





∍ **2** 8 2000

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO DOCKETING DIVISION

HIO DOCKETING DIVISION
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

In the Matter of the Application of
FirstEnergy Corp. on Behalf of Ohio
Edison Company, The Cleveland
Electric Illuminating Company, and
the Toledo Edison Company for
Approval of Their Transition Plans
and for Authorization to Collect
Transition Revenues

Case Nos. 99-1212-EL-ETP, 99-1213-EL-ATA, and 99-1214-EL-AAM

## MEMORANDUM OF UWUA INTERVENORS IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE REPLY AND REPLY TO FIRSTENERGY'S MEMORANDUM CONTRA REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATION AND APPROVAL OF INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL

UWUA Intervenors should be granted leave to file a brief reply to FirstEnergy Corp.'s ("FE") April 27, 2000 Memorandum Contra Motion for Certification and Approval of Interlocutory Appeal ("April 27 Memorandum Contra") in order to address a significant change in FE's position and the impact of that change on the resolution of the matters at issue.

UWUA Intervenors seek leave to reply because FE's position as stated in its April 27 Memorandum Contra is markedly different from the position it took in its pleading leading to the April 19 Entry that is the subject of the certification request. UWUA Intervenors have not previously had an opportunity to address FE's current position or its relationship to the matters at issue. Moreover, FE's positional change is significant in that the Company is now taking a position that is in accord with the crux of the argument advanced by UWUA Intervenors.



## **BRIEF REPLY**

UWUA Intervenors have argued throughout this dispute that Section 4928.34(A)(14) of the Ohio Restructuring Code ("ORC") provides that a proposed Transition Plan cannot be approved unless the Commission makes certain findings, including those required under Section 4928.02. That Section sets forth certain State policies, including (in subsection (A)), ensuring the availability of "adequate, safe, reliable, efficient, nondiscriminatory and reasonably priced retail electric service." UWUA Intervenors seek through discovery to develop evidence relevant to this finding.

In its April 3, 2000, Memorandum Contra to UWUA Intervenors' March 21, 2000 motion to compel, FE argued that UWUA Intervenors reading of the statutory provisions was wrong. FE stated that

UWUA's contention that the Commission must make specific findings regarding service adequacy, reliability and safety prerequisite to approval of a transition plan is no more than an attempt to impose requirements beyond those of the statute. The specific findings required for Commission approval are set out expressly in R.C. 4928.34. The Commission has rebuffed an earlier intervenor group attempt to inject new, additional criteria into R.C. 4928.34 over the back of the transition plan processing rules. [citation and footnote omitted]. It should do so again.

April 3 Memorandum Contra at 4.

In its April 27 Memorandum Contra, FE no longer contends that the statute does not require "specific findings service adequacy, reliability and safety prerequisite to approval of a transition plan." Instead, FE now admits that this is precisely what the Ohio Restructuring Code provisions cited by UWUA Intervenors require:

It is true that Section 4928.34(A)(14) says that the Commission must find that the utility is in compliance with Sections 4928.01 to 4928.11 of the Revised Code.

April 27 Memorandum Contra at 3. Nonetheless, FE argues that its own reading of the statutory language -- which is in complete accord with UWUA Intervenors -- should be ignored because "principles of statutory interpretation notwithstanding, it would be impossible for the Commission to make such a finding." *Id.* In support of this position, FE refers to *other* parts of the Restructuring Statute (Sections 4928.01 and 4928.04), noting that it perceives difficulties in making findings under *those* provisions. FE makes no effort to show that it is "impossible for the Commission to make" findings with respect to service safety or reliability. Obviously, it is not impossible for the Commission to do so.

FE's positional turn-about demonstrates that the interlocutory appeal should be certified. There is no dispute about what the Restructuring Statute requires the Commission to do. In essence, FE argues that the certification of the interlocutory appeal should be denied because the Commission can disregard the plain language of the statute. Were the position to be adopted, it would surely constitute the type of a "new or novel" approach that should be considered immediately by the Commission. *See* OAC Rule 4901-1-15(B)(1).

Respectfully submitted,

Scott U Stran

Scott H. Strauss

David B. Lieb

Attorneys for UWUA Intervenors

SPIEGEL & McDiarmid 1350 New York Avenue, NW Suite 1100 Washington, DC 20005-4798 Ph. (202) 879-4000 Fax. (202) 393-2866

April 28, 2000

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have on this 28th day of April, 2000, caused the foregoing document to be sent by first-class mail to all parties on the service list compiled in this proceeding.

David B. Lieb

Arthur E. Korkosz, Esq. Stephen L. Field, Esq. James W. Burke, Esq. FirstEnergy Corp. 75 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308 David F. Boehm, Esq. Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 2110 CBLD Center 36 East Seventh Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

Ellis Jacobs, Esq. 33 West First Street, Suite 500 Dayton, OH 45402 William M. Ondrey Gruber, Esq. 2714 Leighton Road Shaker Heights, OH 44120

Cornell P. Carter, Esq. City of Cleveland, OH 601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 106 Cleveland, OH 44114 Langdon D. Bell, Esq. Bell, Royer & Sanders Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215

Kimberly J. Wile, Esq. McNees, Wallace & Nurick Fifth Third Center 21 East State Street, Suite 1700 Columbus, OH 43215-4228 Kerry Bruce, Esq. Department of Public Utilities 420 Madison Avenue, Suite 100 Toledo, OH 43604-1829 Joseph P. Meissner, Esq. Legal Aid Society of Cleveland 1223 West Sixth Street Cleveland, OH 44113 Beverly E. Jones, Esq. CNG Tower 625 Liberty Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15222-3199

M. Howard Petricoff, Esq. Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street, P. O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008 Craig G. Goodman, Esq. President, National Energy Marketer 333 K Street, N.W., Suite 425 Washington, D.C. 20007

Steven M. Sherman 111 Monument Circle Suite 2200 Indianapolis, IN 46204 Samuel C. Randazzo, Esq. McNees, Wallace & Nurick Fifth Third Center 21 East State Street, Suite 910 Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Gretchen J. Hummel, Esq. McNees, Wallace & Nurick Fifth Third Center 21 East State Street, Suite 1700 Columbus, OH 43215-4228 Sally W. Bloomfield, Esq. Bricker & Eckler, LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 Joelle Kay Ogg, Esq. John & Hengerer 1200 17<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W. Suite 600 Washington, D.C. 20036-3013 David C. Rinebolt, Esq. Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy 337 South Main Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, Suite 5 P. O. Box 1793 Findlay, OH 45840

William A. Adams, Esq. Arter & Hadden LLP 10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100 Columbus, OH 43215

Elizabeth H. Watts Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215

Jeffrey L. Small, Esq. Chester, Willcox & Saxbe LLP 17 South High Street, Suite 900 Columbus, OH 43215 John W. Bentine, Esq. Chester, Willcox & Saxbe LLP 17 South High Street, Suite 900 Columbus, OH 43215

Joseph C. Blasko, Esq. Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008 Sheldon A. Taft, Esq. 52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008 George Walen Union Local 175 2307 Embury Park Road Dayton, OH 45414-5599 Margaret T. Rauch City of Sylvania 6730 Monroe Street Sylvania, OH 43560-1948

Ron Bridges AARP One South High Street Columbus, OH 43215 Gregory K. Lawrence Sutherland, Asbill & Brennan LLP 1275 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004-2415

Paul F. Forshay Sutherland, Asbill & Brennan LLP 1275 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004-2415 Barry Cohen, Esq. Office of Consumers' Counsel 77 South High Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43266-0550

Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 2110 Society Bank Center 36 East Seventh Street Cincinnati, OH 45202 Robert J. Chet Local 270, UWUA, AFL-CIO 4205 Chester Avenue Cleveland, OH 44103 William L. Wright, Esq. Assistant Attorney General Public Utilities Section 180 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215-3793 Susan Weinstock AARP-State Legislation Department 601 E Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20049

Theodore James Thomas 422 Nantucket Drive Avon Lake, OH 44102 Bruce Weston, Esq. 169 W. Hubbard Avenue Columbus, OH 43215

Robert P. Mone Scott A. Campbell Thompson, Hine & Flory, LLP 10 West Broad Street, Suite 700 Columbus, OH 43215 Glenn S. Krassen, Esq. Arter & Hadden LLP 1100 Huntington Building 925 Euclid Avenue Cleveland, OH 44115-1475

John R. Doll, Esq. Logothetis, Pence & Doll 111 West First Street, Suite 1100 Dayton, OH 45402-1156 Henry W. Eckhart, Esq. 50 West Broad Street #2117 Columbus, OH 43215 Michael H. Igoe, Esq. Carlile, Patchen & Murphy LLP 366 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215

James J. Mayer, Esq. Taft, Stettinius & Hollister LLP 1800 Firstar Tower 425 Walnut Street Cincinnati, OH 45202



Richard L. Sites, Esq. Staff Legal Counsel OHA: The Association for Hospitals and Health Systems 155 East Broad Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3620