

From: Paul.Cortney@PSB
To: Paul.Sullivan
Subject: public comment 16-1871-EL-BGN
Date: Monday, May 18, 2020 4:55:46 PM

-----Original Message-----

From: Tom Sullivan Jr. <tsj@epmnc.com>
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 4:26 PM
To: Metz, Mary <Mary.Metz@del.state.oh.us>
Cc: McCarthy, Daniel <Dan.McCarthy@governor.ohio.gov>; Butler, Matthew <mattbutler@psco.ohio.gov>; Paso Contact@PSB <contactpsb@psco.ohio.gov>; Randazzo, Samuel <Samuel.Randazzo@psco.ohio.gov>; Pelanda, Dorothy <Dorothy.Pelanda@agri.ohio.gov>; OWT Workforce <Workforce@owt.ohio.gov>; Stevenson, Laurie <Laurie.Stevenson@psco.ohio.gov>; Director Amy Acton <DirectorAmyActon@del.state.oh.us>; Greg Murphy@del.state.oh.us
Subject: Bald eagle killed by wind turbine at Wood County site | Toledo Blade - Icebreaker Windpower Inc. will be a Bird Killing Field, and fresh drinking water environmental disaster in Lake Erie

Ms. Mary C. Metz
Director
Ohio Department of Natural Resources
2045 Meese Road, D-3
Columbus, OH 43229

Dear Director Metz, and the Members of the OPSB,

Thank you for your email regarding our petition of 6,729 concerned citizens, opposing PSB case #: 16-1871-EL-BGN, Icebreaker Wind Facility, to be developed by Norwegian company Fred Olsen Renewables, after their purchase of LEEDCO, with permits and lease to develop the bottom and top of Ohio's gem, Lake Erie.

The link to the article below is but one recently killed Bald Eagle in January of this year, at the Industrial wind farm in Wood County Ohio. The article states, that your ODNR team is investigating this killing.

<https://gc0f1.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https://www.usdoashade.com/2f303762f05b2801%2Fbald-eagle-killed-by-wind-turbine-at-Wood-County-site%2Fnotes%2F2020050202&data=02%7C01%7Ccontactpsb%40psco.ohio.gov%7C15642792d2d49639068d7b69b57e%7C5088cc494840784eb36ed57c7c8a2%7C0%7C63725430734644034&data=chQB3I4VZjZPRC0Nqj0bk4%2Fdge8r5BdEaPWCo0Sk%3D&reserved=0>

Further to the article, this Eagle killing is against federal law, as the Bald Eagle is federally protected by the law under the Eagle Act, the Migratory Bird Treaty Act, and Lacey Act, as highlighted here <https://gc0f1.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https://www.fws.gov/2fma6ee8c2f6e46%2Fhistory%2Fprotection.html&data=02%7C01%7Ccontactpsb%40psco.ohio.gov%7C15642792d2d49639068d7b69b57e%7C5088cc494840784eb36ed57c7c8a2%7C0%7C63725430734644034&data=DH7Q%2FC%vVTX7y59r5DTLdR8TfWb2qjSkgrgNZLay%3D&reserved=0>

My mother Sandy Sullivan, along with being a great philanthropist for youth education in North East Ohio, was a true birder, and passed this on to me in my youth. When I was 10 years old, in the 1970s, I found an abandoned baby Robin on our driveway almost dead, and brought it to my mother. Over the next 6 weeks we raised the bird in a shoe box filled with straw in my bedroom. We watched him grow on a diet of worms and Alpo dog food, administered from a medicine dropper to the chirping birds mouth. When the young Robin grew healthy with feathers and started to want to fly, we took him to the Cleveland Metro Parks Nature Reserve, where he made a full recovery and was let back into the wild.

Today I live on the shores of Lake Erie in Bay Village, Ohio, just west of the Huntingdon Beach Metin Park area. Although my mother Sandy passed away in March of last year, I know she would have loved the abundant activity of this years birds, all over our area.

In the spring of 2020, on the shores of Bay Village, Ohio, right where the proposed Icebreaker will be sitting right offshore and east in the waters of Lake Erie, we are experiencing a birding spring, like I and my wife Mary have not seen in many Years.

We have seen the normal nesting of Sparrows, Robins, Golf Finch, Barn Swallows, Crows, Starlings, Doves, Blue Jays, Red Winged Blackbirds, Downy Wood Peckers and an early spotting of Hummingbirds. On the water we have seen the Sea Gulls, Wood Ducks, Mallard Ducks, Canadian Geese, Loons, and rare King Fishers, Snow Geese, and big White Tail Swallows. And of course lurking in the air are the Raptors we have seen including Red Tail Hawks, Turkey Vultures, Peregrine Falcons, Bald Eagles and first time this year a pair of Ospreys pandolling over the water and land.

This Spring is like living in a thriving bird sanctuary in North East Ohio on the shores of Lake Erie, all to be set to slaughter with the proposed development of the Icebreaker industrial wind turbine project.

It is reported that millions of Birds of all species migrate across Lake Erie every year. In the LEEDCO Icebreaker reporting requirements for this project, and at LEEDCO town hall meetings in 2018 and 2019, LEEDCO was making the preposterous claim that NO Birds migrate across Lake Erie.

Recent North American Bird Studies show the alarming data that the numbers of Birds by count are down 29%, or 2.9 Billion birds since 1970, and there is nothing in this study attributed to the 63,000 industrial Wind Turbines in operation in North America today, that surely account for a portion of this slaughter. Rachel Carson's prophetic call of a "Silent Spring", has moved from pesticides and habitat loss for birds, to the Whoosh Whoosh slaughter of birds by industrial wind turbines, throughout the US and Canada today.

The 479 ft high 206 ft blades industrial wind towers to be placed 8 miles out from the Cleveland Shore and spaced off the shores of East Cleveland, Lakewood, Rocky River and Bay Village Ohio, will create a 20 mile killing field for all species of birds, bats and butterflies that normally use this route for migration. And there can be no count of the slaughter because these beautiful creatures, once killed, will simply sink to the bottom of Lake Erie. And this is just the start. The full scale of this project is for 16000 industrial wind turbines in Lake Erie, to completely industrialize and destroy our Great Lake Erie.

Another very important point, for the OPSB members to consider regarding this project, is that North East Ohio and Ohio does not need the extra power to be proposed by this project. Within a 100 mile radius of the proposed Icebreaker site sits to the west the Davis-Besse Nuclear Power Station, and to the east the Perry Nuclear Power Station, providing zero CO2 green affordable, abundant and storable clean energy, for millions of Ohioans every day. And due to the Utica and Marcellus shale oil boom, natural gas costs in the state of Ohio are extremely affordable. With all this in mind, and without the need, it makes no sense to approve Icebreaker as the first Industrial Wind Turbines to be placed in the 11th largest fresh water lake in the world for power supply. This will risk polluting the water, and destroying the fragile environmental habitat that exists in Lake Erie today. Already today, algae bloom growths from agricultural run offs are threatening the fresh water supply and wildlife, and the largest Walleye and Perch fishing habitats in the world today.

The most ironic point with regards to Icebreaker Windpower inc. is that Lake Erie itself is the mother of the EPA. After the Cuyahoga River caught fire in 1969, Lake Erie was showcased as a natural disaster, and the City of Cleveland, and the State of Ohio got together with the Federal Government, and worked on the regulations put forth in December of 1970 that marked the beginning of the EPA itself. Together we helped to create the Clean Water Act of 1972, the US Federal law regarding the discharge of pollution into the nations lakes, rivers and streams. As a part of the EPA clean up of the Cuyahoga River, the Army Corps of Engineers moved all of the toxic sludge and cancer causing chemicals from the Cuyahoga River to bottom of Lake Erie, about 6 miles off the mouth of the River. This area is known as CLA-1 and consists of layers of 30, 50, and 100 years of cumulated carcinogens such as lead, magnesium, arsenic, mercury and PCBs, that have finally settled down nicely, at the bottom of Lake Erie. This area is known as the "Dead Zone", because no wildlife can survive in this area of the Lake. Now, if approved the Icebreaker upriver mussel bucket system will penetrate this toxic sludge and stir it up just 4 miles from the Cleveland Water Crib, which provides 300 million gallons of fresh drinking water to 1.4 million people, and thousands of businesses, schools, churches and recreation centers every day, in 80 different Ohio communities. If this happens the EPA will come full circle from 1970 until today, from helping to fix one of the great environmental disasters of America, only to create another one, in same area of Lake Erie, some 50 years later. I pray that this does not happen. This will make the First Michigan fresh water issue look like a walk in the park.

The final point I want to bring to is the ever important issue of economic development. All I can say in this regard is that the Unions have been duped, and it's right in the NEPA report surrounding the LEEDCO Icebreaker Windpower project. The Unions and businesses from Ohio are rightly looking for jobs and development, and have been led to believe falsely that this project will create locally about 500 new jobs. BUT if you look at the NEPA report on this project, under public records DOE/EA-2045, page 3-100, it clearly states, "the project will directly employ 159 jobs...it is anticipated that many highly specialized jobs would come from outside the area." And this means from the UK and Norway. Further stated is "the operation and maintenance of the project, once complete, will generate nine (9) full time jobs." This is 159 + 9, for a total of 168 jobs, most from Europe, and gone after the project is complete. The other jobs listed in the report are "could create," these are not firm jobs. I want jobs and economic development for Ohio. The idea that this project, as pitched by the Cleveland City Council, and the Cleveland Fed, at a Cleveland economic renaissance and supply chain for the North American wind industry is a myth. The Towers, blades, nacem boxes, and all components of this project will be designed and made where all of Fred Olsen's product systems are made in Europe, Norway and China, and imported here for this project. I don't think the Fred Olsen companies are going to outsource the manufacturing of the parts to Cleveland companies for their PLUMB. North American break thru, fresh water project, not a chance. Icebreaker Windpower inc. will be Fred OSENS design build project, imported from Europe and China. Once they assemble this project, they will be gone.

It is better for Ohio's economic development to pass on this project, and further work on clean water, boating, fishing, recreation and enhanced leisure opportunities, that currently exist in and on the shores of our Lake Erie, that already provide Billions of tourism and recreation dollars, to businesses and the State of Ohio every year.

Thank you very much once again Director Metz, and to all of your colleagues on the OPSB. I know you all have a huge responsibility weighing the costs of the environment versus responsible energy development. Please consider this note, and all of the notes and petitions you have received from literary millions of Ohioans, many of them voters, who strongly oppose the Icebreaker Windpower inc. project, sitting right in the middle of Ohio's gem, Lake Erie.

LONG LIVE EREBILJONEN!
(The Iroquoian Indian Name for Lake Erie)

Sincerely yours,

Tom

Thomas C. Sullivan, Jr.
29300 Lake Road
Bay Village, OH 44140
Cell: 216-272-9865 E-Mail: <https://gc0f1.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https://www.usdoashade.com/2f303762f05b2801%2Fbald-eagle-killed-by-wind-turbine-at-Wood-County-site%2Fnotes%2F2020050202&data=02%7C01%7Ccontactpsb%40psco.ohio.gov%7C15642792d2d49639068d7b69b57e%7C5088cc494840784eb36ed57c7c8a2%7C0%7C63725430734644034&data=9f2FahEhglDkE3p+xDQ%2F0Tt1WVrmFXZzOPRIB+y66A%3D&reserved=0>

Sent from my iPad

This e-mail (including all attachments) may be confidential, has a professional character, may be attorney-client privileged and is intended solely for the use of the intended recipient(s). If you are not the intended recipient and you have received this e-mail in error then any use, dissemination, forwarding, printing or copying of this e-mail is strictly prohibited, may be unlawful and you should contact the sender by return e-mail and then delete all copies in your possession. Any views or opinions presented are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the individual or entity to whom or which it is addressed or from whom or which it is sent. This e-mail does not form part of a legally binding agreement. E-mail messages may contain computer viruses or other defects, we have taken precautions to minimize the risk of transmitting software viruses, but we advise that you carry out your own checks on any attachments to this message. We make no warranties in relation to any loss or damage caused by software viruses or other defects.

CAUTION: This is an external email and may not be safe. If the email looks suspicious, please do not click links or open attachments and forward the email to csc@ohio.gov - csc@ohio.gov or click the Phish Alert Button if available.

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

5/18/2020 5:37:31 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-1871-EL-BGN

Summary: Public Comment Thomas C. Sullivan, Jr., via website, electronically filed by
Docketing Staff on behalf of Docketing