

5

Case No. 04-592-EL-AGG

MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

1. Technician ✓ _____ Date Processed 4/11/20
 2. _____
 3. _____
 4. _____
 5. _____
 6. _____
 7. _____
 8. _____
 9. _____
 10. _____
 11. _____
 12. _____
 13. _____
 14. _____
 15. _____
 16. _____
 17. _____
 18. _____
 19. _____
 20. _____
 21. _____
 22. _____
 23. _____
 24. _____
 25. _____
 26. _____
 27. _____
 28. _____
 29. _____
 30. _____
 31. _____
 32. _____
 33. _____
 34. _____
 35. _____
 36. _____
 37. _____
 38. _____
 39. _____
 40. _____
 41. _____
 42. _____
 43. _____
 44. _____
 45. _____
 46. _____
 47. _____
 48. _____
 49. _____
 50. _____
 51. _____
 52. _____
 53. _____
 54. _____
 55. _____
 56. _____
 57. _____
 58. _____
 59. _____
 60. _____
 61. _____
 62. _____
 63. _____
 64. _____
 65. _____
 66. _____
 67. _____
 68. _____
 69. _____
 70. _____
 71. _____
 72. _____
 73. _____
 74. _____
 75. _____
 76. _____
 77. _____
 78. _____
 79. _____
 80. _____
 81. _____
 82. _____
 83. _____
 84. _____
 85. _____
 86. _____
 87. _____
 88. _____
 89. _____
 90. _____
 91. _____
 92. _____
 93. _____
 94. _____
 95. _____
 96. _____
 97. _____
 98. _____
 99. _____
 100. _____

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Independent) Case No. 04-592-EL-AGG
Energy Consultants, Inc. for Renewal Certification)
as a Retail Aggregator and Power Broker)

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Along with this Motion for Protective Order and Memorandum in Support, Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. has filed its Renewal Certification Application to remain a Retail Aggregator and Power Broker. The application contains all of the required information in compliance with the Commission's Certification Application for Retail Aggregators and Power Brokers and Rule 4901:1-24, Ohio Administrative Code ("O.A.C").

The application requires the submission of Independent Energy Consultants' "Financial Statements" ("Exhibit C-3"), and "Forecasted Financial Statements" ("Exhibit C-5"). Independent Energy Consultants Inc., a privately held S Corporation registered in the State of Ohio, has provided the information under seal because the documents contain competitively sensitive and highly proprietary financial information. Therefore, Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. requests that the Commission maintain the commercially sensitive and confidential nature of the information (along with any copies) contained within the portion of the application filed under seal. OAC Rule 4901:1-24(D) provides that the Commission may issue an order to protect the confidentiality of information contained in documents filed with the Commissions Docketing Division to the extent that state or federal law prohibits the release of information and where non-disclosure of the information is not

inconsistent with the purposes of Ohio Revised Code ("R.C.") Chapter 4929. Revised Code § 4929.23 (A) specifically permits the Commission to grant confidentiality where competitive information is at stake. Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. contends that the commercially sensitive competitive information required by Sections C-3 and C-5 of the application constitutes highly confidential and proprietary trade secrets and, as such, Ohio law prohibits release of the information.

Other jurisdictions have held that not only does a public utilities commission have the authority to protect the trade secrets of a public utility, the trade statute creates a duty to protect them.¹ The Ohio Commission has similarly fulfilled its obligations to protect trade secrets in numerous proceedings.² For the Commission to do otherwise here would contradict the Ohio legislature's protections of all businesses, including public utilities.

In *Pyromatics, Inc. v. Peruzziello*,³ the Court of Appeals set forth six factors to be included in the analysis of what constitutes a trade secret:

(1) The extent to which the information is known outside the business, (2) the extent to which it is known to those inside the business, i.e., by the employees, (3) the precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information, (4) the savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors, (5) the amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information, and (6) the amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information.

Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. satisfies all of these considerations. Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. has provided under seal the information required in Sections C-3

¹ See e.g., *New York Tel. Co. v. Pub. Serv. Comm.* N.Y. 2d 213 (1982)

² See, e.g., *Elyria Telephone Co.*, Case No. 89-965-TP-AEC (Finding and Order, Sept. 21, 1989); *Ohio Bell Telephone Co.*, Case No. 89-718-TP-ATA (Finding and Order, May 31, 1989); *Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc.*, Case No. 90-17-GA-GCR (Entry, Aug. 17, 1990).

³ 7 Ohio App. 3d 131, 134-35 (Cuyahoga County 1983).

and C-5 of the application and has treated the information as a trade secret. In Independent Energy Consultant's normal course of business, the information is deemed confidential, is treated as proprietary and confidential by its employees and is not disclosed to anyone unless required pursuant to law.

Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. is seeking authority to continue to operate as a Retail Aggregator and Power Broker in the State of Ohio. Given the competitive environment in which it seeks to operate the financial information requested in Sections C-3 and C-5 of the application is highly proprietary, confidential and commercially sensitive. Therefore, it is imperative that Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. be required to disclose its financial forecasts only under seal, thus preventing potential competitors from gaining access to this sensitive information. Additionally, maintaining the confidentiality of Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. financial forecasts will in no way prejudice Independent Energy Consultants' competitors, because the Commission will have the financial information necessary to make an informed decision. The Commission can thus assure that Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. complies with the Commissions rules and receives no regulatory advantage over its potential competitors.

Additionally, Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. hereby requests a waiver from Rule 4901-1-24(F), O.A.C., which causes any order prohibiting public disclosure of certain documents to automatically expire eighteen (18) months after the date the order was issued. Given the sensitive nature of the requested documents, Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. believes that a waiver of this rule is appropriate. The information is proprietary now and

will continue to be sensitive in eighteen months. Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. also respectfully requests that the Commission grant a waiver from Rule 4901-1-24(F), O.A.C., to prevent the information that has been filed under seal from being removed from protective status and placed into the public record of the proceeding

WHEREFORE, Independent Energy Consultants, Inc. respectfully requests that this Motion for Protective Order be granted for the reasons set forth herein.

Respectfully submitted

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'David J. Hrina', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

David J. Hrina, Esq.
Brennan Manna Diamond, LLC
75 E. Market Street
Akron, OH 44308
Phone: 330-436-8910
Direct Fax: 330-253-6557

Counsel for Independent Energy Consultants, Inc.

Dated: March 30, 2020