Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Ohio Power Company for Approval ) Case No. 12-1126-EL-UNC

of Full Legal Corporate Separation )

and Amendment to Its Corporate )

Separation Plan )

# REPLY OF INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

August 3, 2012 Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Ohio Power Company for Approval ) Case No. 12-1126-EL-UNC

of Full Legal Corporate Separation )

and Amendment to Its Corporate )

Separation Plan )

# REPLY OF INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO

On March 30, 2012, Ohio Power Company (“OP”)[[1]](#footnote-1) filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) an Application for Approval of Full Legal Corporate Separation and Amendment to Its Corporate Separation Plan (“Application”). On July 9, 2012, the Commission issued an Entry requesting that Intervenors submit Objections to the Application.

On July 27, 2012, the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel (“OCC”), FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. (“FES”), Ohio Manufacturers Association Energy Group (“OMAEG”), the Kroger Company (“Kroger”), Commission Staff, and Industrial Energy Users of Ohio (“IEU-Ohio”) submitted Objections. The Objections hold a common theme: The Application fails to provide the information required by the Commission’s rules, where information is provided it conflicts with the statutory and rule requirements, and the Application fails to satisfy the burden of demonstrating that the generating asset transfer is just, reasonable, and in the public interest.

Accordingly, because OP’s Application is substantially inadequate, the Commission should reject it and require OP to refile[[2]](#footnote-2) an application that complies with the statutory requirements and the Commission’s rules. At a minimum, the Commission should require OP to provide the information required by the Commission’s rules and set the Application for hearing.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph E. Oliker

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

#### Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Reply of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio,* was served upon the following parties of record this 3rd day of August, 2012, *via* electronic transmission, hand-delivery or first class U.S. mail, postage prepaid.

/s/ Joseph E. Oliker

Joseph E. Oliker

Steven T. Nourse

Matthew J. Satterwhite

American Electric Power Service Corporation

1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

[stnourse@aep.com](mailto:stnourse@aep.com)

[mjsatterwhite@aep.com](mailto:mjsatterwhite@aep.com)

**Counsel for Ohio Power Company**

Maureen R. Grady, Counsel of Record

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, OH 43215-3485

[grady@occ.state.oh.us](mailto:grady@occ.state.oh.us)

**Counsel for Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**

Amy B. Spiller, Counsel of Record

Deputy General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery

Associate General Counsel

139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main

PO Box 961

Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960

[Amy.Spiller@duker-energy.com](mailto:Amy.Spiller@duker-energy.com)

[Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com](mailto:Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com)

**Counsel for Duke Energy Retail Sales, LLC and Duke Energy Commercial Asset Management, Inc.**

Mark A. Hayden

FirstEnergy Service Company

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

[haydenm@firstenergycorp.com](mailto:haydenm@firstenergycorp.com)

James F. Lang

Laura C. McBride

N. Trevor Alexander (0080713)

Calfee, Halter & Griswold, LLP

1400 KeyBank Center

800 Superior Ave.

Cleveland, OH 44114

[jlang@calfee.com](mailto:jlang@calfee.com)

[lmcbride@calfee.com](mailto:lmcbride@calfee.com)

[talexander@calfee.com](mailto:talexander@calfee.com)

David A. Kutik

Allison E. Haedt

Jones Day

901 Lakeside Avenue

Cleveland, OH 44114

[dakutik@jonesday.com](mailto:dakutik@jonesday.com)

[aehaedt@jonesday.com](mailto:aehaedt@jonesday.com)

**Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.**

Robert A. McMahon, Counsel of Record

Eberly McMahon LLC

2321 Kemper Lane, Suite 100

Cincinnati, OH 45206

[BMcMahon@emh-law.com](mailto:BMcMahon@emh-law.com)

Rocco D’Ascenzo

Associate General Counsel

Elizabeth Watts

Associate General Counsel

139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main

Cincinnati, OH 45202

[Elizabeth.Watts@duke-energy.com](mailto:Amy.Spiller@duker-energy.com)

[Rocco.D’Ascenzo@duke-energy.com](mailto:Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com)

**Counsel for Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.**

Michael L. Kurtz

David F. Boehm

Jody M. Kyler

Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry

36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510

Cincinnati, OH 45202

[dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com)

[mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com](mailto:mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com)

jklyer@BKLlawfirm.com

**Counsel for Ohio Energy Group**

Joseph M. Clark

Manager, Government and Regulatory Affairs

Direct Energy Services, LLC

6641 North High Street, Suite 200

Worthington, OH 43085

Joseph.Clark@directenergy.com

**Counsel for Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC**

Kurt P. Helfrich

Ann B. Zallocco

Thompson Hine LLP

41 South High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215-6101

Kurt.Helfrich@ThompsonHine.com

[Ann.Zallocco@ThompsonHine.com](mailto:jmclark@vectren.com)

**Counsel for Buckeye Power, Inc.**

Lisa G. McAlister, Counsel of Record

Matthew W. Warnock

J. Thomas Siwo

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

lmcalister@bricker.com

mwarnock@bricker.com

tsiwo@bricker.com

**Counsel for The OMA Energy Group**

Richard L. Sites

General Counsel & Senior Director of Health Policy

Ohio Hospital Association

155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3620

ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O’Brien

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

tobrien@bricker.com

**Counsel for The Ohio Hospital Association**

M. Howard Petricoff

Stephen M. Howard

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street

PO Box 1008

Columbus OH 43216-1008

[mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)

[smhoward@vorys.com](mailto:smhoward@vorys.com)

Stephen Bennett

Retail Policy Manager

Exelon Generation Company, LLC

300 Exelon Way

Kennett Square, PA 19348

Stephen.bennett@exeloncorp.com

David M. Stahl

Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP

224 S. Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100

Chicago, IL 60604

[dstahl@eimerstahl.com](mailto:dstahl@eimerstahl.com)

David I. Fein

Vice President, State Government Affairs-East

Exelon Corporation

550 West Washington, Blvd., Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

david.fein@constellation.com

Cynthia Brady

Senior Counsel

Constellation Energy Resources, LLC

550 West Washington, Blvd., Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

cynthia.brady@constellation.com

**Counsel for Exelon Generation Company, LLC and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.**

Mark S. Yurick

Zachary D. Kravitz

Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP

65 East State Street, Suite 1000

Columbus, OH 43215

myurick@taftlaw.com

zkravitz@taftlaw.com

**Counsel for The Kroger Co.**

William Wright

Assistant Attorney General

Chief, Public Utilities Section

180 E. Broad Street, 6th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3793

[william.wright@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:william.wright@puc.state.oh.us)

**Counsel for the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

Sarah Parrot

Attorney Examiner

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

[Sarah.Parrot@puc.state.oh.us](mailto:Sarah.Parrot@puc.state.oh.us)

**Attorney Examiner**

1. As a result of a merger, OP includes the operations of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company (“CSP”) which are presently separate divisions within the OP structure. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Section 4928.17(B), Revised Code. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)