**Before**

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Ohio Power Company to Establish ) Case No. 12-3254-EL-UNC

a Competitive Bidding Process for )

Procurement of Energy to Support its )

Standard Service Offer )

**INITIAL COMMENTS OF INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO**

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

 Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

**March 4, 2013** **Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio**

**Before**

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Ohio Power Company to Establish ) Case No. 12-3254-EL-UNC

a Competitive Bidding Process for )

Procurement of Energy to Support its )

Standard Service Offer )

**INITIAL COMMENTS OF INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO**

# Introduction

Ohio Power Company (“AEP-Ohio”) proposes an auction format described as a descending clock auction with multiple rounds in which the bidders in each round will state the number of tranches that they are willing to bid for each product in the auction, and that price decrements for each subsequent round will be provided to the bidders prior to the auction. Additionally, AEP-Ohio has proposed to unbundle the Fuel Adjustment Clause (“FAC”). Absent from the summary of the auction process is any indication of a price limit or reserve that governs the opening level of bidding. Because the structure of the proposed auction could lead to increased Standard Service Offer (“SSO”) rates, the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) should adopt modifications to the auction to require an opening bid price cap.

# Need for an opening bid Price Cap

As was apparent in the modified electric security plan (“ESP II”) hearings and the materials provided by AEP-Ohio for the first meeting concerning the design of the competitive bidding process (“CBP”), AEP-Ohio indicated it plans to flow the costs of the energy-only bid through the FAC and make no other changes to base SSO rates for distribution, transmission and generation. It subsequently proposed to unbundle the FAC into fixed/non-energy and variable/energy rate components.[[1]](#footnote-1) Regardless of the design, the only way that the limited energy-only SSO bid will not require an overall price increase to SSO customers is if the cleared bid price is lower than AEP-Ohio’s expected FAC rate. Without such a limit or reserve price cap set at the projected FAC rates, the auction may produce results that increase the price of the SSO that is authorized in the *AEP-Ohio* *ESP II Order*.[[2]](#footnote-2)

AEP-Ohio’s recent proposal to unbundle the FAC does not appear to have any customer benefits. AEP-Ohio does not provide any rationale to support its unbundling proposal other than to point out that the current FAC contains both energy and non-energy costs. The effect of its recommendation, however, is clear. AEP-Ohio seeks to require non-shopping customers to continue to pay for what AEP-Ohio claims are non-energy costs embedded in the current FAC. Although they will be receiving a portion of their energy from the CBP, the non-shopping customers will continue to be responsible for all non-energy costs currently embedded in the FAC. Directionally, AEP-Ohio’s recommendation will increase the likelihood that the blended price will not reduce the SSO rates produced by the CBP.

In light of the concerns raised above, Industrial Energy Users-Ohio (“IEU-Ohio”) recommends that the opening round bid price be set at a level no higher than the average expected FAC rate over the term of the product being bid upon.

# Conclusion

According to the Commission, the move to a CBP would prove “invaluable.”[[3]](#footnote-3) Unless the Commission takes action to set a proper opening bid price cap, the results of the auction could result in further rate increases to non-shopping customers. The “invaluable benefits” of a faster move to an auction based SSO will be lost on those customers who will pay the higher toll.

Respectfully submitted,

 s/ Frank P. Darr

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

 Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Initial Comments of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio* was served upon the following parties of record this 4th day of March, 2013 *via* hand-delivery, electronic transmission, or first class mail, U.S. postage prepaid.

 /s/ Frank P. Darr

 Frank P. Darr

Steven T. Nourse

American Electric Power Service Corporation

1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

stnourse@aep.com

**On Behalf of Ohio Power Company**

Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.

Kurt J. Boehm Esq.

Jody Kyler Cohn, Esq.

Boehn, Kurtz & Lowry

36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510

Cincinnati, OH 45202

dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com

mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com

jkyler@BKLlawfirm.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Energy Group**

Mark A. Hayden

FirstEnergy Service Company

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang

Laura C. McBride

N. Trevor Alexander

Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP

The Calfee Building

1405 East Sixth Street

Cleveland, OH 44114

jlang@calfee.com

lmcbride@calfee.com

talexander@calfee.com

**On Behalf of FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.**

M. Howard Petricoff

Stephen M. Howard

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay Street

Columbus, OH 43215

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

smhoward@vorys.com

David I. Fein

Vice President, State Government Affairs-East

Exelon Corporation

550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

David.Fein@Constellation.com

Cynthia Brady

Assistant General Counsel

Exelon Business Services Company

4300 Winfield Road

Warrenville, IL 60555

Cynthia.Brady@Constellation.com

**On Behalf of Exelon Generation Company, LLC and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.**

Bruce J. Weston

Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

Maureen R. Grady

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, OH 43215-3485

grady@occ.state.oh.us

**On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**

Sarah Parrot

Jonathan Tauber

Attorney Examiners

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

**Attorney Examiners**

1. Supplement to Application at 3 (Feb. 11, 2012). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. *In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan*, Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO, *et al*., Opinion and Order (Aug. 8, 2012) (*“AEP-Ohio* *ESP II Order”*). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. *In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan*, Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO, *et al*., Entry on Rehearing at 11 (Jan. 30, 2013). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)