**BEFORE**

**THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Application of Verde Energy USA Ohio, LLC for Certification as a Competitive Retail Electric Supplier.  In the Matter of the Renewal Application of Verde Energy USA Ohio, LLC for Certification as a Retail Natural Gas Marketer. | )  )  )  )  )  )  ) | Case No. 11-5886-EL-CRS  Case No. 13-2164-GA-CRS |

**MEMORANDUM CONTRA VERDE ENERGY’S  
MOTION TO INDEFINITELY EXTEND ITS COMPETITIVE RETAIL  
ELECTRIC SERVICE AND NATURAL GAS SERVICE CERTIFICATES TO OPERATE AS A MARKETER IN OHIO**

**BY**

**OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS’ COUNSEL**

Verde Energy filed a motion to extend its certificates while the PUCO is considering the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel’s case against Verde. In its Motion, Verde seeks an indefinite extension of its current certificates “until the [PUCO] enters a decision on Verde Energy’s applications to renew those certifications.”[[1]](#footnote-2) Verde previously sought a similar indefinite extension.[[2]](#footnote-3) Instead, the PUCO rightfully granted Verde only a temporary extension to December 31, 2020.[[3]](#footnote-4) Rather than adding further delay to reaching a conclusion to this case, which an indefinite extension enables, the PUCO should do the same here—grant a temporary extension—and finally reach a decision in the pending cases.

Verde’s certificates should be extended to no later than February 28, 2021 for the limited purpose of giving the PUCO additional time to rule on Verde’s renewal applications and OCC’s consumer-protection position that Verde should be banned from operating in the State of Ohio. Further, in the PUCO’s October 30 Entry, it stated that Verde “will not be enrolling new Ohio customers unless and until the Commission approves Verde’s pending renewal applications.”[[4]](#footnote-5) Any entry granting a further extension of Verde’s certificates beyond the current December 31, 2020 should explicitly state the same condition: that unless and until the PUCO grants Verde’s pending renewal applications, Verde shall continue to be prohibited from marketing to and enrolling new customers in Ohio.

In fact, Verde’s services should be continued only to protect consumers and allow for consumers to transition away from service by Verde. Verde’s consumers should be transferred soon to the safety of the utilities’ standard offers. That transitional wind-down of Verde’s operations should begin now.

The opportunity to do business in Ohio is a privilege, not a right. Verde has abused that privilege by abusing its customers. The PUCO’s focus in response to Verde’s motion should be solely to protect customers, not to protect Verde’s business opportunity in Ohio. The PUCO did ban for a time Verde’s marketing to acquire new customers. But if that ban expires (which it should not), new customers could again be at risk of being ripped off by Verde.[[5]](#footnote-6) Perhaps even worse, Verde has been allowed to keep its existing customers, under the settlement that the PUCO adopted.

The PUCO should grant Verde a brief extension to continue serving current customers. Then, the PUCO should protect customers by denying Verde’s certificate renewal applications.

Respectfully submitted,

Bruce Weston (0016973)

Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

*/s/ Christopher Healey*

Christopher Healey (0086027)

Counsel of Record (Case No. 11-5886-EL-CRS)

Angela D. O’Brien (0097579)

Counsel of Record (Case No. 13-2164-GA-CRS)

**Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**

65 East State Street, 7th Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Telephone [Healey]: (614) 466-9571

Telephone [O’Brien]: (614) 466-9531

[christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:christopher.healey@occ.ohio.gov)

[angela.obrien@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:angela.obrien@occ.ohio.gov)

(willing to accept service via e-mail)

Kimberly W. Bojko (0069402)

Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP

280 Plaza, Suite 1300

280 North High Street

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 365-4100

[bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:bojko@carpenterlipps.com)

(willing to accept service via e-mail)

*Special Counsel for the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this Memorandum Contra was served on the persons stated below via electronic transmission this 16th day of December 2020.

*/s/ Christopher Healey*

Christopher Healey

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

The PUCO’s e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the following parties:

**SERVICE LIST**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| [thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  Attorney Examiner:  [Dan.fullin@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:Dan.fullin@puco.ohio.gov)  [Lauren.augostini@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:Lauren.augostini@puco.ohio.gov)  [Patricia.schabo@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:Patricia.schabo@puco.ohio.gov) | [kwhite@sparkenergy.com](mailto:kwhite@sparkenergy.com)  mleclerc@sparkenergy.com  dproano@bakerlaw.com  kkash@bakerlaw.com  dlemon@bakerlaw.com  tathompson@bakerlaw.com  [bclay@sparkenergy.com](mailto:bclay@sparkenergy.com)  [mlundstrom@sparkenergy.com](mailto:mlundstrom@sparkenergy.com) |

1. Motion to Extend Verde Energy USA Ohio, LLC’s Competitive Retail Electric Service and Competitive Retail Natural Gas Service Certifications (Dec. 10, 2020) (the “Motion”). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. Motion to Extend Verde Energy USA Ohio, LLC’s Competitive Retail Electric Service and Competitive Retail Natural Gas Service Certifications (Oct. 23, 2020). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. Entry (Oct. 30, 2020). [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. Entry ¶ 13. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
5. OCC understands that Verde has volunteered to not resume marketing until the PUCO rules on its certificate renewals. *See* Motion at 4. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)