



155 East Broad Street
20th Floor
Columbus, Ohio, 43215

o: 614-222-1334
f: 614-222-1337

January 18, 2017

Ms. Barcy F. McNeal, Secretary
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 11th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Re: *In the Matter of the Application OF Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., Concerning its Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Programs and Portfolio Planning*, Case No.16-576-EL-POR

Dear Ms. McNeal:

Pursuant to a request from the Attorney Examiner in the above-captioned proceeding, Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (Duke Energy Ohio) is providing copies of Staff's data request and the Company's responses to date.

Provided attached is Staff's Data Request No.1, and the Company's three responses to that request. Please note that the second and third response were provided in response to informal requests. In the follow up to initial production, Staff requested that the Company provide the actual documents referenced in the initial response. Thereafter, in a second follow up, Staff requested that the Company circle the relevant number on the spreadsheets provided. In that case, instead of circling numbers, the Company extracted the numbers from the documents and provided a chart.

In a conversation with Staff subsequent to this morning's teleconference with all parties, Staff clarified its current request. The Company understood that the Staff is requesting projections for years 2009 through 2012, during which the Company's energy efficiency cost recovery mechanism was called save-a-watt. Pursuant to this cost recovery mechanism, the Company did not provide projections, so there are no projections to provide.

Additionally, Staff requested more legible spreadsheets for review, however, on January 11, 2017, live Excel spreadsheets for each of the attachments created by Mr. Ziolkowski in each of the Company's relevant cases were provided to Staff. Please see email attached.

Accordingly, at this time the Company does not believe there is anything further to provide. Please let me know if there are any questions.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Elizabeth H. Watts

Amy B. Spiller
Deputy General Counsel
Elizabeth H. Watts
Associate General Counsel
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.
139 E. Fourth Street
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was delivered by U.S. mail (postage prepaid), personal delivery, or electronic mail, on this 18th day of January, 2017, to the following parties.

/s/ Elizabeth H. Watts

Elizabeth H. Watts

Bojko@carpenterlipps.com Ghiloni@carpenterlipps.com paul@carpenterlipps.com mfleisher@elpc.org fdarr@mwncmh.com mpritchard@mwncmh.com joliker@igsenergy.com Natalia.Messenger@ohioattorneygeneral.gov John.Jones@ohioattorneygeneral.gov Christopher.Healey@occ.ohio.gov	cmooney@ohiopartners.org tdougherty@theOEC.org jfinnigan@edf.org rick.sites@ohiohospitals.org mwarnock@bricker.com dborchers@bricker.com Dstinson@bricker.com
--	--

Duke Energy Ohio
Case No. 16-0576-EL-POR
Staff First Set Data Requests
Date Received: December 23, 2016

STAFF-DR-01-001

REQUEST:

Please provide the following information individually for each EE/PDR program year, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014, and 2015:

- a. Projected program costs (\$), as proposed in the applicable portfolio plan
- b. Projected energy savings (MWHs), as proposed in the applicable portfolio plan
- c. Actual program costs (\$) incurred, not including shared savings or lost distribution revenue
- d. Actual energy savings achieved (MWHs) through administration of the applicable portfolio plan
- e. Actual energy savings counted by Duke toward meeting the energy efficiency mandates through administration of programs outside of the applicable portfolio plan (such as the historic mercantile exemption program, and any other applicable programs)

Please provide the requested information for each program year, individually. Do not provide cumulative numbers. If reference must be made to other documents, please be specific in any such reference, identifying where to locate the document and the specific page and line in which the information is located.

RESPONSE:

- a. See Attachment JEZ 1 – Rate Calculations -Program Summary for each case:

Year	Case Number
2011	Case No. 12-1857-EL-RDR
2012	Case No. 13-753-EL-RDR
2013	Case No. 14-457-EL-RDR
2014	Case No. 15-534-EL-RDR
2015	Case No. 16-664-EL-RDR

- b. See Attachment JEZ 1 – Rate Calculations -Program Summary for each case:

Year	Case Number
2011	Case No. 12-1857-EL-RDR
2012	Case No. 13-753-EL-RDR
2013	Case No. 14-457-EL-RDR
2014	Case No. 15-534-EL-RDR
2015	Case No. 16-664-EL-RDR

- c. See Attachment JEZ 1 – Rate Calculations -Program Summary Actual for each case:

Year	Case Number
2011	Case No. 12-1857-EL-RDR
2012	Case No. 13-753-EL-RDR
2013	Case No. 14-457-EL-RDR
2014	Case No. 15-534-EL-RDR
2015	Case No. 16-664-EL-RDR

- d. See Attachment JEZ 1 – Rate Calculations -Program Summary Actual for each case:

Year	Case Number
2011	Case No. 12-1857-EL-RDR
2012	Case No. 13-753-EL-RDR
2013	Case No. 14-457-EL-RDR
2014	Case No. 15-534-EL-RDR
2015	Case No. 16-664-EL-RDR

- e. See Table 3 in the following cases for the impacts achieved annually.

Year	Case Number
2011	Case No. 12-1477-EL-EEC
2012	Case No. 13-1129-EL-EEC
2013	Case No. 14-456-EL-EEC
2014	Case No. 15-454-EL-EEC
2015	Case No. 16-0513-EL-EEC

PERSON RESPONSIBLE: Trisha Haemmerle

Watts, Elizabeth H

From: Watts, Elizabeth H
Sent: Wednesday, January 11, 2017 4:46 PM
To: 'kristin.braun@puco.ohio.gov'
Cc: Haemmerle, Trisha Ann; Duff, Tim; Ziolkowski, Jim; Kuhnell, Dianne B
Subject: FW: 16-576-EL-POR Duke Energy Ohio's response to Staff DR No. 1
Attachments: Case No. 16-664 JEZ-1 Rate Calculations.xlsx; Case No. 13-753 JEZ-1 Rate Calculations.xlsx; Case No. 14-457 JEZ-1 Rate Calculations.xlsx; Case No. 15-534 JEZ-1 Rate Calculations.xlsx; Data Request to Duke Energy Ohio 16-576 1.11.17 v2.docx

Kristin:

Attached are the specific documents you requested in Staff's DR. 1. We are not including information for 2009 to 2011 because the Company had an entirely different portfolio recovery mechanism during those years. The mechanism was known as Rider save-a-watt (Rider DR-SAW). SAW had a much different cost recovery mechanism and functioned in a way completely different from the next portfolio that began in 2012.

Rider EE-PDR began in 2012. It was approved in Case No. 11-4393. Hopefully the attached information will provide you with what you need.

Elizabeth

**Duke Energy Ohio
Case No. 16-0576-EL-POR
Staff First Set Data Requests
Date Received: December 23, 2016**

STAFF-DR-01-001 SUPPLEMENTAL

REQUEST:

Please provide the following information individually for each EE/PDR program year, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014, and 2015:

- a. Projected program costs (\$), as proposed in the applicable portfolio plan
- b. Projected energy savings (MWHs), as proposed in the applicable portfolio plan
- c. Actual program costs (\$) incurred, not including shared savings or lost distribution revenue
- d. Actual energy savings achieved (MWHs) through administration of the applicable portfolio plan
- e. Actual energy savings counted by Duke toward meeting the energy efficiency mandates through administration of programs outside of the applicable portfolio plan (such as the historic mercantile exemption program, and any other applicable programs)

Please provide the requested information for each program year, individually. Do not provide cumulative numbers. If reference must be made to other documents, please be specific in any such reference, identifying where to locate the document and the specific page and line in which the information is located.

RESPONSE:

Year	Projected costs:	Actual costs:	Projected kWh:	Actual kWh:
2009 - 2011*	No projections for this timeframe	\$60,811,566	353,396,517	610,807,683
2012	No projections for this timeframe	\$25,147,118	181,877,519	262,436,819
2013	\$25,747,957	\$22,130,677	115,117,713	144,101,736
2014	\$31,528,406	\$30,608,344	115,850,814	152,268,735
2015	\$36,786,357	\$31,531,908	137,756,583	164,010,308

***Projections and actuals were based on a 3 year timeframe. See No. 12-857-EL-RDR**

PERSON RESPONSIBLE: Trisha Haemmerle