



DELIVERED VIA EMAIL

April 12, 2023

Brian Knipe
FirstEnergy Corp.
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308

Re: Notification of CBP Auction Results

Dear Brian:

Pursuant to the requirements of paragraph 10 of the March 22, 2023 Finding and Order of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO" or "Commission"), please find attached a redacted version of the post-auction letter addressed to you (and cc'd to others) that the Auction Manager, CRA International, submitted on March 20, 2023 following the conclusion of the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities. ("FEOU") Competitive Bidding Process Auction to procure supply for Standard Service Offer customers of FEOU.

Redactions have been updated pursuant to paragraph 10 of the Finding and Order cited above. Other than these changes, the attached redacted letter is no different than the letter sent to you on March 20.

Sincerely yours,

CRA INTERNATIONAL, INC.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Bradley A. Miller". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Bradley A. Miller
Vice President

cc:

Jenifer French, Chairperson, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Tamara Turkenton, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Timothy Benedict, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Matthew Snider, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

Attachment



DELIVERED BY EMAIL

CRA No. D20048 / D20049

March 20, 2023

Mr. Brian Knipe
FirstEnergy Service Corporation
76 S. Main Street
Akron, OH 44308

Re: Notification of CBP Auction Results

Dear Brian:

This is to inform you that we have confirmed the results of the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities' Competitive Bidding Process Auction ("Auction") to procure supply for Standard Service Offer (SSO) customers for the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities. The Auction began on Monday March 20, 2023 and concluded the same day.

There are three tables attached to this letter.

- Table 1 summarizes the results of the Auction.
- Table 2 shows, for each winning bidder, the number of tranches won for each contract in the Auction.
- Table 3 provides the Auction Manager's assessment of the conduct of the Auction.

In accordance with the Bidding Rules, winning bidders will be contacted directly by the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities to execute the Master SSO Supply Agreement no later than three (3) business days following the close of the Auction.

Sincerely yours,

CRA INTERNATIONAL, INC.



Bradley A. Miller
Vice President

cc:

Jenifer French, Chairperson, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Daniel Conway, Vice Chair, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Lawrence Friedeman, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Dennis Deters, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Timothy Benedict, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Tamara Turkenton, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Matthew Snider, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Bob Reeping, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Christine Watchorn, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Sonny Fanelli, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Sam Belcher, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Ed Shuttleworth, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Patricia Mullin, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Randy Feucht, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Melanie Mancuso, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Jimi Oluwabiya, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Dhara Patel, FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities
Frank Mossburg, Bates White
Marjorie Romero, Bates White

Table 1. Summary of SSO Auction Results

Period of Delivery	June 1, 2023 – May 31, 2024
Number of Registered Bidders	7
Total initial eligibility of Registered Bidders	
Total initial eligibility divided by tranche target	
Number of bidders that submitted bids in round 1	
Number of tranches bid in round 1	104
Number of tranches bid in round 1 divided by tranche target	3.06
Number of tranches to procure in auction (tranche target)	34 tranches
Number of tranches procured in auction	34 tranches
Number of rounds in clock phase	15
Was there a sealed-bid round?	Yes
Number of winning bidders	5
Starting price range	\$90.00 to \$120.00 per MWh
Starting price	
Tranche-weighted average price of winning bids	\$83.75 per MWh

Table 2. Winning Bidders and Tranches Won

Winning Bidder	Number of Winning Tranches	Tranche-Weighted Average Price to be Paid (\$/MWh)
BP Energy Company	2	\$83.75
ConocoPhillips Company	2	\$83.75
Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	9	\$83.76
Interstate Gas Supply, LLC	8	\$83.75
NextEra Energy Marketing, LLC	13	\$83.75
	34	\$83.75

Table 3. Auction Manager’s Assessment of the Conduct of the Auction

	Question	
1	Were the competitive bidding rules violated?	No
2	Does the Auction Manager believe the auction was open, fair, transparent, and competitive?	Yes
3	Did bidders have sufficient information to prepare for the auction?	Yes. Bidders received information from the competitive bidding process documents, the Information Website, questions-and-answers posted to the Information Website, and bidder information sessions.
4	Was the information generally provided to bidders in accordance with the published timetable? Was the timetable updated appropriately as needed?	Yes
5	Were there any issues and questions left unresolved prior to the auction that created material uncertainty for bidders?	We do not believe that there were any unresolved issues or questions that created material uncertainty for bidders.
6	Were there any procedural problems or errors with the auction, including the electronic bidding process, the back-up bidding process, and communications between bidders and the Auction Manager?	Following round 2, there was a VPN related issue that required an extended delay in round 3 to resolve and correct. Bidders were contacted during the delay to keep them informed of the status. Once corrected, all bidders logged in and bid successfully in subsequent rounds.
7	Were protocols for communication between bidders and the Auction Manager adhered to?	Yes
8	Were there any hardware or software problems or errors, either with the auction system or with its associated communications systems?	No
9	Were there any unanticipated delays during the auction?	No
10	Did unanticipated delays appear to adversely affect bidding in the auction?	No
11	Were appropriate data back-up procedures planned and carried out?	Yes
12	Were any security breaches observed with the auction process?	No

	Question	
13	Were protocols followed for communications among FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities, the Auction Manager, the PUCO, and the PUCO's consultant during the auction?	Yes
14	Were the protocols followed for decisions regarding changes in auction parameters (e.g., volume adjustments and price decrements)?	Yes
15	Were the calculations (e.g., for price decrements or bidder eligibility) produced by the auction software double-checked or reproduced off-line by the Auction Manager?	Yes
16	Was there evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the auction?	No
17	Were the communications between the Auction Manager and bidders timely and effective?	Yes
18	Was there evidence that bidders felt unduly rushed during the process?	No
19	Was there any evidence of collusion or improper coordination among bidders?	No
20	Was there any evidence of anti-competitive behavior in the auction?	No
21	Was information made public appropriately? Was confidential and sensitive information treated appropriately?	Yes
22	Were there factors exogenous to the auction (e.g., changes in market environment) that materially affected the auction in unanticipated ways?	Recent concerns related to community aggregation and NOPEC may have been mitigated by PUCO's recent Finding and Order on Minimum Stay Provisions.

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities
Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

4/12/2023 10:36:29 AM

in

Case No(s). 16-0776-EL-UNC

Summary: Notification of CBP Auction Results - Updated Redacted Version
electronically filed by Mr. Timothy W. Benedict on behalf of Miller, Bradley A. and
CRA International, Inc..