**BEFORE**

**THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Commission’s Investigation of Ohio’s Retail Electric Service Market. | ) )  ) | Case No. 12-3151-EL-COI |

**DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.’S**

**MEMORANDUM CONTRA APPLICATION FOR REHEARING**

**OF DIRECT ENERGY SERVICES, LLC, DIRECT ENERGY BUSINESS, LLC**

**AND IGS ENERGY**

1. **Introduction**

Pursuant to R.C. 4903.10 and Rule 4901-1-35, Ohio Administrative Code, Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (Duke Energy Ohio) hereby submits its Memorandum Contra Application for Rehearing submitted in the above-referenced proceeding by Direct Energy Services, LLC, Direct Energy Business, LLC, (together referred to as Direct Energy) and IGS Energy. In their respective applications for rehearing, each proposes that the Commission order certain actions with respect to the relationship between electric distribution utilities (EDUs) and competitive retail service providers (CRES) that are not well considered and not timely. For reasons discussed in greater detail below, these grounds for rehearing are without merit and Direct Energy and IGS’ applications for rehearing should be rejected.

1. **Argument**

Direct Energy argues that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission) Finding and Order (Order) in this proceeding is unreasonable because it does not state that EDUs must provide customer interval energy usage data (CEUD) to CRES after tariffs are filed, pursuant to the Order. Direct Energy further argues that the Order is unreasonable in that it does not place time parameters on when EDUs must file tariffs regarding CEUD. In so arguing, Direct Energy ignores the discussion provided in detail in the Commission’s Order, and the realities of what is presently possible or legally permissible.

The Commission recognized that it is presently reviewing rules regarding CEUD in Case No. 12-2050-EL-ORD, and that EDUs will not be able to prepare or even consider tariff language for terms, conditions and charges associated with providing CEUD to CRES until many issues are resolved in that pending proceeding or otherwise addressed. The Commission further points out that the Staff will continue its work in the market development working group (MDWG) and that MDWG Staff Reports will assist the Commission in continually review and adopt competitive retail enhancements to further the development of the market. Despite Direct Energy’s desire to force an order prior to the resolution of many very important issues. Direct Energy’s demands are not well considered and should be rejected.

IGS Energy, likewise, seeks access to data, at customer cost, without any basis upon which to establish that such data will be used for customer benefit. Also, IGS Energy, like Direct Energy, seems to disregard whether EDUs are even capable of providing any such data.

IGS Energy seeks an order that would delineate the specific requirements for data made available to CRES; an order that will not require CRES to pay for the data; an order requiring EDUs to implement meter data management systems; a procedural determination with respect to how EDU tariffs related to providing data will be approved, and finally, an order requiring EDUs to bill for services provided by CRES for every product offering a CRES can devise.

IGS Energy, similar to Direct Energy, seeks to impose its business plan upon the stakeholders in Ohio at any costs and with total disregard to what is possible or advisable. Much of what IGS Energy demands is not yet feasible or possible and certainly not developed in any record before the Commission. IGS Energy’s demands should be rejected.

Based upon the above, Direct Energy and IGS Energy’s arguments are without merit and their respective applications for rehearing should be denied.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Elizabeth H. Watts

Associate General Counsel

Rocco O. D’Ascenzo

Associate General Counsel

Duke Energy Business Services LLC

155 East Broad Street, 21st Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Phone: 614-222-1330

Fax: 614-222-1337

[Elizabeth.Watts@duke-energy.com](mailto:Elizabeth.Watts@duke-energy.com)

[Rocco.DAscenzo@duke-energy.com](mailto:Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com)

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was delivered via U.S. mail (postage prepaid), personal, or electronic mail delivery on this the 5th day of May, 2014, to the parties listed below.

# \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Elizabeth H. Watts

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Maureen R. Grady  Joseph P. Serio  Edmund Berger  Michael J. Schuler  Assistant Consumers’ Counsel  Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel  10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485  [grady@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:grady@occ.state.oh.us)  [serio@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:serio@occ.state.oh.us)  [berger@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:berger@occ.state.oh.us)  schuler@occ.state.oh.us  Attorneys for Ohio Consumers’ Counsel | M. Howard Petricoff  Stephen M. Howard  Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  52 E. Gay Street  Columbus, OH 43215  [mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  [smhoward@vorys.com](mailto:smhoward@vorys.com)  Attorneys for Exelon Generation Company, LLC, and  Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. |
| Christopher J. Allwein  Williams, Allwein & Moser LLC  1500 West Third Avenue, Suite 330  Columbus, Ohio 43212  [callwein@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:callwein@wamenergylaw.com)  Attorney for The Sierra Club | David F. Boehm  Michael L. Kurtz  Jody Kyler Cohn  Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  36 E. Seventh Street, Suite 1510  Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  [dboehm@bkllawfirm.com](mailto:dboehm@bkllawfirm.com)  [mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com)  jkylercohn@bkllawfirm.com  Attorneys for Ohio Energy Group |
| Colleen L. Mooney  Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  231 West Lima Street  Findlay, OH 45839-1793  [cmooney@ohiopartners.org](mailto:cmooney@ohiopartners.org)  Attorneys for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy | Steven T. Nourse  Matthew J. Satterwhite  Yazen Alami  American Electric Power Service  Corporation  1 Riverside Plaza 29th Floor  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [stnourse@aep.com](mailto:stnourse@aep.com)  [mjsatterwhite@aep.com](mailto:mjsatterwhite@aep.com)  [yalami@aep.com](mailto:yalami@aep.com)  Attorneys for Ohio Power Company |
| Trent A. Dougherty  Ohio Environmental Council  1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  Columbus, Ohio 43212  [trent@theoeg.org](mailto:trent@theoeg.org)  Attorney for Ohio Environmental Council | Todd M. Williams  Williams Allwein & Moser, LLC  Two Maritime Plaza, 3rd Floor  Toledo, Ohio 43604  [toddm@wamenergylaw.com](mailto:toddm@wamenergylaw.com)  Attorney for Advanced Energy Economy Ohio |
| Thomas R. Hays  7107 Cannons Park Road  Toledo, Ohio 43617  [trhayslaw@gmail.com](mailto:trhayslaw@gmail.com)  Attorney for Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition | Glenn S. Krassen  Matthew W. Warnock  J. Thomas Siwo  Bricker & Eckler LLP  100 South Third Street  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [gkrassen@bricker.com](mailto:gkrassen@bricker.com)  [mwarnock@bricker.com](mailto:mwarnock@bricker.com)  [tsiwo@bricker.com](mailto:tsiwo@bricker.com)  Attorney for Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council |
| Judi Sobecki  Joseph Strines  The Dayton Power and Light Company  1065 Woodman Drive  Dayton, Ohio 45432  [judi.sobecki@aes.com](mailto:judi.sobecki@aes.com)  Attorneys for The Dayton Power and Light Company | M. Howard Petricoff  Stephen M. Howard  Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  52 East Gay Street  Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008  [mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  [smhoward@vorys.com](mailto:smhoward@vorys.com)  Attorneys for NRG Energy, Inc. |
| Matthew White  Vincent Parisi  IGS Energy  6100 Emerald Parkway  Dublin, Ohio 43016  [mswhite@igsenergy.com](mailto:mswhite@igsenergy.com)  vparisi@igsenergy.com  Attorney for IGS Energy | Gregory Poulos  EnerNOC, Inc.  471 East Broad Street, Suite 1520  New Albany, Ohio 43215  [gpoulos@enernoc.com](mailto:gpoulos@enernoc.com)  Attorney for EnerNOC, Inc. |
| M. Howard Petricoff  Stephen M. Howard  Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  52 East Gay Street  Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008  [mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)  [smhoward@vorys.Com](mailto:smhoward@vorys.Com)  Attorneys for the Retail Energy Supply Association | Joseph Patrick Meissner  Law Firm of Meissner and Associates  5400 Detroit Avenue  Cleveland, Ohio 44102  [meissnerjoseph@yahoo.com](mailto:meissnerjoseph@yahoo.com)  Attorney for The Citizens Coalition |
| Michael R. Smalz  Joseph V. Maskovyak  Ohio Poverty Law Center  555 Buttles Avenue  Columbus, Ohio 43215-1137  [msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org](mailto:msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org)  [jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org](mailto:jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org)  Attorneys for Ohio Poverty Law Center | Ellis Jacobs  Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc.  130 West Second Street, Suite 700 East  Dayton, Ohio 45402  [ejacobs@ablelaw.org](mailto:ejacobs@ablelaw.org)  Attorney for the Edgemont Neighborhood  Coalition |
| Nicholas A. McDaniel  Environmental Law and Policy Center  1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  Columbus, Ohio 43212  [NMcDaniel@elpc.org](mailto:NMcDaniel@elpc.org)  Attorney for ELPC | Michael A. Walters  Pro Seniors, Inc.  7162 Reading Road  Suite 1150  Cincinnati, OH 45237  [mwalters@proseniors.org](mailto:mwalters@proseniors.org) |
| Noel Morgan  Legal Aid of Southwest Ohio, LLC  215 East Ninth Street, Suite 500  Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  [nmorgan@lascinti.org](mailto:nmorgan@lascinti.org)  Attorney for Communities United for Action | Scott Torguson  Legal Aid Society of Columbus  1108 City Park Avenue  Columbus, Ohio 43206  [storguson@columbuslegalaid.org](mailto:storguson@columbuslegalaid.org)  Attorney for Legal Aid Society of Columbus |
| William Sundermeyer  Associate State Director, Advocacy  AARP Ohio  17 S. High Street, #800  Columbus, OH 43215  [wsundermeyer@aarp.org](mailto:wsundermeyer@aarp.org) | Craig G. Goodman, Esq.  President  Stacey Rantala  Director, Regulatory Services  National Energy Marketers Association  3333 K Street, NW, Suite 110  Washington, DC 20007  [cgoodman@energymarketers.com](mailto:cgoodman@energymarketers.com)  [srantala@energymarketers.com](mailto:srantala@energymarketers.com) |
| Jay L. Kooper  Hess Corporation  One Hess Plaza  Woodbridge, NJ 07095  [jkooper@hess.com](mailto:jkooper@hess.com)  Attorney for Hess Corporation | Mark Brooks  Utility Works Union of America  521 Central Avenue  Nashville, TN 37211  [markbrooks@uwua.net](mailto:markbrooks@uwua.net)  Attorney for UWUA |
| Samuel C. Randazzo  Frank P. Darr  Matthew R. Pritchard  McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  21 E. State Street, 17th Floor  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [Sam@mwncmh.com](mailto:Sam@mwncmh.com)  [fdarr@mwncmh.com](mailto:fdarr@mwncmh.com)  [mpritchard@mwncmh.com](mailto:mpritchard@mwncmh.com)  Attorney for Industrial Energy Users of Ohio | James W. Burk  Carrie M. Dunn  FirstEnergy Service Company  76 S. Main Street  Akron, Ohio 44308  [burkj@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:burkj@firstenergycorp.com)  [cdunn@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:cdunn@firstenergycorp.com)  Attorney for FirstEnergy Service Company |
| Peggy Lee  Robert Johns  Southeastern Ohio Legal Services  964 East State Street  Athens, OH 45701  [plee@oslsa.org](mailto:plee@oslsa.org)  [rjohns@oslsa.org](mailto:rjohns@oslsa.org) | Gary Benjamin  Community Legal Aid Services, Inc.  50 South Main Street, Suite 800  Akron, OH 43308  [gbenjamin@communitylegalaid.org](mailto:gbenjamin@communitylegalaid.org) |
| Julie Robie  Anne Reese  The Legal Aid Society of Cleveland  1223 West Sixth Street  Cleveland, OH 44113  [Julie.robie@lasclev.org](mailto:Julie.robie@lasclev.org)  [Anne.reese@lasclev.org](mailto:Anne.reese@lasclev.org) | Amy B. Spiller  Jeanne W. Kingery  Duke Energy Business Services LLC  139 East Fourth Street  Cincinnati, OH 45202  Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com  Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com  Attorneys for Duke Energy Retail Sales, LLC |
| Mark A. Hayden  Scott J. Casto  FirstEnergy Service Company  76 South Main Street  Akron, OH 44308  [haydenm@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:haydenm@firstenergycorp.com)  [scasto@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:scasto@firstenergycorp.com)  Attorneys for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. | Michael K. Lavanga  Brickfield Burchette Ritts & Stone, PC  1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, NW  Eighth Floor, West Tower  Washington D.C. 20007  [mkl@bbrslaw.com](mailto:mkl@bbrslaw.com)  Attorney for Nucor Steel Marian, Inc. |
| Gary A. Jeffries  Assistant General Counsel  Dominion Resources Services, Inc.  501 Martindale Street  Suite 400  Pittsburgh, PA 15212  [Gary.a.jeffries@dom.com](mailto:Gary.a.jeffries@dom.com) | Kimberly W. Bojko  Mallory M. Mohler  Carpenter, Lipps, & Leland, LLP  280 North High St., Suite 1300  Columbus, OH 43215  [Bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:Bojko@carpenterlipps.com)  [Mohler@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:Mohler@carpenterlipps.com)  Attorneys for OMA Energy Group |
| Gretchen L. Petrucci  Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  52 E. Gay Street  Columbus, OH 43215  [glpetrucci@vorys.com](mailto:glpetrucci@vorys.com)  Attorney for Direct Energy Services LLC and Direct Energy Business LLC | Barth E. Royer  Bell & Royer Co., LPA  33 South Grant Avenue  Columbus, Ohio 43215  [barthroyer@aol.com](mailto:barthroyer@aol.com)  Attorney for Dominion Retail, Inc. |