Mooney  231 West Lima Street  PO Box 1793  Columbus, OH 43215  [cmooney2@columbus.rr.com](mailto:cmooney2@columbus.rr.com)  Lance M. Keiffer  420 Madison Ave., Suite 100  Toledo, OH 43604-1219  [lance.keiffer@toledo.oh.gov](mailto:lance.keiffer@toledo.oh.gov)  Michael K. Lavanga  Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone  1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, NW  Eighth Floor, West Tower  Washington, DC 20007-5201  [mkl@bbrslaw.com](mailto:mkl@bbrslaw.com)  Craig I. Smith  2824 Coventry Road  Cleveland, Ohio 44120  [wis29@yahoo.com](mailto:wis29@yahoo.com)  Dane Stinson  Bailey Cavalieri LLC  10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [Dane.Stinson@BaileyCavalieri.com](mailto:Dane.Stinson@BaileyCavalieri.com)  Glenn S. Krassen  Matthew W. Warnock  Bricker & Eckler LLP  1375 E. 9th St., Suite 1500  Cleveland, OH 44114  gkrassen@bricker.com  [mwarnock@bricker.com](mailto:mwarnock@bricker.com)  M. Howard Petricoff  Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease, LLP  52 East Gay St.  PO Box 1008  Columbus, OH 43216-1008  [mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  Jacqueline Lake Roberts  Regulatory Affairs and Public Policy  101 Federal Street, Suite 1100  Boston, MA 02110  [jroberts@enernoc.com](mailto:jroberts@enernoc.com)  Teresa Ringenbach  5400 Frantz Rd., Suite 250  Dublin, OH 43016  [teresa.ringenbach@directenergy.com](mailto:teresa.ringenbach@directenergy.com)  Richard L. Sites  155 E. Broad Street, 15th Floor  Columbus, OH 43215-3620  [ricks@ohanet.org](mailto:ricks@ohanet.org)  Gregory K. Lawrence  28 State Street  McDermott Will & Emory LLP  Boston, MA 02109  [glawrence@mwe.com](mailto:glawrence@mwe.com)  Henry W. Eckhart  50 West Broad Street, #2117  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [henryeckhart@aol.com](mailto:henryeckhart@aol.com)  Amy Spiller  Duke Energy Business Services, Inc.  221 E. Fourth St., 25 Fl.  Cincinnati, OH 45202  [amy.spiller@duke-energy.com](mailto:amy.spiller@duke-energy.com)  Cheri B. Cunningham  Director of Law  161 South High Street  Suite 202  Akron, OH 44308  [ccunningham@akronohio.gov](mailto:ccunningham@akronohio.gov)  David A. Kutik  Jones Day  901 Lakeside Avenue  Cleveland, OH 44114  [dakutik@jonesday.com](mailto:dakutik@jonesday.com)  Laura C. McBride  James F. Lang  Calfee, Halter & Griswold  1400 KeyBank Center  800 Superior Avenue  Cleveland, OH 44114  [lmcbride@calfee.com](mailto:lmcbride@calfee.com)  Mamie J. Mitchell  Cleveland City Council  601 Lakeside Avenue  Room 220  Cleveland, OH 44114  Charles Faruki  D. Jeffrey Ireland  Faruki, Ireland & Cox  500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W.  10 North Ludlow Street  Dayton, OH 45402  [cfaruki@ficlaw.com](mailto:cfaruki@ficlaw.com)  [direland@ficlaw.com](mailto:direland@ficlaw.com)  F. Timothy Hagan, Commissioner  Cuyahoga County Board of County Commissioners  1219 Ontario Street  Cleveland, OH 44113  Laura Chappelle  4218 Jacob Meadows  Okemos, MI 48864  [laurac@chappelleconsulting.net](mailto:laurac@chappelleconsulting.net)  Megan DeLisi  1207 Grandview Avenue  Suite 201  Columbus, OH 43212-3449 | Nolan Moser  Bell & Royer, LPA  33 South Grant Avenue  Columbus, OH 43215  [nmoser@theoec.org](mailto:nmoser@theoec.org)  Michael L. Kurtz  David F. Boehm  Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  Cincinnati, OH 45202  [mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com)  [dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com)  Jeffrey L. Small  Gregory J. Poulos  Assistant Consumers’ Counsel  Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel  10 West Broad Street  18th Floor  Columbus, OH 43215-3485  [small@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:small@occ.state.oh.us)  [poulos@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:poulos@occ.state.oh.us)  [reese@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:reese@occ.state.oh.us)  Matthew S. White  Chester Wilcox & Saxbe, LLP  65 E. State St., Suite 1000  Columbus, OH 43215  [mwhite@cwslaw.com](mailto:mwhite@cwslaw.com)  Theodore S. Robinson  2121 Murray Avenue  Pittsburgh, PA 15217  [robinson@citizenpower.com](mailto:robinson@citizenpower.com)  Michael D. Dortch  Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC  63 E. State St., Suite 200  Columbus, OH 43215  [mdortch@kravitzllc.com](mailto:mdortch@kravitzllc.com)  George A. Yurchisin  FirstEnergy Service Company  76 S. Main St.  Akron, OH 44308  Michael E. Heintz  Staff Attorney  1207 Grandview Ave.  Suite 201  Columbus, Ohio 43212  [mheintz@elpc.org](mailto:mheintz@elpc.org)  Eric D. Weldele  Tucker, Ellis & West, LLP  1225 Huntington Center  41 South High Street  Columbus, OH 43215-6197  [eric.weldele@tuckerellis.com](mailto:eric.weldele@tuckerellis.com)  Joseph P. Meissner  Matthew D. Vincel  The Legal Aid Society of Cleveland  1223 West 6th Street  Cleveland, OH 44113  [jpmeissn@lasclev.org](mailto:jpmeissn@lasclev.org)  Steven Huhman  Morgan Stanley  2000 Westchester Ave.  Purchase, NY 10577  [steven.huhman@morganstanley.com](mailto:steven.huhman@morganstanley.com)  Samuel A. Wolfe  100 W. Elm Street, Suite 410  Conshohocken, PA 19428  Christopher Miller  Andre T. Porter  Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA  250 West St.  Columbus, OH 4321 5  [cmiller@szd.com](mailto:cmiller@szd.com)  [aporter@szd.com](mailto:aporter@szd.com)  Meena T. Sinfelt  Andrews Kurth  1350 I Street, N.W.  Suite 1100  Washington, DC 20005  Robert Kelter  35 East Wacker Drive  Suite 1300  Chicago, IL 60613  Barbara Boyd  State Representative  77 South high Street, 11th Floor  Columbus, OH 43215-6111  Roger Lindgren  Joe Mastervich  2669 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard  Youngstown, OH 44510-1033  Glen Thomas  1060 First Avenue  Suite 400  King of Prussia, PA 19406  Charles R. Dyas, Jr.  Barnes & Thornburg  Fifth Third Center  21 East State Street  Suite 1850  Columbus, OH 43215-4219  Thomas Froehle  McNees Wallace & Nurick  21 East State Street, 17th Floor  Columbus, OH 43215-4228  [tfroehle@mwncmh.com](mailto:tfroehle@mwncmh.com) |