**BEFORE**

**THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Delivery Capital Recovery Rider Contained in the Tariffs of **Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company**. | ::::: | Case No. **12-2855-EL-RDR** |

**JOINT COMMENTS**

SUBMITTED ON BEHALF OF THE STAFF OF

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

AND

OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING COMPANY, AND THE TOLEDO EDISON COMPANY

 On March 22, 2013, Blue Ridge Consulting Services, Inc. (Blue Ridge), an inde­pendent auditor selected by the Commission Staff, with the consent of the Companies, filed its Compliance Audit Report (Report) of the Delivery Capital Recovery (DCR) Rider of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company (collectively, Companies). The Commission Staff and the Companies agree that the Commission should adopt the recommendations Blue Ridge made in its Report as specifically described below:

* On Page 14 of the Report, Blue Ridge recommended that the Companies include quantification of any increase in efficiency and savings within its (IT) project justifications.
* On Page 14 of the Report, Blue Ridge found that of the 90 work orders tested, 12 had errors. On Page 15 of the Report, Blue Ridge found that Ohio Edison and Toledo Edison’s Rider DCR inappropriately includes two Pennsylvania related items in accumulated deferred income taxes (ADIT). The total esti­mated impact to the Rider DCR of Blue Ridge’s findings associated with the work order transactional testing and ADIT is a reduction of approximately $470,614 in the DCR annual revenue requirement. Blue Ridge recommended that the Companies correct the errors identified by Blue Ridge and adjust Rider DCR accordingly. Rider DCR effective July 1, 2013 incorporates these adjustments.
* On Page 16, Blue Ridge recommended that the Commission consider an updated depreciation study be conducted as the last approved study was based on balances as of May 31, 2007. Staff recommends the Commission direct the Companies to submit this study to Staff no later than June 1, 2015.
* On Page 25, Blue Ridge recommended that the Companies continue to closely monitor IT project planning and implementation.
* On Page 26, Blue Ridge recommended that the Companies continue their efforts to reduce the unitization backlog before the next audit to reduce the potential for over or under accrual of depreciation.
* On Page 46, Blue Ridge recommended that the sample of December 2012 work orders be included in the test sample for the 2013 compliance audit.

Respectfully submitted,

**Michael DeWine**

Ohio Attorney General

**William L. Wright**

Section Chief

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

**Thomas W. McNamee**

Assistant Attorney General

Public Utilities Section

180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3793

614.466.4397 (telephone)

614.644.8764 (fax)

thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us

**Counsel for the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

/s/ James W. Burk (via phone authorization)

**James W. Burk**

**Carrie M. Dunn**

FirstEnergy Service Company

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

330.384.5861 (telephone)

339.384.3875 (fax)

burkj@firstenergycorp.com

cdunn@firstenergycorp.com

**Counsel for Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company**

# PROOF OF SERVICE

 I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing **Post-Hearing Brief** submitted on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commis­sion of Ohio,was served by regular U.S. mail, postage pre­paid, or hand-delivered, upon the following Parties of Record, this 22nd day of May, 2013.

/s/ Thomas W. McNamee

**Thomas W. McNamee**

Assistant Attorney General

**Parties of Record:**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Larry S. SauerAssistant Consumers’ CounselOffice of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel10 West Broad StreetSuite 1800Columbus, OH 43215sauer@occ.state.oh.us | James W. BurkCarrie M. DunnFirstEnergy Service Corp.76 South Main StreetAkron, OH 44308burkj@firstenergycorp.comcdunn@firstenergycorp.com |