Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Ohio Power Company for Approval ) Case No. 12-1126-EL-UNC

of an Amendment to Its Corporate )

Separation Plan )

)

**Industrial Energy Users-Ohio’s objections to Ohio Power Company's Application to Amend its Corporate Separation Plan**

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

October 29, 2013 Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Ohio Power Company for Approval ) Case No. 12-1126-EL-UNC

of an Amendment to Its Corporate )

Separation Plan )

)

**Industrial Energy Users-Ohio’s objections to Ohio Power Company's Application to Amend its Corporate Separation Plan**

# Introduction

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) should deny Ohio Power Company's (“AEP-Ohio’s”) request to residually encumber AEP-Ohio with undisclosed liabilities and obligations associated with its purchase power agreement with the Ohio Valley Electric Company (“OVEC”). Without assurances that AEP-Ohio will not seek to recover from customers the cost associated with its OVEC obligations and liabilities, the Commission cannot approve AEP-Ohio’s request.

# Background

On March 30, 2012, AEP-Ohio filed an Application for Approval of Full Legal Corporate Separation and Amendment to its Corporate Separation Plan (hereinafter “Application for Full Structural Separation”). The Application for Full Structural Separation requested authority to transfer AEP-Ohio’s generating assets and purchase power contract entitlements. The Commission approved AEP-Ohio’s Application for Full Structural Separation on October 17, 2012.[[1]](#footnote-1) The currently approved corporate separation plan indicates that AEP-Ohio is scheduled to transfer its generating assets and purchase power contracts to a non-regulated affiliate (AEP Generation Resources or “Genco”) by December 31, 2013.[[2]](#footnote-2)

Over one year later, and approximately two months before AEP-Ohio was scheduled to transfer all of its generating assets and any purchase power contracts, AEP-Ohio filed an application seeking Commission approval to materially modify its approved corporate separation plan (hereinafter “OVEC Application”). The modifications AEP-Ohio seeks would allow AEP-Ohio to remain a party to a power contract, the Amended and Restated Inter-Company Power Agreement (hereinafter the “ICPA”), with OVEC. AEP-Ohio claims that it is unable to transfer its contractual entitlement to the ICPA to Genco because the owners of OVEC have not provided their required consent.[[3]](#footnote-3) Therefore, AEP-Ohio proposes to leave the ICPA in place “with AEP Ohio continuing to take generation under the contract.”[[4]](#footnote-4)  Alternatively, and in the event the Commission does not agree with AEP-Ohio’s requested modification to its corporate separation plan, AEP-Ohio asserts that it will “transfer its [ICPA] interests to the AEP Genco while remaining liable for obligations under the contract in the event of default by AEP Genco.”[[5]](#footnote-5) AEP-Ohio claims that no further Commission approval is required to transfer the contractual entitlement to Genco while encumbering AEP-Ohio with liability for any obligations.[[6]](#footnote-6)

AEP-Ohio states that it currently plans to liquidate the power obtained under the ICPA into the PJM Interconnection LLC market. Therefore, AEP-Ohio suggests that the rate related issues associated with retention of the ICPA be deferred and addressed when the Commission considers AEP-Ohio’s next electric security plan (“ESP”).[[7]](#footnote-7)

# Objections

Industrial Energy Users-Ohio (“IEU-Ohio”) objects to AEP-Ohio’s request to residually encumber AEP-Ohio with obligations and liabilities associated with the ICPA. AEP-Ohio’s request is not just, reasonable, and in the public interest because AEP-Ohio has failed to demonstrate that retention of the ICPA entitlement will not negatively impact Ohio customers.

The Corporate Separation Order requires AEP-Ohio to transfer its owned generation assets and any power purchase contract entitlements to a non-regulated affiliate. The Corporate Separation Order also requires that “[g]eneration-related costs associated with implementing corporate separation shall not be recoverable from [Ohio Power] customers.”[[8]](#footnote-8)

AEP-Ohio’s requested modification to its corporate separation plan would create the possibility that AEP-Ohio may seek to recover from its customers the cost associated with the ICPA obligations and liabilities. AEP-Ohio has indicated that it may seek such cost recovery from customers in its next ESP filing—“the Company will address OVEC rate issues for the period following May 2015 in its upcoming *ESP III* filing.”[[9]](#footnote-9) The Commission should avoid this outcome as it is not just, reasonable, or in the public interest.

If the Commission approves AEP-Ohio’s requested modification to its corporate separation plan and allows AEP-Ohio to retain its ICPA contractual entitlement, IEU-Ohio recommends the Commission condition its approval upon a commitment by AEP-Ohio that it will not seek recovery of any ICPA-related costs from customers.

AEP-Ohio also claims that paragraph 32(c) of the Corporate Separation Order authorizes it to transfer the ICPA to Genco but leave the obligations and liabilities with AEP-Ohio.[[10]](#footnote-10) It mischaracterizes paragraph 32(c). The Corporate Separation Order provides that contractual obligations that cannot be transferred to an affiliate may be retained by AEP-Ohio, but only “**to the extent that [Genco] be made contractually responsible to OP for all costs resulting from such generation related liabilities**.”[[11]](#footnote-11) Thus, under the Corporate Separation Order, Genco is responsible for any generation-related costs that remain with AEP-Ohio.

The Commission dealt with a similar issue when it directed AEP-Ohio and Genco to enter into an intercompany note to hold AEP-Ohio customers harmless from costs associated with Pollution Control Revenue Bonds, stating:

[T]he Commission approves AEP-Ohio's requests to retain the pollution control bonds contingent upon a filing with the Commission demonstrating that AEP-Ohio ratepayers have not and will not incur any costs associated with the cost of servicing the associated debt. More specifically, AEP-Ohio ratepayers shall be held harmless for the cost of the pollution control bonds, as well as any other generation or generation related debt or inter-company notes retained by AEP-Ohio.[[12]](#footnote-12)

Additionally, AEP-Ohio indicated that its parent company, American Electric Power Company (“AEP”), has “offered to issue a parent company guarantee in support of [Genco’s] obligations under the ICPA.”[[13]](#footnote-13) AEP-Ohio’s parent company, AEP, could easily provide a parental guarantee to absorb any liability that would otherwise attach to AEP-Ohio in the event that Genco defaults on its obligations under the ICPA.

Moreover, AEP-Ohio is currently in the process of restructuring the Interconnection Agreement (AEP East Pool) that exists between the AEP operating companies.[[14]](#footnote-14) The Commission should urge AEP-Ohio to pursue other options such as transfer of the OVEC contractual entitlement and obligations to another operating company.

# conclusion

For the reasons stated herein, IEU-Ohio objects to the OVEC Application’s proposal to residually encumber AEP-Ohio with undisclosed obligations and liabilities associated with the ICPA. If the Commission approves the OVEC Application, it must condition such approval upon AEP-Ohio’s commitment that it will not seek recovery of any ICPA-related liability or obligation from customers during the term of the current or a future standard service offer.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph E. Oliker

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

#### Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Industrial Energy Users-Ohio’s Objections to Ohio Power Company's Application to Amend its Corporate Separation Plan* was served upon the following parties of record this 29th day of October 2013, *via* electronic transmission, hand-delivery or first class U.S. mail, postage prepaid.

/s/ Joseph E. Oliker

Joseph E. Oliker

Steven T. Nourse

Matthew J. Satterwhite

American Electric Power Service Corporation

1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

stnourse@aep.com

mjsatterwhite@aep.com

**Counsel for Ohio Power Company**

Maureen R. Grady, Counsel of Record

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, OH 43215-3485

grady@occ.state.oh.us

**Counsel for Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**

Amy B. Spiller, Counsel of Record

Deputy General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery

Associate General Counsel

139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main

PO Box 961

Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960

Amy.Spiller@duker-energy.com

Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com

**Counsel for Duke Energy Retail Sales, LLC and Duke Energy Commercial Asset Management, Inc.**

Mark A. Hayden

FirstEnergy Service Company

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang

N. Trevor Alexander

Calfee, Halter & Griswold, LLP

1400 KeyBank Center

800 Superior Ave.

Cleveland, OH 44114

jlang@calfee.com

talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik

Allison E. Haedt

Jones Day

901 Lakeside Avenue

Cleveland, OH 44114

dakutik@jonesday.com

aehaedt@jonesday.com

**Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.**

Robert A. McMahon, Counsel of Record

Eberly McMahon LLC

2321 Kemper Lane, Suite 100

Cincinnati, OH 45206

BMcMahon@emh-law.com

Rocco D’Ascenzo

Associate General Counsel

Elizabeth Watts

Associate General Counsel

139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Elizabeth.Watts@duke-energy.com

Rocco.D’Ascenzo@duke-energy.com

**Counsel for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.**

Michael L. Kurtz

David F. Boehm

Jody Kyler Cohn

Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry

36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510

Cincinnati, OH 45202

dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com

mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com

jklyercohn@BKLlawfirm.com

**Counsel for Ohio Energy Group**

Joseph M. Clark

Direct Energy

21 East State Street, Suite 1900

Columbus, OH 43215

Joseph.Clark@directenergy.com

**Counsel for Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC**

Kurt P. Helfrich

Ann B. Zallocco

Thompson Hine LLP

41 South High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215-6101

Kurt.Helfrich@ThompsonHine.com

Ann.Zallocco@ThompsonHine.com

**Counsel for Buckeye Power, Inc.**

Kimberly W. Bojko

Rebecca L. Hussey

Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP

280 North High Street, Suite 1300

Columbus, OH 43215

Bojko@carpenterlipps.com

hussey@carpenterlipps.com

**Counsel for The OMA Energy Group**

Richard L. Sites

General Counsel & Senior Director of Health Policy

Ohio Hospital Association

155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3620

ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O’Brien

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

tobrien@bricker.com

**Counsel for The Ohio Hospital Association**

M. Howard Petricoff

Stephen M. Howard

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street

PO Box 1008

Columbus OH 43216-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

smhoward@vorys.com

Stephen Bennett

Retail Policy Manager

Exelon Generation Company, LLC

300 Exelon Way

Kennett Square, PA 19348

Stephen.bennett@exeloncorp.com

David M. Stahl

Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP

224 S. Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100

Chicago, IL 60604

dstahl@eimerstahl.com

David I. Fein

Vice President, State Government Affairs-East

Exelon Corporation

550 West Washington, Blvd., Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

david.fein@constellation.com

Cynthia Brady

Senior Counsel

Constellation Energy Resources, LLC

550 West Washington, Blvd., Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

cynthia.brady@constellation.com

**Counsel for Exelon Generation Company, LLC and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.**

Mark S. Yurick, Counsel of Record

Zachary D. Kravitz

Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP

65 East State Street, Suite 1000

Columbus, OH 43215

myurick@taftlaw.com

zkravitz@taftlaw.com

**Counsel for The Kroger Co.**

John H. Jones

Assistant Attorney General

Assistant Section Chief, Public Utilities Section

180 E. Broad Street, 6th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3793

john.jones@puc.state.oh.us

**Counsel for the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

Sarah Parrot

Greta See

Attorney Examiners

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Sarah.Parrot@puc.state.oh.us

Greta.See@puc.state.oh.us

**Attorney Examiners**

1. *In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Approval of an Amendment to its Corporate Separation Plan,* Case No. 12-1126-EL-UNC, Finding and Order (hereinafter "Corporate Separation Order") (Oct. 17, 2012). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Corporate Separation Order at 8 (Oct. 17, 2012). *See* OVEC Application at 1 (Oct. 4, 2013). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. OVEC Application at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. *Id.* at 4. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. *Id* at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. *Id* at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. OVEC Application at 5. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Corporate Separation Order at ¶32(f). [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. OVEC Application at 5. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. OVEC Application at 2, 5. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Corporate Separation Order at ¶32(c) (emphasis added). [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. *In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to 4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan*, Case Nos. 11-346-EL-SSO, *et al.*, Opinion and Order at 59 (Aug. 8, 2012); *see also* Corporate Separation Order at 17-18 (Oct. 17, 2012). [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. OVEC Application at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. *See generally* Application for Authorization to Transfer Jurisdictional Assets Under Section 203 of the Federal Power Act of American Electric Power Service Corporation, FERC Docket Nos. EC 13-26, *et al*. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)