**Before**

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Columbus Southern Power Company and )

Ohio Power Company for Authority to ) Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO

Establish a Standard Service Offer ) Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO

Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, )

in the Form of an Electric Security Plan. )

In the Matter of the Application of )

Columbus Southern Power Company and ) Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM

Ohio Power Company for Approval of ) Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM

Certain Accounting Authority. )

**INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO’S**

**MEMORANDUM CONTRA OHIO POWER COMPANY’S MOTION TO STRIKE**

Samuel C. Randazzo, Esq.

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Telephone: 614-469-8000

Telecopier: 614-469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

**May 16, 2012 Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio**

**Before**

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Columbus Southern Power Company and )

Ohio Power Company for Authority to ) Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO

Establish a Standard Service Offer ) Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO

Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, )

in the Form of an Electric Security Plan. )

In the Matter of the Application of )

Columbus Southern Power Company and ) Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM

Ohio Power Company for Approval of ) Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM

Certain Accounting Authority. )

**INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO’S MEMORANDUM CONTRA**

**OHIO POWER COMPANY’S MOTION TO STRIKE**

**I. INTRODUCTION**

On May 4, 2012, Industrial Energy Users-Ohio (“IEU-Ohio”) submitted the pre-filed testimony of Kevin M. Murray and Joseph G. Bowser. On May 11, 2012, Ohio Power Company (“OP”) moved to strike portions of both of these witnesses’ pre-filed direct testimony. Because OP’s Motion to Strike is without merit, it should be denied.

**II. ARGUMENT**

**A. Witness Murray’s Testimony on the Effects of a Competitive Bidding Process for Standard Service Offer Service Starting June 1, 2015, is Relevant Because OP Has Raised the Issue in This Proceeding Claiming that its Early Transition to a Competitive Bid Process in June 2015 is a Benefit of its Modified Electric Security Plan**

 All of witness Murray’s testimony that OP seeks to strike relates to his analysis of the likely results of a competitive bidding process (“CBP”) auction for service starting June 1, 2015. OP claims that portions of Kevin Murray’s testimony should be stricken because his analysis goes beyond the term of OP’s proposed Modified Electric Security Plan (“ESP”). OP, however, ignores the fact that it has placed this very issue in front of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) in this proceeding, requesting approval to set rates through a CBP at the end of the ESP. Furthermore, OP claims that the early transition to a CBP is a benefit of the Modified ESP proposal. OP witness Dias claims the CBP that will occur after the proposed ESP ends is an example of why OP’s Modified ESP Application satisfies the State Policy objectives contained in 4928.02, Revised Code.[[1]](#footnote-1) OP cannot have it both ways: OP cannot claim that an early transition to a full CBP (for both energy and capacity) is relevant as a benefit of the Modified ESP, and then seek to strike testimony that addresses the potential benefit (or cost) of the transition to a full CBP on grounds of relevancy. So long as OP’s Application requests approval to set rates at the end of the ESP through a CBP, and claims this transition as a benefit of its Modified ESP, intervening parties have a right to present evidence evaluating OP’s claim.

**B. Witness Bowser’s Testimony Regarding the Phase-In Recovery Rider Is Relevant to This Proceeding Because OP has Proposed the Rider as Part of its Modified ESP**

 Without merit, OP seeks to strike portions of witness Bowser’s testimony on grounds that the Phase-In Recovery Rider (“PIRR”) is not relevant to this proceeding. But testimony regarding the PIRR is relevant to this proceeding because OP included explicit terms and conditions related to the PIRR in its Modified ESP Application.

The Commission previously determined that the issues related to the terms of the PIRR would be addressed in Case Nos. 11-4920-EL-RDR, *et al.*, stating:

[w]hile the Commission's order in the ESP I proceedings permits AEP-Ohio to seek recovery of fuel cost deferrals from 2012 to 2018, it did not establish a rider or other tariff provision for AEP-Ohio to recover deferred fuel costs or set a hard deadline for when recovery shall begin. To the contrary, as FES points out, in the ESP I order, the Commission explicitly provided that any recovery shall occur as necessary, *indicating the Commission would conduct an additional analysis to determine the appropriate recovery of fuel cost expenses incurred plus carrying costs*. AEP-Ohio's mischaracterization of both the language within the March 7 Entry and the ESP I order unravels its other assignments of error, as the Commission cannot violate Sections 4928.144 and 4928.143(C)(2)(b), Revised Code, when the March 7 Entry is entirely consistent with its order in the ESP I proceedings. *Further, AEP-Ohio's arguments that the March 7 Entry failed to order the PIRR to incorporate a weighted average cost of capital carrying charge or permit AEP-Ohio to recover the deferred fuel expense on a gross-of-tax basis should be rejected*, as both arguments are premature and will be addressed in [Case Nos. 11-4920-EL-RDR, *et al*.].[[2]](#footnote-2)

Thus, the Commission has held that terms of the PIRR are yet to be decided. But OP’s Modified ESP Application seeks to set the specific terms of the PIRR in this proceeding. Specifically, OP requests that the Commission delay the implementation of the PIRR until June 1, 2013, continue accrual of carrying charges at full weighted average cost of capital (“WACC”), spread the recovery of the PIRR between OP and Columbus Southern Power Company (“CSP”) customers, and suspend the procedural schedule in Case Nos. 11-4920-EL-RDR, *et al*.[[3]](#footnote-3)

 The Commission can approve an ESP only if it determines that the “electric security plan so approved, including its pricing and all other terms and conditions” is more favorable in the aggregate than an MRO.[[4]](#footnote-4) Because OP has proposed terms for the PIRR as part of its Modified ESP Application the validity of OP’s request must be addressed and accounted for in the ESP v. MRO test. The testimony of Joseph Bowser addresses these very issues.

 Mr. Bowser’s testimony addresses the increased cost to customers that would result from OP’s proposal to delay the implementation of the PIRR and continue to collect carrying costs at full WACC.[[5]](#footnote-5) Mr. Bowser addresses OP’s proposal to spread recovery of the PIRR across OP and CSP customers.[[6]](#footnote-6) Mr. Bowser also addresses open issues regarding the PIRR that OP fails to address, such as accumulated deferred income taxes (“ADIT”) and governmental aggregation. For example, Mr. Bowser addresses the impact of not removing ADIT before calculating carrying charges,[[7]](#footnote-7) as well as the potential impact of any Ohio Supreme Court ruling adverse to OP.[[8]](#footnote-8) Finally, Mr. Bowser’s testimony addresses issues pertaining to government aggregation.

 Putting forward important evidence such that the Commission is able to properly weigh the costs of the ESP in the ESP v. MRO test is a crucial function of the evidentiary hearing in this proceeding and a right possessed by intervenors. Although OP would like to get a free pass to collect carrying charges at a WACC rate (roughly 11.5%) rather than a debt rate (in the range of 3%-5.34%) without an ADIT adjustment and spread the cost to the former CSP customers who did not meaningfully contribute to the deferrals, the fact remains that OP has placed the issue in front of the Commission and intervenors have a right to challenge OP’s position and introduce evidence about the true costs of the ESP.

**III. CONCLUSION**

 For reasons stated herein, the Commission should deny OP’s Motion to Strike.

 Respectfully submitted,

**/s/Joseph Oliker**

Samuel C. Randazzo, Esq.

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Telephone: 614-469-8000

Telecopier: 614-469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

 **Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio**

#### Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Industrial Energy Users-Ohio’s Memorandum Contra Ohio Power Company’s Motion to Strike*, was served upon the following parties of record this 16th day of May 2012, *via* electronic transmission, hand-delivery or first class U.S. mail, postage prepaid.

**/s/ Joseph E. Oliker**

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew J. Satterwhite

Steven T. Nourse

Anne M. Vogel

Yazen Alami

American Electric Power Service Corporation

1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

mjsatterwhite@aep.com

stnourse@aep.com

amvogel@aep.com

yalami@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway

Christen M. Moore

Porter Wright Morris & Arthur

41 S. High Street

Columbus, OH 43215

dconway@porterwright.com

cmoore@porterwright.com

**On Behalf of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company**

Robert A. McMahon

Eberly McMahon LLC

2321 Kemper Lane, Suite 100

Cincinnati, OH 45206

Rocco D’Ascenzo

Elisabeth Watts

Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.

139 East Fourth Street - 1303-Main

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

Rocco.d’ascenzo@duke-energy.com

**On Behalf of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.**

Dorothy K. Corbett

Amy B. Spiller

Jeanne W. Kingery

139 East Fourth Street

1303-Main

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Dorothy.Corbett@duke-energy.com

Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com

Philip B. Sineneng

Thompson Hine LLP

41 S. High Street – Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215

Philip.Sineneng@ThompsonHine.com

**On Behalf of Duke Energy Retail Sales, LLC and Duke Energy Commercial Asset Management, Inc.**

David F. Boehm

Michael L. Kurtz

Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry

36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510

Cincinnati, OH 45202

dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com

mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Energy Group**

Gregory J. Poulos

EnerNOC, Inc.

101 Federal Street, Suite 1100

Boston, MA 02110

gpoulos@enernoc.com

**On Behalf of EnerNOC, Inc.**

Kyle L. Kern

Terry L. Etter

Maureen R. Grady

Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

10 W. Broad Street, 18th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3485

kern@occ.state.oh.us

etter@occ.state.oh.us

grady@occ.state.oh.us

**On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio**

**Consumers’ Counsel**

Richard L. Sites

General Counsel & Senior Director of Health Policy

Ohio Hospital Association

155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3620

ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O’Brien

Bricker & Eckler, LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

tobrien@bricker.com

**Oh Behalf of Ohio Hospital Association**

Mark S. Yurick

Zachary D. Kravitz

Taft Stettinius & Hollister

65 East State Street, Suite 1000

Columbus, OH 43215

myurick@taftlaw.com

zkravitz@taftlaw.com

**On Behalf of The Kroger Co.**

Terrence O’Donnell

Christopher Montgomery

Matthew W. Warnock

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

todonnell@bricker.com

cmontgomery@bricker.com

mwarnock@bricker.com

**On Behalf of Paulding Wind Farm II LLC**

Mark A. Hayden

FirstEnergy Service Company

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F Lang

Laura C. McBride

N. Trevor Alexander

Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP

1400 KeyBank Center

800 Superior Ave.

Cleveland, OH 44114

jlang@calfee.com

lmcbride@calfee.com

talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik

Jones Day

North Point

901 Lakeside Avenue

Cleveland, OH 44114

dakutik@jonesday.com

Allison E. Haedt

Jones Day

P.O. Box 165017

Columbus, OH 43216-5017

aehaedt@jonesday.com

John N. Estes III

Paul F. Wight

Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP

1440 New York Ave., N.W.

Washington, DC 20005

jestes@skadden.com

paul.wight@skadden.com

**On Behalf of FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.**

Michael R. Smalz

Joseph V. Maskovyak

Ohio Poverty Law Center

555 Buttles Avenue

Columbus, OH 43215

msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org

jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

**On Behalf of the Appalachian Peace and Justice Network**

Lisa G. McAlister

J. Thomas Siwo

Thomas O’Brien

BRICKER & ECKLER LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

lmcalister@bricker.com

tsiwo@bricker.com

tobrien@bricker.com

**On Behalf of OMA Energy Group**

Jay E. Jadwin

American Electric Power Service Corporation

1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

jejadwin@aep.com

**On Behalf of AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC**

M. Howard Petricoff

Stephen M. Howard

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay Street

P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43215-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

smhoward@vorys.com

**On Behalf of PJM Power Providers Group and the Retail Energy Supply Association**

Glen Thomas

1060 First Avenue, Ste. 400

King of Prussia, PA 19406

gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Laura Chappelle

4218 Jacob Meadows

Okemos, MI 48864

laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

**On Behalf of PJM Power Providers Group**

M. Howard Petricoff

Michael Settineri

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay Street

P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43215-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

mjsettineri@vorys.com

William L. Massey

Covington & Burling, LLP

1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20004

wmassey@cov.com

Joel Malina

Executive Director

COMPLETE Coalition

1317 F Street, NW

Suite 600

Washington, DC 20004

malina@wexlerwalker.com

**On Behalf of the COMPETE Coalition**

Henry W. Eckhart

1200 Chambers Road, Suite 106

Columbus, OH 43212

henryeckhart@aol.com

Christopher J. Allwein

Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC

1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212

Columbus, OH 43212

callwein@williamsandmoser.com

**On Behalf of the Natural Resources Defense Council and the Sierra Club**

M. Howard Petricoff

Michael J. Settineri

Stephen M. Howard

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street

P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43216-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

mjsettineri@vorys.com

smhoward@vorys.com

**On Behalf of Constellation NewEnergy, Inc., Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc. , Direct Energy Services, LLC**

Gary A Jeffries

Assistant General Counsel

Dominion Resources Services, Inc.

501 Martindale Street, Suite 400

Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817

Gary.A.Jeffries@aol.com

**On Behalf of Dominion Retail, Inc.**

David I. Fein

Vice President, Energy Policy – Midwest

Constellation Energy Group, Inc.

Cynthia Fonner Brady

Senior Counsel

Constellation Energy Resources LLC

550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

david.fein@constellation.com

cynthia.brady@constellation.com

**On Behalf of Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc.**

Jeanine Amid Hummer

Thomas K. Lindsey

 *City of Upper Arlington*

C. Todd Jones,

Christopher L. Miller,

Gregory H. Dunn

Asim Z. Haque

Ice Miller LLC

250 West Street

Columbus, OH 43215

christopher.miller@icemiller.com

gregory.dunn@icemiller.com

asim.haque@icemiller.com

jhummer@uaoh.net

tlindsey@uaoh.net

**On Behalf of the City of Grove City, Ohio and the Association of Independent Colleges and Universities of Ohio, The City of Upper Arlington, The City of Hillsboro, Ohio**

Sandy I-ru Grace

Assistant General Counsel

Exelon Business Services Company

101 Constitution Ave., NW

Suite 400 East

Washington, DC 20001

sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

M. Howard Petricoff

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street/P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43216-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

David M. Stahl

Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP

224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100

Chicago, IL 60604

dstahl@eimerstahl.com

**On Behalf of Exelon Generation Company, LLC**

Kenneth P. Kreider

David A. Meyer

Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL

One East Fourth Street

Suite 1400

Cincinnati, OH 45202

kpkreider@kmklaw.com

dmeyer@kmklaw.com

Holly Rachel Smith

Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC

Hitt Business Center

3803 Rectortown Road

Marshall, VA 20115

holly@raysmithlaw.com

Steve W. Chriss

Manager, State Rate Proceedings

Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.

Bentonville, AR 72716-0550

Stephen.Chriss@wal-mart.com

**On Behalf of Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam’s East, Inc.**

Barth E. Royer (Counsel of Record)

Bell & Royer Co., LPA

33 South Grant Avenue

Columbus, OH 43215-3927

BarthRoyer@aol.com

Tara C. Santarelli

Environmental Law & Policy Center

1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201

Columbus, OH 43212

tsantarelli@elpc.org

**On Behalf of the Environmental Law &**

**Policy Center**

Nolan Moser

Trent A. Dougherty

Camille Yancy

Cathryn Loucas

Ohio Environmental Council

1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus, OH 43212-3449

nolan@theoec.org

trent@theoec.org

camille@theoec.org

cathy@theoec.org.

**On Behalf of the Ohio Environmental Council**

Robert Korandovich

KOREnergy

P.O. Box 148

Sunbury, OH 43074

korenergy@insight.rr.com

**On Behalf of KOREnergy**

Douglas G. Bonner

Emma F. Hand

Keith C. Nusbaum

Clinton A. Vince

Daniel D. Barnowski

James Rubin

Thomas Millar

SNR Denton US LLP

1301 K Street NW

Suite 600, East Tower

Washington, DC 20005

doug.bonner@snrdenton.com

emma.hand@snrdenton.com

keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com

clinton.vince@snrdenton.com

daniel.barnowski@snrdenton.con

james.rubin@snrdenton.com

thomas.millar@snrdenton.com

Arthur Beeman

SNR Denton US LLP

525 Market Street, 26th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94105-2708

arthur.beeman@snrdenton.com

**On Behalf of Ormet Primary Aluminum Corporation**

Jay L. Kooper

Katherine Guerry

Hess Corporation

One Hess Plaza

Woodbridge, NJ 07095

jkooper@hess.com

kguerry@hess.com

**On Behalf of Hess Corporation**

Allen Freifeld

Samuel A. Wolfe

Viridity Energy, Inc.

100 West Elm Street, Suite 410

Conshohocken, PA 19428

afreifeld@viridityenergy.com

swolfe@viridityenergy.com

Jacqueline Lake Roberts,

Counsel of Record

101 Federal Street, Suite 1100

Boston, MA 02110

jroberts@enernoc.com

**On Behalf of CPower, Inc., Viridity Energy, Inc., EnergyConnect Inc., Comverge Inc., Enerwise Global Technologies, Inc., and Energy Curtailment Specialists, Inc.**

Benita Kahn

Lija Kaleps-Clark

Vorys Sater, Seymour and Pease LLC

52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43216-1008

bakahn@vorys.com

lkalepsclark@vorys.com

**On Behalf of Ohio Cable Telecommunications Association**

Mark A. Whitt

Melissa L. Thompson

Whitt Sturtevant LLP

PNC Plaza, Suite 2020

155 East Broad Street

Columbus, OH 43215

whit@whitt-sturtevant.com

thompson@whitt-sturtevant.com

Vincent Parisi

Matthew White

Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

6100 Emerald Parkway

Dublin, OH 43016

vparisi@igsenergy.com

mswhite@igsenergy.com

**On Behalf of Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.**

Dane Stinson

Bailey Cavalieri LLC

10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100

Columbus, OH 43215

**On Behalf of The Ohio Association of School Business Officials, The Ohio School Boards Association, The Ohio Schools Council and The Buckeye Association of School Administrators**

Chad A. Endsley

Chief Legal Counsel

Ohio Farm Bureau Federation

280 North High Street, P.O. Box 182383

Columbus, OH 43218-2383

cendsley@ofbf.org.

**On Behalf of the Ohio Farm Bureau Federation**

Brian P. Barger

Brady, Coyle & Schmidt, LTD

4052 Holland-Sylvania Rd.

Toledo, OH 43623

bpbarger@bcslawyers.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Construction Materials Coalition**

Diem N. Kaelber

Robert J Walter

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1300

Columbus, OH 43215

kaelber@buckleyking.com

walter@buckleyking.com

**On Behalf of Ohio Restaurant Association**

Judi L. Sobecki

Randall V. Griffin

The Dayton Power and Light Company

1065 Woodman Drive

Dayton, OH 45432

Judi.sobecki@dplinc.com

Randall.griffin@dplinc.com

**On Behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company**

Sara Reich Bruce

Ohio Automobile Dealers Association

655 Metro Place South, Suite 270

Dublin, OH 43017

sbruce@oada.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Automobile Dealers Association**

Joseph M. Clark

Direct Energy Services LLC

And Direct Energy Business LLC

6641 North High Street, Suite 200

Worthington, OH 43085

jmclark@vectren.com

**On Behalf of Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC**

Todd M. Williams

Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC

Two Maritime Plaza-Third Floor

Toledo, OH 43604

toddm@wamenergylaw.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Business Council for a Clean Economy**

Matthew R. Cox

Matthew Cox Law, Ltd.

4145 St. Theresa Blvd.

Avon, OH 44011

matt@matthewcoxlaw.com

**On Behalf of the Council of Smaller Enterprises (COSE)**

Carolyn S. Flahive

Stephanie M. Chmiel

THOMPSON HINE LLP

41 S. High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215

Carolyn.Flahive@ThompsonHine.com

Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com

**On Behalf of Border Energy Electric Services, Inc.**

Randy J. Hart

Rob Remington

David J. Michalski

200 Public Square, Suite 2800

Cleveland, OH 44114-2316

rhart@hahnlaw.com

rrremington@hahnlaw.com

djmichalski@hahnlaw.com

**On Behalf of Summit Ethanol, LLC and**

**Fostoria Ethanol, LLC**

Robert Burke

Braith Kelly

Competitive Power Ventures, Inc.

8403 Colesville Road, Ste. 915

Silver Spring, MD 20910

rburke@cpv.com

bkelly@cpv.com

Larry F. Eisenstat

(Counsel of Record)

Richard Lehfeldt

Robert L. Kinder, Jr.

Dickstein Shapiro LLP

1825 Eye St. NW

Washington, DC 20006

eisenstatl@dicksteinshapiro.com

lehfeldtr@dicksteinshapiro.com

kinderr@dicksteinshapiro.com

**On Behalf of CPV Power Development, Inc.**

Robert L. Kinder, Jr.

Dickstein Shapiro LLP

1825 Eye St. NW

Washington, DC 20006

kinder@DicksteinShapiro.com

**On Behalf of CPV Power Development, Inc.**

Jack D’Aurora

The Behal Law Group LLC

501 South High Street

Columbus, OH 43215

jdaurora@behallaw.com

**On Behalf of the University of Toledo**

Roger P. Sugarman

Kegler, Brown, Hill &Ritter

65 East State Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, OH 43215

rsugarman@keglerbrown.com

**On Behalf of NFIB/Ohio**

William Wright

Werner Margard

Thomas Lindgren

John H. Jones

Assistant Attorneys’ General

Public Utilities Section

180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

john.jones@puc.state.oh.us

werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us

thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us

william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

**On Behalf of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

Greta See

Jon Tauber

Attorney Examiner

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

**Attorney Examiners**

1. Direct Testimony of Selwyn J. Dias at 4-5 (March 30, 2012). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. *In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Mechanisms to Recover Deferred Fuel Costs Ordered Under Section 4928.144, Revised Code*, Case Nos. 11-4920-EL-RDR, *et al*., Entry on Rehearing at 5 (April 11, 2012) (emphasis added). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Modified ESP Application at 14-15; Direct Testimony of Selwyn J. Dias at 10. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Section 4928.143(C)(1), Revised Code. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Direct Testimony of Joseph Bowser at 7-8. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Direct Testimony of Joseph Bowser at 17. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. *Id.* at 9, 15-16. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. *Id.* at 9. In its December 14, 2011 Opinion and Order in this proceeding, the Commission held that such issues are relevant to the PIRR, stating:

Finally, the Commission clarifies that prior to securitization of the PIRR, if the Commission or the Court issues a decision that impacts the amount of PIRR regulatory assets, AEP-Ohio shall appropriately adjust the book balance of the PIRR regulatory assets or use a mechanism to make the appropriate adjustment ordered by the Commission or the Court that prospectively adjusts rates through a credit or charge of the PIRR.

Opinion and Order at 59 (Dec. 14, 2011). [↑](#footnote-ref-8)